

APPENDICES

APPENDIX 0: VERSIONS OF STANDARDS USED IN THE ANALYSIS

APPENDIX 1: PIGS

- Appendix 1a: Full results table for the scoring of standards for pigs
- Appendix 1b: Scoring categories for the scoring of standards for pigs
- Appendix 1c: Full results table for the scoring of standards for breeding boars
- Appendix 1d: Scoring categories for the scoring of standards for breeding boars

APPENDIX 2: DAIRY CATTLE

- Appendix 2a: Full results table for the scoring of standards for dairy cattle
- Appendix 2b: Scoring categories for the scoring of standards for dairy cattle
- Appendix 2c: Full results table for the scoring of standards for breeding bulls (dairy)
- Appendix 2d: Scoring categories for the scoring of standards for breeding bulls (dairy)

APPENDIX 3: BEEF CATTLE

- Appendix 3a: Full results table for the scoring of standards for beef cattle
- Appendix 3b: Scoring categories for the scoring of standards for beef cattle
- Appendix 3c: Full results table for the scoring of standards for breeding bulls (beef)
- Appendix 3d: Scoring categories for the scoring of standards for breeding bulls (beef)

APPENDIX 4: SHEEP

- Appendix 4a: Full results table for the scoring of standards for sheep
- Appendix 4b: Scoring categories for the scoring of standards for sheep
- Appendix 4c: Full results table for the scoring of standards for breeding rams
- Appendix 4d: Scoring categories for the scoring of standards for breeding rams

APPENDIX 5: BROILER (MEAT) CHICKENS

- Appendix 5a: Full results table for the scoring of standards for broiler (meat) chickens
- Appendix 5b: Scoring categories for the scoring of standards for broiler (meat) chickens
- Appendix 5c: Full results table for the scoring of standards for broiler breeders
- Appendix 5d: Scoring categories for the scoring of standards for broiler breeders

APPENDIX 6: TURKEYS

- Appendix 6a: Full results table for the scoring of standards for turkeys
- Appendix 6b: Scoring categories for the scoring of standards for turkeys
- Appendix 6c: Full results table for the scoring of standards for turkey breeders
- Appendix 6d: Scoring categories for the scoring of standards for turkey breeders

APPENDIX 7: LAYING HENS

- Appendix 7a: Full results table for the scoring of standards for laying hens
- Appendix 7b: Scoring categories for the scoring of standards for laying hens
- Appendix 7c: Full results table for the scoring of standards for layer breeders
- Appendix 7d: Scoring categories for the scoring of standards for layer breeders

APPENDIX 8: SALMON

- Appendix 8a: Full results table for the scoring of standards for salmon
- Appendix 8b: Scoring categories for the scoring of standards for salmon

APPENDIX 0: VERSIONS OF STANDARDS USED IN THE ANALYSIS

Table A0.1: Versions of farm assurance scheme standards used in the analysis.

Some of the standards have been revised since the analysis was carried out. Where two dates are given, the first date is the main version used in the scoring and the date in parentheses is the latest version, which has been checked and any significant changes incorporated into the analysis. * The scoring of assurance scheme standards for laying hens has been updated to bring them in line with the legislative requirements introduced in January 2012.

	AFS/Lion Code/ CoGP	QMS	RSPCA	SOPA	SA
Pigs	Apr 2010 (Oct 2011)	Jun 2009	Jan 2010	Dec 2007	Apr 2010 (Jun 2011)
Dairy cows	Apr 2010 (Oct 2011)	N/A	Jan 2008 (Jun 2011)	Dec 2007	Apr 2010 (Jun 2011)
Beef cattle	Apr 2010 (Oct 2011)	Sep 2008 (Aug 2011)	Mar 2010	Dec 2007	Apr 2010 (Jun 2011)
Sheep	Apr 2010 (Oct 2011)	Sep 2008 (Aug 2011)	Apr 2010	Dec 2007	Apr 2010 (Jun 2011)
Broilers	Apr 2010 (Oct 2011)	N/A	Feb 2008 (Apr 2011)	Dec 2007	Apr 2010 (Jun 2011)
Turkeys	Oct 2009	N/A	Mar 2010	Dec 2007	Apr 2010 (Jun 2011)
Laying hens*	Jan 2009	N/A	Oct 2009 (May 2011)	Dec 2007	Apr 2010 (Jun 2011)
Salmon	Jan 2006 (Sept 2011)	N/A	Jul 2010	N/A	Apr 2010 (Jun 2011)
Slaughter/ Processing	Jan 2008 (AFS) Oct 2009 (QBT) Apr 2011 (ACP)	Oct 2008	Covered in species-specific standards	Nov 2007	Apr 2010 (Jun 2011)
Transport	Jun 2007 (Jun 2011) (AFS)	Jul 2010	Covered in species-specific standards	Dec 2007	Apr 2010 (Jun 2011)
Markets	Feb 2010 (AFS)	Mar 2011	Covered in species-specific standards	Dec 2007	Apr 2010 (Jun 2011)

APPENDIX 1A

PIGS

APPENDIX 1A: FULL RESULTS TABLE FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR PIGS

Table A1.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for pigs.

Up to 5 points are available for each criterion. Key criteria (marked with an asterisk) are weighted so that they are worth double points (i.e. up to 10 points for each key criterion). Score for breeding boar welfare is derived from **Table A1.3**. Criteria are grouped into five sets. Totals for each set of criteria are converted to scores out of 20, which are totalled to give an overall score out of 100 for each scheme (see **Table 3.1**).

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for pigs	Assured British Pigs (ABP)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
ENVIRONMENT						
No close confinement	No sow stalls*	10 (prohibited by legislation)	10 (prohibited by legislation)	10 (prohibited by legislation)	10 (prohibited by legislation)	10 (prohibited by legislation)
	No farrowing crates*	0 (crates permitted from 7 days before expected farrowing until end of suckling period)	0 (crates permitted from 7 days before expected farrowing until end of suckling period)	4 (crates permitted for limited period – 5 days before expected farrowing until 5 days after farrowing; farrowing crates are not permitted for new entrants to the scheme and will be prohibited for all members from 31st December 2013)	10 (crates prohibited)	10 (crates prohibited)
Adequate space allowance when housed	Adequate space allowance when housed*	2 (minimum areas range from 0.15m ² for ≤10kg rearing pig, 0.4m ² for ≤50kg pig, to 0.65m ² for ≤110kg pig, and 2.25m ² for a sow or 1.64m ² for a gilt)	2 (minimum areas range from 0.15m ² for ≤10kg rearing pig, 0.4m ² for ≤50kg pig, to 0.65m ² for ≤110kg pig, and 2.55m ² for a sow or 1.76m ² for a gilt)	4 (minimum areas range from 0.15m ² for ≤10kg rearing pig, 0.47m ² for ≤50kg pig, to 0.8m ² for ≤110kg pig, and 3.5m ² for a sow or 2.5m ² for a gilt)	8 (minimum areas range from 0.8m ² indoor area plus 0.6m ² outdoor exercise area for ≤50kg rearing pig, to 1.3m ² indoor area plus 1m ² exercise area for ≤110kg pig, and 2.5m ² indoor area plus 1.9m ² outdoor exercise area for a sow without piglets)	10 (minimum areas range from 0.6m ² indoor area plus 0.4m ² outdoor exercise area for ≤30kg rearing pig, 0.8m ² indoor area plus 0.8m ² exercise area for ≤50kg pig, to 1.3m ² indoor area plus 1m ² exercise area for ≤110kg pig, and 3m ² indoor area plus 3m ² outdoor exercise area for a sow without piglets)
Appropriate housing design	Appropriate flooring	0 (fully-slatted floors permitted)	0 (fully-slatted floors permitted)	4 (fully-slatted floors prohibited and bedded lying area required)	4 (fully-slatted floors prohibited and bedded lying area required)	4 (fully-slatted floors prohibited and bedded lying area required)
	Provision of wallows/showers	0 (no requirement for wallows or showers)	1 (in accordance with welfare code, outdoor breeding pigs should be provided with wallows)	0 (facilities for outdoor pigs must minimise risk of sunburn and heat stress but no requirement for wallows/showers if adequate shade)	0 (no requirement for wallows/showers)	0 (wallows and/or shade must be provided in summer but no requirement for wallows if adequate shade)
Provision of appropriate bedding/ litter/ enrichment material	Provision of natural enrichment material/ bedding*	0 (non-natural materials, e.g. footballs or plastic pipes, may be accepted as satisfactory enrichment; no requirement for bedding)	0 (non-natural materials may be accepted as satisfactory enrichment; no requirement for bedding)	10 (pigs must be provided with a bedded lying area and substrate for foraging which must either be topped up at least every 3 days or feed pellets broadcast over entire pen at least once per week)	10 (pigs must be provided with a bedded lying area and access to substrate for rooting when housed)	10 (pigs must be provided with a bedded lying area and access to substrate for rooting when housed)

*Key criteria

Table A1.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for pigs.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for pigs	Assured British Pigs (ABP)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Provision of appropriate nesting facilities	Provision of nesting material for farrowing sows*	0 (in the week before the expected farrowing time sows and gilts must be given suitable nesting material in sufficient quantity unless it is not technically feasible for the slurry system used)	0 (in accordance with legislation, in the week before the expected farrowing time sows and gilts must be given suitable nesting material in sufficient quantity unless it is not technically feasible for the slurry system used)	10 (prior to farrowing, sufficient quantities of appropriate material must be provided to allow sows to carry out nest-building behaviour)	10 (farrowing arcs must be bedded with straw)	10 (farrowing arcs must be bedded – straw recommended)
Appropriate lighting	Appropriate light intensity and light/dark periods	2 (minimum 8 hours light at minimum 40 lux; no minimum dark period specified)	2 (in accordance with legislation, minimum 8 hours light at minimum 40 lux; no minimum dark period specified)	3 (minimum 8 hours light at minimum 50 lux and minimum 6 hours darkness except when natural periods are shorter)	5 (access to natural daylight throughout the year – must have access to outdoor exercise area when housed unless shed is open-fronted)	5 (access to natural daylight throughout the year – must have access to outdoor exercise area when housed)
Free range access	Free range access*	0 (permanent indoor housing permitted)	0 (permanent indoor housing permitted)	0 (permanent indoor housing permitted)	8 (access to pasture required except for up to one fifth of life in final fattening phase or in extreme weather conditions when pigs may be housed with access to an outdoor run with substrate for rooting)	8 (access to pasture required except for up to one fifth of life in final fattening phase or in extreme weather conditions when pigs may be housed with access to an outdoor run with substrate for rooting)
Adequate outdoor space	Low outdoor stocking density	1 (maximum 30 sows per hectare)	2 (in accordance with welfare code, guideline 25 sows per hectare)	1 (maximum 25-30 adult pigs per hectare)	5 (outdoor stocking density must be low enough to prevent poaching of the soil and over-grazing of vegetation)	5 (outdoor stocking density must be low enough to prevent poaching of the soil, over-grazing of vegetation and pollution of watercourses; guideline 9 sows per hectare)
Appropriate shelter/shade and protection from predators	Provision of shelter and shade for outdoor pigs	3 (arcs or other equivalent accommodation must be available and positioned so as to provide shelter from the prevailing wind; farrowing huts must be supplied with straw and provision of bedding is recommended but not required in all accommodation for outdoor pigs; no requirement for shade)	5 (outdoor pigs must have adequate shade or wallows and bedded arcs/ huts in accordance with welfare code)	5 (pigs must be provided with covered shelter with sufficient bedded lying area for all animals to lie at the same time and facilities for outdoor pigs must minimise the risk of sun burn and heat stress through the provision of wallows and/or shade)	5 (free range areas and open air runs must provide sufficient protection against rain, wind, sun and extreme temperatures; bedded lying area required)	5 (pigs must be provided with covered and bedded shelters and with wallows and/or shade during summer)
Appropriate social grouping	Stable social groups avoiding mixing of unfamiliar pigs	1 (pigs should be kept in stable groups with as little mixing as possible but part-groups remaining after slaughter-weight selection may be mixed with other part groups)	1 (pigs should be kept in stable groups with as little mixing as possible in accordance with legislation but pigs may be mixed and, in accordance with welfare code, health plan should include a strategy for managing mixing)	3 (pigs must be kept in stable groups with as little mixing as possible but subdivision is permitted as pigs grow and sows and gilts may be mixed with care taken to prevent bullying; groups for transport must be established at least one week prior to transport)	4 (pigs must be kept in stable evenly-sized groups; steps must be taken to reduce stress during transport, including avoiding mixing of animals from different social groups)	4 (pigs must be kept in stable evenly-sized groups; mixing of pigs from different social groups for transport must be avoided)

*Key criteria

Table A1.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for pigs.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for pigs	Assured British Pigs (ABP)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
HUSBANDRY						
No mutilations	No tail docking*	0 (permitted, no requirement for anaesthesia/ analgesia)	0 (permitted, no requirement for anaesthesia/ analgesia)	2 (only permitted in exceptional circumstances; request must be submitted in writing with details of actions taken to try to alleviate problem; must be reviewed quarterly; no requirement for anaesthesia/analgesia)	10 (prohibited)	10 (prohibited)
	No teeth reduction*	0 (clipping or grinding permitted; grinding is encouraged; only minimal removal of the tips of the teeth permitted and pulp cavity must not be exposed)	0 (clipping or grinding permitted)	2 (clipping or grinding permitted; request must be submitted in writing with reasons; grinding strongly recommended as alternative to clipping; only the points of the teeth may be removed)	10 (prohibited)	10 (prohibited)
	No castration*	10 (prohibited)	10 (prohibited)	10 (prohibited)	10 (prohibited)	10 (prohibited)
	No nose ringing	0 (permitted)	0 (permitted)	1 (only permitted in exceptional circumstances; request must be submitted in writing; must be reviewed quarterly)	5 (prohibited)	5 (prohibited)
No use of genetic engineering/ cloning or invasive reproductive technologies associated with health or welfare problems	No use of genetically modified or cloned animals or their offspring	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	4 (livestock must not be brought in that have been produced using transgenic or other genetic engineering techniques; cloning is effectively prohibited by prohibitions on breeding practices that make livestock systems over-reliant on inappropriate technology and any surgical or chemical interference other than procedures specifically permitted in the standards, but no restriction on the use of the offspring of cloned animals)	4 (livestock must not be brought in that have been produced using transgenic or other genetic engineering techniques; use of cloning is prohibited but no restriction on the use of the offspring of cloned animals)
Appropriate feeding	Provision of adequate high-fibre feed to satisfy hunger and minimise health problems*	2 (not specified; for sows inclusion of some high-fibre feed in daily ration required by legislation)	2 (not specified; for sows inclusion of some high-fibre feed in daily ration required by legislation)	6 (not specified beyond legal requirements but foraging substrate and bedding must be provided for all pigs)	10 (restricted feeding practices are not permitted; daily ration must include roughage, fresh or dried fodder or silage; pigs must have access to pasture/rooting substrate and bedding must be provided for all pigs)	10 (daily ration must include roughage, fresh or dried fodder or silage; pigs must have access to growing green food/rooting substrate and bedding must be provided for all pigs)
Appropriate weaning age	Appropriate weaning age*	0 (in accordance with legislation, minimum 21 days in all-in all-out systems)	0 (in accordance with legislation, minimum 21 days in all-in all-out systems)	0 (minimum 21 days in all-in all-out systems)	8 (minimum 40 days; recommended minimum 8 weeks)	8 (minimum 40 days)

*Key criteria

Table A1.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for pigs.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for pigs	Assured British Pigs (ABP)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Adequate monitoring of health and welfare by producers	Regular veterinary visits and veterinary health plan with targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits*	6 (must have quarterly vet visits with report made available to certifying body; herd performance data must be monitored for signs of disease or production disorders but no requirement for targets; must have written veterinary health plan updated regularly; remedial action must be taken to resolve adverse findings in the quarterly vet report or when mortality levels increase)	4 (must have vet visits every 3 months, or every 6 months if no breeding pigs, with report sent to certifying body; must have written health and welfare plan updated regularly; no requirement to monitor health and welfare indicators or to set targets)	8 (must have quarterly vet visits resulting in a farm-specific report; herd performance data must be continually monitored for signs of disease or production disorders; the condition of the feet must be regularly inspected; must have veterinary health plan updated regularly; includes targets for a range of parameters; remedial action must be taken if parameters fall below tolerance limits)	2 (no requirement for regular veterinary visits; must have animal health plan submitted for approval and updated regularly; no requirement to monitor health and welfare indicators or to set targets)	2 (no requirement for regular veterinary visits; must have animal health plan submitted for approval and reviewed regularly; no requirement to monitor health and welfare indicators or to set targets)

STOCKMANSHIP, HANDLING, TRANSPORT & SLAUGHTER

Appropriate handling	No use of electric goads	1 (prohibited on farm; permitted by haulage and abattoir standards)	0 (permitted)	5 (prohibited)	5 (prohibited)	5 (prohibited)
Promotion of high quality stockmanship	Requirement for stockpeople to be trained/ competent/ experienced	2 (all units must have a sufficient number of competent stockpeople available and records of the experience, qualifications and training of all stockpeople must be kept)	3 (in accordance with legislation, all units must have a sufficient number of competent staff; all units must have some form of training in pig welfare for stockpeople and records of training must be kept)	3 (all managers and stockpeople must be thoroughly trained, skilled and competent in animal husbandry and welfare; managers must develop a training programme for stockpeople with regular updates and keep records of training)	2 (stockpeople must be suitably trained; no requirement to provide formal training in animal welfare or to keep records of training)	2 (stockpeople must be suitably trained or experienced; no requirement to provide formal training in animal welfare or to keep records of training)
Frequent checks for signs of illness, injury or distress	Frequent checks for signs of illness, injury or distress	3 (pigs must be checked at least once per day)	3 (in accordance with legislation, all pigs must be checked at least once per day)	5 (pigs must be checked at least twice per day)	5 (pigs must be checked at least twice per day)	5 (pigs must be checked at least twice per day)
Short transport duration	Short transport duration*	0 (journeys over 8 hours permitted – no upper limit beyond legal requirements)	0 (journeys over 8 hours permitted – no upper limit beyond legal requirements)	8 (pigs must not be transported for more than 8 hours from loading of the first animal to unloading of the last animal)	8 (pigs must not be transported for more than 8 hours from loading of the first animal to unloading of the last animal, excluding sea journeys between the Scottish mainland and remote islands)	8 (pigs must not be transported for more than 8 hours, from the start of loading to the end of unloading, except with permission)
No live export	No live export of pigs for slaughter*	0 (live export of pigs for slaughter permitted)	0 (live export of pigs for slaughter permitted)	8 (live export of pigs for slaughter not specifically prohibited but will be restricted by 8 hour journey limit)	8 (live export of pigs for slaughter not specifically prohibited but will be restricted by 8 hour journey limit)	10 (live export of pigs for slaughter prohibited)

*Key criteria

Table A1.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for pigs.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for pigs	Assured British Pigs (ABP)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
No use of livestock markets	No use of livestock markets	0 (pigs for slaughter may be sold through livestock markets)	0 (pigs may be sold through livestock markets)	5 (the sale of pigs through livestock markets is prohibited)	5 (the sale of pigs through livestock markets is prohibited)	5 (the sale of pigs through livestock markets is prohibited)
Humane slaughter	Requirement for good handling systems in gas stun/kill systems (with wide races allowing pigs to be moved and stunned in groups) and no use of carbon dioxide*	0 (high concentration of CO ₂ permitted and no requirement for wide races and handling/ stunning in groups)	0 (high concentration of CO ₂ permitted and no requirement for wide races and handling/ stunning in groups)	0 (high concentration of CO ₂ permitted and no requirement for wide races and handling/ stunning in groups)	0 (high concentration of CO ₂ permitted following inspection & approval of system but criteria for approval not specified; no requirement for wide races and handling/ stunning in groups)	6 (high concentration of CO ₂ permitted following inspection & approval of system on the basis that welfare overall is improved, i.e. through good handling systems)
	Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death*	8 (all pigs must be stunned; minimum output current specified for electrical stunning equipment; AWO must check regularly and record that pigs are rendered unconscious; stun-stick interval must not exceed 15 seconds following electrical stunning; bleeding method not specified; minimum recommended bleed time 1.5 minutes and should be seen to be effective)	2 (all pigs must be stunned; electrical parameters specified in terms of voltage, frequency and duration; monitoring of stunning, stun-stick interval, bleeding method and minimum bleed time not specified)	10 (all pigs must be stunned; electrical parameters specified in terms of current and duration; the AWO must make frequent and thorough checks throughout the day to ensure that animals are being effectively stunned and are insensible throughout the slaughter operation; effectiveness of stunning must be monitored and recorded at the start of stunning and at least every 2 hours after that with at least 10 animals checked each time; sticking must be immediate with maximum stun-stick interval of 15 seconds; bleeding must be with a chest/ thoracic stick; minimum bleed time 20 seconds)	4 (all pigs must be stunned; maximum stun-stick interval 60 seconds; bleeding must be with a chest/ thoracic stick; minimum bleed time 20 seconds; electrical parameters and monitoring of stunning not specified)	8 (all pigs must be stunned; if stunning is automated a trained and licensed operator must be present at all times to check the stun/kill operation; sticking must be immediate; bleeding must be with a chest/thoracic stick; minimum bleed time 20 seconds; electrical parameters not specified)
Promotion of high welfare standards in the handling of animals during transport and slaughter	Animal welfare policy and CCTV at abattoir and requirement for people involved in transporting and slaughtering of animals to be trained/ competent/ experienced	4 (all drivers must hold a certificate of competence and training records must be kept; producers may also transport their own stock; abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly; there must be a trained AWO on duty at all times during operational hours who must have undertaken an external training course; all persons involved in the handling of livestock must be suitably trained – ideally all staff should have completed an AWO training course or can be trained under the instruction of the AWO; records of training must be kept; no requirement for CCTV)	2 (haulage scheme requires that drivers hold a certificate of competence; producers may also transport their own stock; abattoirs must have at least one member of staff on site who has been formally trained to a recognised certified standard; no requirement for CCTV)	4 (personnel in charge of pig transporters must have completed an approved training course, preferably validated; abattoirs must have a written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly; there must be at least one appointed AWO who must have attended a validated training programme and must be present on site at all times whilst slaughter is being carried out; there must be a training programme for all staff which includes use of HSA training video; installation of CCTV in abattoirs is not currently required but will be introduced from Nov 2011)	2 (no stipulations on training of drivers beyond legal requirements; abattoirs must have a training programme that includes animal welfare; records of training for all staff must be kept; there must be a nominated person who is responsible for animal welfare and they must be trained and competent; a suitably trained and competent person must oversee the unloading of every animal including those arriving out-of-hours; no requirement for CCTV)	3 (no stipulations on training of drivers beyond legal requirements; abattoirs must have a documented quality management system which covers animal welfare and is reviewed regularly; must have a training programme that includes animal welfare and is ongoing with induction and refresher training, further training specific to the job and retraining if any problems or when new procedures introduced; records of training for all operators must be kept; when there are live animals there must always be someone present who is responsible for animal welfare and they must be trained and competent – AWO or abattoir owner/ operator; a suitably trained and competent person must oversee the unloading of every animal including those arriving out-of-hours; no requirement for CCTV)

*Key criteria

Table A1.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for pigs.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for pigs	Assured British Pigs (ABP)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
GENETICS & BREEDING						
No use of breeds associated with increased incidence of health/ welfare problems	No breeds associated with increased incidence of health/ welfare problems and requirement for breeds used in outdoor systems to be suitable for outdoor conditions*	2 (no restriction on permitted breeds but in outdoor systems breeding stock must be of a type that is bred for outdoor production; health must be monitored but no requirement to change genetics if parameters not within acceptable limits; no requirement to use breeds that are less prone to tail biting)	2 (no restriction on permitted breeds but, in accordance with welfare code, stock for outdoor production must be suitable for outdoor conditions; no requirement to use breeds that are less prone to tail biting)	2 (no restriction on permitted breeds but monitoring of key health and welfare parameters required and when health or welfare problems arise, consideration should be given to whether genetics may be a contributory factor and whether changes to the unit's policy on genetics would be beneficial; no requirement for breeds used in outdoor systems to be suitable for outdoor conditions; no requirement to use breeds that are less prone to tail biting)	8 (breeds must be chosen to avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production, e.g. porcine stress syndrome, PSE syndrome, but no requirement to demonstrate that key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate/ production level are within acceptable limits; choice of breeds must take account of the capacity of the animals to adapt to local conditions and their vitality and resistance to disease; tail docking prohibited)	8 (breeds must be chosen to avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production but no requirement to demonstrate that key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate/ production level are within acceptable limits; breeds must be chosen that can adapt to the organic system and local conditions and that have vitality and resistance to disease; tail docking prohibited)
High welfare standards for breeding animals	See Table A1.3 for scoring of breeding boar welfare	1	0	2	4	4
No killing of surplus male animals	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
AUDITING						
Frequent inspections	Frequent inspections by certifying body	4 (inspections annually)	3 (inspections every 6 months initially; time between inspections then varies depending on performance up to 22 months)	4 (inspections annually; time between inspections may be shorter or longer up to 15 months to allow visits at different times of year)	4 (inspections annually)	4 (inspections annually)
Spot-checks	Targeted unannounced spot-checks	1 (routine inspections are supplemented by some random spot checks at short notice)	2 (around 10% of farms receive additional spot-checks; farms selected at random except that all farms for which a complaint has been received from any source will be included; may be unannounced)	5 (RSPCA monitor around 35% of all members and 50% of monitoring visits are unannounced; all monitoring visits are made on a risk assessment basis following annual inspection – farms with non-compliances at assessment will get a monitoring visit)	1 (spot checks are carried out as a routine part of verifying continuous compliance with the standards; may be unannounced; no information supplied to indicate that spot checks are targeted or the proportion of farms receiving spot checks; additional assessments are also carried out where a major change or deviation has been made from the approved farm plan)	3 (there is a programme of additional unannounced inspections over and above the annual visits; these target those who are considered to be higher risk or where specific risks have been identified, e.g. end of derogation periods, parallel production, following up complaints; around 10% of farms receive additional spot-checks or follow-up visits each year)

*Key criteria

Table A1.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for pigs.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for pigs	Assured British Pigs (ABP)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme	Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set*	2 (guidance notes state that inspectors should look for evidence of tail, flank or ear biting, shoulder sores or fighting which goes beyond normal behaviour; where such injuries or behaviour are observed, inspectors should check that a documented action plan is available and being implemented; no targets set)	4 (QMS is piloting assessment of welfare outcomes based on Qualitative Behaviour Assessment (QBA) developed by the Scottish Agricultural College (SAC); in the longer term some BWAP measures may also be incorporated)	8 (RSPCA has developed a system of assessment of welfare outcomes and is working with other standard setters and Bristol University to further develop outcome measures; assessments of welfare outcomes on finishing pig farms have been underway for the past year; observations include lameness, lesions and positive/ negative behaviour; producers set themselves targets and intervention levels in VHP; checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met)	0 (no assessment of welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	6 (SA has a programme of assessments based on the Bristol Welfare Assurance Programme (BWAP); observations for pigs are thin (BCS <2), fat (BCS >4) (sows only), skin lesions, lameness, dirtiness (excluding from wallowing in mud); behaviour – abnormal oral behaviour, playing; no targets set for pigs yet but plan to introduce targets)
Measures to address non-compliance	Stringent measures to address non-compliance	5 (all non-conformances must be corrected; a major non-conformance against one of the 'key standards' will result in suspension of certification until it is corrected; non-conformances against 'other standards' should not result in suspension provided they are corrected within an agreed timescale, normally within 28 days of the assessment; certification may also be suspended in the case of a large number of such non-conformances or in the event of the same non-conformance being found on successive assessment visits)	5 (non-compliance categorised as minor or major; non-compliances must be corrected within an agreed timescale; major non-compliance results in immediate suspension of certification)	5 (all non-compliances must be corrected as soon as possible; certificates are withdrawn after 8 weeks if the Freedom Food certification panel has not received corrective actions and objective evidence to verify compliance; a producer who has their certificate withdrawn due to non-compliance at assessment has 3 unannounced visits by Freedom Food over the next 6 months to ensure compliance is being maintained)	5 (where welfare issues are identified during an inspection, the Certification Officer sets the member targets to be implemented or in extreme cases passes on to SFQC Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) for the SOPA scheme for a full set of new plans and targets to be drawn up; if the targets are not met within a specific timescale then the member is withdrawn from the SOPA scheme; in some cases a specific category of livestock may be de-certified)	5 (an action summary form is drawn up following inspection, listing non-compliances and asking how they will be corrected, with a deadline for return of the completed form; actions to correct non-compliances must be approved before a licence is issued or continued; an additional inspection may be carried out to make sure non-compliances have been corrected; non-compliance categorised as minor, major, critical or manifest infringement; certification will normally be suspended for part or whole of the enterprise in response to critical non-compliance or multiple or unresolved major non-compliance)

*Key criteria

APPENDIX 1B

PIGS

APPENDIX 1B: SCORING CATEGORIES FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR PIGS

Table A1.2: Scoring categories for pigs.

Criteria for pigs	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
ENVIRONMENT						
No sow stalls*	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Sow stalls prohibited
No farrowing crates*	Crates permitted from 7 days before expected farrowing date until end of suckling period (minimum legal requirement)	Farrowing crates permitted for limited period only (a few days before farrowing and a few days afterwards)	Farrowing crates permitted for limited period only (a few days before farrowing and a few days afterwards) and date set to phase out altogether	N/A	N/A	Farrowing crates prohibited
Adequate space allowance when housed*	N/A	Minimum total area of at least 2.25m ² per sow and 0.4m ² per 50kg rearing pig (minimum legislative requirements – sow space allowance may be decreased by 10% in groups over 40)	Minimum total area of at least 2.5m ² per sow and 0.45m ² per 50kg rearing pig	Minimum total area of at least 3m ² per sow and 0.5m ² per 50kg rearing pig	Minimum total area of at least 4m ² per sow and 1m ² per 50kg rearing pig	Minimum total area of at least 6m ² per sow and 1.5m ² per 50kg rearing pig
Appropriate flooring	Fully-slatted floors permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	Fully-slatted floors prohibited (or bedded lying area required) for all pigs	Flooring must be entirely solid for all pigs
Provision of wallows/ showers	No requirement for wallows or showers	Wallows or showers required for outdoor breeding pigs only (and permanent indoor housing permitted)	Wallows or showers required for all outdoor pigs only (and permanent indoor housing permitted)	Wallows or showers required for all breeding pigs only	Wallows or showers required for all pigs over 20kg liveweight	Wallows or showers required for all pigs
Provision of natural enrichment material/ bedding*	Non-natural materials permitted as only enrichment (e.g. ropes, footballs)	N/A	Natural material required for enrichment but small quantities permitted (i.e. not sufficient to act as bedding)	N/A	Natural material required for enrichment sufficient to act as bedding but no requirement to add new material regularly or to provide additional enrichment	Natural material required for enrichment sufficient to act as bedding and either 1) new material must be added regularly or 2) pigs must also have access to substrate for rooting
Provision of nesting material for farrowing sows*	Nesting material must be provided unless it is not compatible with the slurry system (minimum legal requirement)	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	All farrowing sows must be provided with sufficient quantities of suitable nesting material such as straw
Appropriate light intensity and light/dark periods	N/A	N/A	Minimum 8 hours light at minimum 40 lux; no minimum dark period (minimum legal requirements)	Minimum 8 hours light at minimum 50 lux and minimum 6 hours dark period except when natural period shorter	Minimum 8 hours light at minimum 100 lux and minimum 6 hours dark period except when natural period shorter	Access to natural daylight throughout life

*Key criteria

Table A1.2: Scoring categories for pigs.

Criteria for pigs	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Free range access*	Permanent indoor housing permitted	All pigs must have access to an outdoor run throughout life but not necessarily access to pasture or woodland OR Breeding sows must have access to pasture or woodland throughout life but pigs reared for meat may be reared indoors for most of life	N/A	N/A	Breeding sows must have access to pasture or woodland throughout life and pigs reared for meat must have access to pasture or woodland for most of life but housing with access to an outdoor run permitted for no more than one fifth of life during final fattening phase	All pigs must have access to pasture or woodland throughout life (except that piglets may be held within outdoor arcs for the first few days and pigs may be housed temporarily in extreme weather conditions or if required by law due to a disease outbreak)
Low outdoor stocking density	Stocking density may be greater than 30 sows/ hectare	Maximum 30 sows/ hectare	Maximum 25 sows/ hectare	Maximum 20 sows/ hectare	Maximum 15 sows/ hectare	Maximum 10 sows/ hectare OR Outdoor stocking density must be low enough to prevent poaching of the soil and over-grazing of vegetation
Provision of shelter and shade for outdoor pigs	No requirement for shelter and shade for outdoor pigs	N/A	N/A	Shelter required but no requirement for bedding in shelters or for adequate shade in summer	Shelter required and either 1) shelters must be bedded or 2) adequate shade must be provided	Shelter and shade required and bedding must be provided in shelters
Stable social groups avoiding mixing of unfamiliar pigs	N/A	Mixing of unfamiliar pigs permitted but should be minimised; no requirement to avoid mixing of pigs from different groups for transport (minimum legislative requirement)	Growing pigs must be kept in stable groups but subdivision is permitted; sows and gilts may be mixed but steps must be taken to prevent bullying; no requirement to avoid mixing of pigs from different groups for transport	Growing pigs must be kept in stable groups but subdivision is permitted; sows and gilts may be mixed but steps must be taken to prevent bullying; mixing of pigs from different groups for transport must be avoided or groups for transport must be formed in time to allow them to stabilise prior to transport	Pigs must be kept in stable groups; pigs from different social groups must not be mixed for transport	Pigs must be reared in litter groups and sows must be kept in small long-term stable groups; pigs from different social groups must not be mixed for transport

HUSBANDRY

No tail docking*	Tail docking permitted and no requirement for anaesthesia/ analgesia	Tail docking permitted only in exceptional circumstances with written permission from the scheme	N/A	Tail docking permitted only in exceptional circumstances with written permission from the scheme each time and anaesthesia/ analgesia must be used	N/A	Tail docking prohibited
-------------------------	--	--	-----	--	-----	-------------------------

*Key criteria

Table A1.2: Scoring categories for pigs.

Criteria for pigs	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
No teeth reduction*	Teeth reduction permitted by clipping or grinding and no requirement for anaesthesia/ analgesia	Teeth reduction permitted only in exceptional circumstances with written permission from the scheme	N/A	Teeth reduction permitted only in exceptional circumstances with written permission from the scheme each time and only by grinding and only the tip must be removed, avoiding exposure of the pulp cavity	N/A	Teeth reduction prohibited
No castration*	Castration permitted and no requirement for anaesthesia/ analgesia	Castration permitted only in exceptional circumstances with written permission from the scheme and anaesthesia/ analgesia must be used	N/A	N/A	N/A	Castration prohibited
No nose ringing	Nose ringing permitted and no requirement for anaesthesia/ analgesia	Nose ringing permitted only in exceptional circumstances with written permission from the scheme	N/A	N/A	N/A	Nose ringing prohibited
No use of genetically modified or cloned animals or their offspring	No restriction on the use of genetically modified or cloned animals or their offspring	N/A	N/A	The use of genetically modified animals is prohibited but no restriction on the use of cloned animals or their offspring	The use of genetically modified and cloned animals is prohibited but no restriction on the use of clone offspring	The use of genetically modified and cloned animals and their offspring is prohibited
Provision of adequate high-fibre feed to satisfy hunger and minimise health problems*	N/A	Sows must be provided with high-fibre feed in addition to high-energy feed (minimum legal requirements)	N/A	No specific stipulations beyond legal minimum requirements but natural material for foraging/ rooting and bedding required	N/A	Natural material for foraging/ rooting and bedding required and either 1) pigs must have permanent access to roughage and/or grazing, or 2) restricted feeding prohibited
Appropriate weaning age*	Minimum weaning age may be less than 28 days	Minimum weaning age 28 days (in all systems)	Minimum weaning age 32 days	Minimum weaning age 36 days	Minimum weaning age 40 days	Minimum weaning age 56 days
Regular veterinary visits and veterinary health plan with targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits*	No requirement for VHP, regular veterinary visits or monitoring of health and welfare and performance parameters	Must have VHP but no requirement for monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters or regular veterinary visits	Must have VHP and one of 1) monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters or 2) regular veterinary visits	Must have VHP and two of 1) monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters 2) moderate or unspecified targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits 3) regular veterinary visits	Must have VHP, regular veterinary visits and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with moderate or unspecified targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits	Must have VHP, regular veterinary visits and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with stringent targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits

*Key criteria

Table A1.2: Scoring categories for pigs.

Criteria for pigs	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
STOCKMANSHIP, HANDLING, TRANSPORT & SLAUGHTER						
No use of electric goads	Electric goads permitted on farm and at the abattoir in accordance with legislation	Electric goads prohibited on farm but permitted by haulage and abattoir standards	N/A	N/A	N/A	Electric goads prohibited on farm and also by haulage and abattoir standards
Requirement for stockpeople to be trained/ competent/ experienced	No requirements regarding training or experience of stockpeople	N/A	Stockpeople must be suitably trained or experienced but no requirement to provide formal training in animal welfare or for training to be validated	Stockpeople must be suitably trained or experienced; formal training in animal welfare must be provided and records of training must be kept but no requirement for training to be validated	There must be at least one nominated person with responsibility for animal welfare (owner or manager) who must have attended a relevant validated training course; formal training in animal welfare must be provided for all stockpeople and records of training must be kept	All stockpeople must have attended a relevant validated training course and records of training must be kept
Frequent checks for signs of disease, injury or distress	N/A	N/A	N/A	All pigs must be checked at least once per day (minimum legal requirement)	All pigs must be checked at least once per day and vulnerable pigs (e.g. sick or injured pigs and sows due to farrow or recently farrowed) must be checked more frequently	All pigs must be checked at least twice per day
Short transport duration*	Journeys over 12 hours including loading and unloading permitted	N/A	N/A	12 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 12 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)	8 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 8 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)	4 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 4 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)
No live export of pigs for slaughter*	Live export of pigs for slaughter permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	Live export of pigs for slaughter not specifically prohibited but limited by journey limit of 8 hours or less	Live export of pigs for slaughter prohibited
No use of livestock markets	Livestock markets permitted in accordance with legislation	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Livestock markets prohibited

*Key criteria

Table A1.2: Scoring categories for pigs.

Criteria for pigs	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Requirement for good handling systems in gas stun/kill systems (with wide races allowing pigs to be moved and stunned in groups) and no use of carbon dioxide*	High concentration of CO ₂ (above 30%) permitted and no requirement for good handling systems	N/A	N/A	High concentration of CO ₂ (above 30%) only permitted with good group handling systems	High concentration of CO ₂ (above 30%) prohibited and good handling systems required	Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited and good handling systems required
Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death*	Slaughter without stunning permitted and/or no clear specifications for stunning parameters, no requirement for monitoring of effectiveness of stunning, maximum stun-stick interval may be greater than 15 seconds, no requirement to use chest/ thoracic stick and minimum bleed time may be less than 20 seconds	All pigs must be stunned and one of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) immediate sticking with maximum stun-stick interval of 15 seconds 4) chest/thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 20 seconds	All pigs must be stunned and two of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) immediate sticking with maximum stun-stick interval of 15 seconds 4) chest/thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 20 seconds	All pigs must be stunned and three of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) immediate sticking with maximum stun-stick interval of 15 seconds 4) chest/thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 20 seconds	All pigs must be stunned and four of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) immediate sticking with maximum stun-stick interval of 15 seconds 4) chest/thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 20 seconds	All pigs must be stunned; clear specifications for stunning parameters to ensure effective stun; monitoring of effectiveness of stunning required; immediate sticking required with maximum stun-stick interval of 15 seconds; chest/ thoracic stick must be used; minimum bleed time 20 seconds
Animal welfare policy and CCTV at abattoir and requirement for people involved in transporting and slaughtering of animals to be trained/ competent/ experienced	No requirement for personnel in charge of transporting pigs to be trained or for abattoirs to have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly, an appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered, a training programme in animal welfare for all staff or CCTV	At least one of 1) all personnel in charge of transporting pigs must be trained 2) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 3) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 4) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 5) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	At least two of 1) all personnel in charge of transporting pigs must be trained 2) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 3) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 4) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 5) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	At least three of 1) all personnel in charge of transporting pigs must be trained 2) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 3) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 4) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 5) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	At least four of 1) all personnel in charge of transporting pigs must be trained 2) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 3) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 4) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 5) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	All personnel in charge of transporting pigs must be trained; abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly; abattoirs must have appointed AWO who has completed a validated training course on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered; abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept; abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter

*Key criteria

Table A1.2: Scoring categories for pigs.

Criteria for pigs	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
GENETICS & BREEDING						
No breeds associated with increased incidence of health/welfare problems and requirement for breeds used in outdoor systems to be suitable for outdoor conditions*	No stipulations on permitted genetics	At least one of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems permitted 2) key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate/ production level must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 3) breeds that are less prone to tail biting must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or tail docking prohibited and tails are left intact) 4) in outdoor systems breeds must be chosen that are suited to outdoor conditions	At least two of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems permitted 2) key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate/ production level must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 3) breeds that are less prone to tail biting must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or tail docking prohibited and tails are left intact) 4) in outdoor systems breeds must be chosen that are suited to outdoor conditions	N/A	At least three of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems permitted 2) key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate/ production level must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 3) breeds that are less prone to tail biting must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or tail docking prohibited and tails are left intact) 4) in outdoor systems breeds must be chosen that are suited to outdoor conditions	Only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems permitted and key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate/ production level must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary; breeds that are less prone to tail biting must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or tail docking prohibited and tails are left intact); in outdoor systems breeds must be chosen that are suited to outdoor conditions
High welfare standards for breeding boars	See Table A1.4					
AUDITING						
Frequent inspections by certifying body	Inspections may be less frequent than every 24 months	Inspections at least every 24 months on average for all members	Inspections at least every 18 months on average for all members OR Inspections every 12 months initially and then up to 24 months with frequency determined by previous performance	Inspections at least every 15 months on average for all members OR Inspections every 6 months initially and then up to 24 months with frequency determined by previous performance	Inspections at least every 12 months on average for all members OR Inspections every 6 months initially and then up to 18 months with frequency determined by previous performance	Inspections every 6 months initially and then up to 12 months with frequency determined by previous performance
Targeted unannounced spot checks	No spot checks	Spot checks for less than 10% of members annually (or proportion not specified); not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for less than 10% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced OR Spot checks for 10% of members annually but not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for 10% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced OR Spot checks for 20% of members annually but not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for 20% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced OR Spot checks for 30% of members annually but not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for 30% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced

*Key criteria

Table A1.2: Scoring categories for pigs.

Criteria for pigs	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set*	No assessment of welfare outcomes and no stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future	No assessment of welfare outcomes but stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future OR Informal observations of one or two welfare outcomes (e.g. injuries) during routine inspections but no formal recording of welfare outcomes and no targets set OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure records are being maintained	System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place but no targets set OR System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted and producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and either 1) farm-specific targets set by producers or 2) moderate (or unspecified) targets set by assurance scheme	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and stringent targets set by assurance scheme for all farms
Stringent measures to address non-compliance	No requirement to correct minor non-compliances	N/A	N/A	All non-compliances must be corrected but no defined timescale for correction; certification may be suspended or withdrawn for a serious non-compliance or multiple and/or repeated minor non-compliances	N/A	All non-compliances must be corrected within agreed timescale; certification may be suspended or withdrawn for a serious non-compliance or multiple and/or repeated minor non-compliances

*Key criteria

APPENDIX 1C

PIGS

APPENDIX 1C: FULL RESULTS TABLE FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR BREEDING BOARS

Table A1.3: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for breeding boars.

A maximum of 5 points is available for each criterion. Overall scores are converted to a score out of 5 and incorporated into the overall scoring of standards for pigs (see **Table A1.1**).

Specific criteria for breeding boars	Assured British Pigs (ABP)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Adequate space allowance when housed	1 (minimum total area of 6m ² per boar)	1 (minimum total area of 6m ² per boar)	2 (minimum total area of 7.5m ² per boar)	5 (minimum 6m ² indoor area plus 8m ² outdoor exercise area per boar, i.e. minimum total area of 14m ²)	5 (minimum 6m ² indoor area plus 8m ² outdoor exercise area per boar, i.e. minimum total area of 14m ²)
Appropriate flooring	0 (fully-slatted floors permitted)	0 (fully-slatted floors permitted)	4 (fully-slatted floors prohibited and bedded lying area required)	4 (fully-slatted floors prohibited and bedded lying area required)	4 (fully-slatted floors prohibited and bedded lying area required)
Provision of natural enrichment material/ bedding	0 (non-natural materials, e.g. footballs or plastic pipes, may be accepted as satisfactory enrichment; no requirement for bedding)	0 (non-natural materials may be accepted as satisfactory enrichment; no requirement for bedding)	5 (pigs must be provided with a bedded lying area and substrate for foraging which must either be topped up at least every 3 days or feed pellets broadcast over entire pen at least once per week)	5 (pigs must be provided with a bedded lying area and access to substrate for rooting when housed)	5 (pigs must be provided with a bedded lying area and access to substrate for rooting when housed)
Free range access	0 (permanent indoor housing permitted)	0 (permanent indoor housing permitted)	0 (permanent indoor housing permitted)	5 (access to pasture required except in extreme weather conditions when pigs may be housed with access to an outdoor run with substrate for rooting)	5 (access to pasture required except in extreme weather conditions when pigs may be housed with access to an outdoor run with substrate for rooting)
No tail docking	0 (permitted, no requirement for anaesthesia/ analgesia)	0 (permitted, no requirement for anaesthesia/ analgesia)	1 (only permitted in exceptional circumstances; request must be submitted in writing with details of actions taken to try to alleviate problem; must be reviewed quarterly; no requirement for anaesthesia/analgesia)	5 (prohibited)	5 (prohibited)
No teeth reduction	0 (clipping or grinding permitted)	0 (clipping or grinding permitted)	1 (clipping or grinding permitted; request must be submitted in writing with reasons; grinding strongly recommended as alternative to clipping)	5 (prohibited)	5 (prohibited)
No nose ringing	0 (permitted)	0 (permitted)	1 (only permitted in exceptional circumstances; request must be submitted in writing; must be reviewed quarterly)	5 (prohibited)	5 (prohibited)
No tusk trimming	0 (permitted)	0 (permitted)	0 (permitted)	5 (prohibited)	5 (prohibited)
Provision of adequate high-fibre feed to satisfy hunger and minimise health problems	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	1 (not specified but foraging substrate and bedding must be provided for all pigs)	5 (restricted feeding practices are not permitted; daily ration must include roughage, fresh or dried fodder or silage; pigs must have access to pasture/rooting substrate and bedding must be provided for all pigs)	5 (daily ration must include roughage, fresh or dried fodder or silage; pigs must have access to growing green food/rooting substrate and bedding must be provided for all pigs)

Table A1.3: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for breeding boars.

Specific criteria for breeding boars	Assured British Pigs (ABP)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Regular veterinary visits and veterinary health plan with targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits	3 (must have quarterly vet visits with report made available to certifying body; herd performance data must be monitored for signs of disease or production disorders but no requirement for targets; must have written veterinary health plan updated regularly; remedial action must be taken to resolve adverse findings in the quarterly vet report or when mortality levels increase)	2 (must have vet visits every 3 months, with report sent to certifying body; must have written health and welfare plan updated regularly; no requirement to monitor health and welfare indicators or to set targets)	4 (must have quarterly vet visits resulting in a farm-specific report; herd performance data must be continually monitored for signs of disease or production disorders; the condition of the feet must be regularly inspected; must have veterinary health plan updated regularly; includes targets for a range of parameters; remedial action must be taken if parameters fall below tolerance limits)	1 (no requirement for regular veterinary visits; must have animal health plan submitted for approval and updated regularly; no requirement to monitor health and welfare indicators or to set targets)	1 (no requirement for regular veterinary visits; must have animal health plan submitted for approval and reviewed regularly; no requirement to monitor health and welfare indicators or to set targets)
Short transport duration	0 (journeys over 8 hours permitted – no upper limit beyond legal requirements)	0 (journeys over 8 hours permitted – no upper limit beyond legal requirements)	4 (pigs must not be transported for more than 8 hours from loading of the first animal to unloading of the last animal)	4 (pigs must not be transported for more than 8 hours from loading of the first animal to unloading of the last animal, excluding sea journeys between the Scottish mainland and remote islands)	4 (pigs must not be transported for more than 8 hours, from the start of loading to the end of unloading, except with permission)
Requirement for good handling systems in gas stun/kill systems (with wide races allowing pigs to be moved and stunned in groups) and no use of carbon dioxide	0 (high concentration of CO ₂ permitted and no requirement for wide races and handling/ stunning in groups)	0 (high concentration of CO ₂ permitted and no requirement for wide races and handling/ stunning in groups)	0 (high concentration of CO ₂ permitted and no requirement for wide races and handling/ stunning in groups)	0 (high concentration of CO ₂ permitted following inspection & approval of system but criteria for approval not specified; no requirement for wide races and handling/ stunning in groups)	3 (high concentration of CO ₂ permitted following inspection & approval of system on the basis that welfare overall is improved, i.e. through good handling systems)
Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death	4 (all pigs must be stunned; minimum output current specified for electrical stunning equipment; AWO must check regularly and record that pigs are rendered unconscious; stun-stick interval must not exceed 15 seconds following electrical stunning; bleeding method not specified; minimum recommended bleed time 1.5 minutes and should be seen to be effective)	1 (all pigs must be stunned; electrical parameters specified in terms of voltage, frequency and duration; monitoring of stunning, stun-stick interval, bleeding method and minimum bleed time not specified)	5 (all pigs must be stunned; electrical parameters specified in terms of current and duration; the AWO must make frequent and thorough checks throughout the day to ensure that animals are being effectively stunned and are insensible throughout the slaughter operation; effectiveness of stunning must be monitored and recorded at the start of stunning and at least every 2 hours after that with at least 10 animals checked each time; sticking must be immediate with maximum stun-stick interval of 15 seconds; bleeding must be with a chest/ thoracic stick; minimum bleed time 20 seconds)	2 (all pigs must be stunned; maximum stun-stick interval 60 seconds; bleeding must be with a chest/ thoracic stick; minimum bleed time 20 seconds; electrical parameters and monitoring of stunning not specified)	4 (all pigs must be stunned; if stunning is automated a trained and licensed operator must be present at all times to check the stun/kill operation; sticking must be immediate; bleeding must be with a chest/thoracic stick; minimum bleed time 20 seconds; electrical parameters not specified)

Table A1.3: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for breeding boars.

Specific criteria for breeding boars	Assured British Pigs (ABP)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
No breeds associated with increased incidence of health/ welfare problems and requirement for breeds used in outdoor systems to be suitable for outdoor conditions	1 (no restriction on permitted breeds but in outdoor systems breeding stock must be of a type that is bred for outdoor production; health must be monitored but no requirement to change genetics if parameters not within acceptable limits; no requirement to use breeds that are less prone to tail biting)	1 (no restriction on permitted breeds but, in accordance with welfare code, stock for outdoor production must be suitable for outdoor conditions; no requirement to use breeds that are less prone to tail biting)	1 (no restriction on permitted breeds but monitoring of key health and welfare parameters required and when health or welfare problems arise, consideration should be given to whether genetics may be a contributory factor and whether changes to the unit's policy on genetics would be beneficial; no requirement for breeds used in outdoor systems to be suitable for outdoor conditions; no requirement to use breeds that are less prone to tail biting)	4 (breeds must be chosen to avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production, e.g. porcine stress syndrome, PSE syndrome, but no requirement to demonstrate that key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate/ production level are within acceptable limits; choice of breeds must take account of the capacity of the animals to adapt to local conditions and their vitality and resistance to disease; tail docking prohibited)	4 (breeds must be chosen to avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production but no requirement to demonstrate that key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate/ production level are within acceptable limits; breeds must be chosen that can adapt to the organic system and local conditions and that have vitality and resistance to disease; tail docking prohibited)
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set	1 (guidance notes state that inspectors should look for evidence of tail, flank or ear biting, shoulder sores or fighting which goes beyond normal behaviour; where such injuries or behaviour are observed, inspectors should check that a documented action plan is available and being implemented; no targets set)	2 (QMS is piloting assessment of welfare outcomes based on Qualitative Behaviour Assessment (QBA) developed by the Scottish Agricultural College (SAC); in the longer term some BWAP measures may also be incorporated)	3 (RSPCA has developed a system of assessment of welfare outcomes and is working with other standard setters and Bristol University to further develop outcome measures; assessments of welfare outcomes on breeding pig farms are not yet underway; producers set themselves targets and intervention levels in VHP; checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met)	0 (no assessment of welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	3 (SA has a programme of assessments based on the Bristol Welfare Assurance Programme (BWAP); observations for pigs are thin (BCS <2), fat (BCS >4) (sows only), skin lesions, lameness, dirtiness (excluding from wallowing in mud); behaviour – abnormal oral behaviour, playing; no targets set for pigs yet but plan to introduce targets)
Total for breeding boar criteria	10/75	7/75	32/75	55/75	63/75
Welfare score for breeding boars carried over to Table A1.1	1/5	0/5	2/5	4/5	4/5

APPENDIX 1D

PIGS

APPENDIX 1D: SCORING CATEGORIES FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR BREEDING BOARS

Table A1.4: Scoring categories for breeding boars.

Criteria for breeding boars	Score 0	Score 1	Score 2	Score 3	Score 4	Score 5
Adequate space allowance when housed	Minimum total area may be less than 6m ² /boar	Minimum total area of at least 6m ² /boar	Minimum total area of at least 7m ² /boar	Minimum total area of at least 8m ² /boar	Minimum total area of at least 10m ² /boar	Minimum total area of at least 14m ² /boar
Appropriate flooring	Fully-slatted floors permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	Fully-slatted floors prohibited (or bedded lying area required)	Flooring must be entirely solid
Provision of natural enrichment material/ bedding	Non-natural materials permitted as only enrichment (e.g. ropes, footballs)	N/A	Natural material required for enrichment but small quantities permitted (i.e. not sufficient to act as bedding)	N/A	Natural material required for enrichment sufficient to act as bedding but no requirement to add new material regularly or to provide additional enrichment	Natural material required for enrichment sufficient to act as bedding and either 1) new material must be added regularly or 2) pigs must also have access to substrate for rooting
Free range access	Permanent indoor housing permitted	Boars must have access to an outdoor run throughout life but not necessarily access to pasture or woodland	N/A	N/A	N/A	Boars must have access to pasture or woodland throughout their life (except that they may be housed temporarily in extreme weather conditions or if required by law due to a disease outbreak)
No tail docking	Tail docking permitted and no requirement for anaesthesia/ analgesia	Tail docking permitted only with justification and written permission from the scheme	N/A	Tail docking permitted only in exceptional circumstances with written permission from the scheme each time and anaesthesia/ analgesia must be used	N/A	Tail docking prohibited
No teeth reduction	Teeth reduction permitted by clipping or grinding and no requirement for anaesthesia/ analgesia	Teeth reduction permitted only with justification and written permission from the scheme	N/A	Teeth reduction permitted only in exceptional circumstances with written permission from the scheme each time and only by grinding and only the tip must be removed, avoiding exposure of the pulp cavity	N/A	Teeth reduction prohibited
No nose ringing	Nose ringing permitted and no requirement for anaesthesia/ analgesia	Nose ringing permitted only in exceptional circumstances with justification and written permission from the scheme	N/A	N/A	N/A	Nose ringing prohibited
No tusk trimming	Tusk trimming permitted and no requirement for anaesthesia/ analgesia	Tusk trimming permitted only in exceptional circumstances with justification and written permission from the scheme	N/A	N/A	N/A	Tusk trimming prohibited

Table A1.4: Scoring categories for breeding boars.

Criteria for breeding boars	Score 0	Score 1	Score 2	Score 3	Score 4	Score 5
Provision of adequate high-fibre feed to satisfy hunger and minimise health problems	N/A	Boars must be provided with high-fibre feed in addition to high-energy feed	N/A	No specific stipulations but natural material for foraging/ rooting and bedding required	N/A	Natural material for foraging/ rooting and bedding required and either 1) pigs must have permanent access to roughage and/or grazing, or 2) restricted feeding prohibited
Regular veterinary visits and veterinary health plan with targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits	No requirement for VHP, regular veterinary visits or monitoring of health and welfare and performance parameters	Must have VHP but no requirement for monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters or regular veterinary visits	Must have VHP and one of 1) monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters or 2) regular veterinary visits	Must have VHP and two of 1) monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters 2) moderate or unspecified targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits 3) regular veterinary visits	Must have VHP, regular veterinary visits and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with moderate or unspecified targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits	Must have VHP, regular veterinary visits and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with stringent targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits
Short transport duration	Journeys over 12 hours including loading and unloading permitted	N/A	N/A	12 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 12 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)	8 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 8 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)	4 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 4 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)
Requirement for good handling systems in gas stun/ kill systems (with wide races allowing pigs to be moved and stunned in groups) and no use of carbon dioxide	High concentration of CO ₂ (above 30%) permitted and no requirement for good handling systems	N/A	N/A	N/A	High concentration of CO ₂ (above 30%) prohibited and good handling systems required	Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited and good handling systems required
Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death	Slaughter without stunning permitted and/ or no clear specifications for stunning parameters, no requirement for monitoring of effectiveness of stunning, maximum stun-stick interval may be greater than 15 seconds, no requirement to use chest/ thoracic stick and minimum bleed time may be less than 20 seconds	All pigs must be stunned and one of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) immediate sticking with maximum stun-stick interval of 15 seconds 4) chest/thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 20 seconds	All pigs must be stunned and two of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) immediate sticking with maximum stun-stick interval of 15 seconds 4) chest/thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 20 seconds	All pigs must be stunned and three of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) immediate sticking with maximum stun-stick interval of 15 seconds 4) chest/thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 20 seconds	All pigs must be stunned and four of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) immediate sticking with maximum stun-stick interval of 15 seconds 4) chest/thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 20 seconds	All pigs must be stunned; clear specifications for stunning parameters to ensure effective stun; monitoring of effectiveness of stunning required; immediate sticking required with maximum stun-stick interval of 15 seconds; chest/ thoracic stick must be used; minimum bleed time 20 seconds

Table A1.4: Scoring categories for breeding boars.

Criteria for breeding boars	Score 0	Score 1	Score 2	Score 3	Score 4	Score 5
No breeds associated with increased incidence of health/ welfare problems and requirement for breeds used in outdoor systems to be suitable for outdoor conditions	No stipulations on permitted genetics	At least one of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems permitted 2) key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate/ production level must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 3) breeds that are less prone to tail biting must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or tail docking prohibited and tails are left intact) 4) in outdoor systems breeds must be chosen that are suited to outdoor conditions	At least two of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems permitted 2) key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate/ production level must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 3) breeds that are less prone to tail biting must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or tail docking prohibited and tails are left intact) 4) in outdoor systems breeds must be chosen that are suited to outdoor conditions	N/A	At least three of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems permitted 2) key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate/ production level must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 3) breeds that are less prone to tail biting must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or tail docking prohibited and tails are left intact) 4) in outdoor systems breeds must be chosen that are suited to outdoor conditions	Only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems permitted and key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate/ production level must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary; breeds that are less prone to tail biting must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or tail docking prohibited and tails are left intact); in outdoor systems breeds must be chosen that are suited to outdoor conditions
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set	No assessment of welfare outcomes and no stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future	No assessment of welfare outcomes but stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future OR Informal observations of one or two welfare outcomes (e.g. injuries) during routine inspections but no formal recording of welfare outcomes and no targets set OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure records are being maintained	System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place but no targets set OR System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted and producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and either 1) farm-specific targets set by producers or 2) moderate (or unspecified) targets set by assurance scheme	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and stringent targets set by assurance scheme for all farms

APPENDIX 2A

DAIRY CATTLE

APPENDIX 2A: FULL RESULTS TABLE FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR DAIRY CATTLE

Table A2.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for dairy cattle.

Up to 5 points are available for each criterion. Key criteria (marked with an asterisk) are weighted so that they are worth double points (i.e. up to 10 points for each key criterion). Score for breeding bull welfare is derived from **Table A2.3**. Criteria are grouped into five sets. Totals for each set of criteria are converted to scores out of 20, which are totalled to give an overall score out of 100 for each scheme (see **Table 3.2**)

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for dairy cattle	Assured Dairy Farms (ADF)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
ENVIRONMENT					
No close confinement	No tethering*	0 (cattle may be tied in cowsheds provided they are allowed untethered exercise daily)	10 (the use of housing systems in which cattle are tethered for the whole or part of the housing period is prohibited)	10 (prolonged routine tethering prohibited)	10 (routine tethering over long periods prohibited)
Adequate space allowance when housed	Adequate space allowance when housed*	4 (in loose housing, guideline area 5.58m ² total with 4.25m ² bedded for 500kg animal, 6.8m ² total with 5m ² bedded for 600kg animal, 7.75m ² total with 5.75m ² bedded for 700kg animal; if cubicles are used there must be at least one per cow unless access to adjacent loose housing, plus loafing area of at least 120% of cubicle lying area)	4 (in loose housing, minimum area 8m ² total with 5.5m ² bedded for <500kg animal, 8.5m ² total with 6m ² bedded for <600kg animal, 9m ² total with 6.5m ² bedded for <700kg animal, 10m ² total with 7m ² bedded for <800kg animal; if cubicles are used must be at least one per cow and preferably 10-20% more and there must be a minimum of 3m ² /head loafing area)	8 (minimum lying/indoor area 6m ² /head plus additional 4.5m ² /head exercise area excluding pasturage, i.e. minimum of at least 10.5m ² per cow; if cubicles are used the number of cubicles must exceed the number of cows by at least 5%)	8 (minimum lying/indoor area 6m ² /head for cattle up to 600kg, or 1m ² /100kg for cattle over 600kg, plus additional 4.5m ² /head exercise area excluding pasturage, i.e. minimum of at least 10.5m ² per cow; if cubicles are used, cattle must have free access to them, access to an adequate lungeing area and there must be 5% more cubicles than cows)
Appropriate housing design	Appropriate flooring	2 (lying areas for young calves, in-calf cows and milking cows must not be slatted; non-slatted lying area recommended but not required for other cattle such as older calves and heifers)	4 (fully-slatted floors not specifically prohibited but bedded lying area must be provided)	4 (fully-slatted floors prohibited and bedded lying area required)	4 (fully-slatted floors prohibited – maximum 50% slatted – and bedded lying area required)
Provision of appropriate bedding/ litter/ enrichment material	Provision of bedding*	8 (lying areas in cubicles and loose housing must have adequate bedding)	10 (adequate bedding must be provided; recommends minimum 50mm straw or woodshavings, or cow mats with thin layer of bedding; must be topped up at least 3 times per week)	10 (cows must be provided with ample dry bedding in the lying area; cows should be housed in well-bedded yards or, where cubicles are used, they must be comfortably bedded at all times, preferably over mats or other soft coverings if the base is concrete)	10 (cows must be provided with ample dry bedding in the lying area; where concrete-based cubicles are used, rubber mats or other cushioned materials and an additional layer of bedding should be used, otherwise a substantial layer of bedding must be provided)
Provision of appropriate nesting facilities	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A

*Key criteria

Table A2.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for dairy cattle.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for dairy cattle	Assured Dairy Farms (ADF)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Appropriate lighting	Appropriate light intensity and light/dark periods	1 (lighting must be adequate to allow inspection and normal behaviour; must be adequate to meet animals' ethological needs and must have appropriate period of rest from artificial lighting in accordance with legislation)	4 (access to natural daylight during grazing season; natural daylight or minimum 200 lux during the normal period of daylight hours when housed; a period of low lighting must be provided to promote resting)	5 (access to natural daylight throughout the year – must have access to outdoor exercise area when housed unless shed is open-fronted)	3 (access to natural daylight during grazing season; when housed over winter, exercise area may be inside and suitable lighting must be provided but duration and intensity not specified; must be adequate to meet animals ethological needs and must have appropriate period of rest from artificial lighting in accordance with legislation)
Free range access	Free range access*	0 (permanent indoor housing permitted; no requirement for outdoor exercise area)	4 (housing cows all year round is prohibited; cows must have access to grazing for at least 4 hours per day during the grazing season, weather permitting, except during the first 8 weeks of lactation with permission; no requirement for outdoor exercise area outside of the grazing season)	10 (cattle must be at grass when conditions permit but may be housed over the winter; when housed, must have outdoor exercise area unless shed is open-fronted in which case, with approval, exercise area can be indoors)	8 (cattle must graze fresh forage throughout the grazing season; exercise area when housed may be inside or outside)
Adequate outdoor space	Low outdoor stocking density	0 (not specified)	1 (where pasture is only used to give the animals exercise stocking density must not exceed 20 cows/acre and recommends 10-12 cows/acre)	5 (outdoor stocking density must be low enough to prevent poaching of the soil and over grazing of vegetation at all times of year)	5 (total grazing area must be at least 0.27 ha (0.66 acres) per cow per grazing season, which can be part of a grazing rotation)
Appropriate shelter/ shade and protection from predators	Provision of shelter and shade for outdoor cattle	3 (out-wintered cattle must have access to a sheltered well-drained lying area)	5 (in summer cows must have access to a shaded area; if buildings are partially roofed they must provide effective shelter from the wind and a dry comfortable lying area)	5 (free range and open air exercise areas must provide sufficient protection against rain, wind, sun and extreme temperatures depending on local weather conditions and breed)	5 (stock must be provided with sufficient protection against rain, wind, sun and extreme temperatures depending on local conditions and breed)
Appropriate social grouping	Small, stable and appropriate social groups	0 (cattle should be grouped according to size, age and/or production status, except for cow-calf groupings)	0 (not specified)	2 (cows must be kept in reasonably stable groups; steps must be taken to reduce stress during transport, including avoiding mixing of animals from different social groups)	2 (when housed, cattle must be kept with animals of a similar size to reduce the risk of bullying; mixing of animals from different social groups for transport must be avoided)
	No individual housing of calves	2 (individual housing permitted up to 8 weeks; calves must have visual contact with other calves)	2 (individual housing permitted up to 8 weeks; calves must be able to see, smell and hear other calves)	4 (individual housing permitted up to 7 days provided calves can see and hear other calves)	4 (individual housing permitted up to 7 days provided calves can see and hear other calves, and beyond 7 days only with permission, e.g. on animal welfare grounds; calves must not be sold into non-welfare friendly or intensive systems; rearing of calves with their dam or a nurse cow is recommended but not required)

*Key criteria

Table A2.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for dairy cattle.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for dairy cattle	Assured Dairy Farms (ADF)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
HUSBANDRY					
No mutilations	No dehorning/ disbudding*	0 (disbudding permitted by chemical cauterisation without anaesthetic during first week of life or by hot iron with local anaesthetic; dehorning permitted; after 5 months dehorning must be performed by a vet)	6 (disbudding only permitted with hot iron and local anaesthetic; dehorning only permitted when carried out by a vet and must not be routine)	2 (disbudding and dehorning permitted with justification in accordance with legislation/ welfare code but not specifically stated whether anaesthetic and/or pain relief must be used)	2 (disbudding permitted in accordance with legislation/ welfare code but not specifically stated whether anaesthetic and/or pain relief must be used; must justify the need for disbudding in animal health plan)
	No castration of male calves	0 (castration permitted; no requirement to use anaesthetic up to 2 months of age)	0 (castration permitted; no requirement to use anaesthetic up to 2 months of age)	1 (castration permitted with justification in accordance with legislation/ welfare code but not specifically stated whether anaesthetic and/or pain relief must be used)	1 (castration permitted in accordance with legislation/welfare code but not specifically stated whether anaesthetic and/or pain relief must be used; must justify the need for castration in animal health plan)
No use of genetic engineering/ cloning or invasive reproductive technologies associated with health or welfare problems	No use of genetically modified or cloned animals or their offspring	0 (not specified)	5 (the use of genetically modified and/or cloned animals and their offspring is prohibited)	4 (livestock must not be brought in that have been produced using transgenic or other genetic engineering techniques; cloning is effectively prohibited by prohibitions on breeding practices that make livestock systems over-reliant on inappropriate technology and any surgical or chemical interference other than procedures specifically permitted in the standards, but no restriction on the use of offspring)	4 (livestock must not be brought in that have been produced using transgenic or other genetic engineering techniques; use of cloning is prohibited but no restriction on the use of offspring)
	No embryo transfer	0 (permitted)	2 (embryo transfer only permitted in exceptional circumstances with written permission from the scheme)	5 (prohibited)	5 (prohibited)
Appropriate feeding	Provision of adequate high-fibre feed to avoid increased risk of health problems*	0 (no stipulations regarding feeding of fibre)	6 (cattle must be provided with fibre to allow them to ruminate, which must be of such quality and length as to help avoid acidosis; cattle must have access to grass during the grass-growing season)	10 (after weaning at least 60% on a daily dry matter basis of the cattle's diet must consist of fresh or dried fodder, roughage or silage; cattle must have access to pasture during the grazing season)	10 (after weaning at least 60% on a daily dry matter basis of the cattle's diet must consist of fresh or dried fodder, roughage or silage; feed rations that are high in energy and low in fibre or those that contain over 40% concentrates as dry matter percentage of the total diet are not permitted; cattle must graze fresh forage throughout the grazing season)
	Provision of adequate iron and roughage for calves	1 (the diet must provide adequate iron and fibre from 8 days of age in accordance with legislation; fresh, clean, palatable dry feed must be provided from 8 days of age)	3 (unweaned calves must have unlimited access to grass or palatable dried feed and roughage from at least day 8; calves must be fed a wholesome diet which includes iron and must prevent anaemia and maintain minimum blood haemoglobin of 9g/dl (around 5.5mmol/l))	3 (the keeping of animals in conditions or on a diet which may encourage anaemia is prohibited)	3 (if calves are housed they must have access to good quality straw, hay or silage)

*Key criteria

Table A2.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for dairy cattle.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for dairy cattle	Assured Dairy Farms (ADF)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Appropriate weaning age	Appropriate weaning age*	2 (minimum 5 weeks)	4 (minimum 5 weeks and must be eating at least 1kg calf starter per day)	10 (minimum 3 months)	10 (minimum 12 weeks)
Adequate monitoring of health and welfare by producers	Regular veterinary visits and veterinary health plan with targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits*	4 (no requirement for regular vet visits; must have written herd health plan reviewed annually; herd health and performance must be monitored, including lameness, mastitis, fertility, reproductive disorders, calving problems, metabolic disorders, calf diseases and other diseases; the setting of targets is strongly encouraged but not required)	8 (must have at least 2 vet visits per year, at least 5 months apart; herd performance must be continually monitored, including production diseases, infectious diseases and injuries; the feet of all cattle must be inspected at least annually by a competent foot trimmer; must have veterinary health plan updated regularly; remedial action must be taken if parameters fall below tolerance limits)	2 (no requirement for regular veterinary visits; must have animal health plan submitted for approval and updated regularly, which includes mastitis control strategy and foot care but no requirement to monitor health and welfare indicators or to set targets)	2 (no requirement for regular veterinary visits; must have animal health plan submitted for approval and reviewed regularly, which includes mastitis control strategy but no requirement to monitor health and welfare indicators or to set targets)
STOCKMANSHIP, HANDLING, TRANSPORT & SLAUGHTER					
Appropriate handling	No use of electric goods	1 (prohibited on farm; permitted by haulage and abattoir standards)	5 (prohibited)	5 (prohibited)	5 (prohibited)
Promotion of high quality stockmanship	Requirement for stockpeople to be trained/ competent/ experienced	2 (there must be sufficient people available who are competent based on experience and/or training; records of training, qualifications and experience must be kept; staff must be able to demonstrate competence before being given responsibility for the welfare of stock)	3 (all managers and stockpeople must be thoroughly trained, skilled and competent in animal husbandry and welfare; managers must develop a training programme for stockpeople with regular updates and keep records of training; stockpeople must be given appropriate training before being given responsibility for the welfare of stock and must be able to demonstrate competence)	2 (in accordance with legislation, animals must be cared for by a sufficient number of competent staff; no requirement to provide training in animal welfare or to keep records of training)	2 (in accordance with legislation, animals must be cared for by a sufficient number of competent staff; no requirement to provide training in animal welfare or to keep records of training)
Frequent checks for signs of illness, injury or distress	Frequent checks for signs of illness, injury or distress	5 (all dairy cattle must be inspected at least once daily and housed cattle, lactating cows and those close to calving at least twice daily)	4 (when cattle are housed they must be inspected at least twice per day)	3 (not specified but frequency of inspection must be noted in animal health plan which must be submitted to SFQC for approval; must comply with legislation and welfare code – at least once daily in systems where welfare depends on frequent human attention and sufficiently to avoid suffering in other systems)	3 (not specified but must comply with legislation and welfare code – at least once daily in systems where welfare depends on frequent human attention and sufficiently to avoid suffering in other systems)

*Key criteria

Table A2.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for dairy cattle.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for dairy cattle	Assured Dairy Farms (ADF)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Short transport duration	Short transport duration*	0 (no limit on journey duration beyond legal requirements)	8 (cattle including calves must not be transported for more than 8 hours, from loading of the first animal to unloading of the last animal)	8 (cattle must not be transported for more than 8 hours from loading of the first animal to unloading of the last animal, excluding sea journeys between the Scottish mainland and remote islands)	8 (cattle must not be transported for more than 8 hours from the start of loading to the end of unloading, except with permission)
No live export	No live export of cattle for slaughter or of calves to be reared for veal*	0 (live export of cattle and calves permitted)	8 (live export of cattle for slaughter not specifically prohibited but will be restricted by 8 hour journey limit; calves must not be exported live from the UK, either directly or via a third party)	6 (live export not specifically prohibited but will be restricted by 8 hour journey limit)	10 (cattle must not be exported for slaughter; calves under 1 month old must not be sold abroad and calves must not be sold into non-welfare friendly or intensive systems)
No use of livestock markets	No use of livestock markets	0 (cattle and calves may be sold through livestock markets except where prohibited by legislation)	3 (cattle must not be presented for sale at livestock markets but calves may be sold through markets provided they are not sold for export)	3 (calves under 6 months old and cattle within 16 weeks of calving must not be purchased, collected or sold through livestock markets)	3 (calves under 12 weeks old without their dam and cattle over 6 months in calf must not be sold through livestock markets)
Humane slaughter	Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death*	4 (all cattle must be stunned; stun-stick interval must not exceed 60 seconds for penetrative captive bolt, 30 seconds for non-penetrative captive bolt and 10 seconds for electrical head-only stunning; monitoring of stunning and sticking method not specified; minimum bleed time 30 seconds)	10 (all cattle must be stunned; electrical parameters specified in terms of current, frequency and duration; the AWO must make frequent and thorough checks throughout the day to ensure that animals are being effectively stunned and are insensible throughout the slaughter operation; stun-stick interval must not exceed 60 seconds; bleeding must be with a chest stick; minimum bleed time 30 seconds)	6 (all cattle must be stunned; maximum stun-stick interval 60 seconds; bleeding must be with a chest/ thoracic stick; minimum bleed time 30 seconds; electrical parameters and monitoring of stunning not specified)	8 (all cattle must be stunned; if stunning is automated a trained and licensed operator must be present at all times to check the stun/kill operation; stun-stick interval must be less than 60 seconds; bleeding must be with a chest/thoracic stick; minimum bleed time 30 seconds; electrical parameters not specified)
Promotion of high welfare standards in the handling of animals during transport and slaughter	Animal welfare policy and CCTV at abattoir and requirement for people involved in transporting and slaughtering of animals to be trained/ competent/ experienced	4 (haulage scheme requires that all drivers must be trained and records kept; producers may also transport their own stock; abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly; there must be a trained AWO on duty at all times during operational hours who must have undertaken an external training course; all persons involved in the handling of livestock must be suitably trained – ideally all staff should have completed an AWO training course or can be trained under the instruction of the AWO; records of training must be kept; no requirement for CCTV)	4 (personnel in charge of cattle transporters must have completed an approved training course; abattoirs must have a written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly; there must be at least one appointed AWO who must have attended a validated training programme and must be present on site at all times whilst slaughter is being carried out; there must be a training programme for all staff which includes use of HSA training video; installation of CCTV in abattoirs is not currently required but will be introduced from Nov 2011)	2 (no stipulations on training of drivers beyond legal requirements; abattoirs must have a training programme that includes animal welfare; records of training for all staff must be kept; there must be a nominated person who is responsible for animal welfare and they must be trained and competent; a suitably trained and competent person must oversee the unloading of every animal including those arriving out-of-hours; no requirement for CCTV)	3 (no stipulations on training of drivers beyond legal requirements; abattoirs must have a documented quality management system which covers animal welfare and is reviewed regularly; must have a training programme that includes animal welfare and is ongoing with induction and refresher training, further training specific to the job and retraining when there are any problems or when new procedures are introduced; records of training for all operators must be kept; when there are live animals there must always be someone present who is responsible for animal welfare and they must be trained and competent – AWO or abattoir owner/operator; a suitably trained and competent person must oversee the unloading of every animal including those arriving out-of-hours; no requirement for CCTV)

*Key criteria

Table A2.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for dairy cattle.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for dairy cattle	Assured Dairy Farms (ADF)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
GENETICS & BREEDING					
No use of breeds associated with increased incidence of health/ welfare problems	No breeds associated with increased incidence of health/ welfare problems*	2 (no restriction on permitted breeds; health must be monitored but no requirement to change genetics if parameters not within acceptable limits; sires must be selected carefully, taking into account breed, size, age and previous record, to reduce the likelihood of birthing difficulties; no requirement to use polled breed or to breed for polling)	2 (no restriction on permitted breeds; key health and welfare parameters must be monitored but no requirement to change genetics if not within acceptable limits; stockpeople must be aware of welfare requirements during breeding, particularly the selection of suitable bulls, semen and embryos for use in heifers; and caesarean section must not be a routine procedure; no requirement to use polled breed or to breed for polling)	6 (breeds must be chosen to avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production and to avoid problems at birth, but no requirement to demonstrate that key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/ calving ease are within acceptable limits; choice of breeds must take account of the capacity of the animals to adapt to local conditions and their vitality and resistance to disease; no requirement to use polled breed or to breed for polling)	6 (breeds must be chosen to avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production and to avoid problems at birth, but no requirement to demonstrate that key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/ calving ease are within acceptable limits; breeds must be chosen that can adapt to the organic system and local conditions and that have vitality and resistance to disease; no requirement to use polled breed or to breed for polling)
High welfare standards for breeding animals	See Table A2.3 for scoring of breeding bull welfare	0	3	3	4
No killing of surplus male animals	No killing of male dairy calves	0 (no requirement to avoid killing male calves)	0 (no requirement to avoid killing male calves) but the scheme is planning to introduce this in the future	0 (no requirement to avoid killing male calves) but the scheme is planning to introduce this in the future	4 (must have a plan in place with a realistic end date to avoid killing healthy dairy calves)
AUDITING					
Frequent inspections	Frequent inspections by certifying body	2 (inspections at least every 18 months to allow visits at different times of year)	4 (inspections annually; time between inspections may be shorter or longer up to 15 months to allow visits at different times of year)	4 (inspections annually)	4 (inspections annually)
Spot-checks	Targeted unannounced spot-checks	1 (routine inspections are supplemented by some random spot checks at short notice)	5 (RSPCA monitor approx 35% of all members and 50% of monitoring visits are unannounced; all monitoring visits are made on a risk assessment basis following annual inspection – farms with non-compliances at assessment will receive a monitoring visit)	1 (spot checks are carried out as a routine part of verifying continuous compliance with the standards; may be unannounced; no information supplied to indicate that spot checks are targeted or the proportion of farms receiving spot checks; additional assessments are also carried out where a major change or deviation has been made from the approved farm plan)	3 (there is a programme of additional unannounced inspections over and above the annual visits; these target those who are considered to be higher risk or where specific risks have been identified, e.g. end of derogation periods, parallel production, following up complaints; around 10% of farms receive additional spot-checks or follow-up visits each year)

*Key criteria

Table A2.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for dairy cattle.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for dairy cattle	Assured Dairy Farms (ADF)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme	Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set*	0 (no assessment of welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	8 (RSPCA has developed a system of assessment of welfare outcomes and is working with other standard setters and Bristol University to further develop outcome measures; assessments of welfare outcomes on dairy farms have been underway for the past year; observations include lameness, lesions and positive/negative behaviour; producers set themselves targets and intervention levels in VHP; checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met)	0 (no assessment of welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	10 (SA has a programme of assessments based on the Bristol Welfare Assurance Programme (BWAP); observations for dairy cattle are thin (BCS <2), skin lesions, swollen hocks, lameness, dirtiness, behaviour – general; targets are set for each parameter)
Measures to address non-compliance	Stringent measures to address non-compliance	5 (all non-conformances must be corrected; a major non-conformance against one of the 'key standards' will result in suspension of certification until it is corrected; non-conformances against 'other standards' should not result in suspension provided they are corrected within an agreed timescale, normally within 28 days of the assessment; certification may also be suspended in the case of a large number of such non-conformances or in the event of the same non-conformance being found on successive assessment visits)	5 (all non-compliances must be corrected as soon as possible; certificates are withdrawn after 8 weeks if the Freedom Food certification panel has not received corrective actions and objective evidence to verify compliance; a producer who has their certificate withdrawn due to non-compliance at assessment has 3 unannounced visits by Freedom Food over the next 6 months to ensure compliance is being maintained)	5 (where welfare issues are identified during an inspection, the Certification Officer sets the member targets to be implemented or in extreme cases passes on to SFQC Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) for the SOPA scheme for a full set of new plans and targets to be drawn up; if the targets are not met within a specific timescale then the member is withdrawn from the SOPA scheme; in some cases a specific category of livestock may be de-certified)	5 (an action summary form is drawn up following inspection, listing non-compliances and asking how they will be corrected, with a deadline for return of the completed form; actions to correct non-compliances must be approved before a licence is issued or continued; an additional inspection may be carried out to make sure non-compliances have been corrected; non-compliance categorised as minor, major, critical or manifest infringement; certification will normally be suspended for part or whole of the enterprise in response to critical non-compliance or multiple or unresolved major non-compliance)

*Key criteria

APPENDIX 2B

DAIRY CATTLE

APPENDIX 2B: SCORING CATEGORIES FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR DAIRY CATTLE

Table A2.2: Scoring categories for dairy cattle.

Criteria for dairy cattle	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
ENVIRONMENT						
No tethering*	Routine prolonged tethering permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Routine prolonged tethering prohibited
Adequate space allowance when housed (minimum areas based on the system providing the least space and a cubicle is assumed to provide an area of around 3m²)*	Minimum total area may be less than 6m ² /cow	Minimum total area of at least 6m ² /cow; in cubicle systems, number of cows may exceed number of cubicles only if access to adjacent loose housing	Minimum total area of at least 6m ² /cow; if cubicles are used, must be at least as many cubicles as cows	Minimum total area of at least 8m ² /cow; if cubicles are used, must be at least as many cubicles as cows	Minimum total area of at least 10m ² /cow; if cubicles are used, must be 5% more cubicles than cows	Minimum total area of at least 10m ² /cow; use of cubicles prohibited
Appropriate flooring	Fully-slatted floors permitted	N/A	Fully-slatted floors prohibited (or bedded lying area required) for in-calf cows, lactating cows and young calves, but fully-slatted floors permitted for other cattle	N/A	Fully-slatted floors prohibited (or bedded lying area required) for all cattle	Floors must be entirely solid for all cattle
Provision of bedding*	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Bedding material required (minimum legal requirement for lactating cows)	Thick layer of bedding material required; where mats are used they must have an additional layer of bedding on top
Appropriate light intensity and light/dark periods	N/A	During daylight hours the level of natural or artificial lighting must be such that housed livestock can be seen clearly; there must be an appropriate period of rest from artificial lighting but no minimum dark period specified (minimum legal requirements)	No requirement for access to natural daylight; minimum 100 lux during daylight hours when housed	Access to natural daylight at least during grazing season; light intensity may be less than 100 lux during daylight hours when housed but must meet minimum legislative standards	Access to natural daylight at least during grazing season; minimum 100 lux during daylight hours when housed	Access to natural daylight throughout the year
Free range access*	Permanent indoor housing permitted	All cattle must have access to an outdoor exercise area but not necessarily pasture	All cattle must have access to pasture for at least a few hours each day during the grazing season but may be sufficient for exercise only	N/A	All cattle must be kept at pasture during the grazing season throughout their life, but may be housed over winter; no requirement for outdoor exercise area to be provided when housed	All cattle must be kept at pasture at least during the grazing season throughout their life, but may be housed over winter with access to an outdoor exercise area

*Key criteria

Table A2.2: Scoring categories for dairy cattle.

Criteria for dairy cattle	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Low outdoor stocking density	Outdoor stocking density may exceed 20 cows/ acre	Maximum 20 cows/ acre	Maximum 10 cows/ acre	Maximum 5 cows/ acre	Maximum 3 cows/ acre	Maximum 2 cows/ acre OR Outdoor stocking density must be low enough to prevent poaching of the soil and over grazing of vegetation
Provision of shelter and shade for outdoor cattle	No requirement for shelter or shade for outdoor cattle	N/A	N/A	Outdoor cattle must have access to a sheltered dry lying area but no requirement for adequate shade during summer	N/A	Adequate shelter required during winter and adequate shade required during summer
Small, stable and appropriate social groups	No requirement to group cattle appropriately (e.g. may be grouped by production status irrespective of size), to maintain stable groups, to limit group size or to avoid mixing of cattle from different social groups for transport	At least one of 1) cattle must be grouped according to size and age (except for cow-calf groups) 2) cattle must be kept in stable groups 3) group size limited to no more than 100 cattle when housed 4) mixing of cattle from different groups for transport must be avoided or groups for transport must be formed in time to allow them to stabilise prior to transport	At least two of 1) cattle must be grouped according to size and age (except for cow-calf groups) 2) cattle must be kept in stable groups 3) group size limited to no more than 100 cattle when housed 4) mixing of cattle from different groups for transport must be avoided or groups for transport must be formed in time to allow them to stabilise prior to transport	At least three of 1) cattle must be grouped according to size and age (except for cow-calf groups) 2) cattle must be kept in stable groups 3) group size limited to no more than 100 cattle when housed 4) mixing of cattle from different groups for transport must be avoided or groups for transport must be formed in time to allow them to stabilise prior to transport	When housed, cattle must be kept in stable groups of no more than 100 animals of similar size and age (except for cow-calf groups); cattle from different social groups must not be mixed for transport	When housed, cattle must be kept in stable groups of no more than 50 animals of similar size and age (except for cow-calf groups); cattle from different social groups must not be mixed for transport
No individual housing of calves	N/A	N/A	Individual housing permitted up to 8 weeks and calves must have visual contact with other calves (minimum legislative requirements)	Individual housing permitted up to 4 weeks and calves must have visual contact with other calves	Individual housing permitted up to 7 days and calves must have visual contact with other calves	Individual housing of calves prohibited (unless isolated temporarily on the advice of a vet due to illness); calves must be kept with their dam or a nurse cow; calves must not be sold into non-welfare-friendly or intensive systems
HUSBANDRY						
No dehorning/ disbudding*	Disbudding permitted during first week of life by chemical cauterisation without anaesthetic or by hot iron with anaesthetic; dehorning permitted with anaesthetic (minimum legal requirements)	Disbudding permitted only with justification	N/A	Disbudding permitted only with anaesthetic; dehorning prohibited or must only be carried out by a vet with anaesthetic and must not be routine	N/A	Disbudding and dehorning prohibited

*Key criteria

Table A2.2: Scoring categories for dairy cattle.

Criteria for dairy cattle	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
No castration	Castration permitted and no requirement for anaesthetic	Castration permitted only with justification	N/A	Castration permitted only with anaesthetic	N/A	Castration prohibited or permitted only with anaesthetic and only where cattle benefit from an extended life at pasture
No use of genetically modified or cloned animals or their offspring	No restriction on the use of genetically modified or cloned animals or their offspring	N/A	N/A	The use of genetically modified animals is prohibited but no restriction on the use of cloned animals or their offspring	The use of genetically modified and cloned animals is prohibited but no restriction on the use of clone offspring	The use of genetically modified and cloned animals and their offspring is prohibited
No embryo transfer	Embryo transfer permitted	N/A	Embryo transfer only permitted in exceptional circumstances with written permission from the scheme	N/A	N/A	Embryo transfer prohibited
Provision of adequate high-fibre feed to avoid increased risk of health problems*	No requirements regarding the feeding of fibre	N/A	Sufficient fibre must be available in all diets to reduce the risk of health problems but no specific stipulations regarding the quantity of roughage	Cattle must have access to pasture during the grazing season and sufficient roughage must be available in all diets to reduce the risk of health problems but no specific stipulations regarding the quantity of roughage	N/A	Cattle must have access to pasture during the grazing season and, after weaning, at least 60% on a daily dry matter basis of the cattle's diet must consist of fresh or dried fodder, roughage or silage
Provision of adequate iron and roughage for calves	N/A	There must be sufficient iron in the calves' diet to ensure a blood haemoglobin level of at least 4.5 mmol/l; from 2 weeks of age calves must be provided with a minimum of 100g fibrous food daily, rising to 250g for calves 8 to 20 weeks of age (minimum legislative requirements)	There must be sufficient iron in the calves' diet to ensure a blood haemoglobin level of at least 5.5 mmol/l; from 2 weeks of age calves must be provided with a minimum of 200g fibrous food daily, rising to 500g from 15 weeks	There must be sufficient iron in the calves' diet to ensure a blood haemoglobin level of at least 5.5 mmol/l; from 2 weeks of age calves must have free access to grass or other roughage	There must be sufficient iron in the calves' diet to ensure a blood haemoglobin level of 7 mmol/l; from 2 weeks of age calves must have free access to grass or other roughage	The calves' diets must contain at least 50mg iron per kg; from 2 weeks of age all calves must have free access to grass or other roughage
Appropriate weaning age*	Minimum weaning age less than 5 weeks	Minimum weaning age 5 weeks but no requirement to ensure eating enough solid food	Minimum weaning age 5 weeks and only if eating enough solid food	Minimum weaning age 8 weeks and only if eating enough solid food	Minimum weaning age 10 weeks	Minimum weaning age 12 weeks
Regular veterinary visits and veterinary health plan with targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits*	No requirement for VHP, regular veterinary visits or monitoring of health and welfare and performance parameters	Must have VHP but no requirement for monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters or regular veterinary visits	Must have VHP and one of 1) monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters or 2) regular veterinary visits	Must have VHP and two of 1) monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters 2) moderate or unspecified targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits 3) regular veterinary visits	Must have VHP, regular veterinary visits and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with moderate or unspecified targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits	Must have VHP, regular veterinary visits and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with stringent targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits

*Key criteria

Table A2.2: Scoring categories for dairy cattle.

Criteria for dairy cattle	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
STOCKMANSHIP, HANDLING, TRANSPORT & SLAUGHTER						
No use of electric goads	Electric goads permitted on farm and at the abattoir in accordance with legislation	Electric goads prohibited on farm but permitted by haulage and abattoir standards	N/A	N/A	N/A	Electric goads prohibited on farm and also by haulage and abattoir standards
Requirement for stockpeople to be trained/ competent/ experienced	No requirements regarding training or experience of stockpeople	N/A	Stockpeople must be suitably trained or experienced but no requirement to provide formal training in animal welfare or for training to be validated	Stockpeople must be suitably trained or experienced; formal training in animal welfare must be provided and records of training must be kept but no requirement for training to be validated	There must be at least one nominated person with responsibility for animal welfare (owner or manager) who must have attended a relevant validated training course; formal training in animal welfare must be provided for all stockpeople and records of training must be kept	All stockpeople must have attended a relevant validated training course and records of training must be kept
Frequent checks for signs of disease, injury or distress	N/A	N/A	N/A	Cattle must be checked at least once daily in systems where welfare depends on frequent human attention and sufficiently to avoid suffering in other systems (minimum legal requirement)	Housed cattle must be checked at least twice per day and other cattle sufficiently to avoid suffering OR All cattle must be checked at least once per day; vulnerable cattle (e.g. lactating cows, cows close to calving, young calves) must be checked at least twice per day	All cattle must be checked at least once per day; housed cattle and vulnerable cattle (e.g. lactating cows, cows close to calving, young calves) must be checked at least twice per day
Short transport duration*	Journeys over 12 hours including loading and unloading permitted	N/A	N/A	12 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 12 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)	8 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 8 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)	4 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 4 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)
No live export of cattle for slaughter or of calves to be reared for veal*	Live export of cattle for slaughter and calves for veal permitted	N/A	N/A	Live export of cattle for slaughter and calves for veal not specifically prohibited but limited by journey limit of 8 hours or less	Live export of calves for veal prohibited; live export of cattle for slaughter not specifically prohibited but limited by journey limit of 8 hours or less	Live export of cattle for slaughter and calves for veal prohibited
No use of livestock markets	Livestock markets permitted in accordance with legislation	N/A	N/A	Livestock markets permitted but restrictions for young and pregnant animals beyond legal requirements	N/A	Livestock markets prohibited

*Key criteria

Table A2.2: Scoring categories for dairy cattle.

Criteria for dairy cattle	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death*	Slaughter without stunning permitted and/ or no clear specifications for stunning parameters, no requirement for monitoring of effectiveness of stunning, maximum stun-stick interval may be greater than 60 seconds, no requirement to use chest/ thoracic stick and minimum bleed time may be less than 30 seconds	All cattle must be stunned and at least one of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) maximum stun-stick interval of 60 seconds 4) chest/ thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 30 seconds	All cattle must be stunned and at least two of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) maximum stun-stick interval of 60 seconds 4) chest/ thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 30 seconds	All cattle must be stunned and at least three of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) maximum stun-stick interval of 60 seconds 4) chest/ thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 30 seconds	All cattle must be stunned and at least four of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) maximum stun-stick interval of 60 seconds 4) chest/ thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 30 seconds	All cattle must be stunned; clear specifications for stunning parameters to ensure effective stun; monitoring of effectiveness of stunning required; maximum stun-stick interval of 60 seconds; chest/ thoracic stick must be used; minimum uninterrupted bleed time 30 seconds
Animal welfare policy and CCTV at abattoir and requirement for people involved in transporting and slaughtering of animals to be trained/ competent/ experienced	No requirement for personnel in charge of transporting cattle to be trained or for abattoirs to have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly, an appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered, a training programme in animal welfare for all staff or CCTV	At least one of 1) all personnel in charge of transporting cattle must be trained 2) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 3) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 4) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 5) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	At least two of 1) all personnel in charge of transporting cattle must be trained 2) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 3) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 4) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 5) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	At least three of 1) all personnel in charge of transporting cattle must be trained 2) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 3) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 4) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 5) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	At least four of 1) all personnel in charge of transporting cattle must be trained 2) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 3) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 4) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 5) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	All personnel in charge of transporting cattle must be trained; abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly; abattoirs must have appointed AWO who has completed a validated training course on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered; abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept; abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter
GENETICS & BREEDING						
No breeds associated with increased incidence of health/ welfare problems*	No stipulations on permitted genetics or sire choice	At least one of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems permitted 2) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of calving difficulties permitted or sire must be chosen to reduce likelihood of calving difficulties 3) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/ calving ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 4) polled breed must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or disbudding/ dehorning is prohibited and horns are left intact) 5) breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	At least two of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems permitted 2) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of calving difficulties permitted or sire must be chosen to reduce likelihood of calving difficulties 3) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/ calving ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 4) polled breed must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or disbudding/ dehorning is prohibited and horns are left intact) 5) breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	At least three of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems permitted 2) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of calving difficulties permitted or sire must be chosen to reduce likelihood of calving difficulties 3) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/ calving ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 4) polled breed must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or disbudding/ dehorning is prohibited and horns are left intact) 5) breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	At least four of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems permitted 2) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of calving difficulties permitted or sire must be chosen to reduce likelihood of calving difficulties 3) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/ calving ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 4) polled breed must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or disbudding/ dehorning is prohibited and horns are left intact) 5) breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	Only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems or increased incidence of calving difficulties permitted; key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/calving ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary; polled breed must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/ or disbudding/ dehorning prohibited and horns are left intact); breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions

*Key criteria

Table A2.2: Scoring categories for dairy cattle.

Criteria for dairy cattle	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
High welfare standards for breeding bulls	See Table A2.4					
No killing of male dairy calves	No requirement to avoid killing male calves	N/A	N/A	N/A	Must have a plan in place to end the killing of healthy male calves	Killing of healthy male calves prohibited
AUDITING						
Frequent inspections by certifying body	Inspections may be less frequent than every 24 months	Inspections at least every 24 months on average for all members	Inspections at least every 18 months on average for all members OR Inspections every 12 months initially and then up to 24 months with frequency determined by previous performance	Inspections at least every 15 months on average for all members OR Inspections every 6 months initially and then up to 24 months with frequency determined by previous performance	Inspections at least every 12 months on average for all members OR Inspections every 6 months initially and then up to 18 months with frequency determined by previous performance	Inspections every 6 months initially and then up to 12 months with frequency determined by previous performance
Targeted unannounced spot-checks	No spot checks	Spot checks for less than 10% of members annually (or proportion not specified); not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for less than 10% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced OR Spot checks for 10% of members annually but not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for 10% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced OR Spot checks for 20% of members annually but not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for 20% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced OR Spot checks for 30% of members annually but not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for 30% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set*	No assessment of welfare outcomes and no stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future	No assessment of welfare outcomes but stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future OR Informal observations of one or two welfare outcomes (e.g. injuries) during routine inspections but no formal recording of welfare outcomes and no targets set OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure records are being maintained	System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place but no targets set OR System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted and producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and either 1) farm-specific targets set by producers or 2) moderate (or unspecified) targets set by assurance scheme	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and stringent targets set by assurance scheme for all farms
Stringent measures to address non-compliance	No requirement to correct minor non-compliances	N/A	N/A	All non-compliances must be corrected but no defined timescale for correction; certification may be suspended or withdrawn for a serious non-compliance or multiple and/or repeated minor non-compliances	N/A	All non-compliances must be corrected within agreed timescale; certification may be suspended or withdrawn for a serious non-compliance or multiple and/or repeated minor non-compliances

*Key criteria

APPENDIX 2C

DAIRY CATTLE

APPENDIX 2C: FULL RESULTS TABLE FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR BREEDING BULLS (DAIRY)

Table A2.3: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for breeding bulls.

A maximum of 5 points is available for each criterion. Overall scores are converted to a score out of 5 and incorporated into the overall scoring of standards for dairy cattle (see **Table A2.1**).

Specific criteria for breeding bulls	Assured Dairy Farms (ADF)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
No tethering	0 (cattle may be tied in cowsheds provided they are allowed untethered exercise daily)	5 (the use of housing systems in which cattle are tethered for the whole or part of the housing period is prohibited)	5 (prolonged routine tethering prohibited)	5 (routine tethering over long periods prohibited)
Adequate space allowance when housed	0 (minimum space allowance for bulls not specified)	3 (minimum bedded lying area of 16m ² , and not less than 1m ² per 60kg bodyweight for larger bulls, plus exercise area of at least 25m ² ; total area = minimum 41m ²)	3 (minimum indoor area 10m ² /head plus exercise area of at least 30m ² ; total area = minimum 40m ²)	3 (minimum indoor area 10m ² /head plus exercise area of at least 30m ² ; total area = minimum 40m ²)
Appropriate flooring	0 (fully-slatted floors permitted)	4 (fully-slatted floors not specifically prohibited but bedded lying area must be provided)	4 (fully-slatted floors prohibited and bedded lying area required)	4 (fully-slatted floors prohibited – maximum 50% slatted – and bedded lying area required)
Provision of bedding	0 (no requirement to provide bedding for bulls)	5 (bedded lying area required)	5 (bedded lying area required)	5 (bedded lying area required)
Free range access	0 (no requirement for outdoor access for housed bulls)	0 (no requirement for outdoor access for housed bulls)	3 (bulls over one year old may be housed provided they have access to either pasture or an open-air run of at least 30m ²)	3 (bulls over one year old may be housed provided they have access to either pasture or an open-air run of at least 30m ²)
Social contact with other cattle	1 (bulls must be allowed to see and hear other cattle or general farm activity)	3 (bulls must be kept so as to allow them sight, sound and odour of other cattle and general farm activity)	3 (bulls must be kept in sight of other animals; recommends that breeding bulls are kept with other stock, e.g. dry cows, whenever possible)	3 (bulls must be kept in sight of other animals)
No dehorning/ disbudding	0 (disbudding permitted by chemical cauterisation without anaesthetic during first week of life or by hot iron with local anaesthetic; dehorning permitted; after 5 months dehorning must be performed by a vet)	3 (disbudding only permitted with hot iron and local anaesthetic; dehorning only permitted when carried out by a vet and must not be routine)	1 (disbudding and dehorning permitted with justification in accordance with legislation/ welfare code but not specifically stated whether anaesthetic and/or pain relief must be used)	1 (disbudding permitted in accordance with legislation/ welfare code but not specifically stated whether anaesthetic and/or pain relief must be used; must justify the need for disbudding in animal health plan)
Provision of adequate high-fibre feed to avoid increased risk of health problems	0 (no stipulations regarding feeding of fibre)	3 (cattle must be provided with fibre to allow them to ruminate, which must be of such quality and length as to help avoid acidosis; cattle must have access to grass during the grass-growing season)	5 (after weaning at least 60% on a daily dry matter basis of the cattle's diet must consist of fresh or dried fodder, roughage or silage; cattle must have access to pasture during the grazing season)	5 (after weaning at least 60% on a daily dry matter basis of the cattle's diet must consist of fresh or dried fodder, roughage or silage; feed rations that are high in energy and low in fibre or those that contain over 40% concentrates as dry matter percentage of the total diet are not permitted; cattle must graze fresh forage throughout the grazing season)

Table A2.3: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for breeding bulls.

Specific criteria for breeding bulls	Assured Dairy Farms (ADF)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Regular veterinary visits and veterinary health plan with targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits	2 (no requirement for regular vet visits; must have written herd health plan reviewed annually; herd health and performance must be monitored; the setting of targets is strongly encouraged but not required)	4 (must have at least 2 vet visits per year, at least 5 months apart; herd performance must be continually monitored, including production diseases, infectious diseases and injuries; the feet of all cattle must be inspected at least annually by a competent foot trimmer; must have veterinary health plan updated regularly; remedial action must be taken if parameters fall below tolerance limits)	1 (no requirement for regular veterinary visits; must have animal health plan submitted for approval and updated regularly; no requirement to monitor health and welfare indicators or to set targets)	1 (no requirement for regular veterinary visits; must have animal health plan submitted for approval and reviewed regularly but no requirement to monitor health and welfare indicators or to set targets)
Short transport duration	0 (no limit on journey duration beyond legal requirements)	4 (cattle including calves must not be transported for more than 8 hours, from loading of the first animal to unloading of the last animal)	4 (cattle must not be transported for more than 8 hours from loading of the first animal to unloading of the last animal, excluding sea journeys between the Scottish mainland and remote islands)	4 (cattle must not be transported for more than 8 hours from the start of loading to the end of unloading, except with permission)
Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death	2 (all cattle must be stunned; stun-stick interval must not exceed 60 seconds for penetrative captive bolt, 30 seconds for non-penetrative captive bolt and 10 seconds for electrical head-only stunning; monitoring of stunning and sticking method not specified; minimum bleed time 30 seconds)	5 (all cattle must be stunned; electrical parameters specified in terms of current, frequency and duration; the AWO must make frequent and thorough checks throughout the day to ensure that animals are being effectively stunned and are insensible throughout the slaughter operation; stun-stick interval must not exceed 60 seconds; bleeding must be with a chest stick; minimum bleed time 30 seconds)	3 (all cattle must be stunned; maximum stun-stick interval 60 seconds; bleeding must be with a chest/ thoracic stick; minimum bleed time 30 seconds; electrical parameters and monitoring of stunning not specified)	4 (all cattle must be stunned; if stunning is automated a trained and licensed operator must be present at all times to check the stun/kill operation; stun-stick interval must be less than 60 seconds; bleeding must be with a chest/thoracic stick; minimum bleed time 30 seconds; electrical parameters not specified)
No breeds associated with increased incidence of health/ welfare problems	1 (no restriction on permitted breeds; sires must be selected carefully, taking into account breed, size, age and previous record, to reduce the likelihood of calving difficulties, especially with maiden heifers; no requirement to use polled breed or to breed for polling)	1 (no restriction on permitted breeds; stockpeople must be aware of welfare requirements during breeding, particularly the selection of suitable bulls, semen and embryos for use in heifers; no requirement to use polled breed or to breed for polling)	3 (breeds must be chosen to avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production and to avoid problems at birth, but no requirement to demonstrate that key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/ calving ease are within acceptable limits; choice of breeds must take account of the capacity of the animals to adapt to local conditions and their vitality and resistance to disease; no requirement to use polled breed or to breed for polling)	3 (breeds must be chosen to avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production and to avoid problems at birth, but no requirement to demonstrate that key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/ calving ease are within acceptable limits; breeds must be chosen that can adapt to the organic system and local conditions and that have vitality and resistance to disease; no requirement to use polled breed or to breed for polling)
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set	0 (no assessment of welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	4 (RSPCA has developed a system of assessment of welfare outcomes and is working with other standard setters and Bristol University to further develop outcome measures; assessments of welfare outcomes on dairy farms have been underway for the past year; observations include lameness, lesions and positive/ negative behaviour; producers set themselves targets and intervention levels in VHP; checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met)	0 (no assessment of welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	5 (SA has a programme of assessments based on the Bristol Welfare Assurance Programme (BWAP); observations for dairy cattle are thin (BCS <2), skin lesions, swollen hocks, lameness, dirtiness, behaviour – general; targets are set for each parameter)
Total for breeding bull criteria	6/65	44/65	40/65	46/65
Welfare score for breeding bulls carried over to Table A2.1	0/5	3/5	3/5	4/5

APPENDIX 2D

DAIRY CATTLE

APPENDIX 2D: SCORING CATEGORIES FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR BREEDING BULLS (DAIRY)

Table A2.4: Scoring categories for breeding bulls.

Criteria for breeding bulls	Score 0	Score 1	Score 2	Score 3	Score 4	Score 5
No tethering	Routine prolonged tethering permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Routine prolonged tethering prohibited
Adequate space allowance when housed	Minimum total area may be less than 32m ² /bull	Minimum total area of at least 32m ² /bull	Minimum total area of at least 36m ² /bull	Minimum total area of at least 40m ² /bull	Minimum total area of at least 44m ² /bull	Minimum total area of at least 48m ² /bull
Appropriate flooring	Fully-slatted floors permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	Fully-slatted floors prohibited and bedded lying area	Floors must be entirely solid and bedded lying area required
Provision of bedding	No requirement to provide bedding material	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Bedded lying area required
Free range access	Permanent indoor housing permitted	N/A	N/A	Bulls must have permanent access to an outdoor exercise area but not necessarily pasture	N/A	Bulls must have access to pasture at least during the grazing season throughout their life, but may be housed over winter
Social contact with other cattle	No requirement for bulls to be able to see other cattle or general farm activity	Bulls must be able to see other cattle or general farm activity	N/A	Bulls must be able to see other cattle	N/A	Bulls must be kept with other stock, e.g. dry cows
No dehorning/ disbudding	Disbudding permitted during first week of life by chemical cauterisation without anaesthetic or by hot iron with anaesthetic; dehorning permitted with anaesthetic (minimum legal requirements)	Disbudding permitted only with justification	N/A	Disbudding permitted only with anaesthetic; dehorning prohibited or must only be carried out by a vet with anaesthetic and must not be routine	N/A	Disbudding and dehorning prohibited
Provision of adequate high-fibre feed to avoid increased risk of health problems	No requirements regarding the feeding of fibre	N/A	Sufficient fibre must be available in all diets to reduce the risk of health problems but no specific stipulations regarding the quantity of roughage	Cattle must have access to pasture during the grazing season and sufficient roughage must be available in all diets to reduce the risk of health problems but no specific stipulations regarding the quantity of roughage	N/A	Cattle must have access to pasture during the grazing season and, after weaning, at least 60% on a daily dry matter basis of the cattle's diet must consist of fresh or dried fodder, roughage or silage
Regular veterinary visits and veterinary health plan with targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits	No requirement for VHP, regular veterinary visits or monitoring of health and welfare and performance parameters	Must have VHP but no requirement for monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters or regular veterinary visits	Must have VHP and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters but no requirement for targets or regular veterinary visits	Must have VHP, regular veterinary visits and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters but no targets required	Must have VHP, regular veterinary visits and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with moderate or unspecified targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits	Must have VHP, regular veterinary visits and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with stringent targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits

Table A2.4: Scoring categories for breeding bulls.

Criteria for breeding bulls	Score 0	Score 1	Score 2	Score 3	Score 4	Score 5
Short transport duration	Journeys over 12 hours including loading and unloading permitted	N/A	N/A	12 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 12 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)	8 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 8 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)	4 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 4 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)
Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death	Slaughter without stunning permitted and/ or no clear specifications for stunning parameters, no requirement for monitoring of effectiveness of stunning, maximum stun-stick interval may be greater than 60 seconds, no requirement to use chest/ thoracic stick and minimum bleed time may be less than 30 seconds	All cattle must be stunned and at least one of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) maximum stun-stick interval of 60 seconds 4) chest/ thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 30 seconds	All cattle must be stunned and at least two of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) maximum stun-stick interval of 60 seconds 4) chest/ thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 30 seconds	All cattle must be stunned and at least three of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) maximum stun-stick interval of 60 seconds 4) chest/ thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 30 seconds	All cattle must be stunned and at least four of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) maximum stun-stick interval of 60 seconds 4) chest/ thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 30 seconds	All cattle must be stunned; clear specifications for stunning parameters to ensure effective stun; monitoring of effectiveness of stunning required; maximum stun-stick interval of 60 seconds; chest/ thoracic stick must be used; minimum uninterrupted bleed time 30 seconds
No breeds associated with increased incidence of health/ welfare problems	No stipulations on permitted genetics or sire choice	At least one of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems associated with production level permitted 2) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of calving difficulties permitted or sire must be chosen to reduce likelihood of calving difficulties, especially for maiden heifers 3) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/ calving ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 4) polled breed must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or disbudding/ dehorning is prohibited and horns are left intact) 5) breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	At least two of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems associated with production level permitted 2) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of calving difficulties permitted or sire must be chosen to reduce likelihood of calving difficulties, especially for maiden heifers 3) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/ calving ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 4) polled breed must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or disbudding/ dehorning prohibited and horns are left intact) 5) breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	At least three of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems associated with production level permitted 2) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of calving difficulties permitted or sire must be chosen to reduce likelihood of calving difficulties, especially for maiden heifers 3) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/ calving ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 4) polled breed must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or disbudding/ dehorning prohibited and horns are left intact) 5) breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	At least four of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems associated with production level permitted 2) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of calving difficulties permitted or sire must be chosen to reduce likelihood of calving difficulties, especially for maiden heifers 3) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/ calving ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 4) polled breed must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or disbudding/ dehorning prohibited and horns are left intact) 5) breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	Only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems associated with production level or increased incidence of calving difficulties permitted; key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/calving ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary; polled breed must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or disbudding/ dehorning prohibited and horns are left intact); breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions

Table A2.4: Scoring categories for breeding bulls.

Criteria for breeding bulls	Score 0	Score 1	Score 2	Score 3	Score 4	Score 5
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set	No assessment of welfare outcomes and no stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future	No assessment of welfare outcomes but stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future OR Informal observations of one or two welfare outcomes (e.g. injuries) during routine inspections but no formal recording of welfare outcomes and no targets set OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure records are being maintained	System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place but no targets set OR System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted and producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and either 1) farm-specific targets set by producers or 2) moderate (or unspecified) targets set by assurance scheme	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and stringent targets set by assurance scheme for all farms

APPENDIX 3A

BEEF CATTLE

APPENDIX 3A: FULL RESULTS TABLE FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR BEEF CATTLE

Table A3.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for beef cattle.

Up to 5 points are available for each criterion. Key criteria (marked with an asterisk) are weighted so that they are worth double points (i.e. up to 10 points for each key criterion). Score for breeding bull welfare is derived from **Table A3.3**. Criteria are grouped into five sets. Totals for each set of criteria are converted to scores out of 20, which are totalled to give an overall score out of 100 for each scheme (see **Table 3.3**).

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for beef cattle	Assured British Meat (ABM)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
ENVIRONMENT						
No close confinement	No tethering*	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	10 (the use of housing systems in which cattle are tethered for the whole or part of the housing period is prohibited)	10 (prolonged routine tethering prohibited)	10 (routine tethering over long periods prohibited)
Adequate space allowance when housed	Adequate space allowance when housed*	2 (guideline areas range from 1.1m ² for 200kg animal, 2.1m ² for 500kg to 2.3m ² for 600kg for growing/ finishing animals in slatted systems; 2.5m ² for 400kg to 2.75m ² for 500kg for suckler cows in slatted systems; 3m ² with 2m ² bedded for 200kg, 5.85m ² with 4.25m ² bedded for 500kg, to 6.8m ² with 5m ² bedded for 600kg in solid-floor systems; if cubicles are used there must be at least one per animal unless access to adjacent loose housing)	0 (not specified beyond general guidelines in welfare code)	4 (in loose housing, minimum areas range from 3.3m ² total with 1.5m ² bedded for <100kg animal, 8.5m ² total with 6m ² bedded for <600kg animal, to 11.0m ² total with 8.0m ² bedded for >800kg animal; if cubicles are used must be at least one per animal and preferably 5% more and cattle must be provided with the lying area plus a further 50% loafing/ passage area)	8 (minimum areas range from 1.5m ² lying/ indoor area plus additional 1.1m ² exercise area excluding pasturage for ≤100kg animal to at least 5m ² with a minimum of 1m ² /100kg lying/ indoor area plus at least 3.7m ² with a minimum of 0.75m ² /100kg exercise area excluding pasturage for >350kg animal; if cubicles are used the number of cubicles must exceed the number of animals by at least 5%)	8 (minimum areas range from 1.5m ² lying/indoor area plus additional 1.1m ² exercise area excluding pasturage for ≤100kg animal, 5m ² lying/ indoor area plus 3.7m ² exercise area excluding pasturage for ≤500kg animal, to 1m ² /100kg lying/ indoor area with 0.75m ² /100kg exercise area excluding pasturage for >500kg animal; if cubicles are used, cattle must have free access to them, an adequate lungeing area and there must be 5% more cubicles than animals)
Appropriate housing design	Appropriate flooring	0 (fully-slatted floors permitted)	0 (fully-slatted floors permitted)	4 (fully-slatted floors prohibited and bedded lying area required)	4 (fully-slatted floors prohibited and bedded lying area required)	4 (fully-slatted floors prohibited – maximum 50% slatted – and bedded lying area required)
Provision of appropriate bedding/ litter/ enrichment material	Provision of bedding*	0 (no requirement to provide bedding except where required by legislation, e.g. for young calves)	0 (no requirement to provide bedding except where required by legislation, e.g. for young calves)	10 (bedded lying area must be provided; in cubicles a minimum of 50mm straw or woodshavings is recommended, or cow mats with thin layer of bedding; must be topped up at least 3 times per week)	10 (cattle must be provided with ample dry bedding in the lying area; cows should be housed in well-bedded yards or, where cubicles are used, they must be comfortably bedded at all times, preferably over mats or other soft coverings if the base is concrete)	10 (cattle must be provided with ample dry bedding in the lying area; where concrete-based cubicles are used, rubber mats or other cushioned materials and an additional layer of bedding should be used, otherwise a substantial layer of bedding must be provided)
Provision of appropriate nesting facilities	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A

*Key criteria

Table A3.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for beef cattle.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for beef cattle	Assured British Meat (ABM)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Appropriate lighting	Appropriate light intensity and light/dark periods	1 (lighting must be adequate to allow inspection and normal behaviour; must be adequate to meet animals' ethological needs and must have appropriate period of rest from artificial lighting in accordance with legislation)	1 (in accordance with welfare code, during daylight hours the level of natural or artificial lighting should be such that housed livestock can be seen clearly; must be adequate to meet animals' ethological needs and must have appropriate period of rest from artificial lighting in accordance with legislation)	2 (minimum 100 lux during the normal period of daylight hours when housed; a period of low lighting must be provided to promote resting)	5 (access to natural daylight throughout the year – must have access to outdoor exercise area when housed unless shed is open-fronted)	3 (access to natural daylight during grazing season; when housed over winter, exercise area may be inside and suitable lighting must be provided but duration and intensity not specified; must be adequate to meet animals ethological needs and must have appropriate period of rest from artificial lighting in accordance with legislation)
Free range access	Free range access*	0 (permanent indoor housing permitted)	0 (permanent indoor housing permitted)	0 (permanent indoor housing permitted)	8 (cattle must be at grass when conditions permit but may be housed over the winter and the final finishing phase of beef animals may be indoors provided that this does not exceed one fifth of lifetime with absolute maximum of 3 months; when housed over winter, exercise area must be outdoors unless shed is open-fronted in which case, with approval, exercise area can be indoors)	8 (cattle must graze fresh forage throughout the grazing season; beef cattle may be finished in well-bedded spacious yards provided this period is less than one fifth of lifetime and no more than 3 months)
Adequate outdoor space	Low outdoor stocking density	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	5 (outdoor stocking density must be low enough to prevent poaching of the soil and over-grazing of vegetation at all times of year)	5 (outdoor stocking density must be low enough to prevent poaching of the soil, over-grazing of vegetation and pollution of watercourses; total grazing area must be at least 0.27 ha (0.66 acres) per animal per grazing season, which can be part of a grazing rotation)
Appropriate shelter/shade and protection from predators	Provision of shelter and shade for outdoor cattle	3 (where animals are in exposed situations, protection from inclement weather must be provided; out-wintered cattle must have access to a well-drained lying area)	3 (out-wintered cattle must be provided with the opportunity to shelter and must have access to a suitably drained lying area)	5 (provisions must be made to protect cattle from heat stress and consideration may need to be given to the provision of artificial shade; if buildings are partially roofed they must provide effective shelter from the wind and a dry comfortable lying area; for all cattle an assessment of their environmental temperature and air movement must be undertaken, taking into account breed, age, climatic conditions and natural shelter/shade)	5 (free range and open air exercise areas must provide sufficient protection against rain, wind, sun and extreme temperatures depending on local weather conditions and breed)	5 (stock must be provided with sufficient protection against rain, wind, sun and extreme temperatures depending on local conditions and breed)

*Key criteria

Table A3.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for beef cattle.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for beef cattle	Assured British Meat (ABM)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Appropriate social grouping	Small, stable and appropriate social groups	1 (animals must be grouped in appropriate social groupings; loose-housed stock should be grouped according to size and age except for cow-calf groupings)	1 (animals must be grouped in appropriate social groups; young bulls must be kept in their peer group when transported to slaughter to minimise stress but no requirement to avoid mixing other unfamiliar animals)	1 (loose-housed growing cattle must be grouped according to size and age)	2 (cattle must be kept in reasonably stable groups; steps must be taken to reduce stress during transport, including avoiding mixing of animals from different social groups)	2 (when housed, cattle must be kept with animals of a similar size to reduce the risk of bullying; mixing of animals from different social groups for transport must be avoided)
	No individual housing of calves	2 (individual housing permitted up to 8 weeks; calves must have visual contact with other calves)	2 (individual housing permitted up to 8 weeks; calves must have visual and tactile contact with other calves)	2 (individual housing permitted up to 8 weeks; calves must be able to see, smell and hear other calves)	4 (individual housing permitted up to 7 days provided calves can see and hear other calves)	4 (individual housing permitted up to 7 days provided calves can see and hear other calves, and beyond 7 days only with permission, e.g. on animal welfare grounds; calves must not be sold into non-welfare friendly or intensive systems; rearing of calves with their dam or a nurse cow is recommended but not required)

HUSBANDRY

No mutilations	No dehorning/ disbudding*	0 (disbudding permitted by chemical cauterisation without anaesthetic during first week of life or by hot iron with local anaesthetic; dehorning permitted; after 5 months dehorning must be performed by a vet)	6 (disbudding and dehorning permitted; local anaesthetic must be used; after 5 months dehorning must be performed by a vet)	6 (disbudding only permitted with hot iron and local anaesthetic; dehorning only permitted when carried out by a vet and must not be routine)	2 (disbudding and dehorning permitted with justification in accordance with legislation/ welfare code but not specifically stated whether anaesthetic and/ or pain relief must be used)	2 (disbudding permitted in accordance with legislation/ welfare code but not specifically stated whether anaesthetic and/ or pain relief must be used; must justify the need for disbudding in animal health plan)
	No castration (or a requirement to use anaesthetic)*	0 (castration permitted; no requirement for anaesthetic up to 2 months of age)	0 (castration permitted; no requirement for anaesthetic up to 2 months of age)	0 (castration permitted; no requirement to use anaesthetic up to 2 months of age)	2 (castration permitted with justification in accordance with legislation/ welfare code but not specifically stated whether anaesthetic and/ or pain relief must be used)	2 (castration permitted in accordance with legislation/ welfare code but not specifically stated whether anaesthetic and/ or pain relief must be used; must justify the need for castration in animal health plan)
No use of genetic engineering / cloning or invasive reproductive technologies associated with health or welfare problems	No use of genetically modified or cloned animals or their offspring	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	5 (the use of genetically modified and/or cloned animals and their offspring is prohibited)	4 (livestock must not be brought in that have been produced using transgenic or other genetic engineering techniques; cloning is effectively prohibited by prohibitions on breeding practices that make livestock systems over-reliant on inappropriate technology and any surgical or chemical interference other than procedures specifically permitted in the standards, but no restriction on the use of offspring)	4 (livestock must not be brought in that have been produced using transgenic or other genetic engineering techniques; use of cloning is prohibited but no restriction on the use of offspring)
	No embryo transfer	0 (embryo transfer permitted)	0 (embryo transfer permitted)	2 (embryo transfer only permitted in exceptional circumstances with written permission from the scheme)	5 (embryo transfer prohibited)	5 (embryo transfer prohibited)

*Key criteria

Table A3.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for beef cattle.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for beef cattle	Assured British Meat (ABM)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Appropriate feeding	Provision of adequate high-fibre feed to avoid increased risk of health problems*	0 (no stipulations regarding feeding of fibre)	4 (in accordance with welfare code, sufficient roughage must be available in all diets to reduce the risk of inducing bloat or laminitis but no specific stipulations in standards regarding quantity of roughage)	4 (cattle must be provided with fibre to allow them to ruminate, which must be of such quality and length as to help avoid acidosis)	10 (after weaning at least 60% on a daily dry matter basis of the cattle's diet must consist of fresh or dried fodder, roughage or silage)	10 (after weaning at least 60% on a daily dry matter basis of the cattle's diet must consist of fresh or dried fodder, roughage or silage; feed rations that are high in energy and low in fibre or those that contain over 40% concentrates as dry matter percentage of the total diet are not permitted; cattle must graze fresh forage throughout the grazing season)
	Provision of adequate iron and roughage for calves	1 (the diet must provide adequate iron and fibre from 8 days of age in accordance with legislation; fresh, clean, palatable dry feed must be provided from 8 days of age)	1 (calf diets must meet current legislative requirements)	3 (unweaned calves must have unlimited access to grass or palatable dried feed and roughage from at least day 8; calves must be fed a wholesome diet which includes iron and diet must prevent anaemia and maintain minimum blood haemoglobin of 9g/dl (around 5.5mmol/l))	3 (the keeping of animals in conditions or on a diet which may encourage anaemia is prohibited)	3 (if calves are housed they must have access to good quality straw, hay or silage)
Appropriate weaning age	Appropriate weaning age*	2 (minimum 5 weeks)	0 (in accordance with welfare code calves should receive liquid food every day during the first 4 weeks of life and until they are eating enough solid feed)	4 (minimum 5 weeks and must be eating at least 1kg calf starter per day)	10 (minimum 3 months)	10 (minimum 12 weeks)
Adequate monitoring of health and welfare by producers	Regular veterinary visits and veterinary health plan with targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits*	2 (no requirement for regular vet visits; must have written herd health plan reviewed annually; no requirement to monitor health and welfare indicators or to set targets)	6 (no requirement for regular vet visits; all disease problems, including lameness, scour or respiratory disease, must be actively addressed; must have animal health and disease control plan reviewed annually, which should include improvement targets)	8 (must have at least 1 vet visit per year for finishing units and at least 2 for breeding units; herd performance must be continually monitored, including production diseases, infectious diseases and injuries; the feet of all cattle must be inspected at least annually by a competent foot trimmer; must have veterinary health plan updated regularly; includes targets for a range of parameters; remedial action must be taken if parameters fall below tolerance limits)	2 (no requirement for regular veterinary visits; must have animal health plan submitted for approval and updated regularly; no requirement to monitor health and welfare indicators or to set targets)	2 (no requirement for regular veterinary visits; must have animal health plan submitted for approval and reviewed regularly; no requirement to monitor health and welfare indicators or to set targets)

*Key criteria

Table A3.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for beef cattle.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for beef cattle	Assured British Meat (ABM)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
STOCKMANSHIP, HANDLING, TRANSPORT & SLAUGHTER						
Appropriate handling	No use of electric goads	1 (prohibited on farm; permitted by haulage and abattoir standards)	0 (permitted)	5 (prohibited)	5 (prohibited)	5 (prohibited)
Promotion of high quality stockmanship	Requirement for stockpeople to be trained/ competent/ experienced	2 (there must be sufficient people available who are competent based on experience and/or training; records of training, qualifications and experience must be kept; staff must be able to demonstrate competence before being given responsibility for the welfare of stock)	2 (all people involved in managing the running of the unit must demonstrate competence in stockmanship and may be required to demonstrate what training is given to new stockpersons)	3 (all managers and stockpeople must be thoroughly trained, skilled and competent in animal husbandry and welfare; managers must develop a training programme for stockpeople with regular updates and keep records of training; stockpeople must be given appropriate training before being given responsibility for the welfare of stock and must be able to demonstrate competence)	2 (in accordance with legislation/ welfare code animals must be cared for by a sufficient number of competent staff; no requirement to provide training in animal welfare or to keep records of training)	2 (in accordance with legislation/ welfare code animals must be cared for by a sufficient number of competent staff; no requirement to provide training in animal welfare or to keep records of training)
Frequent checks for signs of illness, injury or distress	Frequent checks for signs of illness, injury or distress	5 (all cattle must be inspected at least once daily and housed cattle and cows close to calving at least twice daily)	3 (cattle must be inspected in accordance with legislation/ welfare code – at least once daily in systems where welfare depends on frequent human attention and sufficiently to avoid suffering in other systems)	4 (when cattle are housed they must be inspected at least twice per day)	3 (not specified but frequency of inspection must be noted in animal health plan which must be submitted to SFQC for approval; must comply with legislation and welfare code – at least once daily in systems where welfare depends on frequent human attention and sufficiently to avoid suffering in other systems)	3 (not specified but must comply with legislation and welfare code – at least once daily in systems where welfare depends on frequent human attention and sufficiently to avoid suffering in other systems)
Short transport duration	Short transport duration*	0 (no limit on journey times beyond legal requirements)	0 (no limit on journey times beyond legal requirements)	8 (cattle including calves must not be transported for more than 8 hours, from loading of the first animal to unloading of the last animal)	8 (cattle must not be transported for more than 8 hours from loading of the first animal to unloading of the last animal, excluding sea journeys between the Scottish mainland and remote islands)	8 (cattle must not be transported for more than 8 hours from the start of loading to the end of unloading, except with permission, and must not be exported for slaughter)
No live export	No live export of cattle for slaughter or of calves to be reared for veal*	0 (live export of cattle and calves permitted)	0 (live export of cattle and calves permitted)	8 (live export of cattle for slaughter not specifically prohibited but will be restricted by 8 hour journey limit; calves must not be exported live from the UK, either directly or via a third party)	6 (live export not specifically prohibited but will be restricted by 8 hour journey limit)	10 (cattle must not be exported for slaughter; calves under 1 month old must not be sold abroad and calves must not be sold into non-welfare friendly or intensive systems)

*Key criteria

Table A3.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for beef cattle.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for beef cattle	Assured British Meat (ABM)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
No use of livestock markets	No use of livestock markets	0 (cattle and calves may be sold through livestock markets except where prohibited by legislation)	0 (cattle and calves may be sold through livestock markets except where prohibited by legislation)	3 (cattle must not be presented for sale at livestock markets but calves may be sold through markets provided they are not sold for export)	3 (calves under 6 months old and cattle within 16 weeks of calving must not be purchased, collected or sold through livestock markets)	3 (calves under 12 weeks old without their dam and cattle over 6 months in calf must not be sold through livestock markets)
Humane slaughter	Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death*	4 (all cattle must be stunned; stun-stick interval must not exceed 60 seconds for penetrative captive bolt, 30 seconds for non-penetrative captive bolt and 10 seconds for electrical head-only stunning; monitoring of stunning and sticking method not specified; minimum bleed time 30 seconds)	0 (all cattle must be stunned; stun-stick interval must be as soon as practically possible, preferably within 60 seconds; stunning parameters, monitoring of stunning, sticking method and bleed time not specified)	10 (all cattle must be stunned; electrical parameters specified in terms of current, frequency and duration; the AWO must make frequent and thorough checks throughout the day to ensure that animals are being effectively stunned and are insensible throughout the slaughter operation; stun-stick interval must not exceed 60 seconds; bleeding must be with a chest stick; minimum bleed time 30 seconds)	6 (all cattle must be stunned; maximum stun-stick interval 60 seconds; bleeding must be with a chest/ thoracic stick; minimum bleed time 30 seconds; stunning parameters and monitoring of stunning not specified)	8 (all cattle must be stunned; if stunning is automated a trained and licensed operator must be present at all times to check the stun/kill operation; stun-stick interval must be less than 60 seconds; bleeding must be with a chest/thoracic stick; minimum bleed time 30 seconds; stunning parameters not specified)
Promotion of high welfare standards in the handling of animals during transport and slaughter	Animal welfare policy and CCTV at abattoir and requirement for people involved in transporting and slaughtering of animals to be trained/ competent/ experienced	4 (haulage scheme requires that all drivers must be trained and records kept; producers may also transport their own stock; abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly; there must be a trained AWO on duty at all times during operational hours who must have undertaken an external training course; all persons involved in the handling of livestock must be suitably trained – ideally all staff should have completed an AWO training course or can be trained under the instruction of the AWO; records of training must be kept; no requirement for CCTV)	2 (haulage scheme requires that drivers hold a certificate of competence; producers may also transport their own stock; abattoirs must have at least one member of staff on site who has been formally trained to a recognised certified standard; records of training must be kept; no requirement for CCTV)	4 (personnel in charge of cattle transporters must have completed an approved training course, preferably validated; abattoirs must have a written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly; there must be at least one appointed AWO who must have attended a validated training programme and must be present on site at all times whilst slaughter is being carried out; there must be a training programme for all staff which includes use of HSA training video; installation of CCTV in abattoirs is not currently required but will be introduced from Nov 2011)	2 (no stipulations on training of drivers beyond legal requirements; abattoirs must have a training programme that includes animal welfare; records of training for all staff must be kept; there must be a nominated person who is responsible for animal welfare and they must be trained and competent; a suitably trained and competent person must oversee the unloading of every animal including those arriving out-of-hours; no requirement for CCTV)	3 (no stipulations on training of drivers beyond legal requirements; abattoirs must have a documented quality management system which covers animal welfare and is reviewed regularly; must have a training programme that includes animal welfare and is ongoing with induction and refresher training, further training specific to the job and retraining when there are any problems or when new procedures are introduced; records of training for all operators must be kept; when there are live animals there must always be someone present who is responsible for animal welfare and they must be trained and competent – AWO or abattoir owner/ operator; a suitably trained and competent person must oversee the unloading of every animal including those arriving out-of-hours; no requirement for CCTV)

*Key criteria

Table A3.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for beef cattle.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for beef cattle	Assured British Meat (ABM)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
GENETICS & BREEDING						
No use of breeds associated with increased incidence of health/ welfare problems	No breeds associated with increased incidence of health/ welfare problems*	2 (no restriction on permitted breeds; when breeding, sires must be selected carefully taking into account breed, age, size and previous record to reduce the likelihood of birthing difficulties; no requirement to use polled breed or to breed for polling)	0 (no restriction on permitted breeds or choice of sire; health must be monitored but no requirement to change genetics if not within acceptable limits; no requirement to use polled breed or to breed for polling)	2 (no restriction on permitted breeds; stockpeople must be aware of welfare requirements during breeding, particularly the selection of suitable bulls, semen and embryos for use in heifers and caesarean section must not be a routine procedure; key health and welfare parameters must be monitored but no requirement to change genetics if not within acceptable limits; no requirement to use polled breed or to breed for polling)	6 (breeds must be chosen to avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production and to avoid problems at birth, but no requirement to demonstrate that key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate/ production level/ calving ease are within acceptable limits; choice of breeds must take account of the capacity of the animals to adapt to local conditions and their vitality and resistance to disease; no requirement to use polled breed or to breed for polling)	6 (breeds must be chosen to avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production and to avoid problems at birth but no requirement to demonstrate that key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate/ production level/ calving ease are within acceptable limits; breeds must be chosen that can adapt to the organic system and local conditions and that have vitality and resistance to disease; no requirement to use polled breed or to breed for polling)
High welfare standards for breeding animals	See Table A3.3 for scoring of breeding bull welfare	0	1	3	3	3
No killing of surplus male animals	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
AUDITING						
Frequent inspections	Frequent inspections by certifying body	2 (inspections at least every 18 months to allow visits at different times of year)	4 (inspections annually; time between inspections may be shorter or longer to allow visits at different times of year)	4 (inspections annually; time between inspections may be shorter or longer up to 15 months to allow visits at different times of year)	4 (inspections annually)	4 (inspections annually)
Spot-checks	Targeted unannounced spot-checks	1 (routine inspections are supplemented by some random spot checks at short notice)	2 (around 10% of farms receive additional spot-checks; farms selected at random except that all farms for which a complaint has been received from any source will be included; may be unannounced)	5 (RSPCA monitor approx 35% of all members and 50% of monitoring visits are unannounced; all monitoring visits are made on a risk assessment basis following annual inspection – farms with non-compliances at assessment will get a monitoring visit)	1 (spot checks are carried out as a routine part of verifying continuous compliance with the standards; may be unannounced; no information supplied to indicate that spot checks are targeted or the proportion of farms receiving spot checks; additional assessments are also carried out where a major change or deviation has been made from the approved farm plan)	3 (there is a programme of additional unannounced inspections over and above the annual visits; these target those who are considered to be higher risk or where specific risks have been identified, e.g. end of derogation periods, parallel production, following up complaints; around 10% of farms receive additional spot-checks or follow-up visits each year)

*Key criteria

Table A3.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for beef cattle.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for beef cattle	Assured British Meat (ABM)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme	Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set*	0 (no assessment of welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	4 (QMS is piloting assessments based on Qualitative Behaviour Assessment (QBA) developed by the Scottish Agricultural College (SAC); in the longer term some BWAP measures may also be incorporated)	6 (RSPCA has developed a system of assessment of welfare outcomes and is working with other standard setters and Bristol University to further develop outcome measures; assessments of welfare outcomes on beef cattle farms are not yet underway; producers set themselves targets and intervention levels in VHP; checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met)	0 (no assessment of welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	6 (SA has a programme of assessments based on the Bristol Welfare Assurance Programme (BWAP); observations for beef cattle are thin (BCS <2), fat (BCS >3.5), skin lesions, lameness, dirtiness, behaviour – general; no targets set for beef cattle yet but plan to introduce targets)
Measures to address non-compliance	Stringent measures to address non-compliance	5 (all non-conformances must be corrected; a major non-conformance against one of the 'key standards' will result in suspension of certification until it is corrected; non-conformances against 'other standards' should not result in suspension provided they are corrected within an agreed timescale, normally within 28 days of the assessment; certification may also be suspended in the case of a large number of such non-conformances or in the event of the same non-conformance being found on successive assessment visits)	5 (non-compliance categorised as minor or major; non-compliances must be corrected within an agreed timescale; major non-compliance results in immediate suspension of certification)	5 (all non-compliances must be corrected as soon as possible; certificates are withdrawn after 8 weeks if the Freedom Food certification panel have not received corrective actions and objective evidence to verify compliance; a producer who has their certificate withdrawn due to non-compliance at assessment has 3 unannounced visits by Freedom Food over the next 6 months to ensure compliance is being maintained)	5 (where welfare issues are identified during an inspection, the Certification Officer sets the member targets to be implemented or in extreme cases passes on to SFQC Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) for the SOPA scheme for a full set of new plans and targets to be drawn up; if the targets are not met within a specific time scale then the member is withdrawn from the SOPA scheme; in some cases a specific category of livestock may be de-certified)	5 (an action summary form is drawn up following inspection, listing non-compliances and asking how they will be corrected, with a deadline for return of the completed form; actions to correct non-compliances must be approved before a licence is issued or continued; an additional inspection may be carried out to make sure non-compliances have been corrected; non-compliance categorised as minor, major, critical or manifest infringement; certification will normally be suspended for part or whole of the enterprise in response to critical non-compliance or multiple or unresolved major non-compliance)

*Key criteria

APPENDIX 3B
BEEF CATTLE

APPENDIX 3B: SCORING CATEGORIES FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR BEEF CATTLE

Table A3.2: Scoring categories for beef cattle.

Criteria for beef cattle	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
ENVIRONMENT						
No tethering*	Routine prolonged tethering permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Routine prolonged tethering prohibited
Adequate space allowance when housed (minimum areas based on the system providing the least space and a cubicle is assumed to provide an area of around 3m²)*	Minimum total area may be less than 2m ² /500kg animal and/or in cubicle systems, number of animals may exceed number of cubicles	Minimum total area of at least 2m ² /500kg animal; in cubicle systems, number of animals may exceed number of cubicles only if access to adjacent loose housing	Minimum total area of at least 4m ² /500kg animal; if cubicles are used, must be at least as many cubicles as animals	Minimum total area of at least 6m ² /500kg animal; if cubicles are used, must be at least as many cubicles as animals	Minimum total area of at least 8m ² /500kg animal; if cubicles are used, must be 5% more cubicles than animals	Minimum total area of at least 8m ² /500kg animal; use of cubicles prohibited
Appropriate flooring	Fully-slatted floors permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	Fully-slatted floors prohibited (or bedded lying area required) for all cattle	Flooring must be entirely solid
Provision of bedding*	No requirement to provide bedding material (except for young calves in accordance with legislation)	N/A	N/A	N/A	Bedding material required	Thick layer of bedding material required; where mats are used they must have an additional layer of bedding on top
Appropriate light intensity and light/dark periods	N/A Permanent indoor housing permitted	During daylight hours the level of natural or artificial lighting must be such that housed livestock can be seen clearly; there must be an appropriate period of rest from artificial lighting but no minimum dark period specified (minimum legislative requirements)	No requirement for access to natural daylight; minimum 100 lux during daylight hours when housed	Access to natural daylight at least during grazing season; lighting when housed must meet minimum legislative standards but intensity may be less than 100 lux	Access to natural daylight at least during grazing season; minimum 100 lux during daylight hours when housed	Access to natural daylight throughout the year
Free range access*		All cattle must have access to an outdoor exercise area but not necessarily pasture	N/A	All cattle must be kept at pasture at least during the grazing season, but may be housed over winter and for a final fattening phase for no more than one fifth of life, with a maximum period of 3 months; male dairy calves reared for beef may be housed for longer periods	All cattle must be kept at pasture at least during the grazing season, but may be housed over winter and for a final fattening phase for no more than one fifth of life, with a maximum period of 3 months	All cattle must be kept at pasture at least during the grazing season throughout their life, but may be housed over winter

*Key criteria

Table A3.2: Scoring categories for beef cattle.

Criteria for beef cattle	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Low outdoor stocking density	Stocking density may exceed 20 animals/ acre	Maximum 20 animals/ acre	Maximum 10 animals/ acre	Maximum 5 animals/ acre	Maximum 3 animals/ acre	Maximum 2 animals/ acre OR Outdoor stocking density must be low enough to prevent poaching of the soil and over grazing of vegetation
Provision of shelter and shade for outdoor cattle	No requirement for shelter or shade for outdoor cattle	N/A	N/A	Outdoor cattle must have access to a sheltered dry lying area but no requirement for adequate shade during summer	N/A	Adequate shelter required during winter and adequate shade required during summer
Small, stable and appropriate social groups	No requirement to group cattle appropriately, to maintain stable groups, to limit group size or to avoid mixing of cattle from different social groups for transport	At least one of 1) cattle must be grouped according to size and age (except for cow-calf groups) 2) cattle must be kept in stable groups 3) group size limited to no more than 100 cattle when housed 4) mixing of cattle from different groups for transport must be avoided or groups for transport must be formed in time to allow them to stabilise prior to transport	At least two of 1) cattle must be grouped according to size and age (except for cow-calf groups) 2) cattle must be kept in stable groups 3) group size limited to no more than 100 cattle when housed 4) mixing of cattle from different groups for transport must be avoided or groups for transport must be formed in time to allow them to stabilise prior to transport	At least three of 1) cattle must be grouped according to size and age (except for cow-calf groups) 2) cattle must be kept in stable groups 3) group size limited to no more than 100 cattle when housed 4) mixing of cattle from different groups for transport must be avoided or groups for transport must be formed in time to allow them to stabilise prior to transport	When housed, cattle must be kept in stable groups of no more than 100 animals of similar size and age (except for cow-calf groups); cattle from different social groups must not be mixed for transport	When housed, cattle must be kept in stable groups of no more than 50 animals of similar size and age (except for cow-calf groups); cattle from different social groups must not be mixed for transport
No individual housing of calves	N/A	N/A	Individual housing permitted up to 8 weeks and calves must have visual contact with other calves (minimum legislative requirements)	Individual housing permitted up to 4 weeks and calves must have visual contact with other calves	Individual housing permitted up to 7 days and calves must have visual contact with other calves	Individual housing of calves prohibited (unless isolated temporarily on the advice of a vet due to illness); calves must be kept with their dam or a nurse cow; calves must not be sold into non-welfare-friendly or intensive systems

HUSBANDRY

No dehorning/ disbudding*	Disbudding permitted during first week of life by chemical cauterisation without anaesthetic or by hot iron with anaesthetic; dehorning permitted with anaesthetic (minimum legal requirements)	Disbudding permitted only with justification	N/A	Disbudding permitted only with anaesthetic; dehorning prohibited or must only be carried out by a vet with anaesthetic and must not be routine	N/A	Disbudding and dehorning prohibited
No castration (or a requirement to use anaesthetic)*	Castration permitted and no requirement for anaesthetic	Castration permitted only with justification	N/A	Castration permitted only with anaesthetic	N/A	Castration prohibited or permitted only with anaesthetic and only where cattle benefit from an extended life at pasture

*Key criteria

Table A3.2: Scoring categories for beef cattle.

Criteria for beef cattle	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
No use of genetically modified or cloned animals or their offspring	No restriction on the use of genetically modified or cloned animals or their offspring	N/A	N/A	The use of genetically modified animals is prohibited but no restriction on the use of cloned animals or their offspring	The use of genetically modified and cloned animals is prohibited but no restriction on the use of clone offspring	The use of genetically modified and cloned animals and their offspring is prohibited
No embryo transfer	Embryo transfer permitted	N/A	Embryo transfer only permitted in exceptional circumstances with written permission from the scheme	N/A	N/A	Embryo transfer prohibited
Provision of adequate high-fibre feed to avoid increased risk of health problems*	No requirements regarding the feeding of fibre	N/A	Sufficient fibre must be available in all diets to reduce the risk of health problems but no specific stipulations regarding the quantity of roughage	Cattle must have access to pasture during the grazing season and sufficient roughage must be available in all diets to reduce the risk of health problems but no specific stipulations regarding the quantity of roughage	N/A	Cattle must have access to pasture during the grazing season and, after weaning, at least 60% on a daily dry matter basis of the cattle's diet must consist of fresh or dried fodder, roughage or silage
Provision of adequate iron and roughage for calves	N/A	There must be sufficient iron in the calves' diet to ensure a blood haemoglobin level of at least 4.5 mmol/l; from 2 weeks of age calves must be provided with a minimum of 100g fibrous food daily, rising to 250g for calves 8 to 20 weeks of age (minimum legislative requirements)	There must be sufficient iron in the calves' diet to ensure a blood haemoglobin level of at least 5.5 mmol/l; from 2 weeks of age calves must be provided with a minimum of 200g fibrous food daily, rising to 500g from 15 weeks	There must be sufficient iron in the calves' diet to ensure a blood haemoglobin level of at least 5.5 mmol/l; from 2 weeks of age calves must have free access to grass or other roughage	There must be sufficient iron in the calves' diet to ensure a blood haemoglobin level of 7 mmol/l; from 2 weeks of age calves must have free access to grass or other roughage	The calves' diets must contain at least 50mg iron per kg; from 2 weeks of age all calves must have free access to grass or other roughage
Appropriate weaning age*	Minimum weaning age less than 5 weeks	Minimum weaning age 5 weeks but no requirement to ensure eating enough solid food	Minimum weaning age 5 weeks and only if eating enough solid food	Minimum weaning age 8 weeks and only if eating enough solid food	Minimum weaning age 10 weeks	Minimum weaning age 12 weeks
Regular veterinary visits and veterinary health plan with targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits*	No requirement for VHP, regular veterinary visits or monitoring of health and welfare and performance parameters	Must have VHP but no requirement for monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters or regular veterinary visits	Must have VHP and one of 1) monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters or 2) regular veterinary visits	Must have VHP and two of 1) monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters 2) moderate or unspecified targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits 3) regular veterinary visits	Must have VHP, regular veterinary visits and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with moderate or unspecified targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits	Must have VHP, regular veterinary visits and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with stringent targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits

*Key criteria

Table A3.2: Scoring categories for beef cattle.

Criteria for beef cattle	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
STOCKMANSHIP, HANDLING, TRANSPORT & SLAUGHTER						
No use of electric goads	Electric goads permitted on farm and at the abattoir in accordance with legislation	Electric goads prohibited on farm but permitted by haulage and abattoir standards	N/A	N/A	N/A	Electric goads prohibited on farm and also by haulage and abattoir standards
Requirement for stockpeople to be trained/ competent/ experienced	No requirements regarding training or experience of stockpeople	N/A	Stockpeople must be suitably trained or experienced but no requirement to provide formal training in animal welfare or for training to be validated	Stockpeople must be suitably trained or experienced; formal training in animal welfare must be provided and records of training must be kept but no requirement for training to be validated	There must be at least one nominated person with responsibility for animal welfare (owner or manager) who must have attended a relevant validated training course; formal training in animal welfare must be provided for all stockpeople and records of training must be kept	All stockpeople must have attended a relevant validated training course and records of training must be kept
Frequent checks for signs of illness, injury or distress	N/A	N/A	N/A	Cattle must be checked at least once daily in systems where welfare depends on frequent human attention and sufficiently to avoid suffering in other systems (minimum legal requirement)	Housed cattle must be checked at least twice per day and other cattle sufficiently to avoid suffering OR All cattle must be checked at least once per day; vulnerable cattle (e.g. lactating cows, cows close to calving, young calves) must be checked at least twice per day	All cattle must be checked at least once per day; housed cattle and vulnerable cattle (e.g. lactating cows, cows close to calving, young calves) must be checked at least twice per day
Short transport duration*	Journeys over 12 hours including loading and unloading permitted	N/A	N/A	12 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 12 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)	8 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 8 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)	4 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 4 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)
No live export of cattle for slaughter or of calves to be reared for veal*	Live export of cattle for slaughter and calves for veal permitted	N/A	N/A	Live export of cattle for slaughter and calves for veal not specifically prohibited but limited by journey limit of 8 hours or less	Live export of calves for veal prohibited; live export of cattle for slaughter not specifically prohibited but limited by journey limit of 8 hours or less	Live export of cattle for slaughter and calves for veal prohibited

*Key criteria

Table A3.2: Scoring categories for beef cattle.

Criteria for beef cattle	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
No use of livestock markets	Livestock markets permitted in accordance with legislation	N/A	N/A	Livestock markets permitted but restrictions for young and pregnant animals beyond legal requirements	N/A	Livestock markets prohibited
Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death*	Slaughter without stunning permitted and/or no clear specifications for stunning parameters, no requirement for monitoring of effectiveness of stunning, maximum stun-stick interval may be greater than 60 seconds, no requirement to use chest/ thoracic stick and minimum bleed time may be less than 30 seconds	All cattle must be stunned and at least one of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) maximum stun-stick interval of 60 seconds 4) chest/ thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 30 seconds	All cattle must be stunned and at least two of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) maximum stun-stick interval of 60 seconds 4) chest/ thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 30 seconds	All cattle must be stunned and at least three of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) maximum stun-stick interval of 60 seconds 4) chest/ thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 30 seconds	All cattle must be stunned and at least four of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) maximum stun-stick interval of 60 seconds 4) chest/ thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 30 seconds	All cattle must be stunned; clear specifications for stunning parameters to ensure effective stun; monitoring of effectiveness of stunning required; maximum stun-stick interval of 60 seconds; chest/ thoracic stick must be used; minimum uninterrupted bleed time 30 seconds
Animal welfare policy and CCTV at abattoir and requirement for people involved in transporting and slaughtering of animals to be trained/ competent/ experienced	No requirement for personnel in charge of transporting cattle to be trained or for abattoirs to have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly, an appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered, a training programme in animal welfare for all staff or CCTV	At least one of 1) all personnel in charge of transporting cattle must be trained 2) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 3) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 4) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 5) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	At least two of 1) all personnel in charge of transporting cattle must be trained 2) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 3) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 4) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 5) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	At least three of 1) all personnel in charge of transporting cattle must be trained 2) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 3) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 4) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 5) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	At least four of 1) all personnel in charge of transporting cattle must be trained 2) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 3) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 4) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 5) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	All personnel in charge of transporting cattle must be trained; abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly; abattoirs must have appointed AWO who has completed a validated training course on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered; abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept; abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter

*Key criteria

Table A3.2: Scoring categories for beef cattle.

Criteria for beef cattle	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
GENETICS & BREEDING						
No breeds associated with increased incidence of health/welfare problems*	No stipulations on permitted genetics or sire choice	At least one of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems permitted 2) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of calving difficulties permitted or sire must be chosen to reduce likelihood of calving difficulties 3) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/calving ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 4) polled breed must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or disbudding/dehorning is prohibited and horns are left intact) 5) breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	At least two of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems permitted 2) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of calving difficulties permitted or sire must be chosen to reduce likelihood of calving difficulties 3) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/calving ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 4) polled breed must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or disbudding/dehorning prohibited and horns are left intact) 5) breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	At least three of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems permitted 2) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of calving difficulties permitted or sire must be chosen to reduce likelihood of calving difficulties 3) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/calving ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 4) polled breed must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or disbudding/dehorning prohibited and horns are left intact) 5) breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	At least four of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems permitted 2) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of calving difficulties permitted or sire must be chosen to reduce likelihood of calving difficulties 3) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/calving ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 4) polled breed must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or disbudding/dehorning prohibited and horns are left intact) 5) breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	Only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems or increased incidence of calving difficulties permitted; key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/calving ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary; polled breed must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or disbudding/dehorning prohibited and horns are left intact); breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions
High welfare standards for breeding bulls	See Table A3.4					
AUDITING						
Frequent inspections by certifying body	Inspections may be less frequent than every 24 months	Inspections at least every 24 months on average for all members	Inspections at least every 18 months on average for all members OR Inspections every 12 months initially and then up to 24 months with frequency determined by previous performance	Inspections at least every 15 months on average for all members OR Inspections every 6 months initially and then up to 24 months with frequency determined by previous performance	Inspections at least every 12 months on average for all members OR Inspections every 6 months initially and then up to 18 months with frequency determined by previous performance	Inspections every 6 months initially and then up to 12 months with frequency determined by previous performance
Targeted unannounced spot-checks	No spot checks	Spot checks for less than 10% of members annually (or proportion not specified); not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for less than 10% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced OR Spot checks for 10% of members annually but not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for 10% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced OR Spot checks for 20% of members annually but not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for 20% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced OR Spot checks for 30% of members annually but not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for 30% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced

*Key criteria

Table A3.2: Scoring categories for beef cattle.

Criteria for beef cattle	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set*	No assessment of welfare outcomes and no stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future	No assessment of welfare outcomes but stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future OR Informal observations of one or two welfare outcomes (e.g. injuries) during routine inspections but no formal recording of welfare outcomes and no targets set OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure records are being maintained	System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place but no targets set OR System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted and producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and either 1) farm-specific targets set by producers or 2) moderate (or unspecified) targets set by assurance scheme	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and stringent targets set by assurance scheme for all farms
Stringent measures to address non-compliance	No requirement to correct minor non-compliances	N/A	N/A	All non-compliances must be corrected but no defined timescale for correction; certification may be suspended or withdrawn for a serious non-compliance or multiple and/or repeated minor non-compliances	N/A	All non-compliances must be corrected within agreed timescale; certification may be suspended or withdrawn for a serious non-compliance or multiple and/or repeated minor non-compliances

*Key criteria

APPENDIX 3C

BEEF CATTLE

APPENDIX 3C: FULL RESULTS TABLE FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR BREEDING BULLS (BEEF)

Table A3.3: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for breeding bulls.

A maximum of 5 points is available for each criterion. Overall scores are converted to a score out of 5 and incorporated into the overall scoring of standards for beef cattle (see **Table A3.1**).

Specific criteria for breeding bulls	Assured British Meat (ABM)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
No tethering	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	5 (the use of housing systems in which cattle are tethered for the whole or part of the housing period is prohibited)	5 (prolonged routine tethering prohibited)	5 (routine tethering over long periods prohibited)
Adequate space allowance when housed	0 (minimum space allowance for bulls not specified)	0 (minimum space allowance for bulls not specified)	3 (minimum bedded lying area of 16m ² , and not less than 1m ² per 60kg bodyweight for larger bulls, plus exercise area of at least 25m ² ; total area = minimum 41m ²)	3 (minimum indoor area 10m ² /head plus exercise area of at least 30m ² ; total area = minimum 40m ²)	3 (minimum indoor area 10m ² /head plus exercise area of at least 30m ² ; total area = minimum 40m ²)
Appropriate flooring	0 (fully-slatted floors permitted)	0 (fully-slatted floors permitted)	4 (fully-slatted floors not specifically prohibited but bedded lying area must be provided)	4 (fully-slatted floors prohibited and bedded lying area required)	4 (fully-slatted floors prohibited – maximum 50% slatted – and bedded lying area required)
Provision of bedding	0 (no requirement to provide bedding for bulls)	0 (no requirement to provide bedding for bulls)	5 (bedded lying area required)	5 (bedded lying area required)	5 (bedded lying area required)
Free range access	0 (no requirement for outdoor access for housed bulls)	0 (no requirement for outdoor access for housed bulls)	0 (no requirement for outdoor access for housed bulls)	3 (bulls over one year old may be housed provided they have access to either pasture or an open-air run of at least 30m ²)	3 (bulls over one year old may be housed provided they have access to either pasture or an open-air run of at least 30m ²)
Social contact with other cattle	1 (bulls must be allowed to see and hear other cattle or general farm activity)	3 (bull housing must be situated in an appropriate area to allow social contact)	3 (bulls must be kept so as to allow them sight, sound and odour of other cattle and general farm activity)	3 (bulls must be kept in sight of other animals; recommends that breeding bulls are kept with other stock, e.g. dry cows, whenever possible)	3 (bulls must be kept in sight of other animals)
No dehorning/ disbudding	0 (disbudding permitted by chemical cauterisation without anaesthetic during first week of life or by hot iron with local anaesthetic up to two months of age; dehorning permitted – after 5 months must be performed by a vet)	0 (disbudding and dehorning permitted in accordance with legislation/ welfare code – by chemical cauterisation without anaesthetic during first week of life or by hot iron with local anaesthetic; dehorning permitted with anaesthetic)	3 (disbudding only permitted with hot iron and local anaesthetic; dehorning only permitted when carried out by a vet and must not be routine)	1 (disbudding and dehorning permitted with justification in accordance with legislation/ welfare code but not specifically stated whether anaesthetic and/or pain relief must be used)	1 (disbudding permitted in accordance with legislation/ welfare code but not specifically stated whether anaesthetic and/or pain relief must be used; must justify the need for disbudding in animal health plan)
Provision of adequate high-fibre feed to satisfy hunger and avoid increased risk of health problems	0 (no stipulations regarding feeding of fibre)	1 (in accordance with welfare code, sufficient roughage must be available in all diets to reduce the risk of inducing bloat or laminitis but no specific stipulations in standards regarding quantity of roughage)	1 (cattle must be provided with fibre to allow them to ruminate, which must be of such quality and length as to help avoid acidosis)	5 (after weaning at least 60% on a daily dry matter basis of the cattle's diet must consist of fresh or dried fodder, roughage or silage)	5 (after weaning at least 60% on a daily dry matter basis of the cattle's diet must consist of fresh or dried fodder, roughage or silage; feed rations that are high in energy and low in fibre or those that contain over 40% concentrates as dry matter percentage of the total diet are not permitted; cattle must graze fresh forage throughout the grazing season)

Table A3.3: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for breeding bulls.

Specific criteria for breeding bulls	Assured British Meat (ABM)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Regular veterinary visits and veterinary health plan with targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits	2 (no requirement for regular vet visits; must have written herd health plan reviewed annually; herd health and performance must be monitored; the setting of targets is strongly encouraged but not required)	3 (no requirement for regular vet visits; all disease problems, including lameness, scour or respiratory disease, must be actively addressed; must have animal health and disease control plan reviewed annually; includes improvement targets)	4 (must have at least 2 vet visits per year, at least 5 months apart; herd performance must be continually monitored, including production diseases, infectious diseases and injuries; the feet of all cattle must be inspected at least annually by a competent foot trimmer; must have veterinary health plan updated regularly; remedial action must be taken if parameters fall below tolerance limits)	1 (no requirement for regular veterinary visits; must have animal health plan submitted for approval and updated regularly; requirement to monitor health and welfare indicators or to set targets)	1 (no requirement for regular veterinary visits; must have animal health plan submitted for approval and reviewed regularly but no requirement to monitor health and welfare indicators or to set targets)
Short transport duration	0 (no limit on journey times beyond legal requirements)	0 (no limit on journey times beyond legal requirements)	4 (cattle including calves must not be transported for more than 8 hours, from loading of the first animal to unloading of the last animal)	4 (cattle must not be transported for more than 8 hours from loading of the first animal to unloading of the last animal, excluding sea journeys between the Scottish mainland and remote islands)	4 (cattle must not be transported for more than 8 hours from the start of loading to the end of unloading, except with permission, and must not be exported for slaughter)
Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death	2 (all cattle must be stunned; stun-stick interval must not exceed 60 seconds for penetrative captive bolt, 30 seconds for non-penetrative captive bolt and 10 seconds for electrical head-only stunning; monitoring of stunning and sticking method not specified; minimum bleed time 30 seconds)	0 (all cattle must be stunned; stun-stick interval must be as soon as practically possible, preferably within 60 seconds; stunning parameters, monitoring of stunning, sticking method and bleed time not specified)	5 (all cattle must be stunned; electrical parameters specified in terms of current, frequency and duration; the AWO must make frequent and thorough checks throughout the day to ensure that animals are being effectively stunned and are insensible throughout the slaughter operation; stun-stick interval must not exceed 60 seconds; bleeding must be with a chest stick; minimum bleed time 30 seconds)	3 (all cattle must be stunned; maximum stun-stick interval 60 seconds; bleeding must be with a chest/ thoracic stick; minimum bleed time 30 seconds; stunning parameters and monitoring of stunning not specified)	4 (all cattle must be stunned; if stunning is automated a trained and licensed operator must be present at all times to check the stun/kill operation; stun-stick interval must be less than 60 seconds; bleeding must be with a chest/thoracic stick; minimum bleed time 30 seconds; stunning parameters not specified)
No breeds associated with increased incidence of health/ welfare problems	1 (no restriction on permitted breeds; sires must be selected carefully, taking into account breed, size, age and previous record, to reduce the likelihood of calving difficulties, especially with maiden heifers; no requirement to use polled breed or to breed for polling)	0 (no restriction on permitted breeds or choice of sire and no requirement to use polled breed or to breed for polling)	1 (no restriction on permitted breeds; stockpeople must be aware of welfare requirements during breeding, particularly the selection of suitable bulls, semen and embryos for use in heifers; no requirement to use polled breed or to breed for polling)	3 (breeds must be chosen to avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production and to avoid problems at birth, but no requirement to demonstrate that key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/ calving ease are within acceptable limits; choice of breeds must take account of the capacity of the animals to adapt to local conditions and their vitality and resistance to disease; no requirement to use polled breed or to breed for polling)	3 (breeds must be chosen to avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production and to avoid problems at birth, but no requirement to demonstrate that key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/ calving ease are within acceptable limits; breeds must be chosen that can adapt to the organic system and local conditions and that have vitality and resistance to disease; no requirement to use polled breed or to breed for polling)

Table A3.3: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for breeding bulls.

Specific criteria for breeding bulls	Assured British Meat (ABM)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set	0 (no assessment of welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	2 (QMS is piloting assessments based on Qualitative Behaviour Assessment (QBA) developed by the Scottish Agricultural College (SAC); in the longer term some BWAP measures may also be incorporated)	3 (RSPCA has developed a system of assessment of welfare outcomes and is working with other standard setters and Bristol University to further develop outcome measures; assessments of welfare outcomes on beef cattle farms are not yet underway; producers set themselves targets and intervention levels in VHP; checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met)	0 (no assessment of welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	3 (SA has a programme of assessments based on the Bristol Welfare Assurance Programme (BWAP); observations for beef cattle are thin (BCS <2), fat (BCS >3.5), skin lesions, lameness, dirtiness, behaviour – general; no targets set for beef cattle yet but plan to introduce targets)
Total for breeding bull criteria	6/65	9/65	41/65	40/65	44/65
Welfare score for breeding bulls carried over to Table A3.1	0/5	1/5	3/5	3/5	3/5

APPENDIX 3D

BEEF CATTLE

APPENDIX 3D: SCORING CATEGORIES FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR BREEDING BULLS (BEEF)

Table A3.4: Scoring categories for breeding bulls.

Criteria for breeding bulls	Score 0	Score 1	Score 2	Score 3	Score 4	Score 5
No tethering	Routine prolonged tethering permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Routine prolonged tethering prohibited
Adequate space allowance when housed	Minimum total area may be less than 32m ² /bull	Minimum total area of at least 32m ² /bull	Minimum total area of at least 36m ² /bull	Minimum total area of at least 40m ² /bull	Minimum total area of at least 44m ² /bull	Minimum total area of at least 48m ² /bull
Appropriate flooring	Fully-slatted floors permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	Fully-slatted floors prohibited and bedded lying area	Floors must be entirely solid and bedded lying area required
Provision of bedding	No requirement to provide bedding material	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Bedded lying area required
Free range access	Permanent indoor housing permitted	N/A	N/A	Bulls must have permanent access to an outdoor exercise area but not necessarily pasture	N/A	Bulls must have access to pasture at least during the grazing season throughout their life, but may be housed over winter
Social contact with other cattle	No requirement for bulls to be able to see other cattle or general farm activity	Bulls must be able to see other cattle or general farm activity	N/A	Bulls must be able to see other cattle	N/A	Bulls must be kept with other stock, e.g. dry cows
No dehorning/ disbudding	Disbudding permitted during first week of life by chemical cauterisation without anaesthetic or by hot iron with anaesthetic; dehorning permitted with anaesthetic (minimum legal requirements)	Disbudding permitted only with justification	N/A	Disbudding permitted only with anaesthetic; dehorning prohibited or must only be carried out by a vet with anaesthetic and must not be routine	N/A	Disbudding and dehorning prohibited
Provision of adequate high-fibre feed to avoid increased risk of health problems	No requirements regarding the feeding of fibre	N/A	Sufficient fibre must be available in all diets to reduce the risk of health problems but no specific stipulations regarding the quantity of roughage	Cattle must have access to pasture during the grazing season and sufficient roughage must be available in all diets to reduce the risk of health problems but no specific stipulations regarding the quantity of roughage	N/A	Cattle must have access to pasture during the grazing season and, after weaning, at least 60% on a daily dry matter basis of the cattle's diet must consist of fresh or dried fodder, roughage or silage

Table A3.4: Scoring categories for breeding bulls.

Criteria for breeding bulls	Score 0	Score 1	Score 2	Score 3	Score 4	Score 5
Regular veterinary visits and veterinary health plan with targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits	No requirement for VHP, regular veterinary visits or monitoring of health and welfare and performance parameters	Must have VHP but no requirement for monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters or regular veterinary visits	Must have VHP and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters but no requirement for targets or regular veterinary visits	Must have VHP, regular veterinary visits and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters but no targets required	Must have VHP, regular veterinary visits and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with moderate or unspecified targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits	Must have VHP, regular veterinary visits and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with stringent targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits
Short transport duration	Journeys over 12 hours including loading and unloading permitted	N/A	N/A	12 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 12 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)	8 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 8 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)	4 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 4 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)
Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death	Slaughter without stunning permitted and/or no clear specifications for stunning parameters, no requirement for monitoring of effectiveness of stunning, maximum stun-stick interval may be greater than 60 seconds, no requirement to use chest/ thoracic stick and minimum bleed time may be less than 30 seconds	All cattle must be stunned and at least one of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) maximum stun-stick interval of 60 seconds 4) chest/ thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 30 seconds	All cattle must be stunned and at least two of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) maximum stun-stick interval of 60 seconds 4) chest/ thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 30 seconds	All cattle must be stunned and at least three of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) maximum stun-stick interval of 60 seconds 4) chest/ thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 30 seconds	All cattle must be stunned and at least four of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) maximum stun-stick interval of 60 seconds 4) chest/ thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 30 seconds	All cattle must be stunned; clear specifications for stunning parameters to ensure effective stun; monitoring of effectiveness of stunning required; maximum stun-stick interval of 60 seconds; chest/ thoracic stick must be used; minimum uninterrupted bleed time 30 seconds
No breeds associated with increased incidence of health/ welfare problems	No stipulations on permitted genetics or sire choice	At least one of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems associated with production level permitted 2) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of calving difficulties permitted or sire must be chosen to reduce likelihood of calving difficulties, especially for maiden heifers 3) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/ calving ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 4) polled breed must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or disbudding/ dehorning is prohibited and horns are left intact) 5) breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	At least two of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems associated with production level permitted 2) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of calving difficulties permitted or sire must be chosen to reduce likelihood of calving difficulties, especially for maiden heifers 3) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/ calving ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 4) polled breed must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or disbudding/ dehorning prohibited and horns are left intact) 5) breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	At least three of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems associated with production level permitted 2) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of calving difficulties permitted or sire must be chosen to reduce likelihood of calving difficulties, especially for maiden heifers 3) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/ calving ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 4) polled breed must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or disbudding/ dehorning prohibited and horns are left intact) 5) breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	At least four of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems associated with production level permitted 2) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of calving difficulties permitted or sire must be chosen to reduce likelihood of calving difficulties, especially for maiden heifers 3) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/ calving ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 4) polled breed must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or disbudding/ dehorning prohibited and horns are left intact) 5) breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	Only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems associated with production level or increased incidence of calving difficulties permitted; key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/calving ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary; polled breed must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (and/or disbudding/ dehorning prohibited and horns are left intact); breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions

Table A3.4: Scoring categories for breeding bulls.

Criteria for breeding bulls	Score 0	Score 1	Score 2	Score 3	Score 4	Score 5
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set	No assessment of welfare outcomes and no stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future	No assessment of welfare outcomes but stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future OR Informal observations of one or two welfare outcomes (e.g. injuries) during routine inspections but no formal recording of welfare outcomes and no targets set OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure records are being maintained	System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place but no targets set OR System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted and producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and either 1) farm-specific targets set by producers or 2) moderate (or unspecified) targets set by assurance scheme	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and stringent targets set by assurance scheme for all farms

APPENDIX 4A

SHEEP

APPENDIX 4A: FULL RESULTS TABLE FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR SHEEP

Table A4.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for sheep.

Up to 5 points are available for each criterion. Key criteria (marked with an asterisk) are weighted so that they are worth double points (i.e. up to 10 points for each key criterion). Score for breeding ram welfare is derived from **Table A4.3**. Criteria are grouped into five sets. Totals for each set of criteria are converted to scores out of 20, which are totalled to give an overall score out of 100 for each scheme (see **Table 3.4**).

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for sheep	Assured British Meat (ABM)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
ENVIRONMENT						
No close confinement	No tethering*	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	10 (sheep must not be closely confined, except for the shortest time possible during certain procedures; from 1st September 2010, close restraint of ewes for the purpose of lamb fostering will be prohibited)	10 (prolonged routine tethering prohibited)	10 (routine tethering over long periods prohibited)
Adequate space allowance when housed	Adequate space allowance when housed*	2 (guideline space allowances when housed range depending on body weight and age from 1 to 1.4m ² per ewe, 1.8 to 2.2m ² per ewe with young lambs, 0.5 to 0.6m ² per lamb up to 12 weeks, 0.75 to 0.9m ² per lamb/ sheep from 12 weeks to 12 months)	2 (guideline space allowances when housed, in accordance with welfare code, range depending on body weight and age from 1 to 1.4m ² per ewe, 1.8 to 2.2m ² per ewe with young lambs, 0.5 to 0.9m ² per lamb/ sheep up to 12 months)	4 (minimum bedded lying area when housed ranges depending on body weight and age from 1.1 to 1.4m ² per ewe, 1.3 to 2.2m ² per ewe with young lambs, 0.7 to 1m ² per hogget; total floor space provided must be at least 1.5 times the lying area; recommends that space allowances are increased by around 20% for lactating dairy ewes, especially of higher yielding breeds)	10 (minimum bedded lying area when housed of 1.5m ² per sheep and 0.35m ² per lamb, plus additional exercise area excluding pasturage of 2.5m ² per sheep with 0.5m ² per lamb)	4 (minimum lying/ indoor area when housed of 1.5m ² per sheep, 0.35m ² per lamb; 2m ² per ewe with a single lamb and an additional 0.35m ² per additional lamb)
Appropriate housing design	Appropriate flooring	0 (fully-slatted floors permitted)	0 (fully-slatted floors permitted; welfare code recommends that young lambs should not be put on slatted floors unless bedding is provided)	4 (fully-slatted floors not specifically prohibited but bedded lying area must be provided)	4 (fully-slatted floors prohibited and bedded lying area required)	4 (fully-slatted floors prohibited – maximum 50% slatted – and bedded lying area required)
Provision of appropriate bedding/ litter/ enrichment material	Provision of bedding*	0 (no requirement to provide bedding)	0 (no requirement to provide bedding)	10 (bedded lying area must be provided)	10 (sheep must be provided with ample dry bedding in the lying area)	10 (sheep must be provided with ample dry bedding in the lying area)
Provision of appropriate nesting facilities	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A

*Key criteria

Table A4.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for sheep.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for sheep	Assured British Meat (ABM)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Appropriate lighting	Appropriate light intensity and light/dark periods	1 (during daylight hours the level of natural or artificial lighting must be such that housed sheep can be seen clearly; must be adequate to meet animals' ethological needs and must have appropriate period of rest from artificial lighting in accordance with legislation)	1 (in accordance with welfare code, during daylight hours the level of natural or artificial lighting should be such that housed sheep can be seen clearly; must be adequate to meet animals' ethological needs and must have appropriate period of rest from artificial lighting in accordance with legislation)	4 (access to natural daylight during the grazing season; 100 lux during the normal period of daylight hours; appropriate period of rest from artificial lighting required by legislation)	5 (access to natural daylight throughout the year – must have access to outdoor exercise area when housed unless shed is open-fronted)	3 (access to natural daylight during grazing season; when housed over winter, exercise area may be inside and suitable lighting must be provided but duration and intensity not specified; must be adequate to meet animals' ethological needs and must have appropriate period of rest from artificial lighting in accordance with legislation)
Free range access	Free range access*	0 (permanent indoor housing permitted)	0 (permanent indoor housing permitted)	8 (during the grass-growing season, weather conditions permitting, all sheep must derive the bulk of their nutrient requirements from grazing at pasture, except in the case of dairy ewes, which will require supplementary concentrates in addition to grazing)	8 (sheep must have access to pasture, except that they may be housed for lambing and/or over winter; must have outdoor exercise area when housed, unless shed is open-fronted in which case, with approval, exercise area can be indoors)	8 (sheep must have access to pasture, except that they may be housed for lambing and/or over winter)
Adequate outdoor space	Low outdoor stocking density	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	5 (outdoor stocking density must be low enough to prevent poaching of the soil and over-grazing of vegetation at all times of year)	5 (outdoor stocking density must be low enough to prevent poaching of the soil, over-grazing of vegetation and pollution of watercourses)
Appropriate shelter/shade and protection from predators	Provision of shelter and shade for outdoor sheep	3 (sheep kept outdoors must have access to a sheltered well-drained lying area)	3 (out-wintered sheep must be provided with the opportunity to shelter and must have access to a suitably drained lying area)	5 (all sheep must have access to effective shade and shelter and a dry lying area)	5 (free range and open air exercise areas must provide sufficient protection against rain, wind, sun and extreme temperatures depending on local weather conditions and breed)	5 (stock must be provided with sufficient protection against rain, wind, sun and extreme temperatures depending on local conditions and breed)
Appropriate social grouping	Small, stable and appropriate social groups	1 (when housed, stock should be grouped in appropriate social groups according to size and age except for ewe-lamb groupings; no requirement to limit group size but where possible, pregnant ewes should be kept in groups of less than 50)	1 (animals must be grouped in appropriate social groups; no requirement to limit group size but welfare code recommends that, where possible, pregnant ewes should be kept in groups of less than 50, and that, until weaning, housed lambs should be kept in small groups to facilitate inspection and limit spread of disease)	2 (group size must be determined according to the age, size and class of stock; for at least the first 3 weeks, housed lambs must be kept in groups small enough to facilitate inspection and limit spread of disease; sheep must be transported in social groups established at least 1 week prior to transport)	3 (animals must be kept in reasonably stable groups; when housed over winter, there must be no more than 40 sheep per pen; when housed for lambing there must be no more than 100 sheep per pen; steps must be taken to reduce stress during transport, including avoiding mixing of animals from different social groups)	2 (when housed over winter, there must be no more than 40 sheep per pen; when housed for lambing there must be no more than 100 sheep per pen; mixing of animals from different social groups for transport must be avoided)

*Key criteria

Table A4.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for sheep.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for sheep	Assured British Meat (ABM)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
HUSBANDRY						
No mutilations	No tail docking*	0 (tail docking permitted; no requirement to use anaesthetic if performed during first week of life by application of rubber ring)	0 (tail docking permitted in accordance with legislation/ welfare code; no requirement to use anaesthetic if performed during first week of life by application of rubber ring)	2 (tail docking must only be carried out with written permission from the scheme; when necessary may be performed using rubber ring between 24 hours and 7 days of age without anaesthetic, or using thermocautery up to 8 weeks under vet advice)	2 (tail docking permitted with justification in accordance with legislation/ welfare code but not specifically stated whether anaesthetic and/or pain relief must be used)	2 (tail docking permitted with justification by hot iron between 3 and 6 weeks of age with anaesthetic or by rubber ring up to 7 days of age without anaesthetic)
	No castration*	0 (castration permitted; no requirement to use anaesthetic up to 3 months of age)	0 (castration permitted; no requirement to use anaesthetic up to 3 months of age)	2 (castration permitted only with written permission from the scheme; castration must not be carried out if the predicted slaughter age of ram lambs is below sexual maturity and if management practice allows flock segregation; when necessary may be performed using rubber ring between 24 hours and 7 days of age; bloodless castrator may be used up to 8 weeks in the event of failure or unintentional omission; no requirement to use anaesthetic)	2 (castration permitted with justification but not specifically stated whether anaesthetic and/or pain relief must be used)	2 (castration permitted with justification by burdizzo up to 6 weeks of age with anaesthetic or by rubber ring up to 7 days of age without anaesthetic)
No use of genetic engineering/ cloning or invasive reproductive technologies associated with health or welfare problems	No use of genetically modified or cloned animals or their offspring	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	4 (livestock must not be brought in that have been produced using transgenic or other genetic engineering techniques; cloning is effectively prohibited by prohibitions on breeding practices that make livestock systems over-reliant on inappropriate technology and any surgical or chemical interference other than procedures specifically permitted in the standards, but no restriction on the use of the offspring of cloned animals)	4 (livestock must not be brought in that have been produced using transgenic or other genetic engineering techniques; use of cloning is prohibited but no restriction on the use of the offspring of cloned animals)

*Key criteria

Table A4.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for sheep.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for sheep	Assured British Meat (ABM)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Appropriate feeding	Provision of adequate high-fibre feed to avoid increased risk of health problems*	0 (no stipulations regarding feeding of fibre)	0 (welfare code recommends, where sheep are fed a high cereal-based diet, a gradual introductory feeding period is required, during which sufficient roughage or high-fibre concentrate feed is also provided but no minimum requirements for feeding fibre)	6 (sheep must be provided with adequate suitable fibre to allow them to ruminate; during the grass-growing season, weather conditions permitting, all sheep must derive the bulk of their nutrient requirements from grazing at pasture, except in the case of dairy ewes, which will require supplementary concentrates in addition to grazing)	10 (after weaning at least 60% on a daily dry matter basis of the sheep's diet must consist of fresh or dried fodder, roughage or silage; access to pasture required during grazing season)	10 (after weaning at least 60% on a daily dry matter basis of the sheep's diet must consist of fresh or dried fodder, roughage or silage; access to pasture required during grazing season)
Appropriate weaning age	Appropriate weaning age*	0 (no minimum specified)	2 (in accordance with welfare code lambs should receive liquid feed at regular intervals each day for at least the first 4 weeks of life)	0 (lambs from non-dairy flocks must not be weaned before 5 weeks; dairy lambs must not be weaned before they are capable of consuming sufficient quantities of solid feed to fulfil nutritional requirements – as a guide, not less than 3-4 weeks)	8 (minimum 45 days)	8 (minimum 45 days)
Adequate monitoring of health and welfare by producers	Regular veterinary visits and veterinary health plan with targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits*	2 (no requirement for regular vet visits; must have written flock health plan reviewed annually; no requirement to monitor health and welfare indicators or to set targets)	6 (no requirement for regular vet visits; all disease problems, including lameness, sheep scab, scour or respiratory disease, must be actively addressed; must have animal health and disease control plan reviewed annually, which should include improvement targets)	8 (must have at least 1 vet visit per year for finishing units and at least 2 for breeding units; flock performance must be continually monitored for signs of disease or production disorders; the condition of the feet must be regularly inspected; must have veterinary health plan updated regularly; must include detailed lameness prevention and control plan and targets for a range of parameters; remedial action must be taken if parameters fall below tolerance limits)	2 (no requirement for regular veterinary visits; must have animal health plan submitted for approval and updated regularly; no requirement to monitor health and welfare indicators or to set targets)	2 (no requirement for regular veterinary visits; must have animal health plan submitted for approval and reviewed regularly; no requirement to monitor health and welfare indicators or to set targets)

STOCKMANSHIP, HANDLING, TRANSPORT & SLAUGHTER

Appropriate handling	No use of electric goods	5 (prohibited by legislation)	5 (prohibited by legislation)	5 (prohibited)	5 (prohibited)	5 (prohibited)
Promotion of high quality stockmanship	Requirement for stockpeople to be trained/ competent/ experienced	2 (there must be sufficient people available who are competent based on experience and/or training; records of training, qualifications and experience must be kept; staff must be able to demonstrate competence before being given responsibility for the welfare of stock)	2 (all people involved in managing the running of the unit must demonstrate competence in stockmanship and may be required to demonstrate what training is given to new stockpersons)	3 (all managers and stockpeople must be thoroughly trained, skilled and competent in animal husbandry and welfare; managers must develop and implement a training programme for stockpeople with regular updates and keep records of training; stockpeople must be properly trained before being given responsibility for the welfare of stock and must be able to demonstrate competence)	2 (in accordance with legislation/ welfare code animals must be cared for by a sufficient number of competent staff; no requirement to provide training in animal welfare or to keep records of training)	2 (in accordance with legislation/ welfare code animals must be cared for by a sufficient number of competent staff; no requirement to provide training in animal welfare or to keep records of training)

*Key criteria

Table A4.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for sheep.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for sheep	Assured British Meat (ABM)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Frequent checks for signs of illness, injury or distress	Frequent checks for signs of illness, injury or distress	5 (flocks must be inspected at least once daily where practicable when outdoors and at least twice daily when housed)	3 (sheep must be inspected in accordance with legislation/ welfare code – at least once daily in systems where welfare depends on frequent human attention and sufficiently to avoid suffering in other systems)	4 (when sheep are housed they must be inspected at least twice daily; where any type of mesh fencing is use, outdoor sheep must be inspected at least once daily or twice daily if around lambing field)	3 (not specified but frequency of inspection must be noted in animal health plan which must be submitted to SFQC for approval; must comply with legislation and welfare codes – at least once daily in systems where welfare depends on frequent human attention and sufficiently to avoid suffering in other systems)	3 (not specified but must comply with legislation and welfare codes – at least once daily in systems where welfare depends on frequent human attention and sufficiently to avoid suffering in other systems)
Short transport duration	Short transport duration*	0 (no limit on journey times beyond legal requirements)	0 (no limit on journey times beyond legal requirements)	8 (sheep must not be transported for more than 8 hours, from loading of the first animal to unloading of the last animal)	8 (sheep must not be transported for more than 8 hours from loading of the first animal to unloading of the last animal, excluding sea journeys between the Scottish mainland and remote islands)	8 (sheep must not be transported for more than 8 hours from the start of loading to the end of unloading, except with permission)
No live export	No live export of sheep for slaughter*	0 (live export of sheep for slaughter permitted)	0 (live export of sheep for slaughter permitted)	8 (live export of sheep for slaughter not specifically prohibited but will be restricted by 8 hour journey limit)	8 (live export of sheep for slaughter not specifically prohibited but will be restricted by 8 hour journey limit)	10 (live export of sheep for slaughter prohibited)
No use of livestock markets	No use of livestock markets	0 (sheep and lambs may be bought and sold through livestock markets in accordance with legislation)	0 (sheep and lambs may be bought and sold through livestock markets in accordance with legislation/ welfare code)	5 (sheep must not be presented for sale at livestock markets)	3 (sheep under 12 weeks old and pregnant sheep must not be purchased, collected or sold through livestock markets)	3 (lambs under 45 days old without their dam and ewes over 3 months in lamb must not be sold through livestock markets)
Humane slaughter	Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death*	4 (all sheep must be stunned; stun-stick interval must not exceed 15 seconds; monitoring of stunning and sticking method not specified; minimum bleed time 20 seconds)	2 (all sheep must be stunned; stun-stick interval must not exceed 15 seconds; stunning parameters, monitoring of stunning, sticking method and bleed time not specified)	8 (all sheep must be stunned; electrical parameters specified in terms of current, frequency and duration; the AWO must make frequent and thorough checks throughout the day to ensure that animals are being effectively stunned and are insensible throughout the slaughter operation; effectiveness of stunning must be monitored and recorded at the start of stunning and at least every 2 hours after that with at least 10 animals checked each time; stun-stick interval must not exceed 15 seconds; bleeding may be with a chest or throat cut – if throat, both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed; minimum bleed time 20 seconds)	6 (all sheep must be stunned; maximum stun-stick interval 20 seconds; bleeding must be with a chest/ thoracic stick; minimum bleed time 20 seconds; stunning parameters and monitoring of stunning not specified)	8 (all sheep must be stunned; if stunning is automated a trained and licensed operator must be present at all times to check the stun/kill operation; stun-stick interval must be less than 20 seconds; bleeding must be with a chest/thoracic stick; minimum bleed time 20 seconds; stunning parameters not specified)

*Key criteria

Table A4.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for sheep.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for sheep	Assured British Meat (ABM)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Promotion of high welfare standards in the handling of animals during transport and slaughter	Animal welfare policy and CCTV at abattoir and requirement for people involved in transporting and slaughtering of animals to be trained/ competent/ experienced	4 (haulage scheme requires that all drivers must be trained and records kept; producers may also transport their own stock; abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly; there must be a trained AWO on duty at all times during operational hours who must have undertaken an external training course; all persons involved in the handling of livestock must be suitably trained – ideally all staff should have completed an AWO training course or can be trained under the instruction of the AWO; records of training must be kept; no requirement for CCTV)	2 (haulage scheme requires that drivers hold a certificate of competence; producers may also transport their own stock; abattoirs must have at least one member of staff on site who has been formally trained to a recognised certified standard; no requirement for CCTV)	4 (personnel in charge of sheep transporters must have completed an approved training course, preferably validated; abattoirs must have a written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly; there must be at least one appointed AWO who must have attended a validated training programme and must be present on site at all times whilst slaughter is being carried out; there must be a training programme for all staff which includes use of HSA training video; “installation of CCTV in abattoirs is not currently required but will be introduced from Nov 2011)	2 (no stipulations on training of drivers beyond legal requirements; abattoirs must have a training programme that includes animal welfare; records of training for all staff must be kept; there must be a nominated person who is responsible for animal welfare and they must be trained and competent; a suitably trained and competent person must oversee the unloading of every animal including those arriving out-of-hours; no requirement for CCTV)	3 (no stipulations on training of drivers beyond legal requirements; abattoirs must have a documented quality management system which covers animal welfare and is reviewed regularly; must have a training programme that includes animal welfare and is ongoing with induction and refresher training, further training specific to the job and retraining when there are any problems or when new procedures are introduced; records of training for all operators must be kept; when there are live animals there must always be someone present who is responsible for animal welfare and they must be trained and competent – AWO or abattoir owner/ operator; a suitably trained and competent person must oversee the unloading of every animal including those arriving out-of-hours; no requirement for CCTV)

GENETICS & BREEDING

No use of breeds associated with increased incidence of health/ welfare problems	No breeds associated with increased incidence of health/ welfare problems*	2 (no restriction on permitted breeds; when breeding, sires must be selected carefully taking into account breed, age, size and previous record to reduce the likelihood of birthing difficulties; no requirement to use breeds less susceptible to fly strike or to breed for this)	0 (no restriction on permitted breeds or choice of sire; health must be monitored but no requirement to change genetics if parameters not within acceptable limits; no requirement to use breeds less susceptible to fly strike or to breed for this)	0 (no restriction on permitted breeds or choice of sire; key health and welfare parameters must be monitored but no requirement to change genetics if not within acceptable limits; no requirement to use breeds less susceptible to fly strike or to breed for this)	6 (breeds must be chosen to avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production and to avoid problems at birth, but no requirement to demonstrate that key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate/ production level/ lambing ease are within acceptable limits; choice of breeds must take account of the capacity of the animals to adapt to local conditions and their vitality and resistance to disease; no requirement to use breeds less susceptible to fly strike or to breed for this)	6 (breeds must be chosen to avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production and to avoid problems at birth, but no requirement to demonstrate that key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate/ production level/ lambing ease are within acceptable limits; breeds must be chosen that can adapt to the organic system and local conditions and that have vitality and resistance to disease; no requirement to use breeds less susceptible to fly strike or to breed for this)
---	---	---	--	--	---	--

*Key criteria

Table A4.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for sheep.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for sheep	Assured British Meat (ABM)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
High welfare standards for breeding animals	See Table A4.3 for scoring of breeding ram welfare	1	1	3	3	3
No killing of surplus male animals	No killing of male dairy lambs	0 (no requirement to avoid killing male lambs)	0 (no requirement to avoid killing male lambs)	0 (no requirement to avoid killing male lambs)	0 (no requirement to avoid killing male lambs)	0 (no requirement to avoid killing male lambs)
AUDITING						
Frequent inspections	Frequent inspections by certifying body	2 (inspections at least every 18 months to allow visits at different times of year)	4 (inspections annually; time between inspections may be shorter or longer to allow visits at different times of year)	4 (inspections annually; time between inspections may be shorter or longer up to 15 months to allow visits at different times of year)	4 (inspections annually)	4 (inspections annually)
Spot-checks	Targeted unannounced spot-checks	1 (routine inspections are supplemented by some random spot checks at short notice)	2 (around 10% of farms receive additional spot-checks; farms selected at random except that all farms for which a complaint has been received from any source will be included; may be unannounced)	5 (RSPCA monitor approx 35% of all members and 50% of monitoring visits are unannounced; all monitoring visits are made on a risk assessment basis following annual inspection – farms with non-compliances at assessment will get a monitoring visit)	1 (spot checks are carried out as a routine part of verifying continuous compliance with the standards; may be unannounced; no information supplied to indicate that spot checks are targeted or the proportion of farms receiving spot checks; additional assessments are also carried out where a major change or deviation has been made from the approved farm plan)	3 (there is a programme of additional unannounced inspections over and above the annual visits; these target those who are considered to be higher risk or where specific risks have been identified, e.g. end of derogation periods, parallel production, following up complaints; around 10% of farms receive additional spot-checks or follow-up visits each year)
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme	Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set*	0 (no assessment of welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	4 (QMS is piloting assessments based on Qualitative Behaviour Assessment (QBA) developed by the Scottish Agricultural College (SAC); in the longer term some BWAP measures may also be incorporated)	6 (RSPCA has developed a system of assessment of welfare outcomes and is working with other standard setters and Bristol University to further develop outcome measures; assessments of welfare outcomes on sheep farms are not yet underway; producers set themselves targets and intervention levels in VHP; checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met)	0 (no assessment of welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	6 (SA has a programme of assessments based on the Bristol Welfare Assurance Programme (BWAP); observations for sheep are wool loss, skin lesions, lameness, dirtiness, behaviour – general; no targets set for sheep yet but plan to introduce targets)

*Key criteria

Table A4.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for sheep.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for sheep	Assured British Meat (ABM)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Measures to address non-compliance	Stringent measures to address non-compliance	<p>5 (all non-conformances must be corrected; a major non-conformance against one of the 'key standards' will result in suspension of certification until it is corrected; non-conformances against 'other standards' should not result in suspension provided they are corrected within an agreed timescale, normally within 28 days of the assessment; certification may also be suspended in the case of a large number of such non-conformances or in the event of the same non-conformance being found on successive assessment visits)</p>	<p>5 (non-compliance categorised as minor or major; non-compliances must be corrected within an agreed timescale; major non-compliance results in immediate suspension of certification)</p>	<p>5 (all non-compliances must be corrected as soon as possible; certificates are withdrawn after 8 weeks if the Freedom Food certification panel have not received corrective actions and objective evidence to verify compliance; a producer who has their certificate withdrawn due to non-compliance at assessment has 3 unannounced visits by Freedom Food over the next 6 months to ensure compliance is being maintained)</p>	<p>5 (where welfare issues are identified during an inspection, the Certification Officer sets the member targets to be implemented or in extreme cases passes on to SFQC Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) for the SOPA scheme for a full set of new plans and targets to be drawn up; if the targets are not met within a specific time scale then the member is withdrawn from the SOPA scheme; in some cases a specific category of livestock may be de-certified)</p>	<p>5 (an action summary form is drawn up following inspection, listing non-compliances and asking how they will be corrected, with a deadline for return of the completed form; actions to correct non-compliances must be approved before a licence is issued or continued; an additional inspection may be carried out to make sure non-compliances have been corrected; non-compliance categorised as minor, major, critical or manifest infringement; certification will normally be suspended for part or whole of the enterprise in response to critical non-compliance or multiple or unresolved major non-compliance)</p>

APPENDIX 4B

SHEEP

APPENDIX 4B: SCORING CATEGORIES FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR SHEEP

Table A4.2: Scoring categories for sheep.

Criteria for sheep	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
ENVIRONMENT						
No tethering*	Routine prolonged tethering permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Routine prolonged tethering prohibited
Adequate space allowance when housed*	Minimum total area may be less than 1.2m ² per average ewe	Minimum total area of at least 1.2m ² per average ewe	Minimum total area of at least 1.5m ² per average ewe	Minimum total area of at least 2m ² per average ewe	Minimum total area of at least 3m ² per average ewe	Minimum total area of at least 4m ² per average ewe
Appropriate flooring	Fully-slatted floors permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	Fully-slatted floors prohibited (or bedded lying area required) for all sheep	Flooring must be entirely solid for all sheep
Provision of bedding*	No requirement to provide bedding material	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Bedding material required for all sheep
Appropriate light intensity and light/dark periods	N/A	During daylight hours the level of natural or artificial lighting must be such that housed livestock can be seen clearly; there must be an appropriate period of rest from artificial lighting but no minimum dark period specified (minimum legal requirements)	No requirement for access to natural daylight; minimum 100 lux during daylight hours when housed	Access to natural daylight at least during grazing season; lighting when housed must meet minimum legislative standards but intensity may be less than 100 lux	Access to natural daylight at least during grazing season; minimum 100 lux during daylight hours when housed	Access to natural daylight throughout the year
Free range access*	Permanent indoor housing permitted	All sheep must have access to an outdoor exercise area but not necessarily pasture	N/A	N/A	All sheep must be kept at pasture at least during the grazing season throughout their life, but may be housed for lambing and/or over winter	All sheep must be kept at pasture at least during the grazing season throughout their life, but may be housed for lambing and/or over winter provided the total housed period is no more than one third of their life (i.e. lambs born early in the season must not be sent to slaughter until they have spent two thirds of their life at pasture)
Low outdoor stocking density	No stipulations regarding outdoor stocking density	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Outdoor stocking density must be low enough to prevent poaching of the soil and over-grazing of vegetation
Provision of shelter and shade for outdoor sheep	No requirement for shelter or shade for outdoor sheep	N/A	N/A	Outdoor sheep must have access to a sheltered dry lying area but no requirement for adequate shade during summer	N/A	Adequate shelter required during winter and adequate shade required during summer

*Key criteria

Table A4.2: Scoring categories for sheep.

Criteria for sheep	Score 0	Score 1	Score 2	Score 3	Score 4	Score 5
Small, stable and appropriate social groups	No requirement to group sheep appropriately, to maintain stable groups, to limit group size or to avoid mixing of sheep from different social groups for transport	At least one of 1) sheep must be grouped according to size and age (except for ewe-lamb groups) 2) sheep must be kept in stable groups 3) group size limited to no more than 100 sheep when housed 4) mixing of sheep from different groups for transport must be avoided or groups for transport must be formed in time to allow them to stabilise prior to transport	At least two of 1) sheep must be grouped according to size and age (except for ewe-lamb groups) 2) sheep must be kept in stable groups 3) group size limited to no more than 100 sheep when housed 4) mixing of sheep from different groups for transport must be avoided or groups for transport must be formed in time to allow them to stabilise prior to transport	At least three of 1) sheep must be grouped according to size and age (except for ewe-lamb groups) 2) sheep must be kept in stable groups 3) group size limited to no more than 100 sheep when housed 4) mixing of sheep from different groups for transport must be avoided or groups for transport must be formed in time to allow them to stabilise prior to transport	When housed, sheep must be kept in stable groups of no more than 100 animals of similar size and age (except for ewe-lamb groups); sheep from different social groups must not be mixed for transport	When housed, sheep must be kept in stable groups of no more than 50 animals of similar size and age (except for ewe-lamb groups); sheep from different social groups must not be mixed for transport
HUSBANDRY						
No tail docking*	Tail docking permitted; no requirement to use anaesthetic if performed during the first week of life by application of a rubber ring (minimum legal requirements)	Tail docking permitted only with justification	N/A	Tail docking permitted only with anaesthetic	N/A	Tail docking prohibited
No castration*	Castration permitted and no requirement for anaesthetic	Castration permitted only with justification	N/A	Castration permitted only with anaesthetic	N/A	Castration prohibited
No use of genetically modified or cloned animals or their offspring	No restriction on the use of genetically modified or cloned animals or their offspring	N/A	N/A	The use of genetically modified animals is prohibited but no restriction on the use of cloned animals or their offspring	The use of genetically modified and cloned animals is prohibited but no restriction on the use of clone offspring	The use of genetically modified and cloned animals and their offspring is prohibited
Provision of adequate high-fibre feed to avoid increased risk of health problems*	No requirements regarding the feeding of fibre	N/A	Sufficient fibre must be available in all diets to reduce the risk of health problems but no specific stipulations regarding the quantity of roughage	Sheep must have access to pasture during the grazing season and sufficient roughage must be available in all diets to reduce the risk of health problems but no specific stipulations regarding the quantity of roughage	N/A	Sheep must have access to pasture during the grazing season and, after weaning, at least 60% on a daily dry matter basis of the sheep's diet must consist of fresh or dried fodder, roughage or silage
Appropriate weaning age*	Minimum weaning age may be less than 28 days	Minimum weaning age 28 days	Minimum weaning age 35 days	Minimum weaning age 40 days	Minimum weaning age 45 days	Minimum weaning age 56 days
Regular veterinary visits and veterinary health plan with targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits*	No requirement for VHP, regular veterinary visits or monitoring of health and welfare and performance parameters	Must have VHP but no requirement for monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters or regular veterinary visits	Must have VHP and one of 1) monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters or 2) regular veterinary visits	Must have VHP and two of 1) monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters 2) moderate or unspecified targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits 3) regular veterinary visits	Must have VHP, regular veterinary visits and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with moderate or unspecified targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits	Must have VHP, regular veterinary visits and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with stringent targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits

*Key criteria

Table A4.2: Scoring categories for sheep.

Criteria for sheep	Score 0	Score 1	Score 2	Score 3	Score 4	Score 5
STOCKMANSHIP, HANDLING, TRANSPORT & SLAUGHTER						
No use of electric goads	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Electric goads prohibited (minimum legal requirement)
Requirement for stockpeople to be trained/ competent/ experienced	No requirements regarding training or experience of stockpeople	N/A	Stockpeople must be suitably trained or experienced but no requirement to provide formal training in animal welfare or for training to be validated	Stockpeople must be suitably trained or experienced; formal training in animal welfare must be provided and records of training must be kept but no requirement for training to be validated	There must be at least one nominated person with responsibility for animal welfare (owner or manager) who must have attended a relevant validated training course; formal training in animal welfare must be provided for all stockpeople and records of training must be kept	All stockpeople must have attended a relevant validated training course and records of training must be kept
Frequent checks for signs of illness, injury or distress	N/A	N/A	N/A	Sheep must be checked at least once daily in systems where welfare depends on frequent human attention and sufficiently to avoid suffering in other systems (minimum legal requirement)	Housed sheep must be checked at least twice per day and other sheep sufficiently to avoid suffering OR All sheep must be checked at least once per day; vulnerable sheep (e.g. lactating ewes, ewes close to lambing, young lambs) must be checked at least twice per day	All sheep must be checked at least once per day; housed sheep and vulnerable sheep (e.g. lactating ewes, ewes close to lambing, young lambs) must be checked at least twice per day
Short transport duration*	Journeys over 12 hours including loading and unloading permitted	N/A	N/A	12 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 12 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)	8 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 8 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)	4 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 4 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)
No live export of sheep for slaughter*	Live export of sheep for slaughter permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	Live export of sheep for slaughter not specifically prohibited but limited by journey limit of 8 hours or less	Live export of sheep for slaughter prohibited
No use of livestock markets	Livestock markets permitted in accordance with legislation	N/A	N/A	Livestock markets permitted but restrictions for young and pregnant animals beyond legal requirements	N/A	Livestock markets prohibited

*Key criteria

Table A4.2: Scoring categories for sheep.

Criteria for sheep	Score 0	Score 1	Score 2	Score 3	Score 4	Score 5
Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death*	Slaughter without stunning permitted and/or no clear specifications for stunning parameters, no requirement for monitoring of effectiveness of stunning, maximum stun-stick interval may be greater than 20 seconds, no requirement to use chest/ thoracic stick and minimum bleed time may be less than 20 seconds	All sheep must be stunned and at least one of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) maximum stun-stick interval of 20 seconds 4) chest/ thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 20 seconds	All sheep must be stunned and at least two of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) maximum stun-stick interval of 20 seconds 4) chest/ thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 20 seconds	All sheep must be stunned and at least three of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) maximum stun-stick interval of 20 seconds 4) chest/ thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 20 seconds	All sheep must be stunned and at least four of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) maximum stun-stick interval of 20 seconds 4) chest/ thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 20 seconds	All sheep must be stunned; clear specifications for stunning parameters to ensure effective stun; monitoring of effectiveness of stunning required; maximum stun-stick interval of 20 seconds; chest/ thoracic stick must be used; minimum uninterrupted bleed time 20 seconds
Animal welfare policy and CCTV at abattoir and requirement for people involved in transporting and slaughtering of animals to be trained/ competent/ experienced	No requirement for personnel in charge of transporting sheep to be trained or for abattoirs to have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly, an appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered, a training programme in animal welfare for all staff or CCTV	At least one of 1) all personnel in charge of transporting sheep must be trained 2) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 3) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 4) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 5) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	At least two of 1) all personnel in charge of transporting sheep must be trained 2) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 3) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 4) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 5) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	At least three of 1) all personnel in charge of transporting sheep must be trained 2) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 3) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 4) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 5) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	At least four of 1) all personnel in charge of transporting sheep must be trained 2) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 3) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 4) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 5) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	All personnel in charge of transporting sheep must be trained; abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly; abattoirs must have appointed AWO who has completed a validated training course on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered; abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept; abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter
GENETICS & BREEDING						
No breeds associated with increased incidence of health/ welfare problems*	No stipulations on permitted genetics or sire choice	At least one of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems permitted 2) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of lambing difficulties permitted or sire must be chosen to reduce likelihood of lambing difficulties 3) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/lambing ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 4) breeds that are less susceptible to fly strike must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (unless tail docking is prohibited and tails are left intact) 5) breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	At least two of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems permitted 2) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of lambing difficulties permitted or sire must be chosen to reduce likelihood of lambing difficulties 3) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/lambing ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 4) breeds that are less susceptible to fly strike must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (unless tail docking is prohibited and tails are left intact) 5) breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	At least three of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems permitted 2) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of lambing difficulties permitted or sire must be chosen to reduce likelihood of lambing difficulties 3) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/lambing ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 4) breeds that are less susceptible to fly strike must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (unless tail docking is prohibited and tails are left intact) 5) breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	At least four of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems permitted 2) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of lambing difficulties permitted or sire must be chosen to reduce likelihood of lambing difficulties 3) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/lambing ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 4) breeds that are less susceptible to fly strike must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (unless tail docking is prohibited and tails are left intact) 5) breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	Only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems or increased incidence of lambing difficulties permitted; key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/ lambing ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary; breeds that are less susceptible to fly strike must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (unless tail docking is prohibited and tails are left intact); breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions

*Key criteria

Table A4.2: Scoring categories for sheep.

Criteria for sheep	Score 0	Score 1	Score 2	Score 3	Score 4	Score 5
High welfare standards for breeding rams	See Table A4.4					
AUDITING						
Frequent inspections by certifying body	Inspections may be less frequent than every 24 months	Inspections at least every 24 months on average for all members	Inspections at least every 18 months on average for all members OR Inspections every 12 months initially and then up to 24 months with frequency determined by previous performance	Inspections at least every 15 months on average for all members OR Inspections every 6 months initially and then up to 24 months with frequency determined by previous performance	Inspections at least every 12 months on average for all members OR Inspections every 6 months initially and then up to 18 months with frequency determined by previous performance	Inspections every 6 months initially and then up to 12 months with frequency determined by previous performance
Targeted unannounced spot-checks	No spot checks	Spot checks for less than 10% of members annually (or proportion not specified); not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for less than 10% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced OR Spot checks for 10% of members annually but not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for 10% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced OR Spot checks for 20% of members annually but not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for 20% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced OR Spot checks for 30% of members annually but not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for 30% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set*	No assessment of welfare outcomes and no stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future	No assessment of welfare outcomes but stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future OR Informal observations of one or two welfare outcomes (e.g. injuries) during routine inspections but no formal recording of welfare outcomes and no targets set OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure records are being maintained	System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place but no targets set OR System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted and producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and either 1) farm-specific targets set by producers or 2) moderate (or unspecified) targets set by assurance scheme	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and stringent targets set by assurance scheme for all farms
Stringent measures to address non-compliance	No requirement to correct minor non-compliances	N/A	N/A	All non-compliances must be corrected but no defined timescale for correction; certification may be suspended or withdrawn for a serious non-compliance or multiple and/or repeated minor non-compliances	N/A	All non-compliances must be corrected within agreed timescale; certification may be suspended or withdrawn for a serious non-compliance or multiple and/or repeated minor non-compliances

*Key criteria

APPENDIX 4C

SHEEP

APPENDIX 4C: FULL RESULTS TABLE FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR BREEDING RAMS

Table A4.3: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for breeding rams.

A maximum of 5 points is available for each criterion. Overall scores are converted to a score out of 5 and incorporated into the overall scoring of standards for sheep (see **Table A4.1**).

Specific criteria for breeding rams	Assured British Meat (ABM)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
No tethering	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	5 (sheep must not be closely confined, except for the shortest time possible during certain procedures)	5 (prolonged routine tethering prohibited)	5 (routine tethering over long periods prohibited)
Adequate space allowance when housed	1 (guideline space allowance for rams 1.5-2m ²)	1 (guideline space allowance for rams in accordance with welfare code 1.5-2m ²)	2 (minimum bedded lying area for rams of 1.5-2m ² and total indoor area must be at least 1.5 times the lying area; total area = minimum 2.25m ²)	5 (minimum bedded lying area when housed of 1.5m ² per sheep, plus additional exercise area excluding pasturage of 2.5m ² per sheep; total area = minimum 4m ²)	1 (minimum lying/indoor area when housed of 1.5m ² per sheep; total area = minimum 1.5m ²)
Appropriate flooring	0 (fully-slatted floors permitted)	0 (fully-slatted floors permitted)	4 (fully-slatted floors not specifically prohibited but bedded lying area must be provided)	4 (fully-slatted floors prohibited and bedded lying area required)	4 (fully-slatted floors prohibited – maximum 50% slatted – and bedded lying area required)
Provision of bedding	0 (no requirement to provide bedding for rams)	0 (no requirement to provide bedding for rams)	5 (bedded lying area required)	5 (bedded lying area required)	5 (bedded lying area required)
Free range access	0 (no requirement for outdoor access for housed rams)	0 (no requirement for outdoor access for housed rams)	5 (during the grass-growing season, weather conditions permitting, all sheep must derive the bulk of their nutrient requirements from grazing at pasture)	5 (sheep must have access to pasture, except that they may be housed over winter; must have outdoor exercise area when housed, unless shed is open-fronted in which case, with approval, exercise area can be indoors)	5 (sheep must have access to pasture, except that they may be housed over winter)
No tail docking	0 (tail docking permitted; no requirement to use anaesthetic if performed during first week of life by application of rubber ring)	0 (tail docking permitted in accordance with legislation/ welfare code; no requirement to use anaesthetic if performed during first week of life by application of rubber ring)	1 (tail docking must only be carried out where there is an unavoidable and high risk of great suffering due to fly strike and close supervision of the flock is not possible; when necessary may be performed using rubber ring between 24 hours and 7 days of age without anaesthetic, or using thermocautery up to 8 weeks under vet advice)	1 (tail docking permitted with justification in accordance with legislation/ welfare code but not specifically stated whether anaesthetic and/or pain relief must be used)	1 (tail docking permitted for welfare reasons and must be justified in animal health plan but not specifically stated whether anaesthetic and/or pain relief must be used)
Provision of adequate high-fibre feed to avoid increased risk of health problems	0 (no stipulations regarding feeding of fibre)	0 (welfare code recommends, where sheep are fed a high cereal-based diet, a gradual introductory feeding period is required, during which sufficient roughage or high-fibre concentrate feed is also provided but no minimum requirements for feeding fibre)	3 (sheep must be provided with adequate suitable fibre to allow them to ruminate; during the grass-growing season, weather conditions permitting, all sheep must derive the bulk of their nutrient requirements from grazing at pasture)	5 (after weaning at least 60% on a daily dry matter basis of the sheep's diet must consist of fresh or dried fodder, roughage or silage; access to pasture required during grazing season)	5 (after weaning at least 60% on a daily dry matter basis of the sheep's diet must consist of fresh or dried fodder, roughage or silage; access to pasture required during grazing season)

Table A4.3: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for breeding rams.

Specific criteria for breeding rams	Assured British Meat (ABM)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Regular veterinary visits and veterinary health plan with targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits	1 (recommended but not required that vet visits at least once a year; must have written flock health plan reviewed annually; no requirement for targets)	3 (no requirement for regular vet visits; all disease problems, including lameness, sheep scab, scour or respiratory disease, must be actively addressed; must have animal health and disease control plan reviewed annually; includes improvement targets)	4 (must have at least 1 vet visit per year for finishing units and at least 2 for breeding units; flock performance must be continually monitored for signs of disease or production disorders; the condition of the feet must be regularly inspected; must have veterinary health plan updated regularly; includes targets for a range of parameters; remedial action must be taken if parameters fall below tolerance limits)	1 (no requirement for regular veterinary visits; must have animal health plan submitted for approval and updated regularly; no requirement for targets)	1 (no requirement for regular veterinary visits; must have animal health plan submitted for approval and reviewed regularly; no requirement for targets)
Short transport duration	0 (no limit on journey times beyond legal requirements)	0 (no limit on journey times beyond legal requirements)	4 (sheep must not be transported for more than 8 hours, from loading of the first animal to unloading of the last animal)	4 (sheep must not be transported for more than 8 hours from loading of the first animal to unloading of the last animal, excluding sea journeys between the Scottish mainland and remote islands)	4 (sheep must not be transported for more than 8 hours from the start of loading to the end of unloading, except with permission, and must not be exported for slaughter)
Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death	2 (all sheep must be stunned; stun-stick interval must not exceed 15 seconds; monitoring of stunning and sticking method not specified; minimum bleed time 20 seconds)	1 (all sheep must be stunned; stun-stick interval must not exceed 15 seconds; stunning parameters, monitoring of stunning, sticking method and bleed time not specified)	4 (all sheep must be stunned; electrical parameters specified in terms of current, frequency and duration; the AWO must make frequent and thorough checks throughout the day to ensure that animals are being effectively stunned and are insensible throughout the slaughter operation; effectiveness of stunning must be monitored and recorded at the start of stunning and at least every 2 hours after that with at least 10 animals checked each time; stun-stick interval must not exceed 15 seconds; bleeding may be with a chest or throat cut – if throat, both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed; minimum bleed time 20 seconds)	3 (all sheep must be stunned; maximum stun-stick interval 20 seconds; bleeding must be with a chest/ thoracic stick; minimum bleed time 20 seconds; stunning parameters and monitoring of stunning not specified)	4 (all sheep must be stunned; if stunning is automated a trained and licensed operator must be present at all times to check the stun/kill operation; stun-stick interval must be less than 20 seconds; bleeding must be with a chest/thoracic stick; minimum bleed time 20 seconds; stunning parameters not specified)

Table A4.3: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for breeding rams.

Specific criteria for breeding rams	Assured British Meat (ABM)	Quality Meat Scotland (QMS)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
No breeds associated with increased incidence of health/welfare problems	2 (no restriction on permitted breeds; when breeding, sires must be selected carefully taking into account breed, age, size and previous record to reduce the likelihood of birthing difficulties; no requirement to use short-tailed breed or to breed for this)	0 (no restriction on permitted breeds or choice of sire; no requirement to use short-tailed breed or to breed for this)	0 (no restriction on permitted breeds or choice of sire; no requirement to use short-tailed breed or to breed for this)	3 (breeds must be chosen to avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production and to avoid problems at birth, but no requirement to demonstrate that key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate/ production level/ lambing ease are within acceptable limits; choice of breeds must take account of the capacity of the animals to adapt to local conditions and their vitality and resistance to disease; no requirement to use short-tailed breed or to breed for this)	3 (breeds must be chosen to avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production and to avoid problems at birth, but no requirement to demonstrate that key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate/ production level/ lambing ease are within acceptable limits; breeds must be chosen that can adapt to the organic system and local conditions and that have vitality and resistance to disease; no requirement to use short-tailed breed or to breed for this)
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set	0 (no assessment of welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	2 (QMS is piloting assessments based on Qualitative Behaviour Assessment (QBA) developed by the Scottish Agricultural College (SAC); in the longer term some BWAP measures may also be incorporated)	3 (RSPCA has developed a system of assessment of welfare outcomes and is working with other standard setters and Bristol University to further develop outcome measures; assessments of welfare outcomes on sheep farms are not yet underway; producers set themselves targets and intervention levels in VHP; checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met)	0 (no assessment of welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	3 (SA has a programme of assessments based on the Bristol Welfare Assurance Programme (BWAP); observations for sheep are wool loss, skin lesions, lameness, dirtiness, behaviour – general; no targets set for sheep yet but plan to introduce targets)
Total for breeding ram criteria	6/60	7/60	40/60	41/60	41/60
Welfare score for breeding rams carried over to Table A4.1	1/5	1/5	3/5	3/5	3/5

APPENDIX 4D

SHEEP

APPENDIX 4D: SCORING CATEGORIES FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR BREEDING RAMS

Table A4.4: Scoring categories for breeding rams.

Criteria for breeding rams	Score 0	Score 1	Score 2	Score 3	Score 4	Score 5
No tethering	Routine prolonged tethering permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Routine prolonged tethering prohibited
Adequate space allowance when housed	Minimum total area may be less than 1.5m ² /ram	Minimum total area of at least 1.5m ² /ram	Minimum total area of at least 2m ² /ram	Minimum total area of at least 2.5m ² /ram	Minimum total area of at least 3m ² /ram	Minimum total area of at least 4m ² /ram
Appropriate flooring	Fully-slatted floors permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	Fully-slatted floors prohibited and bedded lying area	Floors must be entirely solid and bedded lying area required
Provision of bedding	No requirement to provide bedding material	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Bedded lying area required
Free range access	Permanent indoor housing permitted	N/A	Rams must have permanent access to an outdoor exercise area but not necessarily pasture	N/A	N/A	Rams must have access to pasture at least during the grazing season throughout their life, but may be housed over winter
No tail docking	Tail docking permitted; no requirement to use anaesthetic if performed during the first week of life by application of a rubber ring (minimum legal requirements)	Tail docking permitted only with justification	N/A	Tail docking permitted only with anaesthetic	N/A	Tail docking prohibited
Provision of adequate high-fibre feed to avoid increased risk of health problems	No requirements regarding the feeding of fibre	N/A	Sufficient fibre must be available in all diets to reduce the risk of health problems but no specific stipulations regarding the quantity of roughage	Sheep must have access to pasture during the grazing season and sufficient roughage must be available in all diets to reduce the risk of health problems but no specific stipulations regarding the quantity of roughage	N/A	Sheep must have access to pasture during the grazing season and, after weaning, at least 60% on a daily dry matter basis of the sheep's diet must consist of fresh or dried fodder, roughage or silage
Regular veterinary visits and veterinary health plan with targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits	No requirement for VHP, regular veterinary visits or monitoring of health and welfare and performance parameters	Must have VHP but no requirement for monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters or regular veterinary visits	Must have VHP and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters but no requirement for targets or regular veterinary visits	Must have VHP, regular veterinary visits and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters but no targets required	Must have VHP, regular veterinary visits and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with moderate or unspecified targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits	Must have VHP, regular veterinary visits and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with stringent targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits
Short transport duration	Journeys over 12 hours including loading and unloading permitted	N/A	N/A	12 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 12 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)	8 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 8 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)	4 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 4 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)

Table A4.4: Scoring categories for breeding rams.

Criteria for breeding rams	Score 0	Score 1	Score 2	Score 3	Score 4	Score 5
Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death	Slaughter without stunning permitted and/or no clear specifications for stunning parameters, no requirement for monitoring of effectiveness of stunning, maximum stun-stick interval may be greater than 20 seconds, no requirement to use chest/ thoracic stick and minimum bleed time may be less than 20 seconds	All sheep must be stunned and at least one of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) maximum stun-stick interval of 20 seconds 4) chest/ thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 20 seconds	All sheep must be stunned and at least two of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) maximum stun-stick interval of 20 seconds 4) chest/ thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 20 seconds	All sheep must be stunned and at least three of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) maximum stun-stick interval of 20 seconds 4) chest/ thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 20 seconds	All sheep must be stunned and at least four of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) monitoring of effectiveness of stunning 3) maximum stun-stick interval of 20 seconds 4) chest/ thoracic stick must be used 5) minimum bleed time 20 seconds	All sheep must be stunned; clear specifications for stunning parameters to ensure effective stun; monitoring of effectiveness of stunning required; maximum stun-stick interval of 20 seconds; chest/ thoracic stick must be used; minimum uninterrupted bleed time 20 seconds
No breeds associated with increased incidence of health/ welfare problems	No stipulations on permitted genetics or sire choice	At least one of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems permitted 2) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of lambing difficulties permitted or sire must be chosen to reduce likelihood of lambing difficulties 3) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/ lambing ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 4) breeds that are less susceptible to fly strike must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (unless tail docking is prohibited and tails are left intact) 5) breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	At least two of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems permitted 2) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of lambing difficulties permitted or sire must be chosen to reduce likelihood of lambing difficulties 3) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/ lambing ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 4) breeds that are less susceptible to fly strike must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (unless tail docking is prohibited and tails are left intact) 5) breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	At least three of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems permitted 2) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of lambing difficulties permitted or sire must be chosen to reduce likelihood of lambing difficulties 3) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/ lambing ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 4) breeds that are less susceptible to fly strike must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (unless tail docking is prohibited and tails are left intact) 5) breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	At least four of 1) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems permitted 2) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of lambing difficulties permitted or sire must be chosen to reduce likelihood of lambing difficulties 3) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/ lambing ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 4) breeds that are less susceptible to fly strike must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (unless tail docking is prohibited and tails are left intact) 5) breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	Only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health or welfare problems or increased incidence of lambing difficulties permitted; key health and welfare parameters associated with production level/ lambing ease must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary; breeds that are less susceptible to fly strike must be used or breeding programme must be working towards this (unless tail docking is prohibited and tails are left intact); breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions

Table A4.4: Scoring categories for breeding rams.

Criteria for breeding rams	Score 0	Score 1	Score 2	Score 3	Score 4	Score 5
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set	No assessment of welfare outcomes and no stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future	No assessment of welfare outcomes but stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future OR Informal observations of one or two welfare outcomes (e.g. injuries) during routine inspections but no formal recording of welfare outcomes and no targets set OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure records are being	System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place but no targets set OR System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted and producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and either 1) farm-specific targets set by producers or 2) moderate (or unspecified) targets set by assurance scheme	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and stringent targets set by assurance scheme for all farms

APPENDIX 5A

BROILER CHICKENS

APPENDIX 5A: FULL RESULTS TABLE FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR BROILER (MEAT) CHICKENS

Table A5.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for broiler chickens.

Up to 5 points are available for each criterion. Key criteria (marked with an asterisk) are weighted so that they are worth double points (i.e. up to 10 points for each key criterion). Score for breeding bird welfare is derived from **Table A5.3**. Criteria are grouped into five sets. Totals for each set of criteria are converted to scores out of 20, which are totalled to give an overall score out of 100 for each scheme (see **Table 3.5**).

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for broiler chickens	Assured Chicken Production minimum standards (ACP minimum)	Assured Chicken Production free-range standards (ACP free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
ENVIRONMENT							
No close confinement	No cages	5 (cages prohibited)	5 (cages prohibited)	5 (not specified but cages effectively prohibited by other requirements of standards)	5 (not specified but cages effectively prohibited by other requirements of standards)	5 (not specified but cages effectively prohibited by other requirements of standards)	5 (not specified but cages effectively prohibited by other requirements of standards)
Adequate space allowance when housed	Low indoor stocking density*	2 (planned maximum 38kg/m ² i.e. initial stocking rate must not be expected to result in a final stocking density above 38kg/m ² , allowing for a realistic estimate of expected mortality)	6 (maximum 27.5kg/m ²)	6 (maximum 30kg/m ²)	6 (maximum 27.5kg/m ²)	10 (maximum 30kg/m ² in mobile houses not exceeding 150m ² floor area which remain open at night; fixed housing not permitted)	10 (maximum 21kg/m ² in fixed housing; maximum 30kg/m ² in mobile housing of less than 150m ² floor space which remain open at night)
	Stringent limit on number of birds per m² and prohibition of thinning (removal of part of the flock for slaughter prior to depopulation of the entire flock)	0 (no limit on number of birds; thinning permitted)	4 (thinning is not prohibited but the limit on the number of birds to 13/m ² prevents thinning being used to facilitate overstocking)	3 (thinning is restricted because birds must not be removed for slaughter more than once prior to depopulation of entire flock, the stocking density at the time of thinning and at depopulation, when combined, must not add up to more than 55kg/m ² , and the number of birds is limited to 19/m ² ; thinning is strongly discouraged and will be prohibited from 2016)	5 (thinning prohibited and number of birds limited to 13/m ²)	4 (thinning is not prohibited but the limit on the number of birds to 16/m ² prevents thinning being used to facilitate overstocking)	4 (thinning is not prohibited but the limit on the number of birds to 10/m ² in fixed housing or 16/m ² in mobile housing prevents thinning being used to facilitate overstocking)
Appropriate housing design	Adequate environmental conditions maintained by ventilation/heating/insulation and monitoring to maintain temperature, humidity and air quality within acceptable limits	3 (all houses must have controlled environment to ensure temperature and humidity suited to birds' needs; houses must be insulated; must have documented ventilation plan; minimum and maximum temperatures must be recorded daily; when outside temperature in shade exceeds 30°C,	3 (fixed houses must be insulated; no requirement for insulation of mobile houses; minimum and maximum temperatures must be recorded daily; no limits specified for humidity or air quality parameters and no requirement to monitor or record humidity	5 (chickens must have access to a thermally comfortable environment at all times; minimum and maximum temperatures must be recorded daily; records of relative humidity must be kept; averaged over an 8 hour period, dust must not exceed 10mg/m ³	5 (chickens must have access to a thermally comfortable environment at all times; minimum and maximum temperatures must be recorded daily; records of relative humidity must be kept; averaged over an 8 hour period, dust must not exceed 10mg/m ³ and carbon monoxide must not exceed 50ppm;	3 (insulation, heating and ventilation of the building must ensure that circulation, dust level, temperature, relative humidity and gas concentration are kept within limits that are not harmful to the animals; no requirement to	3 (housing must provide suitable temperature, humidity, dust levels and natural ventilation; no requirement to monitor/keep records of environmental conditions; houses must be open during the day)

*Key criteria

Table A5.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for broiler chickens.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for broiler chickens	Assured Chicken Production minimum standards (ACP minimum)	Assured Chicken Production free-range standards (ACP free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
		inside temperature should not exceed outside temperature by more than 3°C; average relative humidity over 48 hours should not exceed 70% when outside temperature is below 10°C; NH ₃ should not exceed 20ppm, CO ₂ should not exceed 3000ppm; no requirement to regularly monitor or record humidity or air quality parameters)	or air quality parameters; houses must be open during the day)	and CO ₂ must not exceed 50ppm; CO ₂ should not exceed 5000ppm and NH ₃ should not exceed 15ppm; air quality parameters should be recorded weekly and, where levels are detected which exceed those in the standards, they should be recorded daily until acceptable levels are achieved and maintained; relative humidity should be between 50 and 70%)	CO ₂ should not exceed 5000ppm and NH ₃ should not exceed 15ppm; air quality parameters should be recorded weekly and, where levels are detected which exceed those in the standards, they should be recorded daily until acceptable levels are achieved and maintained; relative humidity should be between 50 and 70%; houses must be open during the day)	monitor/ keep records of environmental conditions; houses must be open during the day)	
Provision of appropriate bedding/ litter/ enrichment	Provision of litter material and additional enrichment to encourage exercise and foraging (e.g. perches, straw bales, roughage, pecking objects)*	4 (litter must be provided to a minimum depth of 2cm; no requirement for litter to be replenished until depopulation; it is recommended but not required that enrichment is used)	6 (litter must be provided to a minimum depth of 2cm; no requirement for litter to be replenished until depopulation; perches should be provided – minimum of 2m per 1000 birds; litter bales must be provided – minimum of 1 bale per 1000 birds)	10 (litter must be provided over the entire floor area and maintained at an average minimum depth of 5cm and topped up daily if necessary to maintain in a dry friable condition suitable for dustbathing; perches must be provided – minimum of 2m per 1000 birds; recommends 40m per 1000 birds; straw bales and pecking objects, e.g. peck-a-blocks/brassicas/hanging wooden blocks, must be provided – minimum 1.5 straw bales and 1 pecking object per 1000 birds)	10 (litter must be provided over the entire floor area and maintained at an average minimum depth of 5cm and topped up daily if necessary to maintain in a dry friable condition suitable for dustbathing; perches must be provided – minimum of 2m per 1000 birds; recommends 40m per 1000 birds; straw bales and pecking objects, e.g. peck-a-blocks/brassicas/hanging wooden blocks, must be provided – minimum 1.5 straw bales and 1 pecking object per 1000 birds)	8 (litter must be provided over at least one third of floor area and replenished regularly; no requirement for perches; when birds are housed they must have permanent access to sufficient quantities of roughage and suitable material to meet ethological needs)	6 (litter must be provided over at least half of floor area and topped up regularly; no requirement for perches or other indoor enrichment)
Provision of appropriate nesting facilities	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A

*Key criteria

Table A5.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for broiler chickens.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for broiler chickens	Assured Chicken Production minimum standards (ACP minimum)	Assured Chicken Production free-range standards (ACP free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Appropriate lighting	Appropriate light intensity and light/dark periods	1 (minimum 8 hours light at minimum 20 lux at bird level over at least 80% of useable area; minimum 6 hours dark period – including 4 hours continuous – except for first 7 and last 3 days; temporary reduction in light level permitted on vet advice)	3 (access to natural light outdoors; minimum 8 hours natural or artificial light in buildings sufficient for birds to be seen clearly; minimum 6 hours dark period except when natural dark period is shorter – except for first 3 and last 3 days when must have minimum 1 hour dark period)	4 (birds must be provided with natural daylight at all times during the natural daylight period from 7 days of age or earlier; minimum 8 hours light and minimum 6/ maximum 12 hours continuous darkness except when natural periods are shorter and during first 7 days and last 3 days when minimum dark period is 2 hours; minimum 100 lux at bird level over at least 75% of floor area and at least 20 lux over remainder; birds must be exposed to natural or artificial dawn and dusk periods – artificial lighting must be turned on and off gradually over a period of at least 15 minutes)	4 (access to natural light outdoors and birds must be provided with natural daylight at all times during the natural daylight period from 7 days of age or earlier; minimum 8 hours light and minimum 6/ maximum 12 hours continuous darkness except when natural periods are shorter and during first 7 days and last 3 days when minimum dark period is 2 hours; minimum 100 lux at bird level over at least 75% of floor area and at least 20 lux over remainder; birds must be exposed to natural or artificial dawn and dusk periods – artificial lighting must be turned on and off gradually over a period of at least 15 minutes)	5 (access to natural daylight outdoors; artificial lighting may be used to prolong the day length up to a maximum of 16 hours per day and must end at dusk)	5 (access to natural daylight outdoors; artificial lighting may be used to prolong the day length up to a maximum of 16 hours per day and must end at dusk)
Free range access	Free range access*	0 (permanent indoor housing permitted)	8 (birds must have access to range for at least half the growing period)	0 (permanent indoor housing permitted)	8 (birds must have access to range as soon as they are mature enough and in any case from 28 days, i.e. minimum half of growing period)	10 (birds must have continuous daytime access to pasture/ range for at least two thirds of life except in extreme weather conditions or when required by law due to disease outbreak when birds may be housed with permanent access to sufficient quantities of roughage and suitable material to meet ethological needs)	10 (birds must have continuous and easy daytime access to pasture for at least two thirds of life except in adverse weather conditions or when required by law due to disease outbreak)
Adequate outdoor space	Low outdoor stocking density	0 (no outdoor access)	3 (1m ² per chicken)	0 (no outdoor access)	3 (1m ² per chicken)	5 (2500 birds/ha = 4m ² per chicken)	5 (2500 birds/ha = 4m ² per chicken)

*Key criteria

Table A5.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for broiler chickens.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for broiler chickens	Assured Chicken Production minimum standards (ACP minimum)	Assured Chicken Production free-range standards (ACP free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Appropriate shelter/ shade and protection from predators	Provision of overhead cover and protection from predators for outdoor chickens	0 (no outdoor access)	2 (natural shelter/ cover should be encouraged such as hedges/ trees / semi-permanent vegetation; artificial shelter such as camouflage netting/ big bales / A-frames should be provided to move with mobile houses; no stipulations regarding protection from predators)	0 (no outdoor access)	4 (a minimum of 8m ² of natural or artificial overhead shade per 1000 birds must be provided; recommended that shade area calculated according to formula in standards which would give a total shade area of 17.4m ² per 1000 birds reared to 2.2kg; humane precautions must be taken to protect chickens from predators)	4 (birds must have access to shelter at all times and be provided with protection from predators; adequate natural or artificial cover must be provided in the free range areas to give the birds conditions akin to their native habitat, protection from overhead predators and shelter from extreme weather conditions; this cover should be provided in a way that encourages ranging behaviour and ensures maximum use of the pasture)	4 (birds must have access to shelter at all times, protection from predators, and enough natural or artificial cover in the free range areas to imitate their native habitat and encourage them to range fully; access to woodland is recommended)
Appropriate social grouping	Small flock size	0 (no restriction on flock size)	0 (no restriction on flock size)	0 (no restriction on flock size)	0 (no restriction on flock size)	3 (maximum 1000 birds in a housing unit but restricted to 500 unless certain conditions are met including demonstrating high level of bird health and welfare, good environmental conditions and adequate access to range)	3 (maximum 1000 birds in a housing unit but restricted to 500 unless certain conditions are met including demonstrating high level of bird health and welfare, good environmental conditions and adequate access to range)
HUSBANDRY							
No mutilations	No beak trimming	5 (prohibited)	5 (prohibited)	5 (prohibited)	5 (prohibited)	5 (prohibited)	5 (prohibited)
No use of genetic engineering/ cloning or invasive reproductive technologies associated with health or welfare problems	No use of genetically modified or cloned animals or their offspring	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	4 (livestock must not be brought in that have been produced using transgenic or other genetic engineering techniques; cloning is effectively prohibited by prohibitions on breeding practices that make livestock systems over-reliant on inappropriate technology and any surgical or chemical interference other than procedures specifically permitted in the standards, but no restriction on the use of the offspring of cloned animals)	4 (livestock must not be brought in that have been produced using transgenic or other genetic engineering techniques; use of cloning is prohibited but no restriction on the use of the offspring of cloned animals)

Table A5.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for broiler chickens.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for broiler chickens	Assured Chicken Production minimum standards (ACP minimum)	Assured Chicken Production free-range standards (ACP free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Appropriate feeding	Short duration of feed withdrawal prior to slaughter	4 (feed must not be withdrawn for more than 9 hours prior to catching)	4 (feed must not be withdrawn for more than 9 hours prior to catching)	4 (no bird must be deprived of feed for more than 10 hours prior to slaughter)	4 (no bird must be deprived of feed for more than 10 hours prior to slaughter)	0 (feed may be withheld for a limited period just prior to transport and/or slaughter; length of time not specified)	3 (feed may be withheld for up to 12 hours before slaughter)
Appropriate weaning age	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Adequate monitoring of health and welfare by producers	Veterinary health plan with stringent targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits*	8 (must have written health plan updated regularly; flock performance records must be monitored for signs of problems; tolerance limits must be set and once exceeded the vet must be informed and advice sought; mortality and daily culls including leg culls specifically, hockburn, pododermatitis, bruising, DOAs and PMI rejects must be recorded; levels should not normally exceed 5% mortality, 15% hockburn, 1.5% PMI rejects)	8 (must have written health plan updated regularly; flock performance records must be monitored for signs of problems; tolerance limits must be set and once exceeded the vet must be informed and advice sought; mortality and daily culls including leg culls specifically, hockburn, pododermatitis, bruising, DOAs and PMI rejects must be recorded; levels should not normally exceed 5% mortality, 15% hockburn, 1.5% PMI rejects)	10 (must have veterinary health plan updated regularly; includes targets for a range of performance parameters; remedial action must be taken if parameters fall below tolerance limits; must have plan to reduce/prevent increase of hockburn, footpad burn, breast blisters, back scratches and dirty feathers; target for hockburn and footpad burn 4%; all birds of gait score 3 or above must be culled and where leg cull is greater than 3% to 42 days of age, this must be investigated and reported to the Freedom Food Assessor and RSPCA Farm Livestock Officer; all transport deaths and injuries must be recorded and reported)	10 (must have veterinary health plan updated regularly; includes targets for a range of performance parameters; remedial action must be taken if parameters fall below tolerance limits; must have plan to reduce/prevent increase of hockburn, footpad burn, breast blisters, back scratches and dirty feathers; all birds of gait score 3 or above must be culled and where leg cull is greater than 3% to 42 days of age, this must be investigated and reported to the Freedom Food Assessor and RSPCA Farm Livestock Officer; all transport deaths and injuries must be recorded and reported)	2 (must have animal health plan submitted for approval and updated regularly; no requirement for monitoring of key health and welfare parameters and no targets specified)	6 (must have animal health plan submitted for approval and reviewed regularly; health and welfare parameters must be monitored and records kept of all health problems and veterinary treatments, mortalities and the cause of death, hock damage, reject percentages and the cause of rejection and production records but no targets specified)
STOCKMANSHIP, HANDLING, TRANSPORT & SLAUGHTER							
Appropriate handling	Humane catching/handling methods*	0 (catching by one leg permitted; no limit on number of birds carried)	0 (catching by one leg permitted; no limit on number of birds carried)	6 (birds must be caught individually by both legs and carried by both legs with no more than 3 birds carried in one hand)	6 (birds must be caught individually by both legs and carried by both legs with no more than 3 birds carried in one hand)	6 (welfare code must be complied with, which recommends that birds are caught and carried by the body or both legs and that no more than 3 birds are carried in one hand)	6 (welfare code must be complied with, which recommends that birds are caught and carried by the body or both legs and that no more than 3 birds are carried in one hand)

*Key criteria

Table A5.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for broiler chickens.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for broiler chickens	Assured Chicken Production minimum standards (ACP minimum)	Assured Chicken Production free-range standards (ACP free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Promotion of high quality stockmanship	Requirement for stockpeople to be trained/ competent/ experienced	3 (stockpeople must be trained and able to demonstrate competence; training must be to a recognised level, e.g. NVQ/ SVQ or formal in-house training; training must be regularly reviewed and updated; records of training must be kept; competence must be regularly assessed and records kept)	3 (stockpeople must be trained and able to demonstrate competence; training must be to a recognised level, e.g. NVQ/ SVQ or formal in-house training; training must be regularly reviewed and updated; records of training must be kept; competence must be regularly assessed and records kept)	4 (managers and stockpeople must be thoroughly trained, skilled and competent in animal husbandry and welfare; all managers/ assistant managers must possess or be working towards a recognised validated poultry qualification; managers must ensure all stockpeople have completed relevant, adequate, validated training or formal in-house training and can satisfy assessor and RSPCA Livestock Officer of their competence in practical situations)	4 (managers and stockpeople must be thoroughly trained, skilled and competent in animal husbandry and welfare; all managers/ assistant managers must possess or be working towards a recognised validated poultry qualification; managers must ensure all stockpeople have completed relevant, adequate, validated training or formal in-house training and can satisfy assessor and RSPCA Livestock Officer of their competence in practical situations)	2 (stockpeople must be suitably trained or experienced; no requirement to provide formal training in animal welfare or to keep records of training)	2 (stockpeople must be suitably trained or experienced; no requirement to provide formal training in animal welfare or to keep records of training)
Frequent checks for signs of illness, injury or distress	Frequent checks for signs of illness, injury or distress	4 (flocks must be checked at least twice daily and the stockperson must walk within 3 metres of each bird)	4 (flocks must be checked at least twice daily and the stockperson must walk within 3 metres of each bird)	4 (flocks must be checked at least 3 times daily and at least one inspection must be sufficiently thorough to identify any bird showing signs of sickness or injury)	4 (flocks must be checked at least 3 times daily and at least one inspection must be sufficiently thorough to identify any bird showing signs of sickness or injury)	5 (flocks must be checked at least 3 times daily and the stockperson should pass within 3 metres of each bird)	5 (flocks must be checked at least 3 times daily and the stockperson should pass within 3 metres of each bird)
Short transport duration	Short transport duration*	6 (journeys must not exceed 12 hours from start of loading to unloading)	6 (journeys must not exceed 12 hours from start of loading to unloading)	8 (all birds must be slaughtered within 8 hours of loading the first bird; journeys must not exceed 4 hours from leaving the farm to arrival at the processing plant)	8 (all birds must be slaughtered within 8 hours of loading the first bird; journeys must not exceed 4 hours from leaving the farm to arrival at the processing plant)	8 (journeys must not exceed 8 hours from loading of first bird to unloading of last bird, excluding sea journeys between the Scottish mainland and remote islands)	8 (journeys must not exceed 8 hours from the start of loading to the end of unloading, except with permission)
No live export	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
No use of livestock markets	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A

*Key criteria

Table A5.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for broiler chickens.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for broiler chickens	Assured Chicken Production minimum standards (ACP minimum)	Assured Chicken Production free-range standards (ACP free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Humane slaughter	Only humane stunning/ slaughter methods permitted – no shackling of live birds and no use of carbon dioxide*	0 (shackling permitted; measures must be taken to prevent wing flapping, e.g. breast bar; recommended but not required to use subdued or blue lighting; maximum time in shackles prior to stun 2 minutes; high concentration of CO ₂ permitted)	0 (shackling permitted; measures must be taken to prevent wing flapping, e.g. breast bar; recommended but not required to use subdued or blue lighting; maximum time in shackles prior to stun 2 minutes; high concentration of CO ₂ permitted)	6 (shackling permitted; breast comforters and low lighting – maximum 5 lux – must be used; waterbath stunners must be designed and set up to prevent pre-stun shocks; maximum time in shackles prior to stun 30 seconds; controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method and shackling will be prohibited for off-farm slaughter from 2016; concentrations of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited)	6 (shackling permitted; breast comforters and low lighting – maximum 5 lux – must be used; waterbath stunners must be designed and set up to prevent pre-stun shocks; maximum time in shackles prior to stun 30 seconds controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method and shackling will be prohibited for off-farm slaughter from 2016; concentrations of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited)	2 (shackling permitted; no requirement for breast comforters or low lighting; no restriction on length of time in shackles beyond legal requirements; use of CO ₂ prohibited)	2 (shackling permitted; no requirement for breast comforters or low lighting; waterbath stunners must not overflow at entrance or deliver pre-stun shocks to any bird; no restriction on length of time in shackles beyond legal requirements; use of CO ₂ prohibited)
	Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death*	6 (all birds must be stunned; stun-neck cutting interval must not exceed 15 seconds; both major blood vessels on both sides of neck must be severed; manual or back-up neck cutting must be provided for birds that miss automatic neck cut; at least 90 seconds must elapse between neck cutting and scald tank; the efficiency of the stunning and slaughter/killing process must be regularly checked by vet or licensed slaughterman; stunning parameters not specified)	6 (all birds must be stunned; stun-neck cutting interval must not exceed 15 seconds; both major blood vessels on both sides of neck must be severed; manual or back-up neck cutting must be provided for birds that miss automatic neck cut; at least 90 seconds must elapse between neck cutting and scald tank; the efficiency of the stunning and slaughter/killing process must be regularly checked by vet or licensed slaughterman; stunning parameters not specified)	10 (all birds must be stunned; electrical parameters specified in terms of current, frequency and duration and must be AC; all birds leaving water bath must be checked to ensure they have been effectively stunned or killed and any birds which are not properly stunned must be humanely killed prior to entering the scald tank; stun-neck cutting interval must not exceed 10 seconds; both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed; all birds must be checked to ensure effective neck cut and the blood vessels severed manually if necessary; at least 90 seconds must elapse between neck cutting and scald tank and all birds must be checked to ensure they are dead prior to entering scald tank; for gas killing all birds must be checked immediately on leaving the system to ensure they are dead)	10 (all birds must be stunned; electrical parameters specified in terms of current, frequency and duration and must be AC; all birds leaving water bath must be checked to ensure they have been effectively stunned or killed and any birds which are not properly stunned must be humanely killed prior to entering the scald tank; stun-neck cutting interval must not exceed 10 seconds; both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed; all birds must be checked to ensure effective neck cut and the blood vessels severed manually if necessary; at least 90 seconds must elapse between neck cutting and scald tank and all birds must be checked to ensure they are dead prior to entering scald tank; for gas killing all birds must be checked immediately on leaving the system to ensure they are dead)	2 (all birds must be stunned; stunning must cause instantaneous unconsciousness that is maintained until death but stunning parameters not specified; both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed; minimum time between stunning and neck cutting and between neck cutting and scald tank not specified)	6 (all birds must be stunned; current must be strong enough and in contact for long enough so that every bird is immediately unconscious and stays unconscious until it is dead but stunning parameters not specified; someone must be present at all times to check that the stun is effective and where the stun may have not worked correctly, to stun or kill without delay; stun-neck cutting interval must not exceed 10 seconds; both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed; minimum time between neck cutting and scald tank not specified)

*Key criteria

Table A5.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for broiler chickens.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for broiler chickens	Assured Chicken Production minimum standards (ACP minimum)	Assured Chicken Production free-range standards (ACP free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Promotion of high welfare standards in the handling of animals during transport and slaughter	Animal welfare policy and CCTV at abattoir and requirement for people involved in catching, transport and slaughter of birds to be trained/ competent/ experienced	4 (drivers must be competent and trained in poultry handling and welfare; training must be documented; catching teams must be trained, including induction and refresher training, and records must be kept; person responsible for welfare of flock must be present during depopulation; named person responsible for welfare during catching; abattoirs must have a written bird welfare policy; must have a trained Poultry Welfare Officer (PWO) who must oversee the unloading, lairaging and slaughter of birds; lairage staff must be trained in the welfare of birds, including induction and refresher courses; managers must ensure staff have access to and receive guidance on relevant regulations, guides and codes; no requirement for CCTV)	4 (drivers must be competent and trained in poultry handling and welfare; training must be documented; catching teams must be trained, including induction and refresher training, and records must be kept; person responsible for welfare of flock must be present during depopulation; named person responsible for welfare during catching; abattoirs must have a written bird welfare policy; must have a trained PWO who must oversee the unloading, lairaging and slaughter of birds; lairage staff must be trained in the welfare of birds, including induction and refresher courses; managers must ensure staff have access to and receive guidance on relevant regulations, guides and codes; no requirement for CCTV)	4 (all personnel involved in catching and transport must be trained and competent; recommended that training is validated; must have full and detailed written instructions on catching and handling; named person responsible for welfare during catching; personnel in charge of transport must have completed an approved training course; abattoirs must have a written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly; there must be at least one appointed PWO and it is recommended that they should have attended a validated training programme; there must be a training programme for all staff which includes use of HSA training video; recommended that training is validated; installation of CCTV in abattoirs is not currently required but will be introduced from Nov 2011)	4 (all personnel involved in catching and transport must be trained and competent; recommended that training is validated; must have full and detailed written instructions on catching and handling; named person responsible for welfare during catching; personnel in charge of transport must have completed an approved training course; abattoirs must have a written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly; there must be at least one appointed PWO and it is recommended that they should have attended a validated training programme; there must be a training programme for all staff which includes use of HSA training video; recommended that training is validated; installation of CCTV in abattoirs is not currently required but will be introduced from Nov 2011)	2 (no stipulations on training of catchers or drivers beyond legal requirements; abattoirs must have a training programme that includes animal welfare; records of training for all staff must be kept; there must be a nominated person who is responsible for animal welfare and they must be trained and competent; a suitably trained and competent person must oversee the unloading of every animal including those arriving out-of-hours; no requirement for CCTV)	3 (no stipulations on training of catchers or drivers beyond legal requirements; abattoirs must have a documented quality management system which covers animal welfare and is reviewed regularly; must have a training programme that includes animal welfare and is ongoing with induction and refresher training, further training specific to the job and retraining when there are any problems or when new procedures are introduced; records of training for all operators must be kept; recommends that training is validated; when there are live animals there must always be someone present who is responsible for animal welfare and they must be trained and competent – AWO or abattoir owner/operator; a suitably trained and competent person must oversee the unloading of every animal including those arriving out-of-hours; no requirement for CCTV)
GENETICS & BREEDING							
No use of breeds associated with increased incidence of health/ welfare problems	Only slower-growing breeds permitted and requirement for breeds used in outdoor systems to be suitable for outdoor conditions*	0 (no restriction on growth rate or permitted breeds; no minimum slaughter age; key health and welfare problems associated with growth rate must be monitored, e.g. incidence of leg culls, but no requirement to change genetics if levels are unacceptable)	0 (no restriction on growth rate or permitted breeds; minimum slaughter age in accordance with legislation – 56 days; key health and welfare problems associated with growth rate must be monitored, e.g. incidence of leg culls, but no requirement to change genetics if levels are unacceptable; suitability of breeds for the system not specified)	6 (the genetic growth rate of a bird must not be greater than 45g per day, on average, i.e. average flock weight will not reach 2.2kg before 49 days of age; key health and welfare problems associated with growth rate must be monitored, e.g. incidence of leg culls; all birds of gait score 3 or above must be culled and where leg cull is greater than 3% to 42 days of age, this must be investigated and reported to the Freedom Food Assessor and RSPCA Farm Livestock Officer)	6 (the genetic growth rate of a bird must not be greater than 45g per day, on average; minimum slaughter age in accordance with legislation – 56 days; key health and welfare problems associated with growth rate must be monitored, e.g. incidence of leg culls; all birds of gait score 3 or above must be culled and where leg cull is greater than 3% to 42 days of age, this must be investigated and reported to the Freedom Food Assessor and RSPCA Farm Livestock Officer; suitability of breeds for the system not specified)	6 (traditional or slow-growing strains must be used, or if fast-growing Ross/Cobb type hybrids are used the minimum slaughter age is 81 days; breeds must be chosen to avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production, e.g. sudden death syndrome, PSE syndrome, but no requirement for monitoring of key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate; choice of breeds must take account of the capacity of the animals to adapt to local conditions and their vitality and resistance to disease)	8 (traditional or slow-growing strains must be used, or if fast-growing breeds are used the minimum slaughter age is 81 days – slow growing breeds are defined as having daily weight gain averaged over the life of the bird of no more than 35g per day, according to published breed data, and maximum daily weight gain measured on farm of never more than 60g; breeds must be chosen to avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production; key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate must be monitored, e.g. mortality and causes, culls and reasons; breeds must be chosen that can adapt to the organic system and local conditions and that have vitality and resistance to disease)

*Key criteria

Table A5.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for broiler chickens.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for broiler chickens	Assured Chicken Production minimum standards (ACP minimum)	Assured Chicken Production free-range standards (ACP free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
High welfare standards for breeding animals	See Table A5.3 for scoring of breeding bird welfare	2	2	0	0	0	4
No killing of surplus male animals	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
AUDITING							
Frequent inspections	Frequent inspections by certifying body	4 (inspections annually)	4 (inspections annually)	4 (annual inspection; time between inspections may be shorter or longer up to 15 months to allow visits at different times of year)	4 (annual inspection; time between inspections may be shorter or longer up to 15 months to allow visits at different times of year)	4 (annual inspection)	4 (annual inspection)
Spot-checks	Targeted unannounced spot-checks	1 (routine inspections are supplemented by some random spot checks at short notice)	1 (routine inspections are supplemented by some random spot checks at short notice)	5 (RSPCA monitor approx 35% of all members and 50% of monitoring visits are unannounced; all monitoring visits are made on a risk assessment basis following annual inspection – farms with non-compliances at assessment will get a monitoring visit)	5 (RSPCA monitor around 35% of all members and 50% of monitoring visits are unannounced; all monitoring visits are made on a risk assessment basis following annual inspection – farms with non-compliances at assessment will get a monitoring visit)	1 (spot checks are carried out as a routine part of verifying continuous compliance with the standards; may be unannounced; no information supplied to indicate that spot checks are targeted or the proportion of farms receiving continuous compliance with the standards; may be unannounced; no information supplied to indicate that spot checks are targeted or the proportion of farms receiving continuous compliance with the standards; additional assessments are also carried out where a major change or deviation has been made from the approved farm plan)	3 (there is a programme of additional unannounced inspections over and above the annual visits; these target those who are considered to be higher risk or where specific risks have been identified, e.g. end of derogation periods, parallel production, following up complaints; around 10% of farms receive additional spot-checks or follow-up visits each year)
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme	Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set*	2 (no assessment of welfare outcomes but checks are carried out during inspections to ensure producers are collecting and maintaining records of health and performance data)	2 (no assessment of welfare outcomes but checks are carried out during inspections to ensure producers are collecting and maintaining records of health and performance data)	6 (RSPCA has developed a system of assessment of welfare outcomes and is working with other standard setters and Bristol University to further develop outcome measures; assessments of welfare outcomes on broiler farms are not yet underway; producers set themselves targets and intervention levels in VHP; checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met)	6 (RSPCA has developed a system of assessment of welfare outcomes and is working with other standard setters and Bristol University to further develop outcome measures; assessments of welfare outcomes on broiler farms are not yet underway; producers set themselves targets and intervention levels in VHP; checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met)	0 (no assessment of welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	6 (SA has a programme of assessments based on the Bristol Welfare Assurance Programme (BWAP); observations for broiler chickens are feather loss, lameness, trauma/ injury, dirty feathers, behaviour – evidence of dustbathing/ ranging; no targets set for broilers yet but plan to introduce targets)

Stringent measures

*Key criteria

Table A5.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for broiler chickens.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for broiler chickens	Assured Chicken Production minimum standards (ACP minimum)	Assured Chicken Production free-range standards (ACP free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Measures to address non-compliance	to address non-compliance	5 (all non-conformances must be corrected; a major non-conformance against one of the 'key standards' will result in suspension of certification until it is corrected; non-conformances against 'other standards' should not result in suspension provided they are corrected within an agreed timescale, normally within 28 days of the assessment; certification may also be suspended in the case of a large number of such non-conformances or in the event of the same non-conformance being found on successive assessment visits)	5 (all non-conformances must be corrected; a major non-conformance against one of the 'key standards' will result in suspension of certification until it is corrected; non-conformances against 'other standards' should not result in suspension provided they are corrected within an agreed timescale, normally within 28 days of the assessment; certification may also be suspended in the case of a large number of such non-conformances or in the event of the same non-conformance being found on successive assessment visits)	5 (all non-compliances must be corrected as soon as possible; certificates are withdrawn after 8 weeks if the Freedom Food certification panel have not received corrective actions and objective evidence to verify compliance; a producer who has their certificate withdrawn due to non-compliance at assessment has 3 unannounced visits by Freedom Food over the next 6 months to ensure compliance is being maintained)	5 (all non-compliances must be corrected as soon as possible; certificates are withdrawn after 8 weeks if the Freedom Food certification panel have not received corrective actions and objective evidence to verify compliance; a producer who has their certificate withdrawn due to non-compliance at assessment has 3 unannounced visits by Freedom Food over the next 6 months to ensure compliance is being maintained)	5 (where welfare issues are identified during an inspection, the Certification Officer sets the member targets to be implemented or in extreme cases passes on to SFQC Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) for the SOPA scheme for a full set of new plans and targets to be drawn up; if the targets are not met within a specific time scale then the member is withdrawn from the SOPA scheme; in some cases a specific category of livestock may be de-certified)	5 (an action summary form is drawn up following inspection, listing non-compliances and asking how they will be corrected, with a deadline for return of the completed form; actions to correct non-compliances must be approved before a licence is issued or continued; an additional inspection may be carried out to make sure non-compliances have been corrected; non-compliance categorised as minor, major, critical or manifest infringement; certification will normally be suspended for part or whole of the enterprise in response to critical non-compliance or multiple or unresolved major non-compliance)

APPENDIX 5B

BROILER CHICKENS

APPENDIX 5B: SCORING CATEGORIES FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR BROILER (MEAT) CHICKENS

Table A5.2: Scoring categories for broiler chickens.

Criteria for broiler chickens	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
ENVIRONMENT						
No cages	Cages permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Cages prohibited
Low indoor stocking density*	Maximum stocking density in excess of 39kg/m ²	Maximum stocking density 39kg/m ² or lower	Maximum stocking density 34kg/m ² or lower	Maximum stocking density 30kg/m ² or lower	Maximum stocking density 25kg/m ² or lower in fixed housing (can be up to 40kg/m ² in small mobile houses which are kept open at night)	Maximum stocking density 21kg/m ² or lower in fixed housing (can be up to 30kg/m ² in small mobile houses which are kept open at night)
Stringent limit on number of birds per m² and prohibition of thinning (removal of part of the flock for slaughter prior to depopulation of the entire flock)	Thinning permitted; high number of birds/ m ² permitted or not specified	N/A	Thinning permitted but moderate limit on number of birds per m ² to ensure thinning cannot be used to facilitate severe overstocking	Thinning restricted to once during birds' lifetime and moderate limit on number of birds per m ² to ensure thinning cannot be used to facilitate severe overstocking	Thinning prohibited OR Thinning not strictly prohibited but stringent limit on number of birds per m ² to ensure thinning cannot be used to facilitate overstocking	Thinning prohibited and stringent limit on number of birds/m ²
Adequate environmental conditions maintained by ventilation/ heating/ insulation and monitoring to maintain temperature, humidity and air quality within acceptable limits	No requirement for appropriate design of houses in terms of ventilation/ insulation/ heating; no requirement for monitoring of environmental conditions; limits for temperature, humidity and air quality parameters not specified	Houses must be appropriately designed in terms of ventilation/ insulation/ heating but no requirement for monitoring of environmental conditions and limits for temperature, humidity and air quality parameters not specified	Houses must be appropriately designed in terms of ventilation/ insulation/heating to maintain good environmental conditions; minimum and maximum temperature must be recorded daily; limits for humidity and air quality parameters not specified and no requirement for regular monitoring or recording of humidity or air quality parameters	Houses must be appropriately designed in terms of ventilation/ insulation/ heating to maintain good environmental conditions; minimum and maximum temperature must be recorded daily; limits specified for humidity and some air quality parameters but no requirement for regular monitoring or recording OR No requirement for regular monitoring of environmental conditions and/or limits not specified but houses must be appropriately designed in terms of ventilation/ insulation/ heating to maintain good environmental conditions and houses must be open during the day	Houses must be appropriately designed in terms of ventilation/ insulation/heating to maintain good environmental conditions; minimum and maximum temperature must be recorded daily; limits specified for humidity and some air quality parameters which must be monitored and recorded regularly	Houses must be appropriately designed in terms of ventilation/ insulation/heating to maintain good environmental conditions; minimum and maximum temperature must be recorded daily; limits specified for humidity and a wide range of air quality parameters which must be monitored and recorded regularly

*Key criteria

Table A5.2: Scoring categories for broiler chickens.

Criteria for broiler chickens	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Provision of litter material and additional enrichment to encourage exercise and foraging (e.g. perches, straw bales, roughage, pecking objects)*	N/A	N/A	At least one of 1) litter material must be provided 2) litter material required over the entire floor area to a minimum depth of 5cm 3) fresh litter material must be added regularly 4) additional enrichment required (minimum legislative requirement meets first point)	At least two of 1) litter material must be provided 2) litter material required over the entire floor area to a minimum depth of 5cm 3) fresh litter material must be added regularly 4) additional enrichment required	At least three of 1) litter material must be provided 2) litter material required over the entire floor area to a minimum depth of 5cm 3) fresh litter material must be added regularly 4) additional enrichment required	Deep layer of litter material required over the entire floor area and fresh material must be added regularly; additional enrichment required
Appropriate light intensity and light/dark periods	Minimum light intensity less than 20 lux or less than minimum 8 hours light period or less than minimum 6 hours dark period; no requirement for dusk period	Minimum 8 hours light at minimum 20 lux; minimum 6 hours dark period – including 4 hours continuous – except for first 7 and last 3 days (minimum legislative requirements); no requirement for dusk period	Minimum 8 hours light at minimum 50 lux and minimum 6 hours dark period; no requirement for dusk period	Access to natural light; minimum 6 hours dark period except when natural period is shorter; no requirement for dusk period	Access to natural light; minimum 6 hours dark period except when natural period is shorter; dusk period OR Access to natural light; minimum 8 hours dark period except when natural period is shorter; no requirement for dusk period	Access to natural light; minimum 8 hours dark period except when natural period is shorter; dusk period
Free range access*	Permanent indoor housing permitted	No requirement for access to range but all birds must have access to a covered veranda with enrichment and natural light	N/A	N/A	All birds must have access to range for at least half of life (except that birds may be housed temporarily in extreme weather conditions or if required by law due to a disease outbreak)	All birds must have access to range for at least two thirds of life (except that birds may be housed temporarily in extreme weather conditions or if required by law due to a disease outbreak)
Low outdoor stocking density	Outdoor access not required	N/A	N/A	At least 1m ² /bird (minimum legislative requirement for free range)	At least 2m ² /bird	At least 4m ² /bird
Provision of overhead cover and protection from predators for outdoor chickens	No requirement for overhead cover on the range; no specified requirement for protection from predators OR Outdoor access not required	N/A	One of 1) some overhead cover should be provided but no minimum specified or 2) protection from predators required	Some overhead cover should be provided but no minimum specified; protection from predators required	Overhead cover must be provided over a specified minimum area of the range; protection from predators required OR Natural or artificial cover sufficient to mimic natural environment required; protection from predators required	Natural or artificial cover must be provided over at least 20% of the range and positioned so as to encourage use of the entire range area; protection from predators required

*Key criteria

Table A5.2: Scoring categories for broiler chickens.

Criteria for broiler chickens	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Small flock size	No limit on flock size	Maximum flock size 2000 birds or 4000 if demonstrably high level of bird health and welfare and good environmental conditions	Maximum flock size 1000 birds or 2000 if demonstrably high level of bird health and welfare and good environmental conditions OR Maximum flock size 2000 birds or 4000 if demonstrably high level of bird health and welfare and good environmental conditions and partitions must be provided	Maximum flock size 500 birds or 1000 if demonstrably high level of bird health and welfare and good environmental conditions OR Maximum flock size 1000 birds or 2000 if demonstrably high level of bird health and welfare and good environmental conditions and partitions must be provided	Maximum flock size 250 birds or 500 if demonstrably high level of bird health and welfare and good environmental conditions OR Maximum flock size 500 birds or 1000 if demonstrably high level of bird health and welfare and good environmental conditions and partitions must be provided	Natural flock sizes (i.e. up to around 20 birds)
HUSBANDRY						
No beak trimming	Beak trimming permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Beak trimming prohibited
No use of genetically modified or cloned animals or their offspring	No restriction on the use of genetically modified or cloned animals or their offspring	N/A	N/A	The use of genetically modified animals is prohibited but no restriction on the use of cloned animals or their offspring	The use of genetically modified and cloned animals is prohibited but no restriction on the use of clone offspring	The use of genetically modified and cloned animals and their offspring is prohibited
Short duration of feed withdrawal prior to slaughter	Period without feed prior to slaughter may be in excess of 12 hours	N/A	N/A	Period without feed prior to slaughter must not exceed 12 hours	Period without feed prior to slaughter must not exceed 10 hours	Period without feed prior to slaughter must not exceed 8 hours
Veterinary health plan with stringent targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits*	No requirement for VHP or monitoring of health and welfare and performance parameters	Must have VHP but no requirement for monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters	Must have VHP and recording of mortality and culls but no requirement for monitoring of other key health and welfare and performance parameters	Must have VHP and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters but no targets required	Must have VHP and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with moderate or unspecified targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits	Must have VHP and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with stringent targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits
STOCKMANSHIP, HANDLING, TRANSPORT & SLAUGHTER						
Humane catching/handling methods*	Catching by one leg permitted and no limit on number of birds carried	Catching by one leg prohibited but more than 3 birds may be carried per hand	N/A	Catching by one leg prohibited; no more than 3 birds may be carried per hand	Catching by one leg prohibited; no more than one bird may be carried per hand OR Catching must be automated (and catching machine must be shown to improve welfare)	All birds must be caught individually and carried in an upright position

*Key criteria

Table A5.2: Scoring categories for broiler chickens.

Criteria for broiler chickens	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Requirement for stockpeople to be trained/ competent/ experienced	No requirements regarding training or experience of stockpeople	N/A	Stockpeople must be suitably trained or experienced but no requirement to provide formal training in animal welfare or for training to be validated	Stockpeople must be suitably trained or experienced; formal training in animal welfare must be provided and records of training must be kept but no requirement for training to be validated	There must be at least one nominated person with responsibility for animal welfare (owner or manager) who must have attended a relevant validated training course; formal training in animal welfare must be provided for all stockpeople and records of training must be kept	All stockpeople must have attended a relevant validated training course and records of training must be kept
Frequent checks for signs of illness, injury or distress	N/A	N/A	N/A	Flocks must be checked at least once per day (minimum legal requirement)	Flocks must be checked at least twice per day OR Flocks must be checked at least 3 times per day but only one inspection must be sufficiently thorough to identify any bird showing signs of sickness or injury	Flocks must be checked at least 3 times per day
Short transport duration*	Journeys over 12 hours including loading and unloading or 8 hours excluding loading and unloading permitted	N/A	N/A	12 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 12 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used) OR 8 hour journey limit excluding loading and unloading	8 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 8 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used) OR 4 hour journey limit excluding loading and unloading	4 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 4 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)
Only humane stunning/ slaughter methods permitted – no shackling of live birds and no use of carbon dioxide*	Fewer than two of 1) controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method for off-farm slaughter 2) waterbath stunners must be designed to avoid pre-stun shocks 3) shackle line must have breast comforters 4) shackle line must have low lighting 5) maximum time in shackles limited to 30 seconds 6) Use of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited 7) Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited	At least two of 1) controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method for off-farm slaughter 2) waterbath stunners must be designed to avoid pre-stun shocks 3) shackle line must have breast comforters 4) shackle line must have low lighting 5) maximum time in shackles limited to 30 seconds 6) Use of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited 7) Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited	At least four of 1) controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method for off-farm slaughter 2) waterbath stunners must be designed to avoid pre-stun shocks 3) shackle line must have breast comforters 4) shackle line must have low lighting 5) maximum time in shackles limited to 30 seconds 6) Use of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited 7) Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited	At least six of 1) controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method for off-farm slaughter 2) waterbath stunners must be designed to avoid pre-stun shocks 3) shackle line must have breast comforters 4) shackle line must have low lighting 5) maximum time in shackles limited to 30 seconds 6) Use of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited 7) Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited	Use of metal shackles prohibited; birds slaughtered off-farm must be killed by controlled atmosphere stunning; birds slaughtered on-farm may be restrained in cones or soft (e.g. leather) shackles for electrical or percussive stunning	Use of metal shackles and CO ₂ prohibited; birds slaughtered off-farm must be killed by controlled atmosphere stunning using non-aversive gases; birds slaughtered on-farm may be restrained in cones or soft (e.g. leather) shackles for electrical or percussive stunning

*Key criteria

Table A5.2: Scoring categories for broiler chickens.

Criteria for broiler chickens	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death*	Slaughter without stunning permitted and/or no clear specifications for stunning parameters, time between stunning and neck cutting may exceed 10 seconds, no requirement for both carotid arteries and both jugular veins to be severed, no manual checking and back-up systems required, and time between neck cutting and scald tank may exceed 90 seconds	All birds must be stunned and at least one of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting 3) both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed 4) manual checking and back-up systems required 5) minimum of 90 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank.	All birds must be stunned and at least two of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting 3) both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed 4) manual checking and back-up systems required 5) minimum of 90 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank	All birds must be stunned and at least three of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting 3) both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed 4) manual checking and back-up systems required 5) minimum of 90 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank	All birds must be stunned and at least four of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting 3) both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed 4) manual checking and back-up systems required 5) minimum of 90 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank	All birds must be stunned; clear specifications for stunning parameters to ensure effective stun; maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting; both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed; manual checking and back-up systems required; minimum of 90 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank
Animal welfare policy and CCTV at abattoir and requirement for people involved in catching, transport and slaughter of birds to be trained/ competent/ experienced	No requirement for personnel in charge of catching and transporting birds to be trained or for abattoirs to have written animal welfare policy, an appointed AWO, a training programme in animal welfare or CCTV	At least one of 1) all personnel in charge of catching birds must be trained 2) all personnel in charge of transporting birds must be trained 3) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 4) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 5) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 6) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	At least two of 1) all personnel in charge of catching birds must be trained 2) all personnel in charge of transporting birds must be trained 3) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 4) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 5) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 6) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	At least three of 1) all personnel in charge of catching birds must be trained 2) all personnel in charge of transporting birds must be trained 3) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 4) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 5) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 6) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	At least five of 1) all personnel in charge of catching birds must be trained 2) all personnel in charge of transporting birds must be trained 3) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 4) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 5) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 6) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	All personnel in charge of catching and transporting birds must be trained; abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly; abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered; abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept; abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter

*Key criteria

Table A5.2: Scoring categories for broiler chickens.

Criteria for broiler chickens	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
GENETICS & BREEDING						
Only slower-growing breeds permitted and requirement for birds used in outdoor systems to be suitable for outdoor conditions*	No restrictions on permitted genetics; no requirement for monitoring of key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate	No restrictions on permitted genetics; key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary	Birds must be at least moderately slower-growing (no more than 45g average liveweight gain per day); no requirement for breeds to be suitable for the system; no requirement for monitoring of key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate	Fast-growing breeds not strictly prohibited but standards make it very difficult to use fast-growing breeds through restrictions on minimum slaughter age and only breeds suitable for outdoor use permitted in outdoor systems; no requirement for monitoring of key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate OR Birds must be at least moderately slower-growing (no more than 45g average liveweight gain per day); key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate must be monitored	Fast-growing breeds not strictly prohibited but standards make it very difficult to use fast-growing breeds through restrictions on minimum slaughter age and only breeds suitable for outdoor use permitted in outdoor systems; key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate must be monitored	Fast-growing breeds (over 35g average liveweight gain per day) strictly prohibited; only breeds suitable for outdoor use permitted in outdoor systems; key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate must be monitored and demonstrated to be within stringent limits
High welfare standards for breeding birds	See Table A5.4					
AUDITING						
Frequent inspections by certifying body	Inspections may be less frequent than every 24 months	Inspections at least every 24 months on average for all members	Inspections at least every 18 months on average for all members OR Inspections every 12 months initially and then up to 24 months with frequency determined by previous performance	Inspections at least every 15 months on average for all members OR Inspections every 6 months initially and then up to 24 months with frequency determined by previous performance	Inspections at least every 12 months on average for all members OR Inspections every 6 months initially and then up to 18 months with frequency determined by previous performance	Inspections every 6 months initially and then up to 12 months with frequency determined by previous performance
Targeted unannounced spot-checks	No spot checks	Spot checks for less than 10% of members annually (or proportion not specified); not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for less than 10% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced OR Spot checks for 10% of members annually but not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for 10% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced OR Spot checks for 20% of members annually but not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for 20% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced OR Spot checks for 30% of members annually but not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for 30% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced

*Key criteria

Table A5.2: Scoring categories for broiler chickens.

Criteria for broiler chickens	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set*	No assessment of welfare outcomes and no stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future	No assessment of welfare outcomes but stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future OR Informal observations of one or two welfare outcomes (e.g. injuries) during routine inspections but no formal recording of welfare outcomes and no targets set OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure records are being maintained	System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place but no targets set OR System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted and producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and either 1) farm-specific targets set by producers or 2) moderate (or unspecified) targets set by assurance scheme	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and stringent targets set by assurance scheme for all farms
Stringent measures to address non-compliance	No requirement to correct minor non-compliances	N/A	N/A	All non-compliances must be corrected but no defined timescale for correction; certification may be suspended or withdrawn for a serious non-compliance or multiple and/or repeated minor non-compliances	N/A	All non-compliances must be corrected within agreed timescale; certification may be suspended or withdrawn for a serious non-compliance or multiple and/or repeated minor non-compliances

*Key criteria

APPENDIX 5C

BROILER CHICKENS

APPENDIX 5C: FULL RESULTS TABLE FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR BROILER BREEDERS

Table A5.3: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for broiler breeders.

A maximum of 5 points is available for each criterion. Overall scores are converted to a score out of 5 and incorporated into the overall scoring of standards for broiler chickens (see **Table A5.1**).

Criteria for broiler breeders	Assured Chicken Production minimum standards (ACP minimum)	Assured Chicken Production free-range standards (ACP free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Low indoor stocking density	3 (maximum 25kg/m ²)	3 (maximum 25kg/m ²)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	4 (maximum 6 birds/m ²)
Provision of elevated perches, litter material for dustbathing and foraging and additional indoor enrichment (e.g. straw bales, pecking objects, roughage)	1 (litter must be provided to a minimum depth of 2cm; no requirement for litter to be topped up regularly; no requirement for additional enrichment)	1 (litter must be provided to a minimum depth of 2cm; no requirement for litter to be topped up regularly; no requirement for additional enrichment)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	3 (litter must be provided over at least half of floor area and topped up regularly; minimum 18cm elevated perch space per bird; slats cannot count toward perch requirements; it is recommended that fresh greens or turf are provided from day one)
Provision of nests	3 (nests provided but no specifications re minimum nest space)	3 (nests provided but no specifications re minimum nest space)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	5 (one nest for every 6 birds or 120cm ² of nest space per bird in communal nests)
Free range access	0 (permanent indoor housing permitted)	0 (permanent indoor housing permitted)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	5 (birds must have access to pasture from 12 weeks of age)
No beak trimming	0 (recommended that beak trimming of breeding birds should be kept to a minimum but no requirement to avoid beak trimming)	0 (recommended that beak trimming of breeding birds should be kept to a minimum but no requirement to avoid beak trimming)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	4 (beak trimming only permitted in exceptional circumstances with permission from the scheme each time and problem must be identified and rectified for future flocks)
No feed restriction	0 (feed restriction permitted; diet must be sufficient to maintain full health and vigour; males must have sufficient feed to maintain body weight within the profile recommended by the breeding company)	0 (feed restriction permitted; diet must be sufficient to maintain full health and vigour; males must have sufficient feed to maintain body weight within the profile recommended by the breeding company)	3 (breeding birds not covered by standards but requirement for moderately slower growth rate would be expected to reduce the requirement for feed restriction of breeding birds)	3 (breeding birds not covered by standards but requirement for moderately slower growth rate would be expected to reduce the requirement for feed restriction of breeding birds)	3 (breeding birds not covered by standards but encouragement of use of traditional/ slower growing breeds would be expected to reduce the requirement for feed restriction of breeding birds)	5 (birds must have access to feed throughout the day; feed restriction prohibited)

Table A5.3: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for broiler breeders.

Criteria for broiler breeders	Assured Chicken Production minimum standards (ACP minimum)	Assured Chicken Production free-range standards (ACP free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
No forced moulting	5 (forced moulting prohibited)	5 (forced moulting prohibited)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	5 (forced moulting effectively prohibited by requirement to provide access to food throughout the day)
Veterinary health plan with stringent targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits	4 (must have written health plan updated regularly; flock performance records must be monitored for signs of problems; tolerance limits must be set and once exceeded the vet must be informed and advice sought; mortality and daily culls including leg culls specifically, hockburn, pododermatitis, bruising and DOAs must be recorded)	4 (must have written health plan updated regularly; flock performance records must be monitored for signs of problems; tolerance limits must be set and once exceeded the vet must be informed and advice sought; mortality and daily culls including leg culls specifically, hockburn, pododermatitis, bruising and DOAs must be recorded)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	3 (must have animal health plan submitted for approval and reviewed regularly; health and welfare parameters must be monitored and records kept of veterinary treatments, mortalities and the cause of death, and hock damage, but no targets specified)
Humane catching/handling methods	0 (catching by one leg permitted; no limit on number of birds carried)	0 (catching by one leg permitted; no limit on number of birds carried)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	3 (welfare code must be complied with, which recommends that birds are caught and carried by the body or both legs and that no more than 3 birds are carried in one hand)
Short transport duration	3 (journeys must not exceed 12 hours from start of loading to unloading)	3 (journeys must not exceed 12 hours from start of loading to unloading)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	4 (journeys must not exceed 8 hours from the start of loading to the end of unloading, except with permission)
Only humane stunning/ slaughter methods permitted – no shackling of live birds and no use of carbon dioxide	0 (shackling permitted; measures must be taken to prevent wing flapping, e.g. breast bar; recommended but not required to use subdued or blue lighting; maximum time in shackles prior to stun 2 minutes; high concentration of CO ₂ permitted)	0 (shackling permitted; measures must be taken to prevent wing flapping, e.g. breast bar; recommended but not required to use subdued or blue lighting; maximum time in shackles prior to stun 2 minutes; high concentration of CO ₂ permitted;)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	1 (shackling permitted; no requirement for breast comforters or low lighting; waterbath stunners must not overflow at entrance or deliver pre-stun shocks to any bird; no restriction on length of time in shackles beyond legal requirements; use of CO ₂ prohibited)

Table A5.3: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for broiler breeders.

Criteria for broiler breeders	Assured Chicken Production minimum standards (ACP minimum)	Assured Chicken Production free-range standards (ACP free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death	3 (stun-neck cutting interval must not exceed 15 seconds; both major blood vessels on both sides of neck must be severed; manual or back-up neck cutting must be provided for birds that miss automatic neck cut; at least 90 seconds must elapse between neck cutting and scald tank; the efficiency of the stunning and slaughter/killing process must be regularly checked by vet or licensed slaughterman; stunning parameters not specified)	3 (stun-neck cutting interval must not exceed 15 seconds; both major blood vessels on both sides of neck must be severed; manual or back-up neck cutting must be provided for birds that miss automatic neck cut; at least 90 seconds must elapse between neck cutting and scald tank; the efficiency of the stunning and slaughter/killing process must be regularly checked by vet or licensed slaughterman; stunning parameters not specified)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	3 (all birds must be stunned; current must be strong enough and in contact for long enough so that every bird is immediately unconscious and stays unconscious until it is dead but stunning parameters not specified; someone must be present at all times to check that the stun is effective and where the stun may have not worked correctly, to stun or kill without delay; stun-neck cutting interval must not exceed 10 seconds; both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed; minimum time between neck cutting and scald tank not specified)
Only slower-growing breeds permitted	0 (no restrictions on permitted genetics)	0 (no restrictions on permitted genetics)	3 (breeding birds not covered by standards but requirement for moderately slower growth rate in standards for growing birds)	3 (breeding birds not covered by standards but requirement for moderately slower growth rate in standards for growing birds)	3 (breeding birds not covered by standards but encouragement of use of traditional/ slow growing breeds in standards for growing birds)	5 (breeds must be suitable for organic, free range management and produce offspring that are hardy and slow growing; slow growing breeds are defined as having daily weight gain averaged over the life of the bird of no more than 35g per day, according to published breed data, and maximum daily weight gain measured on farm of never more than 60g)
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set	1 (no assessment of welfare outcomes but checks are carried out during inspections to ensure producers are collecting and maintaining records of health and performance data)	1 (no assessment of welfare outcomes but checks are carried out during inspections to ensure producers are collecting and maintaining records of health and performance data)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	3 (SA has a programme of assessments based on the Bristol Welfare Assurance Programme (BWAP); observations for broiler chickens are feather loss, lameness, trauma/ injury, dirty feathers, behaviour – evidence of dustbathing/ ranging; no targets set for broilers yet but plan to introduce targets)
Total for broiler breeder criteria	23/70	23/70	6/70	6/70	6/70	53/70
Welfare score for broiler breeders carried over to Table A5.1	2/5	2/5	0/5	0/5	0/5	4/5

APPENDIX 5D

BROILER CHICKENS

APPENDIX 5D: SCORING CATEGORIES FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR BROILER BREEDERS

Table A5.4: Scoring categories for broiler breeders.

Criteria for broiler breeders	Score 0	Score 1	Score 2	Score 3	Score 4	Score 5
Low indoor stocking density	Maximum stocking density in excess of 30kg/m ² or more than 9 birds/m ²	Maximum stocking density 30kg/m ² or lower OR No more than 9 birds/m ²	Maximum stocking density 27.5kg/m ² or lower OR No more than 8 birds/m ²	Maximum stocking density 25kg/m ² or lower OR No more than 7 birds/m ²	Maximum stocking density 21kg/m ² or lower OR No more than 6 birds/m ²	Maximum stocking density 18kg/m ² or lower OR No more than 5 birds/m ²
Provision of elevated perches, litter material for dustbathing and foraging and additional indoor enrichment (e.g. straw bales, pecking objects, roughage)	No requirement for perches, litter material or additional enrichment	At least one of 1) perches must be provided 2) minimum of 18cm of elevated perching space per bird 3) litter material must be provided 4) litter material required over entire floor area 5) fresh litter material must be added regularly 6) additional enrichment required	At least two of 1) perches must be provided 2) minimum of 18cm of elevated perching space per bird 3) litter material must be provided 4) litter material required over entire floor area 5) fresh litter material must be added regularly 6) additional enrichment required	At least three of 1) perches must be provided 2) minimum of 18cm of elevated perching space per bird 3) litter material must be provided 4) litter material required over entire floor area 5) fresh litter material must be added regularly 6) additional enrichment required	At least five of 1) perches must be provided 2) minimum of 18cm of elevated perching space per bird 3) litter material must be provided 4) litter material required over entire floor area 5) fresh litter material must be added regularly 6) additional enrichment required	Minimum of 18cm of elevated perching space per bird; litter material required over entire floor area and fresh material must be added regularly; additional enrichment required
Provision of nests	No requirement to provide nests	N/A	N/A	Nests required but minimum nest number or area inadequate or not specified	N/A	Adequate nesting facilities required
Free range access	Permanent indoor housing permitted	No requirement for access to range but all birds must have access to a covered veranda with enrichment and natural light	N/A	N/A	All birds must have access to range for whole of laying life (except that birds may be housed temporarily in extreme weather conditions or if required by law due to a disease outbreak)	All birds must have access to range from 12 weeks (except that birds may be housed temporarily in extreme weather conditions or if required by law due to a disease outbreak)
No beak trimming	Beak trimming permitted	N/A	N/A	Beak trimming permitted but commitment to phase out in near future	Beak trimming only permitted in exceptional circumstances with written permission the from scheme each time and problem must be identified and rectified for future flocks	Beak trimming prohibited
No feed restriction	Feed restriction permitted in line with breeding company recommendations	N/A	N/A	Feed restriction not specifically prohibited or not covered by standards but only moderately slower-growing breeds permitted or standards make it very difficult to use fast-growing breeds so requirement for feed restriction of breeding birds is likely to be reduced	Feed restriction of breeding birds not specifically prohibited or not covered by standards but only traditional/ slow-growing breeds permitted so feed restriction of breeding birds is likely to be much reduced or avoided altogether	Feed restriction of breeding birds prohibited
No forced moulting	Forced moulting permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Forced moulting prohibited

Table A5.4: Scoring categories for broiler breeders.

Criteria for broiler breeders	Score 0	Score 1	Score 2	Score 3	Score 4	Score 5
Veterinary health plan with stringent targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits	No requirement for VHP or monitoring of health and welfare and performance parameters	Must have VHP but no requirement for monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters	N/A	Must have VHP and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters but no targets required	Must have VHP and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with moderate or unspecified targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits	Must have VHP and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with stringent targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits
Humane catching/handling methods	Catching by one leg permitted and no limit on number of birds carried	Catching by one leg prohibited but more than 3 birds may be carried per hand	N/A	Catching by one leg prohibited; no more than 3 birds may be carried per hand	Catching by one leg prohibited; no more than one bird may be carried per hand OR Catching must be automated (and catching machine must be shown to improve welfare)	All birds must be caught individually and carried in an upright position
Short transport duration	Journeys over 12 hours including loading and unloading or 8 hours excluding loading and unloading permitted	N/A	N/A	12 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 12 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used) OR 8 hour journey limit excluding loading and unloading	8 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 8 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used) OR 4 hour journey limit excluding loading and unloading	4 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 4 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)
Only humane stunning/ slaughter methods permitted –no shackling of live birds and no use of carbon dioxide	Fewer than two of 1) controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method for off-farm slaughter 2) waterbath stunners must be designed to avoid pre-stun shocks 3) shackle line must have breast comforters 4) shackle line must have low lighting 5) maximum time in shackles limited to 60 seconds 6) Use of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited 7) Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited	At least two of 1) controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method for off-farm slaughter 2) waterbath stunners must be designed to avoid pre-stun shocks 3) shackle line must have breast comforters 4) shackle line must have low lighting 5) maximum time in shackles limited to 60 seconds 6) Use of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited 7) Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited	At least four of 1) controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method for off-farm slaughter 2) waterbath stunners must be designed to avoid pre-stun shocks 3) shackle line must have breast comforters 4) shackle line must have low lighting 5) maximum time in shackles limited to 60 seconds 6) Use of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited 7) Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited	At least six of 1) controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method for off-farm slaughter 2) waterbath stunners must be designed to avoid pre-stun shocks 3) shackle line must have breast comforters 4) shackle line must have low lighting 5) maximum time in shackles limited to 60 seconds 6) Use of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited 7) Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited	Use of metal shackles prohibited; birds slaughtered off-farm must be killed by controlled atmosphere stunning; birds slaughtered on-farm may be restrained in cones or soft (e.g. leather) shackles for electrical or percussive stunning	Use of metal shackles and CO ₂ prohibited; birds slaughtered off-farm must be killed by controlled atmosphere stunning using non-aversive gases; birds slaughtered on-farm may be restrained in cones or soft (e.g. leather) shackles for electrical or percussive stunning

Table A5.4: Scoring categories for broiler breeders.

Criteria for broiler breeders	Score 0	Score 1	Score 2	Score 3	Score 4	Score 5
Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death	Slaughter without stunning permitted and/or no clear specifications for stunning parameters, time between stunning and neck cutting may exceed 10 seconds, no requirement for both carotid arteries and both jugular veins to be severed, no manual checking and back-up systems required, and time between neck cutting and scald tank may exceed 90 seconds	All birds must be stunned and at least one of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting 3) both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed 4) manual checking and back-up systems required 5) minimum of 90 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank	All birds must be stunned and at least two of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting 3) both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed 4) manual checking and back-up systems required 5) minimum of 90 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank	All birds must be stunned and at least three of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting 3) both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed 4) manual checking and back-up systems required 5) minimum of 90 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank	All birds must be stunned and at least four of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting 3) both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed 4) manual checking and back-up systems required 5) minimum of 90 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank	All birds must be stunned; clear specifications for stunning parameters to ensure effective stun; maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting; both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed; manual checking and back-up systems required; minimum of 90 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank
Only slower-growing breeds permitted	No restrictions on permitted genetics	N/A	N/A	Breeding birds not covered by standards but requirement for moderately slower growth rate or encouragement of use of traditional/ slow growing breeds in standards for growing birds	Birds must be at least moderately slower-growing (no more than 45g average liveweight gain per day)	Birds must be slow-growing (no more than 35g average liveweight gain per day)
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set	No assessment of welfare outcomes and no stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future	No assessment of welfare outcomes but stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future OR Informal observations of one or two welfare outcomes (e.g. injuries) during routine inspections but no formal recording of welfare outcomes and no targets set OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure records are being maintained	System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place but no targets set OR System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted and producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and either 1) farm-specific targets set by producers or 2) moderate (or unspecified) targets set by assurance scheme	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and stringent targets set by assurance scheme for all farms

APPENDIX 6A

TURKEYS

APPENDIX 6A: FULL RESULTS TABLE FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR TURKEYS

Table A6.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for turkeys.

Up to 5 points are available for each criterion. Key criteria (marked with an asterisk) are weighted so that they are worth double points (i.e. up to 10 points for each key criterion). Score for breeding bird welfare is derived from **Table A6.3**. Criteria are grouped into five sets. Totals for each set of criteria are converted to scores out of 20, which are totalled to give an overall score out of 100 for each scheme (see **Table 3.6**).

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for turkeys	Quality British Turkey minimum standards (QBT minimum)	Quality British Turkey free-range standards (QBT free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
ENVIRONMENT							
No close confinement	No cages	5 (cages prohibited)	5 (cages prohibited)	5 (not specified but cages effectively prohibited by other requirements of standards)	5 (not specified but cages effectively prohibited by other requirements of standards)	5 (not specified but cages effectively prohibited by other requirements of standards)	5 (not specified but cages effectively prohibited by other requirements of standards)
Adequate space allowance when housed	Low indoor stocking density*	2 (maximum stocking density determined by FAWC formula, equivalent to between 17.3kg/m ² at 0.5kg liveweight and 59.1kg/m ² at 20kg liveweight)	8 (maximum 25kg/m ²)	8 (maximum 25kg/m ²)	8 (maximum 25kg/m ²)	8 (maximum not specified in terms of weight but no more than 3 birds/m ² in mobile housing, e.g. equivalent to 24kg/m ² if reared to 8kg; fixed housing not permitted)	10 (maximum 21kg/m ²)
	Stringent limit on number of birds per m² and prohibition of thinning (removal of part of the flock for slaughter prior to depopulation of the entire flock)	0 (maximum stocking density determined by FAWC formula, equivalent to between 34.6 birds/m ² at 0.5kg liveweight and 3.0 birds/m ² at 20kg liveweight; thinning permitted)	1 (number of birds per m ² as determined by FAWC formula within limits of 25kg/m ² maximum; thinning permitted)	4 (thinning is prohibited, effectively limiting the number of birds/m ² , e.g. 3 birds/m ² if reared to 8kg)	4 (thinning is prohibited, effectively limiting the number of birds/m ² , e.g. 3 birds/m ² if reared to 8kg)	4 (thinning is not strictly prohibited but the limit on the number of birds to 3/m ² prevents thinning being used to facilitate overstocking)	4 (thinning is not prohibited but the limit on the number of birds to 2/m ² in fixed housing or 3/m ² in mobile housing prevents thinning being used to facilitate overstocking)
Appropriate housing design	Adequate environmental conditions maintained by ventilation/ heating/ insulation and monitoring to maintain temperature, humidity and air quality within acceptable limits	2 (ventilation in controlled environment housing must ensure that the house temperature meets the needs of the birds; minimum and maximum temperatures must be recorded daily; controlled environment houses must be insulated; no limits specified for humidity or air quality parameters and no requirement to monitor or record humidity or air quality parameters)	3 (the ventilation system must be suitable for the design and construction of the house; minimum and maximum temperatures must be recorded daily; no limits specified for humidity or air quality parameters and no requirement to monitor humidity or air quality parameters; houses must be open during the day)	5 (turkeys must have access to a thermally comfortable environment at all times; minimum and maximum temperatures must be recorded daily; records of relative humidity and ventilation must be kept; air quality parameters should be recorded weekly and, where levels are detected which exceed those in the standards, they should be recorded daily until acceptable levels are achieved and maintained; relative humidity should be between 50 and 70% and levels should not exceed 5ppm ammonia, 5000ppm CO ₂ , 10mg/m ³ dust and 50ppm carbon monoxide)	5 (turkeys must have access to a thermally comfortable environment at all times; minimum and maximum temperatures must be recorded daily; records of relative humidity and ventilation must be kept; air quality parameters should be recorded weekly and, where levels are detected which exceed those in the standards, they should be recorded daily until acceptable levels are achieved and maintained; relative humidity should be between 50 and 70% and levels should not exceed 5ppm ammonia, 5000ppm CO ₂ , 10mg/m ³ dust and 50ppm carbon monoxide; houses must be open during the day)	3 (insulation, heating and ventilation of the building must ensure that air circulation, dust level, temperature, relative humidity and gas concentration are kept within limits that are not harmful to the animals but no requirement to monitor environmental conditions; houses must be open during the day)	3 (housing must provide suitable temperature, humidity, dust levels and natural ventilation but no requirement to monitor environmental conditions; houses must be open during the day)

*Key criteria

Table A6.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for turkeys.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for turkeys	Quality British Turkey minimum standards (QBT minimum)	Quality British Turkey free-range standards (QBT free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Provision of appropriate bedding/ litter/ enrichment	Provision of elevated perches, litter material for dustbathing and foraging and additional indoor enrichment (e.g. straw bales, pecking objects, roughage)*	2 (litter must be provided but no minimum depth stipulated and no requirement for litter to be replenished until depopulation; recommended but not required that birds are provided with perches, straw bales, pecking objects and suspended vegetables)	2 (litter must be provided but no minimum depth stipulated and no requirement for litter to be replenished until depopulation; no requirement for perches or additional enrichment)	8 (litter must be provided over the entire floor area and maintained at an average minimum depth of 5cm and topped up daily if necessary to maintain in a dry friable condition suitable for dustbathing; for every 500 birds there must be minimum 2m perch space, 1 large or 2 small straw bales and 2 lengths of rope; must be increased by at least 25% if pecking is a problem; it is recommended that 40cm of perching space per bird is provided and additional pecking objects such as brassicas, CDs and plastic bottles)	8 (litter must be provided over the entire floor area and maintained at an average minimum depth of 5cm and topped up daily if necessary to maintain in a dry friable condition suitable for dustbathing; for every 500 birds there must be minimum 2m perch space, 1 large or 2 small straw bales and 2 lengths of rope; it is recommended that 40cm of perching space per bird is provided and additional pecking objects such as brassicas, CDs and plastic bottles)	8 (litter must be provided over at least one third of floor area and replenished regularly; minimum 40cm perch space per bird; when birds are housed they must have permanent access to sufficient quantities of roughage and suitable material to meet ethological needs)	6 (litter must be provided over at least half of floor area and topped up regularly; minimum 40cm perch space per bird)
Provision of appropriate nesting facilities	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Appropriate lighting	Appropriate light intensity and light/ dark periods	1 (minimum 10 lux and may be reduced as an emergency measure; minimum 8 hours continuous dark period in any 24 hour period or natural dark period in naturally-lit units; no requirement for light to be turned on or off gradually)	4 (access to natural daylight outdoors; during the brooding stage in enclosed housing must have minimum 10 lux and minimum 8 hours continuous dark period in any 24 hour period; minimum 8 hours natural or artificial light in any 24 hour period and minimum 7 hours continuous darkness except when natural dark period is shorter than 6 hours except during brooding stage and days immediately prior to slaughter; no requirement for light to be turned on or off gradually)	3 (minimum 12 hours light at minimum 20 lux and minimum 8 hours continuous darkness except in naturally-lit systems when natural dark period is shorter and during first 3 days after placement; where artificial light is used to extend natural daylight period it must be turned on and off gradually over a period of at least 30 minutes; from 1 Jan 2012 all systems must provide natural daylight from 35 days of age; if pecking is a problem the entire building must be lit with UV light)	5 (access to natural daylight outdoors; minimum 12 hours light at minimum 20 lux and minimum 8 hours continuous darkness except in naturally-lit systems when natural dark period is shorter and during first 3 days after placement; where artificial light is used to extend natural daylight period it must be turned on and off gradually over a period of at least 30 minutes; from 1 Jan 2012 all systems must provide natural daylight from 35 days of age; if pecking is a problem the entire building must be lit with UV light)	5 (access to natural daylight outdoors; artificial lighting may be used to prolong the day length up to a maximum of 16 hours per day and must end at dusk)	5 (access to natural daylight outdoors; artificial lighting may be used to prolong the day length up to a maximum of 16 hours per day and must end at dusk)

*Key criteria

Table A6.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for turkeys.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for turkeys	Quality British Turkey minimum standards (QBT minimum)	Quality British Turkey free-range standards (QBT free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Free range access	Free range access*	0 (permanent indoor housing permitted)	8 (birds must have access to range for at least half the growing period)	0 (permanent indoor housing permitted)	8 (birds must have access to range for at least half the growing period)	10 (birds must have continuous daytime access to pasture/ range for at least two thirds of life except in extreme weather conditions or when required by law due to disease outbreak when birds may be housed with permanent access to sufficient quantities of roughage and suitable material to meet ethological needs)	10 (birds must have continuous and easy daytime access to pasture for at least two thirds of life except in adverse weather conditions or when required by law due to disease outbreak)
Adequate outdoor space	Low outdoor stocking density	0 (no outdoor access)	3 (4m ² per turkey)	0 (no outdoor access)	3 (4m ² per turkey)	5 (800 birds/ha = 12.5m ² per turkey)	5 (800 birds/ha = 12.5m ² per turkey)
Appropriate shelter/shade and protection from predators	Provision of overhead cover and protection from predators for outdoor turkeys	0 (no outdoor access)	2 (natural shelter/ cover should be encouraged such as hedges/ trees / semi-permanent vegetation; artificial shelter such as camouflage netting/ big bales / A-frames should be provided to move with mobile houses; no stipulations regarding protection from predators)	0 (no outdoor access)	4 (a minimum of 10m ² of natural or artificial overhead shade per 1000 birds must be provided; recommended that shade area calculated according to formula in standards which would give a total shade area of 25m ² per 500 birds reared to 7kg; humane precautions must be taken to protect turkeys from predators)	4 (birds must have access to shelter at all times and be provided with protection from predators; adequate natural or artificial cover must be provided in the free range areas to give the birds conditions akin to their native habitat, protection from overhead predators and shelter from extreme weather conditions; this cover should be provided in a way that encourages ranging behaviour and ensures maximum use of the pasture)	4 (birds must have access to shelter at all times, protection from predators, and enough natural or artificial cover in the free range areas to imitate their native habitat and encourage them to range fully; access to woodland is recommended)
Appropriate social grouping	Small flock size	0 (no restriction on flock size)	0 (no restriction on flock size)	1 (no restriction on flock size but birds must be provided with visual barriers to allow them to seek refuge from other birds)	1 (no restriction on flock size but birds must be provided with visual barriers to allow them to seek refuge from other birds)	3 (maximum 1000 birds in a housing unit but restricted to 250 unless certain conditions are met including demonstrating high level of bird health and welfare, good environmental conditions and adequate access to range)	3 (maximum 1000 birds in a housing unit but restricted to 250 unless certain conditions are met including demonstrating high level of bird health and welfare, good environmental conditions and adequate access to range)

*Key criteria

Table A6.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for turkeys.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for turkeys	Quality British Turkey minimum standards (QBT minimum)	Quality British Turkey free-range standards (QBT free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
HUSBANDRY							
No mutilations	No beak trimming*	0 (permitted)	0 (permitted)	2 (only permitted in controlled environment housing on the advice of a vet during an outbreak of injurious pecking to prevent further welfare problems; permitted in naturally lit systems)	0 (permitted in naturally lit systems)	10 (prohibited)	10 (prohibited)
No use of genetic engineering/ cloning or invasive reproductive technologies associated with health or welfare problems	No use of genetically modified or cloned animals or their offspring	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	4 (livestock must not be brought in that have been produced using transgenic or other genetic engineering techniques; cloning is effectively prohibited by prohibitions on breeding practices that make livestock systems over-reliant on inappropriate technology and any surgical or chemical interference other than procedures specifically permitted in the standards, but no restriction on the use of the offspring of cloned animals)	4 (livestock must not be brought in that have been produced using transgenic or other genetic engineering techniques; use of cloning is prohibited but no restriction on the use of the offspring of cloned animals)
Appropriate feeding	Short duration of feed withdrawal prior to slaughter	3 (feed withdrawal must not exceed 12 hours prior to catching)	3 (feed withdrawal must not exceed 12 hours prior to catching)	4 (no bird must be deprived of feed for more than 10 hours prior to slaughter)	4 (no bird must be deprived of feed for more than 10 hours prior to slaughter)	0 (feed may be withheld for a limited period just prior to transport and/or slaughter; length of time not specified)	3 (feed may be withheld for up to 12 hours before slaughter)
Appropriate weaning age	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Adequate monitoring of health and welfare by producers	Veterinary health plan with stringent targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits*	4 (must have detailed health plan reviewed regularly by vet; mortality and culls must be recorded on a daily basis; DOAs and PMI rejects must be recorded; if DOAs exceed 0.25% there must be a written report investigating the cause)	4 (must have detailed health plan reviewed regularly by vet; mortality and culls must be recorded on a daily basis; DOAs and PMI rejects must be recorded; if DOAs exceed 0.25% there must be a written report investigating the cause)	8 (must have veterinary health plan reviewed regularly by vet; must include targets for flock performance parameters, which must be continuously monitored for signs of disease or production disorders; tolerance limits must be set and remedial action taken if exceeded; daily mortality, and culls and reasons, must be recorded; records must be kept of the level of footpad burn, breast blisters, back scratches and dirty feathers and action taken if problems identified; all transport deaths and injuries must be recorded and reported)	8 (must have veterinary health plan reviewed regularly by vet; must include targets for flock performance parameters, which must be continuously monitored for signs of disease or production disorders; tolerance limits must be set and remedial action taken if exceeded; daily mortality, and culls and reasons, must be recorded; records must be kept of the level of footpad burn, breast blisters, back scratches and dirty feathers and action taken if problems identified; all transport deaths and injuries must be recorded and reported)	2 (must have animal health plan submitted for approval and updated regularly; no requirement for monitoring or targets)	6 (must have animal health plan submitted for approval and reviewed regularly; health and welfare parameters must be monitored and records kept of all health problems and veterinary treatments, mortalities and the cause of death, hock damage, reject percentages and the cause of rejection and production records but no targets specified)

*Key criteria

Table A6.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for turkeys.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for turkeys	Quality British Turkey minimum standards (QBT minimum)	Quality British Turkey free-range standards (QBT free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
STOCKMANSHIP, HANDLING, TRANSPORT & SLAUGHTER							
Appropriate handling	Humane catching/handling methods*	6 (small birds <5kg must either be carried by both legs or in both hands (e.g. gripped in rugby ball style); large birds >5kg must be carried by one leg and the diagonally opposite wing. Birds should not be lifted or carried by one leg and should be carried hanging head downwards for as short a period and distance as possible)	6 (small birds <5kg must either be carried by both legs or in both hands (e.g. gripped in rugby ball style); large birds >5kg must be carried by one leg and the diagonally opposite wing. Birds should not be lifted or carried by one leg and should be carried hanging head downwards for s short a period and distance as possible)	8 (birds weighing <5kg must be caught and carried by both legs with no more than one bird carried in each hand and each bird placed in crate one at a time; birds weighing ≥5kg must be caught individually by grasping the shoulder of the wing furthest from the catcher whilst using the other hand to hold both legs and lifted and held close to body and placed in crate with care; turkeys must not be caught or carried by a single leg)	8 (birds weighing <5kg must be caught and carried by both legs with no more than one bird carried in each hand and each bird placed in crate one at a time; birds weighing ≥5kg must be caught individually by grasping the shoulder of the wing furthest from the catcher whilst using the other hand to hold both legs and lifted and held close to body and placed in crate with care; turkeys must not be caught or carried by a single leg)	0 (birds must be handled with proper care and concern for their welfare and in accordance with all relevant legislation and government welfare codes, but no specific requirements on catching method)	0 (poultry must be handled with proper care and concern for their welfare, observing all relevant legislation and government welfare codes, in conditions that minimise stress and avoid the chance of injuring them, but no specific requirements on catching method)
Promotion of high quality stockmanship	Requirement for stockpeople to be trained/ competent/ experienced	3 (must have appointed welfare officer who is responsible for ensuring regular refresher training for managers, supervisors and husbandry personnel; key staff must be trained to NVQ or equivalent in-house training; management must regularly review training needs and assess competency of staff; records of training must be kept)	3 (must have appointed welfare officer who is responsible for ensuring regular refresher training for managers, supervisors and husbandry personnel; key staff must be trained to NVQ or equivalent in-house training; management must regularly review training needs and assess competency of staff; records of training must be kept)	3 (managers and stockpeople must be thoroughly trained, skilled and competent in animal husbandry and welfare; managers must ensure all stockpeople have completed relevant, adequate training and can satisfy assessor and RSPCA Livestock Officer of their competence in practical situations; recommended that training should be validated; records of training must be kept for all staff)	3 (managers and stockpeople must be thoroughly trained, skilled and competent in animal husbandry and welfare; managers must ensure all stockpeople have completed relevant, adequate training and can satisfy assessor and RSPCA Livestock Officer of their competence in practical situations; recommended that training should be validated; records of training must be kept for all staff)	2 (stockpeople must be suitably trained or experienced; no requirement to provide formal training in animal welfare or to keep records of training)	2 (stockpeople must be suitably trained or experienced; no requirement to provide formal training in animal welfare or to keep records of training)
Frequent checks for signs of illness, injury or distress	Frequent checks for signs of illness, injury or distress	4 (flocks must be checked at least twice daily and birds should be encouraged to move)	4 (flocks must be checked at least twice daily and birds should be encouraged to move)	5 (flocks must be checked at least 3 times daily and the stock-keeper must walk within 3 metres of each bird and encourage them to move)	5 (flocks must be checked at least 3 times daily and the stock-keeper must walk within 3 metres of each bird and encourage them to move)	5 (flocks must be checked at least 3 times daily and the stockperson should pass within 3 metres of each bird)	5 (flocks must be checked at least 3 times daily and the stockperson should pass within 3 metres of each bird)

*Key criteria

Table A6.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for turkeys.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for turkeys	Quality British Turkey minimum standards (QBT minimum)	Quality British Turkey free-range standards (QBT free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Short transport duration	Short transport duration*	6 (the time from loading of the first bird to unloading of the last birds must not exceed 12 hours)	6 (the time from loading of the first bird to unloading of the last birds must not exceed 12 hours)	8 (the time from loading of the first bird to unloading of the last birds must be less than 6 hours and journey time excluding loading and unloading must not exceed 4 hours)	8 (the time from loading of the first bird to unloading of the last birds must be less than 6 hours and journey time excluding loading and unloading must not exceed 4 hours)	8 (journeys must not exceed 8 hours from loading of first bird to unloading of last bird, excluding sea journeys between the Scottish mainland and remote islands)	8 (journeys must not exceed 8 hours from the start of loading to the end of unloading, except with permission)
No live export	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
No use of livestock markets	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Humane slaughter	Only humane stunning/ slaughter methods permitted – no shackling of live birds and no use of carbon dioxide*	4 (shackling permitted; maximum time in shackles prior to stun 2 minutes; breast comforters must be fitted along whole line; hanging-on area should be equipped with low lighting or screened from direct sunlight; stun bath must be designed and operated to prevent pre-stun shocks and stunner must be assessed annually by an independent authority; states that controlled atmosphere stunning is the preferred method; concentrations of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited)	4 (shackling permitted; maximum time in shackles prior to stun 2 minutes; breast comforters must be fitted along whole line; hanging-on area should be equipped with low lighting or screened from direct sunlight; stun bath must be designed and operated to prevent pre-stun shocks and stunner must be assessed annually by an independent authority; states that controlled atmosphere stunning is the preferred method; concentrations of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited)	6 (shackling permitted; must have breast comforter along entire length of line, reduced noise and low – maximum 5 lux – or blue lighting; waterbath design must eliminate risk of pre-stun shocks; maximum time in shackles prior to stun 1 minute; controlled atmosphere stunning is strongly encouraged; concentrations of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited)	6 (shackling permitted; must have breast comforter along entire length of line, reduced noise and low – maximum 5 lux – or blue lighting; waterbath design must eliminate risk of pre-stun shocks; maximum time in shackles prior to stun 1 minute; controlled atmosphere stunning is strongly encouraged; concentrations of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited)	2 (shackling permitted; no requirement for breast comforters or low lighting; no restriction on length of time in shackles beyond legal requirements; use of CO ₂ prohibited)	2 (shackling permitted; no requirement for breast comforters or low lighting; waterbath stunners must not overflow at entrance or deliver pre-stun shocks to any bird; no restriction on length of time in shackles beyond legal requirements; use of CO ₂ prohibited)

*Key criteria

Table A6.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for turkeys.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for turkeys	Quality British Turkey minimum standards (QBT minimum)	Quality British Turkey free-range standards (QBT free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
	Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death*	6 (all birds must be stunned; electrical parameters specified in terms of current; average current applied must be recorded at hourly intervals; manual back-up procedures must be in place; birds must have neck cut immediately after stunning but minimum stun-neck cutting interval not specified; at least one carotid artery and one jugular vein must be severed; at least 140 seconds must elapse between neck cutting and any other process)	6 (all birds must be stunned; electrical parameters specified in terms of current; average current applied must be recorded at hourly intervals; manual back-up procedures must be in place; birds must have neck cut immediately after stunning but minimum stun-neck cutting interval not specified; at least one carotid artery and one jugular vein must be severed; at least 140 seconds must elapse between neck cutting and any other process)	10 (all birds must be stunned; electrical parameters specified in terms of current, frequency and duration and must be AC; all birds leaving water bath must be checked to ensure they have been effectively stunned or killed and any birds which are not properly stunned must be immediately stunned and humanely slaughtered prior to entering the scald tank; stun-neck cutting interval must not exceed 10 seconds; both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed; all birds must be checked to ensure effective neck cut and the blood vessels severed manually if necessary; at least 120 seconds must elapse between neck cutting and scald tank and all birds must be checked to ensure they are dead prior to entering scald tank; for gas killing all birds must be checked immediately on leaving the system to ensure they are dead)	10 (all birds must be stunned; electrical parameters specified in terms of current, frequency and duration and must be AC; all birds leaving water bath must be checked to ensure they have been effectively stunned or killed and any birds which are not properly stunned must be immediately stunned and humanely slaughtered prior to entering the scald tank; stun-neck cutting interval must not exceed 10 seconds; both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed; all birds must be checked to ensure effective neck cut and the blood vessels severed manually if necessary; at least 120 seconds must elapse between neck cutting and scald tank and all birds must be checked to ensure they are dead prior to entering scald tank; for gas killing all birds must be checked immediately on leaving the system to ensure they are dead)	2 (all birds must be stunned; stunning must cause instantaneous unconsciousness that is maintained until death but stunning parameters not specified; both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed; minimum time between stunning and neck cutting and between neck cutting and scald tank not specified)	6 (all birds must be stunned; current must be strong enough and in contact for long enough so that every bird is immediately unconscious and stays unconscious until it is dead but stunning parameters not specified; someone must be present at all times to check that the stun is effective and where the stun may have not worked correctly, to stun or kill without delay; stun-neck cutting interval must not exceed 10 seconds; both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed; minimum time between neck cutting and scald tank not specified)

*Key criteria

Table A6.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for turkeys.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for turkeys	Quality British Turkey minimum standards (QBT minimum)	Quality British Turkey free-range standards (QBT free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Promotion of high welfare standards in the handling of animals during transport and slaughter	Animal welfare policy and CCTV at abattoir and requirement for people involved in catching, transport and slaughter of birds to be trained/ competent/ experienced	4 (drivers must be competent and trained in bird handling and welfare; all catching teams must be trained including induction and annual refresher courses; records of training must be kept; manager or stockman must be present during depopulation; abattoirs must have bird welfare policy and at least one trained Poultry Welfare Officer (PWO) available at all times while birds are on site; must have staff training and development plan; no requirement for CCTV)	4 (drivers must be competent and trained in bird handling and welfare; all catching teams must be trained including induction and annual refresher courses; records of training must be kept; manager or stockman must be present during depopulation; abattoirs must have bird welfare policy and at least one trained PWO available at all times while birds are on site; must have staff training and development plan; no requirement for CCTV)	4 (all personnel involved in catching and transport must be trained and competent; recommended that training is validated; must have full and detailed written instructions on catching and handling; named person responsible for welfare during catching; personnel in charge of transport must have completed an approved training course; abattoirs must have a written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly; there must be at least one appointed PWO and it is recommended that they should have attended a validated training programme; there must be a training programme for all staff which includes use of HSA training video; recommended that training is validated; installation of CCTV in abattoirs is not currently required but will be introduced from Nov 2011)	4 (all personnel involved in catching and transport must be trained and competent; recommended that training is validated; must have full and detailed written instructions on catching and handling; named person responsible for welfare during catching; personnel in charge of transport must have completed an approved training course; abattoirs must have a written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly; there must be at least one appointed PWO and it is recommended that they should have attended a validated training programme; there must be a training programme for all staff which includes use of HSA training video; recommended that training is validated; installation of CCTV in abattoirs is not currently required but will be introduced from Nov 2011)	2 (no stipulations on training of catchers or of drivers beyond legal requirements; abattoirs must have a training programme that includes animal welfare; records of training for all staff must be kept; there must be a nominated person who is responsible for animal welfare and they must be trained and competent; a suitably trained and competent person must oversee the unloading of every animal including those arriving out-of-hours; no requirement for CCTV)	3 (no stipulations on training of catchers or drivers beyond legal requirements; abattoirs must have a documented quality management system which covers animal welfare and is reviewed regularly; must have a training programme that includes animal welfare and is ongoing with induction and refresher training, further training specific to the job and retraining when there are any problems or when new procedures are introduced; records of training for all operators must be kept; recommends that training is validated; when there are live animals there must always be someone present who is responsible for animal welfare and they must be trained and competent – AWO or abattoir owner/ operator; a suitably trained and competent person must oversee the unloading of every animal including those arriving out-of-hours; no requirement for CCTV)

Table A6.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for turkeys.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for turkeys	Quality British Turkey minimum standards (QBT minimum)	Quality British Turkey free-range standards (QBT free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
GENETICS & BREEDING							
No use of breeds associated with increased incidence of health/ welfare problems	Only slower-growing breeds and those selected for low propensity to engage in injurious pecking permitted and requirement for breeds used in outdoor systems to be suitable for outdoor conditions*	0 (no restriction on growth rate or permitted breeds; no minimum slaughter age)	0 (no restriction on growth rate or permitted breeds; minimum slaughter age in accordance with legislation – 70 days; suitability of breeds for the system not specified)	2 (no restriction on growth rate or permitted breeds and no minimum slaughter age but key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate must be monitored, e.g. culls and reason, and recommends that strains should be selected that have good health and welfare characteristics and that the limits of the birds' growth potential should not be exploited if it is likely to result in poorer welfare)	2 (no restriction on growth rate or permitted breeds and no minimum slaughter age but key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate must be monitored, e.g. culls and reason, and recommends that strains should be selected that have good health and welfare characteristics and that the limits of the birds' growth potential should not be exploited if it is likely to result in poorer welfare; minimum slaughter age in accordance with legislation – 70 days; suitability of breeds for the system not specified)	6 (traditional or slow-growing strains must be used, or if fast-growing strains are used the minimum slaughter age is 140 days; breeds must be chosen to avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production, e.g. sudden death syndrome, PSE syndrome; no requirement to monitor key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate; choice of breeds must take account of the capacity of the animals to adapt to local conditions and their vitality and resistance to disease; beak trimming prohibited)	8 (traditional or slow-growing strains must be used, or if fast-growing breeds are used the minimum slaughter age is 140 days – slow-growing breeds are defined as having daily weight gain averaged over the life of the bird of no more than 35g per day, according to published breed data, and maximum daily weight gain measured on farm of never more than 75g for females or 105g for males; breeds must be chosen to avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production; key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate must be monitored, e.g. mortality and causes, culls and reasons; breeds must be chosen that can adapt to the organic system and local conditions and that have vitality and resistance to disease; beak trimming prohibited)
High welfare standards for breeding animals	See Table A6.3 for scoring of breeding bird welfare	2	2	0	0	0	4
No killing of surplus male animals	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A

*Key criteria

Table A6.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for turkeys.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for turkeys	Quality British Turkey minimum standards (QBT minimum)	Quality British Turkey free-range standards (QBT free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
AUDITING							
Frequent inspections	Frequent inspections by certifying body	4 (inspections annually)	4 (inspections annually)	4 (inspections annually; time between inspections may be shorter or longer up to 15 months to allow visits at different times of year)	4 (inspections annually; time between inspections may be shorter or longer up to 15 months to allow visits at different times of year)	4 (inspections annually)	4 (inspections annually)
Spot-checks	Targeted unannounced spot-checks	1 (routine inspections are supplemented by some random spot checks at short notice)	1 (routine inspections are supplemented by some random spot checks at short notice)	5 (RSPCA monitor approx 35% of all members and 50% of monitoring visits are unannounced; all monitoring visits are made on a risk assessment basis following annual inspection – farms with non-compliances at assessment will get a monitoring visit)	5 (RSPCA monitor around 35% of all members and 50% of monitoring visits are unannounced; all monitoring visits are made on a risk assessment basis following annual inspection – farms with non-compliances at assessment will get a monitoring visit)	1 (spot checks are carried out as a routine part of verifying continuous compliance with the standards; may be unannounced; no information supplied to indicate that spot checks are targeted or the proportion of farms receiving spot checks; additional assessments are also carried out where a major change or deviation has been made from the approved farm plan)	3 (there is a programme of additional unannounced inspections over and above the annual visits; these target those who are considered to be higher risk or where specific risks have been identified, e.g. end of derogation periods, parallel production, following up complaints; around 10% of farms receive additional spot-checks or follow-up visits each year)
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme	Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set*	0 (no assessment of welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	0 (no assessment of welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	6 (RSPCA has developed a system of assessment of welfare outcomes and is working with other standard setters and Bristol University to further develop outcome measures; assessments of welfare outcomes on turkey farms are not yet underway; producers set themselves targets and intervention levels in VHP; checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met)	6 (RSPCA has developed a system of assessment of welfare outcomes and is working with other standard setters and Bristol University to further develop outcome measures; assessments of welfare outcomes on turkey farms are not yet underway; producers set themselves targets and intervention levels in VHP; checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met)	0 (no assessment of welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	6 (SA has a programme of assessments based on the Bristol Welfare Assurance Programme (BWAP); observations for turkeys are feather loss, lameness, trauma/ injury, dirty feathers, behaviour – evidence of dustbathing/ ranging; no targets set for turkeys yet but plan to introduce targets)

*Key criteria

Table A6.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for turkeys.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for turkeys	Quality British Turkey minimum standards (QBT minimum)	Quality British Turkey free-range standards (QBT free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Measures to address non-compliance	Stringent measures to address non-compliance	5 (all non-conformances must be corrected; a major non-conformance against one of the 'key standards' will result in suspension of certification until it is corrected; non-conformances against 'other standards' should not result in suspension provided they are corrected within an agreed timescale, normally within 28 days of the assessment; certification may also be suspended in the case of a large number of such non-conformances or in the event of the same non-conformance being found on successive assessment visits)	5 (all non-conformances must be corrected; a major non-conformance against one of the 'key standards' will result in suspension of certification until it is corrected; non-conformances against 'other standards' should not result in suspension provided they are corrected within an agreed timescale, normally within 28 days of the assessment; certification may also be suspended in the case of a large number of such non-conformances or in the event of the same non-conformance being found on successive assessment visits)	5 (all non-compliances must be corrected as soon as possible; certificates are withdrawn after 8 weeks if the Freedom Food certification panel have not received corrective actions and objective evidence to verify compliance; a producer who has their certificate withdrawn due to non-compliance at assessment has 3 unannounced visits by Freedom Food over the next 6 months to ensure compliance is being maintained)	5 (all non-compliances must be corrected as soon as possible; certificates are withdrawn after 8 weeks if the Freedom Food certification panel have not received corrective actions and objective evidence to verify compliance; a producer who has their certificate withdrawn due to non-compliance at assessment has 3 unannounced visits by Freedom Food over the next 6 months to ensure compliance is being maintained)	5 (where welfare issues are identified during an inspection, the Certification Officer sets the member targets to be implemented or in extreme cases passes on to SFQC Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) for the SOPA scheme for a full set of new plans and targets to be drawn up; if the targets are not met within a specific time scale then the member is withdrawn from the SOPA scheme; in some cases a specific category of livestock may be de-certified)	5 (an action summary form is drawn up following inspection, listing non-compliances and asking how they will be corrected, with a deadline for return of the completed form; actions to correct non-compliances must be approved before a licence is issued or continued; an additional inspection may be carried out to make sure non-compliances have been corrected; non-compliance categorised as minor, major, critical or manifest infringement; certification will normally be suspended for part or whole of the enterprise in response to critical non-compliance or multiple or unresolved major non-compliance)

APPENDIX 6 B
TURKEYS

APPENDIX 6B: SCORING CATEGORIES FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR TURKEYS

Table A6.2: Scoring categories for turkeys.

Criteria for turkeys	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
ENVIRONMENT						
No cages	Cages permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Cages prohibited
Low indoor stocking density*	Maximum stocking density in excess of FAWC recommendations	Maximum stocking density in accordance with FAWC recommendations or lower	Maximum stocking density 35kg/m ² or lower	Maximum stocking density 30kg/m ² or lower	Maximum stocking density 25kg/m ² or lower	Maximum stocking density 21kg/m ² or lower
Stringent limit on number of birds per m² and prohibition of thinning (removal of part of the flock for slaughter prior to depopulation of the entire flock)	Thinning permitted; permitted number of birds/m ² in excess of FAWC recommendations or not specified	Thinning permitted; number of birds/m ² in accordance with FAWC recommendations or lower	Thinning permitted but moderate limit on number of birds per m ² to ensure thinning cannot be used to facilitate severe overstocking	Thinning restricted to once during birds' lifetime and moderate limit on number of birds per m ² to ensure thinning cannot be used to facilitate severe overstocking	Thinning prohibited OR Thinning not strictly prohibited but stringent limit on number of birds per m ² to ensure thinning cannot be used to facilitate overstocking	Thinning prohibited and stringent limit on number of birds/m ²
Adequate environmental conditions maintained by ventilation/ heating/ insulation and monitoring to maintain temperature, humidity and air quality within acceptable limits	No requirement for appropriate design of houses in terms of ventilation/ insulation/ heating; no requirement for monitoring of environmental conditions; limits for temperature, humidity and air quality parameters not specified	Houses must be appropriately designed in terms of ventilation/ insulation/ heating but no requirement for monitoring of environmental conditions and limits for temperature, humidity and air quality parameters not specified	Houses must be appropriately designed in terms of ventilation/ insulation/heating to maintain good environmental conditions; minimum and maximum temperature must be recorded daily; limits for humidity and air quality parameters not specified and no requirement for regular monitoring or recording of humidity or air quality parameters	Houses must be appropriately designed in terms of ventilation/ insulation/ heating to maintain good environmental conditions; minimum and maximum temperature must be recorded daily; limits specified for humidity and some air quality parameters but no requirement for regular monitoring or recording OR No requirement for regular monitoring of environmental conditions and/or limits not specified but houses must be appropriately designed in terms of ventilation/ insulation/ heating to maintain good environmental conditions and houses must be open during the day	Houses must be appropriately designed in terms of ventilation/ insulation/heating to maintain good environmental conditions; minimum and maximum temperature must be recorded daily; limits specified for humidity and some air quality parameters which must be monitored and recorded regularly	Houses must be appropriately designed in terms of ventilation/ insulation/heating to maintain good environmental conditions; minimum and maximum temperature must be recorded daily; limits specified for humidity and a wide range of air quality parameters which must be monitored and recorded regularly

*Key criteria

Table A6.2: Scoring categories for turkeys.

Criteria for turkeys	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Provision of elevated perches, litter material for dustbathing and foraging and additional indoor enrichment (e.g. straw bales, pecking objects, roughage)*	No requirement for perches, litter material or additional enrichment	At least one of 1) perches must be provided 2) minimum of 40cm of elevated perching space per bird 3) litter material must be provided 4) litter material required over entire floor area 5) fresh litter material must be added regularly 6) additional enrichment required	At least two of 1) perches must be provided 2) minimum of 40cm of elevated perching space per bird 3) litter material must be provided 4) litter material required over entire floor area 5) fresh litter material must be added regularly 6) additional enrichment required	At least three of 1) perches must be provided 2) minimum of 40cm of elevated perching space per bird 3) litter material must be provided 4) litter material required over entire floor area 5) fresh litter material must be added regularly 6) additional enrichment required	At least five of 1) perches must be provided 2) minimum of 40cm of elevated perching space per bird 3) litter material must be provided 4) litter material required over entire floor area 5) fresh litter material must be added regularly 6) additional enrichment required	Minimum of 40cm of elevated perching space per bird; litter material required over entire floor area and fresh material must be added regularly; additional enrichment required
Appropriate light intensity and light/dark periods	Minimum light intensity less than 10 lux or less than minimum 8 hours light period or less than minimum 6 hours dark period; no requirement for dusk period	Minimum 8 hours light at minimum 10 lux and minimum 6 hours dark period except for first 7 and last 3 days; no requirement for dusk period	Minimum 8 hours light at minimum 20 lux and minimum 8 hours dark period; no requirement for dusk period OR Minimum 8 hours light at minimum 20 lux and minimum 6 hours dark period; dusk period	Minimum 8 hours light at minimum 20 lux and minimum 8 hours dark period; dusk period	Access to natural light; minimum 6 hours dark period except when natural period is shorter; dusk period OR Access to natural light; minimum 8 hours dark period except when natural period is shorter; no requirement for dusk period	Access to natural light; minimum 8 hours dark period except when natural period is shorter; dusk period
Free range access*	Permanent indoor housing permitted	No requirement for access to range but all birds must have access to a covered veranda with enrichment and natural light	N/A	N/A	All birds must have access to range for at least half of life (except that birds may be housed temporarily in extreme weather conditions or if required by law due to a disease outbreak)	All birds must have access to range for at least two thirds of life (except that birds may be housed temporarily in extreme weather conditions or if required by law due to a disease outbreak)
Low outdoor stocking density	Outdoor access not required	N/A	N/A	At least 4m ² /bird (minimum legislative requirement for free range)	At least 8m ² /bird	At least 12m ² /bird
Provision of overhead cover and protection from predators for outdoor turkeys	No requirement for overhead cover on the range; no specified requirement for protection from predators OR Outdoor access not required	N/A	One of 1) some overhead cover should be provided but no minimum specified or 2) protection from predators required	Some overhead cover should be provided but no minimum specified; protection from predators required	Overhead cover must be provided over a specified minimum area of the range; protection from predators required OR Natural or artificial cover sufficient to mimic natural environment required; protection from predators required	Natural or artificial cover must be provided over at least 20% of the range and positioned so as to encourage use of the entire range area; protection from predators required

*Key criteria

Table A6.2: Scoring categories for turkeys.

Criteria for turkeys	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Small flock size	No limit on flock size	Maximum flock size 1000 birds or 2500 if demonstrably high level of bird health and welfare and good environmental conditions OR Flock size may be in excess of 2500 but partitions must be provided	Maximum flock size 500 birds or 2000 if demonstrably high level of bird health and welfare and good environmental conditions OR Maximum flock size 1000 birds or 2500 if demonstrably high level of bird health and welfare and good environmental conditions and partitions must be provided	Maximum flock size 250 birds or 1000 if demonstrably high level of bird health and welfare and good environmental conditions OR Maximum flock size 500 birds or 2000 if demonstrably high level of bird health and welfare and good environmental conditions and partitions must be provided	Maximum flock size 100 birds or 500 if demonstrably high level of bird health and welfare and good environmental conditions OR Maximum flock size 250 birds or 1000 if demonstrably high level of bird health and welfare and good environmental conditions and partitions must be provided	Natural flock sizes (i.e. up to around 20 birds)
HUSBANDRY						
No beak trimming*	Beak trimming permitted	Beak trimming only permitted in controlled environment housing in exceptional circumstances to prevent further welfare problems during an outbreak of injurious pecking (where controlled environment housing is likely to be the main housing type covered by the standards)	N/A	Beak trimming permitted but commitment to phase out in near future	Beak trimming permitted only in exceptional circumstances with written permission from the scheme each time and problem must be identified and rectified for future flocks	Beak trimming prohibited
No use of genetically modified or cloned animals or their offspring	No restriction on the use of genetically modified or cloned animals or their offspring	N/A	N/A	The use of genetically modified animals is prohibited but no restriction on the use of cloned animals or their offspring	The use of genetically modified and cloned animals is prohibited but no restriction on the use of clone offspring	The use of genetically modified and cloned animals and their offspring is prohibited
Short duration of feed withdrawal prior to slaughter	Period without feed prior to slaughter may be in excess of 12 hours	N/A	N/A	Period without feed prior to slaughter must not exceed 12 hours	Period without feed prior to slaughter must not exceed 10 hours	Period without feed prior to slaughter must not exceed 8 hours
Veterinary health plan with stringent targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits*	No requirement for VHP or monitoring of health and welfare and performance parameters	Must have VHP but no requirement for monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters	Must have VHP and recording of mortality and culls but no requirement for monitoring of other key health and welfare and performance parameters	Must have VHP and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters but no targets required	Must have VHP and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with moderate or unspecified targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits	Must have VHP and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with stringent targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits

*Key criteria

Table A6.2: Scoring categories for turkeys.

Criteria for turkeys	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
STOCKMANSHIP, HANDLING, TRANSPORT & SLAUGHTER						
Humane catching/handling methods*	Catching by one leg permitted and no limit on number of birds carried	N/A	N/A	Catching by one leg prohibited but more than one bird may be carried in each hand	Catching by one leg prohibited and no more than one bird may be carried in each hand OR Catching must be automated (and catching machine must be shown to improve welfare)	All birds must be caught individually and carried in an upright position
Requirement for stockpeople to be trained/ competent/ experienced	No requirements regarding training or experience of stockpeople	N/A	Stockpeople must be suitably trained or experienced but no requirement to provide formal training in animal welfare or for training to be validated	Stockpeople must be suitably trained or experienced; formal training in animal welfare must be provided and records of training must be kept but no requirement for training to be validated	There must be at least one nominated person with responsibility for animal welfare (owner or manager) who must have attended a relevant validated training course; formal training in animal welfare must be provided for all stockpeople and records of training must be kept	All stockpeople must have attended a relevant validated training course and records of training must be kept
Frequent checks for signs of illness, injury or distress	N/A	N/A	N/A	Flocks must be checked at least once per day (minimum legal requirement)	Flocks must be checked at least twice per day OR Flocks must be checked at least 3 times per day but only one inspection must be sufficiently thorough to identify any bird showing signs of sickness or injury	Flocks must be checked at least 3 times per day
Short transport duration*	Journeys over 12 hours including loading and unloading or 8 hours excluding loading and unloading permitted	N/A	N/A	12 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 12 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used) OR 8 hour journey limit excluding loading and unloading	8 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 8 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used) OR 4 hour journey limit excluding loading and unloading	4 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 4 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)

*Key criteria

Table A6.2: Scoring categories for turkeys.

Criteria for turkeys	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Only humane stunning/ slaughter methods permitted –no shackling of live birds and no use of carbon dioxide*	Fewer than two of 1) controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method for off-farm slaughter 2) waterbath stunners must be designed to avoid pre-stun shocks 3) shackle line must have breast comforters 4) shackle line must have low lighting 5) maximum time in shackles limited to 60 seconds 6) Use of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited 7) Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited	At least two of 1) controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method for off-farm slaughter 2) waterbath stunners must be designed to avoid pre-stun shocks 3) shackle line must have breast comforters 4) shackle line must have low lighting 5) maximum time in shackles limited to 60 seconds 6) Use of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited 7) Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited	At least four of 1) controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method for off-farm slaughter 2) waterbath stunners must be designed to avoid pre-stun shocks 3) shackle line must have breast comforters 4) shackle line must have low lighting 5) maximum time in shackles limited to 60 seconds 6) Use of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited 7) Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited	At least six of 1) controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method for off-farm slaughter 2) waterbath stunners must be designed to avoid pre-stun shocks 3) shackle line must have breast comforters 4) shackle line must have low lighting 5) maximum time in shackles limited to 60 seconds 6) Use of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited 7) Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited	Use of metal shackles prohibited; birds slaughtered off-farm must be killed by controlled atmosphere stunning; birds slaughtered on-farm may be restrained in cones or soft (e.g. leather) shackles for electrical or percussive stunning	Use of metal shackles and CO ₂ prohibited; birds slaughtered off-farm must be killed by controlled atmosphere stunning using non-aversive gases; birds slaughtered on-farm may be restrained in cones or soft (e.g. leather) shackles for electrical or percussive stunning
Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death*	Slaughter without stunning permitted and/or no clear specifications for stunning parameters, time between stunning and neck cutting may exceed 10 seconds, no requirement for both carotid arteries and both jugular veins to be severed, no manual checking and back-up systems required, and time between neck cutting and scald tank may exceed 120 seconds	All birds must be stunned and at least one of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting 3) both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed 4) manual checking and back-up systems required 5) minimum of 120 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank	All birds must be stunned and at least two of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting 3) both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed 4) manual checking and back-up systems required 5) minimum of 120 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank	All birds must be stunned and at least three of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting 3) both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed 4) manual checking and back-up systems required 5) minimum of 120 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank	All birds must be stunned and at least four of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting 3) both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed 4) manual checking and back-up systems required 5) minimum of 120 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank	All birds must be stunned; clear specifications for stunning parameters to ensure effective stun; maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting; both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed; manual checking and back-up systems required; minimum of 120 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank

*Key criteria

Table A6.2: Scoring categories for turkeys.

Criteria for turkeys	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Animal welfare policy and CCTV at abattoir and requirement for people involved in catching, transport and slaughter of birds to be trained/ competent/ experienced	No requirement for personnel in charge of catching and transporting birds to be trained or for abattoirs to have written animal welfare policy, an appointed AWO, a training programme in animal welfare or CCTV	At least one of 1) all personnel in charge of catching birds must be trained 2) all personnel in charge of transporting birds must be trained 3) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 4) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 5) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 6) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	At least two of 1) all personnel in charge of catching birds must be trained 2) all personnel in charge of transporting birds must be trained 3) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 4) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 5) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 6) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	At least three of 1) all personnel in charge of catching birds must be trained 2) all personnel in charge of transporting birds must be trained 3) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 4) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 5) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 6) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	At least five of 1) all personnel in charge of catching birds must be trained 2) all personnel in charge of transporting birds must be trained 3) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 4) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 5) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 6) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	All personnel in charge of catching and transporting birds must be trained; abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly; abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered; abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept; abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter
GENETICS & BREEDING						
Only slower-growing breeds and those selected for low propensity to engage in injurious pecking permitted and requirement for breeds used in outdoor systems to be suitable for outdoor conditions*	No restrictions on permitted genetics; no requirement for monitoring of key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate; no requirement for breeds to be suitable for the system; no requirement to choose strains that have a low propensity to engage in injurious pecking	No restrictions on permitted genetics but key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary; no requirement for breeds to be suitable for the system; no requirement to choose strains that have a low propensity to engage in injurious pecking	Birds must be at least moderately slower-growing (no more than 45g average liveweight gain per day); no requirement for breeds to be suitable for the system; no requirement for monitoring of key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate; no requirement to choose strains that have a low propensity to engage in injurious pecking	Fast-growing breeds not strictly prohibited but standards make it very difficult to use fast-growing breeds through restrictions on minimum slaughter age and only breeds suitable for outdoor use permitted in outdoor systems; no requirement for monitoring of key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate; strains must be chosen that have a low propensity to engage in injurious pecking (and/or beak trimming prohibited) OR Birds must be at least moderately slower-growing (no more than 45g average liveweight gain per day); key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate must be monitored; strains must be chosen that have a low propensity to engage in injurious pecking (and/or beak trimming prohibited)	Fast-growing breeds not strictly prohibited but standards make it very difficult to use fast-growing breeds through restrictions on minimum slaughter age and only breeds suitable for outdoor use permitted in outdoor systems; key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate must be monitored; strains must be chosen that have a low propensity to engage in injurious pecking (and/or beak trimming prohibited)	Fast-growing breeds (over 35g average liveweight gain per day) strictly prohibited; only breeds suitable for outdoor use permitted in outdoor systems; key health and welfare parameters associated with growth rate must be monitored and demonstrated to be within stringent limits; strains must be chosen that have a low propensity to engage in injurious pecking (and/or beak trimming prohibited)

*Key criteria

Table A6.2: Scoring categories for turkeys.

Criteria for turkeys	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
High welfare standards for breeding birds	See Table A6.4					
AUDITING						
Frequent inspections by certifying body	Inspections may be less frequent than every 24 months	Inspections at least every 24 months on average for all members	Inspections at least every 18 months on average for all members OR Inspections every 12 months initially and then up to 24 months with frequency determined by previous performance	Inspections at least every 15 months on average for all members OR Inspections every 6 months initially and then up to 24 months with frequency determined by previous performance	Inspections at least every 12 months on average for all members OR Inspections every 6 months initially and then up to 18 months with frequency determined by previous performance	Inspections every 6 months initially and then up to 12 months with frequency determined by previous performance
Targeted unannounced spot-checks	No spot checks	Spot checks for less than 10% of members annually (or proportion not specified); not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for less than 10% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced OR Spot checks for 10% of members annually but not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for 10% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced OR Spot checks for 20% of members annually but not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for 20% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced OR Spot checks for 30% of members annually but not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for 30% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set*	No assessment of welfare outcomes and no stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future	No assessment of welfare outcomes but stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future OR Informal observations of one or two welfare outcomes (e.g. injuries) during routine inspections but no formal recording of welfare outcomes and no targets set OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure records are being maintained	System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place but no targets set OR System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted and producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and either 1) farm-specific targets set by producers or 2) moderate (or unspecified) targets set by assurance scheme	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and stringent targets set by assurance scheme for all farms

Table A6.2: Scoring categories for turkeys.

Criteria for turkeys	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Stringent measures to address non-compliance	No requirement to correct minor non-compliances	N/A	N/A	All non-compliances must be corrected but no defined timescale for correction; certification may be suspended or withdrawn for a serious non-compliance or multiple and/or repeated minor non-compliances	N/A	All non-compliances must be corrected within agreed timescale; certification may be suspended or withdrawn for a serious non-compliance or multiple and/or repeated minor non-compliances

APPENDIX 6C

TURKEYS

APPENDIX 6C: FULL RESULTS TABLE FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR TURKEY BREEDERS

Table A6.3: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for turkey breeders.

A maximum of 5 points is available for each criterion. Overall scores are converted to a score out of 5 and incorporated into the overall scoring of standards for turkeys (see **Table A6.1**).

Criteria for turkey breeders	Assured British Turkey minimum standards (ACP minimum)	Assured British Turkey free-range standards (ACP free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Low indoor stocking density	1 (for breeding stags between 0.49m ² /bird at 12kg liveweight – equivalent to 24.5kg/m ² – and 1m ² /bird at ≥18kg liveweight; maximum stocking density for hens determined by FAWC formula, equivalent to between 17.3kg/m ² at 0.5kg liveweight and 59.1kg/m ² at 20kg liveweight)	1 (for breeding stags between 0.49m ² /bird at 12kg liveweight – equivalent to 24.5kg/m ² – and 1m ² /bird at ≥18kg liveweight; maximum stocking density for hens determined by FAWC formula, equivalent to between 17.3kg/m ² at 0.5kg liveweight and 59.1kg/m ² at 20kg liveweight)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	5 (maximum 21kg/m ² and no more than 2 birds/m ² in fixed housing or 3 birds/m ² in mobile housing)
Provision of elevated perches, litter material for dustbathing and foraging and additional indoor enrichment (e.g. straw bales, pecking objects, roughage)	1 (litter must be provided but no minimum depth stipulated and no requirement for litter to be replenished until depopulation; no requirement for additional enrichment)	1 (litter must be provided but no minimum depth stipulated and no requirement for litter to be replenished until depopulation; no requirement for additional enrichment)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	3 (litter must be provided over at least half of floor area and topped up regularly; minimum 40cm elevated perch space per bird; slats cannot count toward perch requirements; it is recommended that fresh greens or turf are provided from day one)
Provision of nests	5 (one nest for every 5 hens and must be of a size that allows hen to turn around easily)	5 (one nest for every 5 hens and must be of a size that allows hen to turn around easily)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	5 (one nest for every 6 birds or 120cm ² of nest space per bird in communal nests)
Free range access	0 (permanent indoor housing permitted)	0 (permanent indoor housing permitted)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	5 (birds must have access to pasture from 12 weeks of age)
No beak trimming	0 (beak trimming including a second trim permitted)	0 (beak trimming including a second trim permitted)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	4 (beak trimming only permitted in exceptional circumstances with permission from the scheme each time and problem must be identified and rectified for future flocks)

Table A6.3: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for turkey breeders.

Criteria for turkey breeders	Assured British Turkey minimum standards (ACP minimum)	Assured British Turkey free-range standards (ACP free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
No feed restriction	0 (feed restriction permitted; feeding programmes must be managed to control weight)	0 (feed restriction permitted; feeding programmes must be managed to control weight)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	3 (breeding birds not covered by standards but encouragement of use of traditional/ slower-growing breeds would be expected to reduce the requirement for feed restriction of breeding birds)	3 (breeding birds not covered by standards but encouragement of use of traditional/ slower-growing breeds would be expected to reduce the requirement for feed restriction of breeding birds)
No forced moulting	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	5 (forced moulting effectively prohibited by requirement to provide access to food throughout the day)
Veterinary health plan with stringent targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits	3 (must have detailed health plan reviewed regularly by vet; mortality and culls must be recorded on a daily basis but no targets required)	3 (must have detailed health plan reviewed regularly by vet; mortality and culls must be recorded on a daily basis but no targets required)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	3 (must have animal health plan submitted for approval and reviewed regularly; health and welfare parameters must be monitored and records kept of veterinary treatments, mortalities and the cause of death, and hock damage, but no targets required)
Humane catching/handling methods	3 (small birds <5kg must either be carried by both legs or in both hands (e.g. gripped in rugby ball style); large birds >5kg must be carried by one leg and the diagonally opposite wing. Birds should not be lifted or carried by one leg and should be carried hanging head downwards for as short a period and distance as possible)	3 (small birds <5kg must either be carried by both legs or in both hands (e.g. gripped in rugby ball style); large birds >5kg must be carried by one leg and the diagonally opposite wing. Birds should not be lifted or carried by one leg and should be carried hanging head downwards for as short a period and distance as possible)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (poultry must be handled with proper care and concern for their welfare, observing all relevant legislation and government welfare codes, in conditions that minimise stress and avoid the chance of injuring them, but no specific requirements on catching method)
Short transport duration	3 (the time from loading of the first bird to unloading of the last birds must not exceed 12 hours)	3 (the time from loading of the first bird to unloading of the last birds must not exceed 12 hours)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	4 (journeys must not exceed 8 hours from the start of loading to the end of unloading, except with permission)

Table A6.3: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for turkey breeders.

Criteria for turkey breeders	Assured British Turkey minimum standards (ACP minimum)	Assured British Turkey free-range standards (ACP free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Only humane stunning/slaughter methods permitted – no shackling of live birds and no use of carbon dioxide	2 (shackling permitted; maximum time in shackles prior to stun 2 minutes; breast comforters must be fitted along whole line; hanging-on area should be equipped with low lighting or screened from direct sunlight; stun bath must be designed and operated to prevent pre-stun shocks and stunner must be assessed annually by an independent authority; states that controlled atmosphere stunning is the preferred method; concentrations of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited)	2 (shackling permitted; maximum time in shackles prior to stun 2 minutes; breast comforters must be fitted along whole line; hanging-on area should be equipped with low lighting or screened from direct sunlight; stun bath must be designed and operated to prevent pre-stun shocks and stunner must be assessed annually by an independent authority; states that controlled atmosphere stunning is the preferred method; concentrations of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	1 (shackling permitted; no requirement for breast comforters or low lighting; waterbath stunners must not overflow at entrance or deliver pre-stun shocks to any bird; no restriction on length of time in shackles beyond legal requirements; use of CO ₂ prohibited)
Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death	3 (all birds must be stunned; electrical parameters specified in terms of current; average current applied must be recorded at hourly intervals; manual back-up procedures must be in place; birds must have neck cut immediately after stunning but minimum stun-neck cutting interval not specified; at least one carotid artery and one jugular vein must be severed; at least 140 seconds must elapse between neck cutting and any other process)	3 (all birds must be stunned; electrical parameters specified in terms of current; average current applied must be recorded at hourly intervals; manual back-up procedures must be in place; birds must have neck cut immediately after stunning but minimum stun-neck cutting interval not specified; at least one carotid artery and one jugular vein must be severed; at least 140 seconds must elapse between neck cutting and any other process)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	3 (all birds must be stunned; current must be strong enough and in contact for long enough so that every bird is immediately unconscious and stays unconscious until it is dead but stunning parameters not specified; someone must be present at all times to check that the stun is effective and where the stun may have not worked correctly, to stun or kill without delay; stun-neck cutting interval must not exceed 10 seconds; both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed; minimum time between neck cutting and scald tank not specified)

Table A6.3: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for turkey breeders.

Criteria for turkey breeders	Assured British Turkey minimum standards (ACP minimum)	Assured British Turkey free-range standards (ACP free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Only slower-growing breeds permitted	0 (no restrictions on permitted genetics)	0 (no restrictions on permitted genetics)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	3 (breeding birds not covered by standards but encouragement of use of traditional/ slow growing breeds in standards for growing birds)	5 (breeds must be suitable for organic, free-range management and produce offspring that are hardy and slow growing; slow growing breeds are defined as having daily weight gain averaged over the life of the bird of no more than 35g per day, according to published breed data, and maximum daily weight gain measured on farm of never more than 75g for females and 105g for males)
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set	0 (no requirement to assess welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	0 (no requirement to assess welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	3 (SA has a programme of assessments based on the Bristol Welfare Assurance Programme (BWAP); observations for turkeys are feather loss, lameness, trauma/ injury, dirty feathers, behaviour – evidence of dustbathing/ ranging; no targets set for turkeys yet but plan to introduce targets)
Total for turkey breeder criteria	21/70	21/70	0/70	0/70	6/70	51/70
Welfare score for turkey breeders carried over to Table A6.1	2/5	2/5	0/5	0/5	0/5	4/5

APPENDIX 6 D

TURKEYS

APPENDIX 6D: SCORING CATEGORIES FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR TURKEY BREEDERS

Table A6.4: Scoring categories for turkey breeders.

Criteria for turkey breeders	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Low indoor stocking density	Maximum stocking density in excess of FAWC recommendations	Maximum stocking density in accordance with FAWC recommendations or lower	Maximum stocking density 35kg/m ² or lower	Maximum stocking density 30kg/m ² or lower	Maximum stocking density 25kg/m ² or lower	Maximum stocking density 21kg/m ² or lower
Provision of elevated perches, litter material for dustbathing and foraging and additional indoor enrichment (e.g. straw bales, pecking objects, roughage)	No requirement for perches, litter material or additional enrichment	At least one of 1) perches must be provided 2) minimum of 40cm of elevated perching space per bird 3) litter material must be provided 4) litter material required over entire floor area 5) fresh litter material must be added regularly 6) additional enrichment required	At least two of 1) perches must be provided 2) minimum of 40cm of elevated perching space per bird 3) litter material must be provided 4) litter material required over entire floor area 5) fresh litter material must be added regularly 6) additional enrichment required	At least three of 1) perches must be provided 2) minimum of 40cm of elevated perching space per bird 3) litter material must be provided 4) litter material required over entire floor area 5) fresh litter material must be added regularly 6) additional enrichment required	At least five of 1) perches must be provided 2) minimum of 40cm of elevated perching space per bird 3) litter material must be provided 4) litter material required over entire floor area 5) fresh litter material must be added regularly 6) additional enrichment required	Minimum of 40cm of elevated perching space per bird; litter material required over entire floor area and fresh material must be added regularly; additional enrichment required
Provision of nests	No requirement to provide nests	N/A	N/A	Nests required but minimum nest number or area inadequate or not specified	N/A	Adequate nesting facilities required
Free range access	Permanent indoor housing permitted	No requirement for access to range but all birds must have access to a covered veranda with enrichment and natural light	N/A	N/A	All birds must have access to range for whole of laying life (except that birds may be housed temporarily in extreme weather conditions or if required by law due to a disease outbreak)	All birds must have access to range from 12 weeks (except that birds may be housed temporarily in extreme weather conditions or if required by law due to a disease outbreak)
No beak trimming	Beak trimming permitted	N/A	N/A	Beak trimming permitted but commitment to phase out in near future	Beak trimming permitted only in exceptional circumstances with written permission from the scheme each time and problem must be identified and rectified for future flocks	Beak trimming prohibited
No feed restriction	Feed restriction permitted in line with breeding company recommendations	N/A	N/A	Feed restriction not specifically prohibited or not covered by standards but only moderately slower-growing breeds permitted or standards make it very difficult to use fast-growing breeds so requirement for feed restriction of breeding birds is likely to be reduced	Feed restriction of breeding birds not specifically prohibited or not covered by standards but only traditional/ slow-growing breeds permitted so feed restriction of breeding birds is likely to be much reduced or avoided altogether	Feed restriction of breeding birds prohibited

Table A6.4: Scoring categories for turkey breeders.

Criteria for turkey breeder	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
No forced moulting	Forced moulting permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Forced moulting prohibited
Veterinary health plan with stringent targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits	No requirement for VHP or monitoring of health and welfare and performance parameters	Must have VHP but no requirement for monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters	N/A	Must have VHP and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters but no targets required	Must have VHP and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with moderate or unspecified targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits	Must have VHP and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with stringent targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits
Humane catching/handling methods	Catching by one leg permitted and no limit on number of birds carried	N/A	N/A	Catching by one leg prohibited but more than one bird may be carried in each hand	Catching by one leg prohibited and no more than one bird may be carried in each hand OR Catching must be automated (and catching machine must be shown to improve welfare)	All birds must be caught individually and carried in an upright position
Short transport duration	Journeys over 12 hours including loading and unloading or 8 hours excluding loading and unloading permitted	N/A	N/A	12 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 12 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used) OR 8 hour journey limit excluding loading and unloading	8 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 8 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used) OR 4 hour journey limit excluding loading and unloading	4 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 4 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)
Only humane stunning/ slaughter methods permitted – no shackling of live birds and no use of carbon dioxide	Fewer than two of 1) controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method for off-farm slaughter 2) waterbath stunners must be designed to avoid pre-stun shocks 3) shackle line must have breast comforters 4) shackle line must have low lighting 5) maximum time in shackles limited to 60 seconds 6) Use of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited 7) Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited	At least two of 1) controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method for off-farm slaughter 2) waterbath stunners must be designed to avoid pre-stun shocks 3) shackle line must have breast comforters 4) shackle line must have low lighting 5) maximum time in shackles limited to 60 seconds 6) Use of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited 7) Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited	At least four of 1) controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method for off-farm slaughter 2) waterbath stunners must be designed to avoid pre-stun shocks 3) shackle line must have breast comforters 4) shackle line must have low lighting 5) maximum time in shackles limited to 60 seconds 6) Use of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited 7) Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited	At least six of 1) controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method for off-farm slaughter 2) waterbath stunners must be designed to avoid pre-stun shocks 3) shackle line must have breast comforters 4) shackle line must have low lighting 5) maximum time in shackles limited to 60 seconds 6) Use of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited 7) Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited	Use of metal shackles prohibited; birds slaughtered off-farm must be killed by controlled atmosphere stunning; birds slaughtered on-farm may be restrained in cones or soft (e.g. leather) shackles for electrical or percussive stunning	Use of metal shackles and CO ₂ prohibited; birds slaughtered off-farm must be killed by controlled atmosphere stunning using non-aversive gases; birds slaughtered on-farm may be restrained in cones or soft (e.g. leather) shackles for electrical or percussive stunning

Table A6.4: Scoring categories for turkey breeders.

Criteria for turkey breeder	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death	Slaughter without stunning permitted and/ or no clear specifications for stunning parameters, time between stunning and neck cutting may exceed 10 seconds, no requirement for both carotid arteries and both jugular veins to be severed, no manual checking and back-up systems required, and time between neck cutting and scald tank may exceed 120 seconds	All birds must be stunned and at least one of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting 3) both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed 4) manual checking and back-up systems required 5) minimum of 120 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank	All birds must be stunned and at least two of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting 3) both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed 4) manual checking and back-up systems required 5) minimum of 120 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank	All birds must be stunned and at least three of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting 3) both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed 4) manual checking and back-up systems required 5) minimum of 120 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank	All birds must be stunned and at least four of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting 3) both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed 4) manual checking and back-up systems required 5) minimum of 120 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank	All birds must be stunned; clear specifications for stunning parameters to ensure effective stun; maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting; both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed; manual checking and back-up systems required; minimum of 120 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank
Only slower-growing breeds permitted	No restrictions on permitted genetics	N/A	N/A	Breeding birds not covered by standards but requirement for moderately slower growth rate or encouragement of use of traditional/ slow-growing breeds in standards for growing birds	Birds must be at least moderately slower-growing (no more than 45g average liveweight gain per day)	Birds must be slow-growing (no more than 35g average liveweight gain per day)
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set	No assessment of welfare outcomes and no stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future	No assessment of welfare outcomes but stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future OR Informal observations of one or two welfare outcomes (e.g. injuries) during routine inspections but no formal recording of welfare outcomes and no targets set OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure records are being maintained	System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place but no targets set OR System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted and producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and either 1) farm-specific targets set by producers or 2) moderate (or unspecified) targets set by assurance scheme	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and stringent targets set by assurance scheme for all farms

APPENDIX 7A

LAYING HENS

APPENDIX 7A: FULL RESULTS TABLE FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR LAYING HENS

Table A7.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for laying hens.

Up to 5 points are available for each criterion. Key criteria (marked with an asterisk) are weighted so that they are worth double points (i.e. up to 10 points for each key criterion). Score for breeding bird welfare is derived from **Table A7.3**. Criteria are grouped into five sets. Totals for each set of criteria are converted to scores out of 20, which are totalled to give an overall score out of 100 for each scheme (see **Table 3.7**).

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for laying hens	Lion Egg Code of Practice minimum standards (Lion minimum)	Lion Egg Code of Practice free-range standards (Lion free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
ENVIRONMENT							
No close confinement	No cages*	0 (enriched cages permitted; conventional cages prohibited by legislation from 2012)	10 (cages prohibited)	10 (cages prohibited)	10 (cages prohibited)	10 (cages prohibited)	10 (cages prohibited)
Adequate space allowance when housed	Low indoor stocking density*	2 (minimum space allowance of 600cm ² usable area per hen in enriched cages – legal minimum requirements from 2012; equivalent to 16.7 birds/ m ²)	8 (maximum 9 birds/m ² usable area)	8 (maximum 9 birds/m ² usable area in multi-tier systems there must be no more than 15 birds/m ² when calculated at floor level)	8 (maximum 9 birds/m ² usable area in multi-tier systems there must be no more than 15 birds/m ² when calculated at floor level)	10 (maximum 6 birds/m ²)	10 (maximum 6 birds/m ²)
Appropriate housing design	Adequate environmental conditions maintained by ventilation/ heating/ insulation and monitoring to maintain temperature, humidity and air quality within acceptable limits	2 (birds must be provided with a thermally comfortable environment; minimum and maximum temperatures must be recorded daily; air circulation, dust levels and gas concentrations must be kept within limits that are not harmful to the birds but no limits specified and no requirement to monitor air quality parameters or humidity)	3 (birds must be provided with a thermally comfortable environment; minimum and maximum temperatures must be recorded daily; air circulation, dust levels and gas concentrations must be kept within limits that are not harmful to the birds but no limits specified and no requirement to monitor air quality parameters or humidity; houses must be open during the day)	5 (birds must have access to a thermally comfortable environment at all times; minimum and maximum temperatures must be recorded daily; records of ventilation must be kept; averaged over an 8 hour period, dust must not exceed 10mg/m ³ and carbon monoxide must not exceed 50ppm; air quality parameters should be recorded weekly and, where levels are detected which exceed those in the standards, they should be recorded daily until acceptable levels are achieved and maintained; relative humidity should be between 50 and 70% and CO ₂ should be below 5000ppm and ammonia below 25ppm)	5 (birds must have access to a thermally comfortable environment at all times; minimum and maximum temperatures must be recorded daily; records of ventilation must be kept; averaged over an 8 hour period, dust must not exceed 10mg/m ³ and carbon monoxide must not exceed 50ppm; air quality parameters should be recorded weekly and, where levels are detected which exceed those in the standards, they should be recorded daily until acceptable levels are achieved and maintained; relative humidity should be between 50 and 70% and CO ₂ should be below 5000ppm and ammonia below 25ppm)	3 (insulation, heating and ventilation of the building must ensure that air circulation, dust level, temperature, relative humidity and gas concentration are kept within limits that are not harmful to the animals but no requirement to monitor environmental conditions; houses must be open during the day)	3 (housing must provide suitable temperature, humidity, dust levels and natural ventilation but no requirement to monitor environmental conditions; houses must be open during the day)

*Key criteria

Table A7.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for laying hens.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for laying hens	Lion Egg Code of Practice minimum standards (Lion minimum)	Lion Egg Code of Practice free-range standards (Lion free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Provision of appropriate bedding/litter/enrichment	Provision of elevated perches, litter material for dustbathing and foraging and additional indoor enrichment (e.g. straw bales, pecking objects, roughage)*	2 (in accordance with legislation from 2012, minimum 15cm perch space per bird; perches may be only slightly elevated above the cage floor; some litter must be provided for pecking and scratching but amount may be small and may not be permanently available)	4 (minimum 15cm perch space per bird; perches can be incorporated into a slatted floor; litter must be provided over at least one third of floor area and maintained at an average minimum depth of 5cm)	6 (minimum 15cm perch space per bird; perforated floors can count towards perch requirements where perches are incorporated within the floor structure – minimum 460cm ² per hen of perch space on slatted floor area; litter must be provided over at least one third of usable area and maintained at an average minimum depth of 10cm – may be built up from 5cm over 2 months – and topped up daily if necessary to maintain in a dry friable condition allowing birds to dustbathe; enrichment devices recommended as part of management techniques to remove need for beak trimming – all producers are required to make progress in moving away from the need to beak trim)	6 (minimum 15cm perch space per bird; perforated floors can count towards perch requirements where perches are incorporated within the floor structure – minimum 460cm ² per hen of perch space on slatted floor area; litter must be provided over at least one third of usable area and maintained at an average minimum depth of 10cm – may be built up from 5cm over 2 months – and topped up daily if necessary to maintain in a dry friable condition allowing birds to dustbathe; enrichment devices recommended as part of management techniques to remove need for beak trimming – all producers are required to make progress in moving away from the need to beak trim)	8 (minimum 18cm elevated perch space per bird; not specified whether slats can count toward perch requirements; litter must be provided over at least one third of floor area and replenished regularly; when birds are housed they must have permanent access to sufficient quantities of roughage and suitable material to meet ethological needs)	8 (minimum 18cm elevated perch space per bird; slats cannot count toward perch requirements; litter must be provided over at least half of floor area and topped up regularly to maintain in a suitable state for scratching and dustbathing)
Provision of appropriate nesting facilities	Provision of nests for laying birds*		8 (one nest for every 5 birds or 1m ² of nest space for every 120 birds in communal nests – approx 83cm ² per bird)	8 (one nest for every 5 birds or 1m ² of nest space for every 120 birds in communal nests – approx 83cm ² per bird)	8 (one nest for every 5 birds or 1m ² of nest space for every 120 birds in communal nests – approx 83cm ² per bird)	10 (one nest for every 6 birds or 120cm ² of nest space per bird in communal nests)	10 (one nest for every 6 birds or 120cm ² of nest space per bird in communal nests)
Appropriate lighting	Appropriate light intensity and light/dark periods	2 (in accordance with legislation from 2012, nest must be provided in enriched cages but number/area not specified) 1 (minimum 8 hours light and continuous dark period of around one third of day but no minimum specified; minimum 10	3 (access to natural daylight outdoors; minimum 8 hours light and continuous dark period of around one third of day but no minimum specified; minimum 10 lux except in shaded areas of house and may be reduced if feather pecking or cannibalism is evident; recommended but not required that lights switched off gradually)	2 (minimum 8 hours light and minimum 6 hours continuous darkness except when natural darkness period is shorter; minimum 10 lux except in shaded area of house and can be reduced as last resort if cannibalism is evident; lights must be switched off gradually)	4 (access to natural daylight outdoors; minimum 8 hours light and minimum 6 hours continuous darkness except when natural darkness period is shorter; minimum 10 lux except in shaded area of house and can be reduced as last resort if cannibalism is evident; lights must be switched off gradually)	5 (access to natural daylight outdoors; artificial lighting may be used to prolong the day length up to a maximum of 16 hours per day and must end at dusk)	5 (access to natural daylight outdoors; artificial lighting may be used to prolong the day length up to a maximum of 16 hours per day and must end at dusk)

*Key criteria

Table A7.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for laying hens.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for laying hens	Lion Egg Code of Practice minimum standards (Lion minimum)	Lion Egg Code of Practice free-range standards (Lion free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Free range access	Free range access*	lux except in shaded areas of house and may be reduced if feather pecking or cannibalism is evident; recommended but not required that lights switched off gradually) 0 (permanent indoor housing permitted)	10 (birds must have continuous daytime access to open-air runs which must be mainly covered with vegetation except when veterinary restrictions)	0 (permanent indoor housing permitted)	10 (birds must have continuous daytime access to range from 21 weeks of age)	10 (birds must have continuous and easy daytime access to pasture/range for the whole of the laying period except in extreme weather conditions or when required by law due to disease outbreak when birds may be housed with permanent access to sufficient quantities of roughage and suitable material to meet ethological needs)	10 (birds must have continuous and easy daytime access to pasture for the whole of the laying period except in adverse weather conditions or when required by law due to disease outbreak; pullets must have access to pasture from at least 12 weeks of age but non-organic pullets can be brought in if necessary)
Adequate outdoor space	Low outdoor stocking density		3 (2500 birds/ha = 4m ² per hen)	0 (no outdoor access)	4 (2000 birds/ha = 5m ² per hen; restricted to 1000 birds/ha unless additional standards for cover on the range are met)	5 (1000 birds/ha = 10m ² per hen)	5 (1000 birds/ha = 10m ² per hen)
Appropriate shelter/shade and protection from predators	Provision of overhead cover and protection from predators for outdoor hens	0 (no outdoor access) 0 (no outdoor access)	2 (birds must be adequately protected from predators and free-range birds must be provided with shelter if range extends beyond 150m from nearest pophole, minimum 4 shelters per hectare in accordance with legal requirements)	0 (no outdoor access)	4 (a minimum of 8m ² of overhead shade/shelter per 1000 birds must be provided; must be appropriately distributed to encourage birds onto range; if outdoor stocking density exceeds 1000 birds/ha, 5% of outdoor range area must provide natural cover in addition to the minimum)	4 (birds must have access to shelter at all times and be provided with protection from predators; adequate natural or artificial cover must be provided in the free range areas to give the birds conditions akin to their native habitat, protection from overhead predators and shelter from extreme weather conditions; this cover should be provided in a way that encourages ranging behaviour and ensures maximum use of the pasture)	4 (birds must have access to shelter at all times, protection from predators, and enough natural or artificial cover in the free range areas to imitate their native habitat and encourage them to range fully; access to woodland is recommended)

*Key criteria

Table A7.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for laying hens.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for laying hens	Lion Egg Code of Practice minimum standards (Lion minimum)	Lion Egg Code of Practice free-range standards (Lion free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Appropriate social grouping	Small flock size	2 (flock size in cages not specified but likely to be very small in conventional cages, although may be significantly larger in enriched cages)	0 (maximum flock size 16000 birds for free range systems; for flocks with more than 6000 birds, must be sub-divided into colonies with maximum 4000 birds)	0 (maximum flock size 32000 birds for barn systems; for flocks with more than 6000 birds, must be sub-divided into colonies with maximum 4000 birds)	0 (maximum flock size 32000 birds for free range systems; for flocks with more than 6000 birds, must be sub-divided into colonies with maximum 4000 birds)	3 (maximum 2000 birds in a housing unit but restricted to 500 unless certain conditions are met including demonstrating high level of bird health and welfare, good environmental conditions and adequate access to range; where housing units accommodate more than 100 adult birds they must allow the development of social groups within the unit through the number and distribution of feeders, drinkers and other facilities and/or providing partitions)	3 (maximum 2000 birds in a housing unit but restricted to 500 unless certain conditions are met including demonstrating high level of bird health and welfare, good environmental conditions and adequate access to range; where housing units accommodate more than 100 adult birds they must allow the development of social groups within the unit through the number and distribution of feeders, drinkers and other facilities, and providing partitions)
HUSBANDRY							
No mutilations	No beak trimming*	0 (permitted)	0 (permitted)	6 (permitted but intend to phase out over next 5 years and all producers are required to make progress towards avoiding beak trimming)	6 (permitted but intend to phase out over next 5 years and all producers are required to make progress towards avoiding beak trimming)	10 (prohibited)	8 (beak tipping only permitted in exceptional circumstances with written permission from the scheme and recommendation from vet each time; management plan must be reviewed to avoid problem in future; no producers were using beak-tipped birds in 2009)
No use of genetic engineering/ cloning or invasive reproductive technologies associated with health or welfare problems	No use of genetically modified or cloned animals or their offspring	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	4 (livestock must not be brought in that have been produced using transgenic or other genetic engineering techniques; cloning is effectively prohibited by prohibitions on breeding practices that make livestock systems over-reliant on inappropriate technology and any surgical or chemical interference other than procedures specifically permitted in the standards, but no restriction on the use of the offspring of cloned animals)	4 (livestock must not be brought in that have been produced using transgenic or other genetic engineering techniques; use of cloning is prohibited but no restriction on the use of the offspring of cloned animals)

*Key criteria

Table A7.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for laying hens.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for laying hens	Lion Egg Code of Practice minimum standards (Lion minimum)	Lion Egg Code of Practice free-range standards (Lion free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Appropriate feeding	Provision of adequate high-fibre feed to reduce risk of behavioural problems (e.g. injurious pecking) and insoluble grit to aid digestion	0 (not specified)	3 (no specifications on feeding of roughage but birds must have access to vegetation outdoors during laying period; no requirement for access to insoluble grit)	1 (no specifications on feeding of roughage and no requirement for access to vegetation outdoors; hens must have access to insoluble grit no less than once weekly)	4 (no specifications on feeding of roughage but birds must have access to vegetation outdoors from 21 weeks; hens must have access to insoluble grit no less than once weekly)	5 (roughage, fresh or dried fodder, or silage must be added to the daily feed ration for poultry; birds must have access to vegetation outdoors for whole of laying life and when poultry are kept indoors they must have permanent access to roughage; poultry must have access to insoluble grit)	4 (no specifications on feeding of roughage but birds must have access to vegetation outdoors for whole of laying life; poultry must have access to insoluble grit)
	No forced moulting*	10 (forced moulting prohibited)	10 (forced moulting prohibited)	10 (forced moulting prohibited)	10 (forced moulting prohibited)	10 (not specified but forced moulting is effectively prohibited because poultry must have access to water at all times during daylight hours and food withdrawal not permitted except prior to transport and slaughter or for veterinary reasons)	10 (not specified but forced moulting is effectively prohibited because poultry must have access to water at all times during daylight hours and food withdrawal not permitted except prior to transport and slaughter or for veterinary reasons)
	Short duration of feed withdrawal prior to slaughter	3 (feed must be available until at least 12 hours prior to slaughter)	3 (feed must be available until at least 12 hours prior to slaughter)	3 (no bird must be deprived of feed for more than 12 hours prior to slaughter)	3 (no bird must be deprived of feed for more than 12 hours prior to slaughter)	0 (feed may be withheld for a limited period just prior to transport and/or slaughter; length of time not specified)	3 (feed may be withheld for up to 12 hours before slaughter)
Appropriate weaning age	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A

*Key criteria

Table A7.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for laying hens.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for laying hens	Lion Egg Code of Practice minimum standards (Lion minimum)	Lion Egg Code of Practice free-range standards (Lion free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Adequate monitoring of health and welfare by producers	Veterinary health plan with stringent targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits*	2 (must have written veterinary health plan reviewed annually; DOAs must be recorded and if exceeds 0.5% for any flock, an investigation of the cause must be carried out and a written report including corrective action points produced but no requirement to monitor health and welfare parameters)	2 (must have written veterinary health plan reviewed annually; DOAs must be recorded and if exceeds 0.5% for any flock, an investigation of the cause must be carried out and a written report including corrective action points produced but no requirement to monitor health and welfare parameters)	8 (must have veterinary health plan updated regularly; must include targets for a range of health and performance parameters and records must be kept to identify whether targets have been met every year; the vet must be informed and the VHP revised to include programme of action to remedy problem if parameters fall below tolerance limits; daily mortality and causes, injuries and causes, and culls and reasons must be recorded; particular attention must be paid to egg peritonitis, cannibalism, significant feather loss and red mite infestation; all transport deaths and injuries must be recorded and reported; if transport mortality exceeds 0.1% during any 3 month period or on an individual journey it must be recorded and investigated)	8 (must have veterinary health plan updated regularly; must include targets for a range of health and performance parameters and records must be kept to identify whether targets have been met every year; the vet must be informed and the VHP revised to include programme of action to remedy problem if parameters fall below tolerance limits; daily mortality and causes, injuries and causes, and culls and reasons must be recorded; particular attention must be paid to egg peritonitis, cannibalism, significant feather loss and red mite infestation; all transport deaths and injuries must be recorded and reported; if transport mortality exceeds 0.1% during any 3 month period or on an individual journey it must be recorded and investigated)	2 (must have animal health plan submitted for approval and updated regularly; no requirement to monitor health and welfare parameters)	6 (must have animal health plan submitted for approval and reviewed regularly; health and welfare must be monitored and records kept of all health problems and veterinary treatments, mortalities and the cause of death, hock damage and production records but no targets specified)

STOCKMANSHIP, HANDLING, TRANSPORT & SLAUGHTER

Appropriate handling	Humane catching/handling methods*	6 (birds must be handled in accordance with the Joint Industry Welfare Guide to the Handling of End of Lay Hens and Breeders, which states that birds must be caught by both legs with no more than 3 birds carried in one hand and that caged birds must be removed from cages singly)	6 (birds must be handled in accordance with the Joint Industry Welfare Guide to the Handling of End of Lay Hens and Breeders, which states that birds must be caught by both legs with no more than 3 birds carried in one hand and that mobile catching frames should be used to reduce the risk of smothering)	6 (birds must be caught individually by both legs and carried by both legs with no more than 3 birds carried in one hand)	6 (birds must be caught individually by both legs and carried by both legs with no more than 3 birds carried in one hand)	6 (welfare code must be complied with, which states that birds should be caught and carried by the body or both legs and no more than 3 birds should be carried in one hand)	6 (welfare code must be complied with, which states that birds should be caught and carried by the body or both legs and no more than 3 birds should be carried in one hand)
-----------------------------	--	--	---	--	--	---	---

*Key criteria

Table A7.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for laying hens.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for laying hens	Lion Egg Code of Practice minimum standards (Lion minimum)	Lion Egg Code of Practice free-range standards (Lion free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Promotion of high quality stockmanship	Requirement for stockpeople to be trained/ competent/ experienced	2 (the person responsible for the day to day management of the unit must demonstrate competence in stockmanship and welfare; no requirement to provide formal training in animal welfare or to keep records of training)	2 (the person responsible for the day to day management of the unit must demonstrate competence in stockmanship and welfare; no requirement to provide formal training in animal welfare or to keep records of training)	3 (managers and stockpeople must be thoroughly trained, skilled and competent in animal husbandry and welfare; managers must ensure all stockpeople have completed relevant, adequate training and can satisfy assessor and RSPCA Livestock Officer of their competence in practical situations; recommended that training is validated; records of training must be kept for all staff)	3 (managers and stockpeople must be thoroughly trained, skilled and competent in animal husbandry and welfare; managers must ensure all stockpeople have completed relevant, adequate training and can satisfy assessor and RSPCA Livestock Officer of their competence in practical situations; recommended that training is validated; records of training must be kept for all staff)	2 (stockpeople must be suitably trained or experienced; no requirement to provide formal training in animal welfare or to keep records of training)	2 (stockpeople must be suitably trained or experienced; no requirement to provide formal training in animal welfare or to keep records of training)
Frequent checks for signs of illness, injury or distress	Frequent checks for signs of illness, injury or distress	3 (all birds must be inspected at least once daily)	3 (all birds must be inspected at least once daily)	5 (flocks must be checked at least 3 times daily using a procedure which will identify all birds which are sick, injured or behaving abnormally)	5 (flocks must be checked at least 3 times daily using a procedure which will identify all birds which are sick, injured or behaving abnormally)	5 (flocks must be checked at least 3 times daily and the stockperson should pass within 3 metres of each bird)	5 (flocks must be checked at least 3 times daily and the stockperson should pass within 3 metres of each bird)
Short transport duration	Short transport duration*	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	6 (journeys must be less than 8 hours from loading of the last bird to arrival at final destination)	6 (journeys must be less than 8 hours from loading of the last bird to arrival at final destination)	8 (journeys must not exceed 8 hours from loading of first bird to unloading of last bird, excluding sea journeys between the Scottish mainland and remote islands)	8 (journeys must not exceed 8 hours from the start of loading to the end of unloading, except with permission)
No live export	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
No use of livestock markets	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A

*Key criteria

Table A7.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for laying hens.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for laying hens	Lion Egg Code of Practice minimum standards (Lion minimum)	Lion Egg Code of Practice free-range standards (Lion free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Humane slaughter	Only humane stunning/ slaughter methods permitted – no shackling of live birds and no use of carbon dioxide*	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	4 (shackling permitted; measures must be taken to prevent wing-flapping and birds raising their heads, e.g. breast bar/curtain; stunning line must be darkened or lit with blue light; waterbath system must be designed and set up to prevent birds receiving pre-stun shocks and water must not overflow at entrance; maximum time in shackles prior to stun 60 seconds (reduced to 30 seconds from 2013); controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method and shackling will be prohibited for off-farm slaughter from 2016; concentrations of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited)	4 (shackling permitted; measures must be taken to prevent wing-flapping and birds raising their heads, e.g. breast bar/curtain; stunning line must be darkened or lit with blue light; waterbath system must be designed and set up to prevent birds receiving pre-stun shocks and water must not overflow at entrance; maximum time in shackles prior to stun 60 seconds; (reduced to 30 seconds from 2013); controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method and shackling will be prohibited for off-farm slaughter from 2016; concentrations of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited)	2 (shackling permitted; no requirement for breast comforters or low lighting; no restriction on length of time in shackles beyond legal requirements; use of CO ₂ prohibited)	2 (shackling permitted; no requirement for breast comforters or low lighting; waterbath stunners must not overflow at entrance or deliver pre-stun shocks to any bird; no restriction on length of time in shackles beyond legal requirements; use of CO ₂ prohibited)
	Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death*	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	8 (all birds must be stunned; electrical parameters specified in terms of current and duration; all birds leaving water bath must be checked to ensure they have been effectively stunned or killed and any birds which are not properly stunned must be humanely killed immediately; stun-neck cutting interval must not exceed 10 seconds; both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed; all birds must be checked to ensure effective neck cut and the blood vessels severed manually if necessary; at least 90 seconds must elapse between neck cutting and scald tank and all birds must be checked to ensure they are dead prior to entering scald tank; for gas killing all birds must be checked immediately on leaving the system to ensure they are dead)	8 (all birds must be stunned; electrical parameters specified in terms of current and duration; all birds leaving water bath must be checked to ensure they have been effectively stunned or killed and any birds which are not properly stunned must be humanely killed immediately; stun-neck cutting interval must not exceed 10 seconds; both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed; all birds must be checked to ensure effective neck cut and the blood vessels severed manually if necessary; at least 90 seconds must elapse between neck cutting and scald tank and all birds must be checked to ensure they are dead prior to entering scald tank; for gas killing all birds must be checked immediately on leaving the system to ensure they are dead)	2 (all birds must be stunned; stunning must cause instantaneous unconsciousness that is maintained until death but stunning parameters not specified; both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed; minimum time between stunning and neck cutting and between neck cutting and scald tank not specified)	6 (all birds must be stunned; current must be strong enough and in contact for long enough so that every bird is immediately unconscious and stays unconscious until it is dead but stunning parameters not specified; someone must be present at all times to check that the stun is effective and where the stun may have not worked correctly, to stun or kill without delay; stun-neck cutting interval must not exceed 10 seconds; both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed; minimum time between neck cutting and scald tank not specified)

*Key criteria

Table A7.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for laying hens.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for laying hens	Lion Egg Code of Practice minimum standards (Lion minimum)	Lion Egg Code of Practice free-range standards (Lion free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
<p>Promotion of high welfare standards in the handling of animals during transport and slaughter</p>	<p>Animal welfare policy and CCTV at abattoir and requirement for people involved in catching, transport and slaughter of birds to be trained/ competent/ experienced</p>	<p>1 (at all times during loading, trained and nominated management must be present to ensure welfare requirements are met; inexperienced catchers should receive prior training and be closely supervised; drivers must be fully competent to ensure bird welfare; no specifications for abattoirs)</p>	<p>1 (at all times during loading, trained and nominated management must be present to ensure welfare requirements are met; inexperienced catchers should receive prior training and be closely supervised; drivers must be fully competent to ensure bird welfare; no specifications for abattoirs)</p>	<p>4 (all personnel involved in catching and transport must be trained and competent; recommended that training is validated; must have written depopulation action plan; named person responsible for welfare during catching; personnel in charge of transport must have completed an approved training course; abattoirs must have a written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly; there must be at least one appointed PWO and it is recommended that they should have attended a validated training programme; there must be a training programme for all staff; recommended that training is validated; installation of CCTV in abattoirs is not currently required but will be introduced from Nov 2011</p>	<p>4 (all personnel involved in catching and transport must be trained and competent; recommended that training is validated; must have written depopulation action plan; named person responsible for welfare during catching; personnel in charge of transport must have completed an approved training course; abattoirs must have a written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly; there must be at least one appointed PWO and it is recommended that they should have attended a validated training programme; there must be a training programme for all staff; recommended that training is validated; installation of CCTV in abattoirs is not currently required but will be introduced from Nov 2011</p>	<p>2 (no stipulations on training of catchers or drivers beyond legal requirements; abattoirs must have a training programme that includes animal welfare; records of training for all staff must be kept; there must be a nominated person who is responsible for animal welfare and they must be trained and competent; a suitably trained and competent person must oversee the unloading of every animal including those arriving out-of-hours; no requirement for CCTV)</p>	<p>3 (no stipulations on training of catchers or drivers beyond legal requirements; abattoirs must have a documented quality management system which covers animal welfare and is reviewed regularly; must have a training programme that includes animal welfare and is ongoing with induction and refresher training, further training specific to the job and retraining when there are any problems or when new procedures are introduced; records of training for all operators must be kept; recommends that training is validated; when there are live animals there must always be someone present who is responsible for animal welfare and they must be trained and competent – AWO or abattoir owner/ operator; a suitably trained and competent person must oversee the unloading of every animal including those arriving out-of-hours; no requirement for CCTV)</p>

Table A7.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for laying hens.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for laying hens	Lion Egg Code of Practice minimum standards (Lion minimum)	Lion Egg Code of Practice free-range standards (Lion free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
GENETICS & BREEDING							
No use of breeds associated with increased incidence of health/welfare problems	Only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health/ welfare problems (e.g. high levels of bone fractures, high propensity to feather peck) permitted and requirement for breeds used in outdoor systems to be suitable for outdoor conditions*	0 (no restrictions on permitted breeds)	0 (no restrictions on permitted breeds)	2 (recommends that consideration should be given to breed type as the tendency to feather peck can be less with certain strains; requires that all producers make progress in moving away from the need to beak trim; no requirement to select breeds that are less susceptible to bone fractures; injuries and causes must be recorded and monitored but no requirement to change genetics if not within acceptable limits)	2 (recommends that consideration should be given to breed type as the tendency to feather peck can be less with certain strains; requires that all producers make progress in moving away from the need to beak trim; no requirement to select breeds that are less susceptible to bone fractures; injuries and causes must be recorded and monitored but no requirement to change genetics if not within acceptable limits; no requirement to ensure free-range birds are suited to outdoor conditions)	6 (breeds must be chosen to avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production but no specific reference to bone strength and no requirement to monitor key health and welfare parameters associated with genetics, e.g. bone fractures; beak trimming prohibited; choice of breeds must take account of the capacity of the animals to adapt to local conditions and their vitality and resistance to disease)	6 (breeds must be chosen to avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production but no specific reference to bone strength and no requirement to monitor key health and welfare parameters associated with genetics, e.g. bone fractures; beak trimming largely prohibited; breeds must be chosen that can adapt to the organic system and local conditions and that have vitality and resistance to disease)
High welfare standards for breeding animals	See Table A7.3 for scoring of breeding bird welfare	1	1	0	0	0	4
No killing of surplus male animals	No culling of surplus male chicks (i.e. dual purpose breeds used)	0 (no requirement to avoid culling of male chicks)	0 (no requirement to avoid culling of male chicks)	0 (no requirement to avoid culling of male chicks)	0 (no requirement to avoid culling of male chicks)	0 (no requirement to avoid culling of male chicks)	0 (no requirement to avoid culling of male chicks)
AUDITING							
Frequent inspections	Frequent inspections by certifying body	2 (inspections every 18 months; where certification is reinstated following suspension, the frequency of inspections is increased to every 9 months; producers must also complete a self-audit every 6 months)	2 (inspections every 18 months; where certification is reinstated following suspension, the frequency of inspections is increased to every 9 months; producers must also complete a self-audit every 6 months)	4 (inspections annually; time between inspections may be shorter or longer up to 15 months to allow visits at different times of year)	4 (inspections annually; time between inspections may be shorter or longer up to 15 months to allow visits at different times of year)	4 (inspections annually)	4 (inspections annually)

*Key criteria

Table A7.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for laying hens.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for laying hens	Lion Egg Code of Practice minimum standards (Lion minimum)	Lion Egg Code of Practice free-range standards (Lion free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Spot-checks	Targeted unannounced spot-checks	1 (the monitoring agency may make unannounced visits; no information supplied to indicate that spot checks are targeted or the proportion of farms receiving spot checks)	1 (the monitoring agency may make unannounced visits; no information supplied to indicate that spot checks are targeted or the proportion of farms receiving spot checks)	5 (RSPCA monitor approx 35% of all members and 50% of monitoring visits are unannounced; all monitoring visits are made on a risk assessment basis following annual inspection – farms with non-compliances at assessment will get a monitoring visit)	5 (RSPCA monitor around 35% of all members and 50% of monitoring visits are unannounced; all monitoring visits are made on a risk assessment basis following annual inspection – farms with non-compliances at assessment will get a monitoring visit)	1 (spot checks are carried out as a routine part of verifying continuous compliance with the standards; may be unannounced; no information supplied to indicate that spot checks are targeted or the proportion of farms receiving spot checks; additional assessments are also carried out where a major change or deviation has been made from the approved farm plan)	3 (there is a programme of additional unannounced inspections over and above the annual visits; these target those who are considered to be higher risk or where specific risks have been identified, e.g. end of derogation periods, parallel production, following up complaints; around 10% of farms receive additional spot-checks or follow-up visits each year)
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme	Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set*	0 (no assessment of welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	0 (no assessment of welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	8 (RSPCA has developed a system of assessment of welfare outcomes and is working with other standard setters and Bristol University to further develop outcome measures; assessments of welfare outcomes on laying hen farms have been underway for the past year; observations include lesions and positive/ negative behaviour; producers set themselves targets and intervention levels in VHP; checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met)	8 (RSPCA has developed a system of assessment of welfare outcomes and is working with other standard setters and Bristol University to further develop outcome measures; assessments of welfare outcomes on laying hen farms have been underway for the past year; observations include lesions and positive/ negative behaviour; producers set themselves targets and intervention levels in VHP; checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met)	0 (no assessment of welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	6 (SA has a programme of assessments based on the Bristol Welfare Assurance Programme (BWAP); observations for laying hens are comb colour, feather loss, abnormal beak length, dirty feathers, behaviour – evidence of dustbathing/ ranging; no targets set for laying hens yet but plan to introduce targets)

*Key criteria

Table A7.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for laying hens.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for laying hens	Lion Egg Code of Practice minimum standards (Lion minimum)	Lion Egg Code of Practice free-range standards (Lion free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Measures to address non-compliance	Stringent measures to address non-compliance	<p>5 (non-compliance categorised as critical or non-critical; certification is immediately suspended where a critical non-compliance is identified; immediate corrective action must be taken which is signed-off by the monitoring agency before the suspension is lifted; non-critical non-compliances must be remedied within 28 days; failure to provide evidence of the rectification of the non-compliance to the monitoring agency with 28 days will result in suspension; where certification is reinstated following suspension, the frequency of inspections is increased to every 9 months)</p>	<p>5 (non-compliance categorised as critical or non-critical; certification is immediately suspended where a critical non-compliance is identified; immediate corrective action must be taken which is signed-off by the monitoring agency before the suspension is lifted; non-critical non-compliances must be remedied within 28 days; failure to provide evidence of the rectification of the non-compliance to the monitoring agency with 28 days will result in suspension; where certification is reinstated following suspension, the frequency of inspections is increased to every 9 months)</p>	<p>5 (all non-compliances must be corrected as soon as possible; certificates are withdrawn after 8 weeks if the Freedom Food certification panel have not received corrective actions and objective evidence to verify compliance; a producer who has their certificate withdrawn due to non-compliance at assessment has 3 unannounced visits by Freedom Food over the next 6 months to ensure compliance is being maintained)</p>	<p>5 (all non-compliances must be corrected as soon as possible; certificates are withdrawn after 8 weeks if the Freedom Food certification panel have not received corrective actions and objective evidence to verify compliance; a producer who has their certificate withdrawn due to non-compliance at assessment has 3 unannounced visits by Freedom Food over the next 6 months to ensure compliance is being maintained)</p>	<p>5 (where welfare issues are identified during an inspection, the Certification Officer sets the member targets to be implemented or in extreme cases passes on to SFQC Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) for the SOPA scheme for a full set of new plans and targets to be drawn up; if the targets are not met within a specific time scale then the member is withdrawn from the SOPA scheme; in some cases a specific category of livestock may be de-certified)</p>	<p>5 (an action summary form is drawn up following inspection, listing non-compliances and asking how they will be corrected, with a deadline for return of the completed form; actions to correct non-compliances must be approved before a licence is issued or continued; an additional inspection may be carried out to make sure non-compliances have been corrected; non-compliance categorised as minor, major, critical or manifest infringement; certification will normally be suspended for part or whole of the enterprise in response to critical non-compliance or multiple or unresolved major non-compliance)</p>

APPENDIX 7B

LAYING HENS

APPENDIX 7B: SCORING CATEGORIES FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR LAYING HENS

Table A7.2: Scoring categories for laying hens.

Criteria for laying hens	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
ENVIRONMENT						
No use of cages*	Cages permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Cages prohibited
Low indoor stocking density*	Maximum stocking density may be in excess of 16.7 birds/m ² usable area	Maximum 16.7 birds/m ² usable area (equivalent to 600cm ² per hen – minimum legislative requirement in enriched cages)	Maximum 13.3 birds/m ² usable area (equivalent to 750cm ² per hen)	Maximum 12 birds/m ² (minimum legislative requirement for some existing non-cage systems prior to 1st Jan 2012)	Maximum 9 birds/m ² usable area in all systems (minimum legislative requirement in all non-cage systems from 1st Jan 2012)	Maximum 6 birds/m ² usable area in all systems
Adequate environmental conditions maintained by ventilation/heating/insulation and monitoring to maintain temperature, humidity and air quality within acceptable limits	No requirement for appropriate design of houses in terms of ventilation/ insulation/ heating; no requirement for monitoring of environmental conditions; limits for temperature, humidity and air quality parameters not specified	Houses must be appropriately designed in terms of ventilation/ insulation/ heating but no requirement for monitoring of environmental conditions and limits for temperature, humidity and air quality parameters not specified	Houses must be appropriately designed in terms of ventilation/ insulation/heating to maintain good environmental conditions; minimum and maximum temperature must be recorded daily; limits for humidity and air quality parameters not specified and no requirement for regular monitoring or recording of humidity or air quality parameters	Houses must be appropriately designed in terms of ventilation/ insulation/heating to maintain good environmental conditions; minimum and maximum temperature must be recorded daily; limits specified for humidity and some air quality parameters but no requirement for regular monitoring or recording OR No requirement for regular monitoring of environmental conditions and/or limits not specified but houses must be appropriately designed in terms of ventilation/ insulation/heating to maintain good environmental conditions and houses must be open during the day	Houses must be appropriately designed in terms of ventilation/ insulation/heating to maintain good environmental conditions; minimum and maximum temperature must be recorded daily; limits specified for humidity and some air quality parameters which must be monitored and recorded regularly	Houses must be appropriately designed in terms of ventilation/ insulation/heating to maintain good environmental conditions; minimum and maximum temperature must be recorded daily; limits specified for humidity and a wide range of air quality parameters which must be monitored and recorded regularly
Provision of elevated perches, litter material for dustbathing and foraging and additional indoor enrichment (e.g. straw bales, pecking objects, roughage)*	No requirement for perches, litter material or additional enrichment	At least one of 1) at least 15cm of perching space per bird 2) at least 18cm of perching space per bird 3) perches must be well elevated above the floor/platforms - slats cannot count towards perching requirements 4) litter material required over at least one third of floor area 5) fresh litter material must be added regularly 6) additional enrichment required (minimum legislative requirement in enriched cages meets point 1)	At least two of 1) at least 15cm of perching space per bird 2) at least 18cm of perching space per bird 3) perches must be well elevated above the floor/platforms - slats cannot count towards perching requirements 4) litter material required over at least one third of floor area 5) fresh litter material must be added regularly 6) additional enrichment required (minimum legislative requirement in non-cage systems meets points 1 and 4)	At least three of 1) at least 15cm of perching space per bird 2) at least 18cm of perching space per bird 3) perches must be well elevated above the floor/platforms - slats cannot count towards perching requirements 4) litter material required over at least one third of floor area 5) fresh litter material must be added regularly 6) additional enrichment required	At least five of 1) at least 15cm of perching space per bird 2) at least 18cm of perching space per bird 3) perches must be well elevated above the floor/platforms - slats cannot count towards perching requirements 4) litter material required over at least one third of floor area 5) fresh litter material must be added regularly 6) additional enrichment required	Minimum of 18cm of elevated perching space per bird; slats cannot count towards perching space; litter material required over at least one third of floor area and fresh material must be added regularly; additional enrichment required

*Key criteria

Table A7.2: Scoring categories for laying hens.

Criteria for laying hens	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Provision of nests for laying birds*	No requirement for nests	Nest(s) required but may be fewer than one nest for every 7 birds or less than 1m ² of nest space for every 120 birds in communal nests (minimum legislative requirement in enriched cages)	N/A	One nest for every 7 birds or 1m ² of nest space for every 120 birds in communal nests – equivalent to 83cm ² per bird (minimum legislative standards for non-cage systems)	Requirements for number of individual nests or for space in communal nests exceed minimum legislative standards for non-cage systems	Requirements for number of individual nests and for space in communal nests exceed minimum legislative standards for non-cage systems
Appropriate light intensity and light/dark periods	N/A	Lighting must follow 24-hour rhythm and be sufficient to allow hens to investigate surroundings visually and to show normal levels of activity; uninterrupted period of darkness of around one third of the day (minimum legislative requirements); no requirement for dusk period	Minimum 8 hours light at minimum 10 lux, which may be lowered temporarily in the event of an outbreak of injurious pecking; minimum 6 hours dark period; dusk period OR Minimum 8 hours light at minimum 20 lux, which may be lowered temporarily in the event of an outbreak of injurious pecking; minimum 6 hours dark period; no requirement for dusk period	Access to natural light outdoors and/or minimum of 50 lux indoors, which may be lowered temporarily in the event of an outbreak of injurious pecking; minimum 6 hours dark period except when natural period is shorter; no requirement for dusk period	Access to natural light outdoors and/or minimum of 50 lux indoors, which may be lowered temporarily in the event of an outbreak of injurious pecking; minimum 6 hours dark period except when natural period is shorter; dusk period OR Access to natural light outdoors and/or minimum of 50 lux indoors, which may be lowered temporarily in the event of an outbreak of injurious pecking; minimum 8 hours dark period except when natural period is shorter; no requirement for dusk period	Access to natural light outdoors; minimum 8 hours light period and minimum 8 hours dark period except when natural periods are shorter; dusk period
Free range access*	Permanent indoor housing permitted	No requirement for access to range but all birds must have access to a covered veranda with enrichment and natural light	N/A	N/A	N/A	All birds must have continuous daytime access to range throughout the laying period (except that birds may be housed temporarily in extreme weather conditions or if required by law due to a disease outbreak)
Low outdoor stocking density	Outdoor access not required	N/A	N/A	At least 4m ² /bird (minimum legislative requirement for free range systems)	At least 5m ² /bird	At least 10m ² /bird

*Key criteria

Table A7.2: Scoring categories for laying hens.

Criteria for laying hens	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Provision of overhead cover and protection from predators for outdoor chickens	Outdoor access not required	N/A	Open air runs must be equipped with shelter from inclement weather and predators; free-range birds must be provided with shelters on the range only if the range extends beyond 150m from the nearest pophole – minimum 4 shelters per hectare (minimum legislative requirements)	Some overhead cover should be provided on the range but no minimum specified; protection from predators required	Overhead cover must be provided over a specified minimum area of the range; protection from predators required OR Natural or artificial cover must be provided sufficient to mimic natural environment but minimum area not specified; protection from predators required	Natural or artificial cover must be provided over at least 20% of the range and positioned so as to encourage use of the entire range area; protection from predators required
Small flock size	No limit on flock size	Maximum flock size 1000 birds or 2500 if demonstrably high level of bird health and welfare and good environmental conditions OR Flock size may be in excess of 2500 but partitions must be provided	Maximum flock size 500 birds or 2000 if demonstrably high level of bird health and welfare and good environmental conditions OR Maximum flock size 1000 birds or 2500 if demonstrably high level of bird health and welfare and good environmental conditions and partitions must be provided OR Flock size not specified but likely to be small (e.g. cage systems)	Maximum flock size 250 birds or 1000 if demonstrably high level of bird health and welfare and good environmental conditions OR Maximum flock size 500 birds or 2000 if demonstrably high level of bird health and welfare and good environmental conditions and partitions must be provided	Maximum flock size 100 birds or 500 if demonstrably high level of bird health and welfare and good environmental conditions OR Maximum flock size 250 birds or 1000 if demonstrably high level of bird health and welfare and good environmental conditions and partitions must be provided	Natural flock sizes (i.e. up to around 20 birds)
HUSBANDRY						
No beak trimming*	Beak trimming permitted	N/A	N/A	Beak trimming permitted but commitment to phase out in near future	Beak trimming permitted only in exceptional circumstances with written permission from the scheme each time and problem must be identified and rectified for future flocks	Beak trimming prohibited
No genetic engineering or cloning	No restriction on the use of genetically modified or cloned animals or their offspring	N/A	N/A	The use of genetically modified animals is prohibited but no restriction on the use of cloned animals or their offspring	The use of genetically modified and cloned animals is prohibited but no restriction on the use of clone offspring	The use of genetically modified and cloned animals and their offspring is prohibited

*Key criteria

Table A7.2: Scoring categories for laying hens.

Criteria for laying hens	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Provision of adequate high-fibre feed to reduce risk of behavioural problems (e.g. injurious pecking) and insoluble grit to aid digestion	No requirement to provide roughage or insoluble grit	Insoluble grit must be provided but no requirement to provide roughage or access to vegetation	N/A	Birds must have access to vegetation outdoors but no requirement to provide additional roughage or insoluble grit	Insoluble grit must be provided and birds must have access to vegetation outdoors but no requirement to provide additional roughage	Insoluble grit must be provided; birds must have access to vegetation outdoors; roughage must be added to daily feed ration and when birds are housed they must have permanent access to roughage
No forced moulting*	Forced moulting permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Forced moulting prohibited
Short duration of feed withdrawal prior to slaughter	Period without feed prior to slaughter may be in excess of 12 hours	N/A	N/A	Period without feed prior to slaughter must not exceed 12 hours	Period without feed prior to slaughter must not exceed 10 hours	Period without feed prior to slaughter must not exceed 8 hours
Veterinary health plan with stringent targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits*	No requirement for VHP or monitoring of health and welfare and performance parameters	Must have VHP but no requirement for monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters	Must have VHP and recording of mortality and culls but no requirement for monitoring of other key health and welfare and performance parameters	Must have VHP and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters but no targets required	Must have VHP and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with moderate or unspecified targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits	Must have VHP and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with stringent targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits

STOCKMANSHIP, HANDLING, TRANSPORT & SLAUGHTER

Requirement to use humane catching methods – no catching by one leg/limit on number of birds carried at a time*	Catching by one leg permitted and no limit on number of birds carried	N/A	N/A	Catching by one leg prohibited; caged birds must be removed from cages singly but more than one bird may be carried in each hand	Catching by one leg prohibited; caged birds must be removed from cages singly; no more than one bird may be carried in each hand OR Catching must be automated (and catching machine must be shown to improve welfare)	All birds must be caught individually and carried in an upright position
Requirement for stockpeople to be trained/ competent/ experienced	No requirements regarding training or experience of stockpeople	N/A	Stockpeople must be suitably trained or experienced but no requirement to provide formal training in animal welfare or for training to be validated	Stockpeople must be suitably trained or experienced; formal training in animal welfare must be provided and records of training must be kept but no requirement for training to be validated	There must be at least one nominated person with responsibility for animal welfare (owner or manager) who must have attended a relevant validated training course; formal training in animal welfare must be provided for all stockpeople and records of training must be kept	All stockpeople must have attended a relevant validated training course and records of training must be kept

*Key criteria

Table A7.2: Scoring categories for laying hens.

Criteria for laying hens	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Frequent checks for signs of disease, injury or distress	N/A	N/A	N/A	Flocks must be checked at least once per day (minimum legal requirement)	Flocks must be checked at least twice per day OR Flocks must be checked at least 3 times per day but only one inspection must be sufficiently thorough to identify any bird showing signs of sickness or injury	Flocks must be checked at least 3 times per day
Short transport duration*	Journeys over 12 hours including loading and unloading or 8 hours excluding loading and unloading permitted	N/A	N/A	12 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 12 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used) OR 8 hour journey limit excluding loading and unloading	8 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 8 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used) OR 4 hour journey limit excluding loading and unloading	4 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 4 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)
Only humane stunning/slaughter methods permitted – no shackling of live birds and no use of carbon dioxide*	Fewer than two of 1) controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method for off-farm slaughter 2) waterbath stunners must be designed to avoid pre-stun shocks 3) shackle line must have breast comforters 4) shackle line must have low lighting 5) maximum time in shackles limited to 30 seconds 6) Use of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited 7) Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited	At least two of 1) controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method for off-farm slaughter 2) waterbath stunners must be designed to avoid pre-stun shocks 3) shackle line must have breast comforters 4) shackle line must have low lighting 5) maximum time in shackles limited to 30 seconds 6) Use of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited 7) Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited	At least four of 1) controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method for off-farm slaughter 2) waterbath stunners must be designed to avoid pre-stun shocks 3) shackle line must have breast comforters 4) shackle line must have low lighting 5) maximum time in shackles limited to 30 seconds 6) Use of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited 7) Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited	At least six of 1) controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method for off-farm slaughter 2) waterbath stunners must be designed to avoid pre-stun shocks 3) shackle line must have breast comforters 4) shackle line must have low lighting 5) maximum time in shackles limited to 30 seconds 6) Use of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited 7) Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited	Use of metal shackles prohibited; birds slaughtered off-farm must be killed by controlled atmosphere stunning; birds slaughtered on-farm may be restrained in cones or soft (e.g. leather) shackles for electrical or percussive stunning	Use of metal shackles and CO ₂ prohibited; birds slaughtered off-farm must be killed by controlled atmosphere stunning using non-aversive gases; birds slaughtered on-farm may be restrained in cones or soft (e.g. leather) shackles for electrical or percussive stunning

*Key criteria

Table A7.2: Scoring categories for laying hens.

Criteria for laying hens	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death*	Slaughter without stunning permitted and/or no clear specifications for stunning parameters, time between stunning and neck cutting may exceed 10 seconds, no requirement for both carotid arteries and both jugular veins to be severed, no manual checking and back-up systems required, and time between neck cutting and scald tank may exceed 90 seconds	All birds must be stunned and at least one of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting 3) both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed 4) manual checking and back-up systems required 5) minimum of 90 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank	All birds must be stunned and at least two of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting 3) both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed 4) manual checking and back-up systems required 5) minimum of 90 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank	All birds must be stunned and at least three of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting 3) both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed 4) manual checking and back-up systems required 5) minimum of 90 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank	All birds must be stunned and at least four of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting 3) both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed 4) manual checking and back-up systems required 5) minimum of 90 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank	All birds must be stunned; clear specifications for stunning parameters to ensure effective stun; maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting; both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed; manual checking and back-up systems required; minimum of 90 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank
Animal welfare policy and CCTV at abattoir and requirement for people involved in catching, transport and slaughter of birds to be trained/ competent/ experienced	No requirement for personnel in charge of catching and transporting birds to be trained or for abattoirs to have written animal welfare policy, an appointed AWO, a training programme in animal welfare or CCTV	At least one of 1) all personnel in charge of catching birds must be trained 2) all personnel in charge of transporting birds must be trained 3) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 4) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 5) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 6) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	At least two of 1) all personnel in charge of catching birds must be trained 2) all personnel in charge of transporting birds must be trained 3) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 4) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 5) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 6) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	At least three of 1) all personnel in charge of catching birds must be trained 2) all personnel in charge of transporting birds must be trained 3) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 4) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 5) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 6) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	At least five of 1) all personnel in charge of catching birds must be trained 2) all personnel in charge of transporting birds must be trained 3) abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly 4) abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered 5) abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept 6) abattoirs must have CCTV installed to monitor all stages of pre-slaughter handling, stunning and slaughter	All personnel in charge of catching and transporting birds must be trained; abattoirs must have written animal welfare policy reviewed regularly; abattoirs must have appointed AWO on site at all times when animals are being unloaded or slaughtered; abattoirs must have a training programme in animal welfare for all staff and records of training must be kept

*Key criteria

Table A7.2: Scoring categories for laying hens.

Criteria for laying hens	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
GENETICS & BREEDING						
Only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health/ welfare problems (e.g. high levels of bone fractures, high propensity to feather peck) permitted and requirement for breeds used in outdoor systems to be suitable for outdoor conditions*	No restrictions on permitted genetics; no requirement for monitoring of key health and welfare parameters associated with production level	At least one of 1) breeds must be chosen that avoid health and welfare problems associated with intensive production 2) breeds must be chosen that have a lower propensity to engage in injurious pecking (and/or beak trimming prohibited or producers must make progress in moving away from beak trimming) 3) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of bone fractures permitted 4) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 5) in free-range systems, breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	At least two of 1) breeds must be chosen that avoid health and welfare problems associated with intensive production 2) breeds must be chosen that have a lower propensity to engage in injurious pecking (and/or beak trimming prohibited or producers must make progress in moving away from beak trimming) 3) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of bone fractures permitted 4) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 5) in free-range systems, breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	At least three of 1) breeds must be chosen that avoid health and welfare problems associated with intensive production 2) breeds must be chosen that have a lower propensity to engage in injurious pecking (and/or beak trimming prohibited or producers must make progress in moving away from beak trimming) 3) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of bone fractures permitted 4) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 5) in free-range systems, breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	At least four of 1) breeds must be chosen that avoid health and welfare problems associated with intensive production 2) breeds must be chosen that have a lower propensity to engage in injurious pecking (and/or beak trimming prohibited or producers must make progress in moving away from beak trimming) 3) only breeds not associated with increased incidence of bone fractures permitted 4) key health and welfare parameters associated with production level must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary 5) in free-range systems, breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions	Breeds must be chosen that have a lower propensity to engage in injurious pecking and that are not associated with increased incidence of bone fractures or other health and welfare problems associated with intensive production; key health and welfare parameters associated with production level must be monitored and demonstrated to be within acceptable limits or genetics changed if necessary; in free-range systems, breeds must be chosen that are suited to local conditions
High welfare standards for breeding birds	See Table A7.4					
AUDITING						
Frequent inspections by certifying body	Inspections may be less frequent than every 24 months	Inspections at least every 24 months on average for all members	Inspections at least every 18 months on average for all members OR Inspections every 12 months initially and then up to 24 months with frequency determined by previous performance	Inspections at least every 15 months on average for all members OR Inspections every 6 months initially and then up to 24 months with frequency determined by previous performance	Inspections at least every 12 months on average for all members OR Inspections every 6 months initially and then up to 18 months with frequency determined by previous performance	Inspections every 6 months initially and then up to 12 months with frequency determined by previous performance

*Key criteria

Table A7.2: Scoring categories for laying hens.

Criteria for laying hens	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Targeted unannounced spot-checks	No spot checks	Spot checks for less than 10% of members annually (or proportion not specified); not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for less than 10% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced OR Spot checks for 10% of members annually but not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for 10% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced OR Spot checks for 20% of members annually but not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for 20% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced OR Spot checks for 30% of members annually but not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for 30% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set*	No assessment of welfare outcomes and no stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future	No assessment of welfare outcomes but stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future OR Informal observations of one or two welfare outcomes (e.g. injuries) during routine inspections but no formal recording of welfare outcomes and no targets set OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure records are being maintained	System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place but no targets set OR System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted and producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and either 1) farm-specific targets set by producers or 2) moderate (or unspecified) targets set by assurance scheme	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and stringent targets set by assurance scheme for all farms
Stringent measures to address non-compliance	No requirement to correct minor non-compliances	N/A	N/A	All non-compliances must be corrected but no defined timescale for correction; certification may be suspended or withdrawn for a serious non-compliance or multiple and/or repeated minor non-compliances	N/A	All non-compliances must be corrected within agreed timescale; certification may be suspended or withdrawn for a serious non-compliance or multiple and/or repeated minor non-compliances

*Key criteria

APPENDIX 7C

LAYING HENS

APPENDIX 7C: FULL RESULTS TABLE FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR LAYER BREEDERS

Table A7.3: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for layer breeders.

A maximum of 5 points is available for each criterion. Overall scores are converted to a score out of 5 and incorporated into the overall scoring of standards for laying hens (see **Table A7.1**).

Criteria for layer breeders	Lion Egg Code of Practice minimum standards (Lion minimum)	Lion Egg Code of Practice free-range standards (Lion free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Low indoor stocking density	1 (maximum stocking density not specified but must comply with breeder's recommended standards)	1 (maximum stocking density not specified but must comply with breeder's recommended standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	5 (maximum 6 birds/m ²)
Provision of elevated perches, litter material for dustbathing and foraging and additional indoor enrichment to encourage exercise and foraging (e.g. straw bales, pecking objects, roughage)	1 (litter must be provided and maintained at an average minimum depth of 5cm; no requirement for perches or additional enrichment specified)	1 (litter must be provided and maintained at an average minimum depth of 5cm; no requirement for perches or additional enrichment specified)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	4 (minimum 18cm elevated perch space per bird; slats cannot count toward perch requirements; litter must be provided over at least half of floor area and topped up regularly to maintain in a suitable state for scratching and dustbathing)
Provision of nests	3 (nests provided but number/area not specified)	3 (nests provided but number/area not specified)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	5 (one nest for every 6 birds or 120cm ² of nest space per bird in communal nests)
Free range access	0 (permanent indoor housing permitted)	0 (permanent indoor housing permitted)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	5 (birds must have access to pasture from 12 weeks of age)
No beak trimming	0 (permitted)	0 (permitted)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	4 (beak tipping only permitted in exceptional circumstances with written permission from the scheme and recommendation from vet each time; management plan must be reviewed to avoid problem in future)
No forced moulting	0 (not specified for breeding birds)	0 (not specified for breeding birds)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	5 (forced moulting effectively prohibited by requirement to provide access to food throughout the day)

Table A7.3: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for layer breeders.

Criteria for layer breeders	Lion Egg Code of Practice minimum standards (Lion minimum)	Lion Egg Code of Practice free-range standards (Lion free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Veterinary health plan with stringent targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits	1 (must have written veterinary health plan reviewed annually; mortality must be recorded but no requirement to monitor other health and welfare parameters; DOAs must be recorded and if exceeds 0.5% for any flock, an investigation of the cause must be carried out and a written report including corrective action points produced)	1 (must have written veterinary health plan reviewed annually; mortality must be recorded but no requirement to monitor other health and welfare parameters; DOAs must be recorded and if exceeds 0.5% for any flock, an investigation of the cause must be carried out and a written report including corrective action points produced)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	3 (must have animal health plan submitted for approval and reviewed regularly; health and welfare parameters must be monitored and records kept of veterinary treatments, mortalities and the cause of death and hock damage, but no targets specified)
Humane catching/handling methods	3 (birds must be handled in accordance with the Joint Industry Welfare Guide to the Handling of End of Lay Hens and Breeders, which states that birds must be caught by both legs with no more than 3 birds carried in one hand and that caged birds must be removed from cages singly)	3 (birds must be handled in accordance with the Joint Industry Welfare Guide to the Handling of End of Lay Hens and Breeders, which states that birds must be caught by both legs with no more than 3 birds carried in one hand and that mobile catching frames should be used to reduce the risk of smothering)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	3 (welfare code must be complied with, which states that birds should be caught and carried by the body or both legs and no more than 3 birds should be carried in one hand)
Short transport duration	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	4 (journeys must not exceed 8 hours from the start of loading to the end of unloading, except with permission)
Only humane stunning/slaughter methods permitted – no shackling of live birds and no use of carbon dioxide	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	1 (shackling permitted; no requirement for breast comforters or low lighting; waterbath stunners must not overflow at entrance or deliver pre-stun shocks to any bird; no restriction on length of time in shackles beyond legal requirements; use of CO ₂ prohibited)

Table A7.3: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for layer breeders.

Criteria for layer breeders	Lion Egg Code of Practice minimum standards (Lion minimum)	Lion Egg Code of Practice free-range standards (Lion free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	3 (all birds must be stunned; current must be strong enough and in contact for long enough so that every bird is immediately unconscious and stays unconscious until it is dead but stunning parameters not specified; someone must be present at all times to check that the stun is effective and where the stun may have not worked correctly, to stun or kill without delay; stun-neck cutting interval must not exceed 10 seconds; both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed; minimum time between neck cutting and scald tank not specified)
Only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health/welfare problems (e.g. high levels of bone fractures, high propensity to feather peck) permitted	0 (no restrictions on permitted breeds)	0 (no restrictions on permitted breeds)	2 (breeding birds not covered by standards but requirement for all producers to make progress in moving away from beak trimming in laying flocks)	2 (breeding birds not covered by standards but requirement for all producers to make progress in moving away from beak trimming in laying flocks)	4 (breeding birds not covered by standards but standards for laying birds require that breeds are chosen to avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production and beak trimming prohibited in laying flocks)	4 (breeds must be chosen to avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production and beak trimming largely prohibited in laying flocks)
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set	0 (no requirement to assess welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	0 (no requirement to assess welfare outcomes during inspection visits; no information supplied to indicate any future plans to introduce outcome measures)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	0 (breeding birds not covered by standards)	3 (SA has a programme of assessments based on the Bristol Welfare Assurance Programme (BWAP); observations for laying hens are comb colour, feather loss, abnormal beak length, dirty feathers, behaviour – evidence of dustbathing/ ranging; no targets set for laying hens yet but plan to introduce targets)

Table A7.3: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for layer breeders.

Criteria for layer breeders	Lion Egg Code of Practice minimum standards (Lion minimum)	Lion Egg Code of Practice free-range standards (Lion free-range)	RSPCA Freedom Food minimum standards (RSPCA minimum)	RSPCA Freedom Food free-range standards (RSPCA free-range)	Scottish Organic Producers Association (SOPA)	Soil Association (SA)
Total for layer breeder criteria	9/65	9/65	2/65	2/65	4/65	49/65
Welfare score for layer breeders carried over to Table A7.1	1/5	1/5	0/5	0/5	0/5	4/5

APPENDIX 7D

LAYING HENS

APPENDIX 7D: SCORING CATEGORIES FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR LAYER BREEDERS

Table A7.4: Scoring categories for layer breeders.

Criteria for layer breeders	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Low indoor stocking density	Maximum stocking density in excess of breeder's recommendations	Maximum stocking density in accordance with breeder's recommendations	Maximum stocking density 9 birds/m ² or lower	Maximum stocking density 8 birds/m ² or lower	Maximum stocking density 7 birds/m ² or lower	Maximum stocking density 6 birds/m ² or lower
Provision of elevated perches, litter material for dustbathing and foraging and additional indoor enrichment (e.g. straw bales, pecking objects, roughage)	No requirement for perches, litter material or additional enrichment	At least one of 1) at least 15cm of perching space per bird 2) at least 18cm of perching space per bird 3) slats cannot count towards perching requirements 4) litter material required over at least one third of floor area 5) fresh litter material must be added regularly 6) additional enrichment required	At least two of 1) at least 15cm of perching space per bird 2) at least 18cm of perching space per bird 3) slats cannot count towards perching requirements 4) litter material required over at least one third of floor area 5) fresh litter material must be added regularly 6) additional enrichment required	At least three of 1) at least 15cm of perching space per bird 2) at least 18cm of perching space per bird 3) slats cannot count towards perching requirements 4) litter material required over at least one third of floor area 5) fresh litter material must be added regularly 6) additional enrichment required	At least five of 1) at least 15cm of perching space per bird 2) at least 18cm of perching space per bird 3) slats cannot count towards perching requirements 4) litter material required over at least one third of floor area 5) fresh litter material must be added regularly 6) additional enrichment required	Minimum of 18cm of elevated perching space per bird; slats cannot count towards perching space; litter material required over at least one third of floor area and fresh material must be added regularly; additional enrichment required
Provision of nests	No requirement to provide nests	N/A	N/A	Nests required but minimum nest number/ area not specified	Nesting facilities required at least equivalent to minimum legislative standards for laying birds in non-cage systems	Nesting facilities required exceeding minimum legislative standards for laying birds in non-cage systems
Free range access	Permanent indoor housing permitted	No requirement for access to range but all birds must have access to a covered veranda with enrichment and natural light	N/A	N/A	All birds must have access to range for whole of laying life (except that birds may be housed temporarily in extreme weather conditions or if required by law due to a disease outbreak)	All birds must have access to range from 12 weeks (except that birds may be housed temporarily in extreme weather conditions or if required by law due to a disease outbreak)
No beak trimming	Beak trimming permitted	N/A	N/A	Beak trimming permitted but commitment to phase out in near future	Beak trimming permitted only in exceptional circumstances with written permission from the scheme each time and problem must be identified and rectified for future flocks	Beak trimming prohibited
No forced moulting	Forced moulting permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Forced moulting prohibited

Table A7.4: Scoring categories for layer breeders.

Criteria for layer breeders	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Veterinary health plan with stringent targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits	No requirement for VHP or monitoring of health and welfare and performance parameters	Must have VHP but no requirement for monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters	N/A	Must have VHP and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters but no targets required	Must have VHP and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with moderate or unspecified targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits	Must have VHP and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with stringent targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits
Humane catching/handling methods	Catching by one leg permitted and no limit on number of birds carried	N/A	N/A	Catching by one leg prohibited but more than one bird may be carried in each hand	Catching by one leg prohibited and no more than one bird may be carried in each hand OR Catching must be automated (and catching machine must be shown to improve welfare)	All birds must be caught individually and carried in an upright position
Short transport duration	Journeys over 12 hours including loading and unloading or 8 hours excluding loading and unloading permitted	N/A	N/A	12 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 8 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used) OR 8 hour journey limit excluding loading and unloading	8 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 4 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used) OR 4 hour journey limit excluding loading and unloading	4 hour journey limit including loading and unloading (except where nearest abattoir is further than 4 hours away in which case nearest abattoir must be used)
Only humane stunning/slaughter methods permitted – no shackling of live birds and no use of carbon dioxide	Fewer than two of 1) controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method for off-farm slaughter 2) waterbath stunners must be designed to avoid pre-stun shocks 3) shackle line must have breast comforters 4) shackle line must have low lighting 5) maximum time in shackles limited to 60 seconds 6) Use of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited 7) Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited	At least two of 1) controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method for off-farm slaughter 2) waterbath stunners must be designed to avoid pre-stun shocks 3) shackle line must have breast comforters 4) shackle line must have low lighting 5) maximum time in shackles limited to 60 seconds 6) Use of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited 7) Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited	At least four of 1) controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method for off-farm slaughter 2) waterbath stunners must be designed to avoid pre-stun shocks 3) shackle line must have breast comforters 4) shackle line must have low lighting 5) maximum time in shackles limited to 60 seconds 6) Use of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited 7) Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited	At least six of 1) controlled atmosphere stunning is recommended method for off-farm slaughter 2) waterbath stunners must be designed to avoid pre-stun shocks 3) shackle line must have breast comforters 4) shackle line must have low lighting 5) maximum time in shackles limited to 60 seconds 6) Use of CO ₂ above 30% prohibited 7) Use of CO ₂ completely prohibited	Use of metal shackles prohibited; birds slaughtered off-farm must be killed by controlled atmosphere stunning; birds slaughtered on-farm may be restrained in cones or soft (e.g. leather) shackles for electrical or percussive stunning	Use of metal shackles and CO ₂ prohibited; birds slaughtered off-farm must be killed by controlled atmosphere stunning using non-aversive gases; birds slaughtered on-farm may be restrained in cones or soft (e.g. leather) shackles for electrical or percussive stunning

Table A7.4: Scoring categories for layer breeders.

Criteria for layer breeders	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death	Slaughter without stunning permitted and/or no clear specifications for stunning parameters, time between stunning and neck cutting may exceed 10 seconds, no requirement for both carotid arteries and both jugular veins to be severed, no manual checking and back-up systems required, and time between neck cutting and scald tank may exceed 90 seconds	All birds must be stunned and at least one of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting 3) both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed 4) manual checking and back-up systems required 5) minimum of 90 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank	All birds must be stunned and at least two of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting 3) both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed 4) manual checking and back-up systems required 5) minimum of 90 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank	All birds must be stunned and at least three of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting 3) both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed 4) manual checking and back-up systems required 5) minimum of 90 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank	All birds must be stunned and at least four of 1) clear specifications for stunning parameters 2) maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting 3) both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed 4) manual checking and back-up systems required 5) minimum of 90 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank	All birds must be stunned; clear specifications for stunning parameters to ensure effective stun; maximum of 10 seconds between stunning and neck cutting; both carotid arteries and both jugular veins must be severed; manual checking and back-up systems required; minimum of 90 seconds between neck cutting and scald tank
Only breeds not associated with increased incidence of health/ welfare problems (e.g. high levels of bone fractures, high propensity to feather peck) permitted	No restrictions on permitted genetics	N/A	Breeding birds not covered by standards but beak trimming prohibited in laying flocks or requirement to make progress in moving away from beak trimming in laying flocks OR Breeding birds not covered by standards but only breeds not associated with increased incidence of bone fractures permitted in laying flocks or requirement to make progress reducing incidence of bone fractures in laying flocks	Breeding birds not covered by standards but beak trimming prohibited in laying flocks or requirement to make progress in moving away from beak trimming in laying flocks and only breeds not associated with increased incidence of bone fractures permitted in laying flocks or requirement to make progress reducing incidence of bone fractures in laying flocks	Beak trimming prohibited or requirement to make progress in moving away from beak trimming and general requirement to choose breeds that avoid specific disease or health problems associated with intensive production but no specific requirement to choose breeds that are not associated with increased incidence of bone fractures	Breeds must be chosen that have a lower propensity to engage in injurious pecking and that are not associated with increased incidence of bone fractures

Table A7.4: Scoring categories for layer breeders.

Criteria for layer breeders	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
<p>Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set</p>	<p>No assessment of welfare outcomes and no stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future</p>	<p>No assessment of welfare outcomes but stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future OR Informal observations of one or two welfare outcomes (e.g. injuries) during routine inspections but no formal recording of welfare outcomes and no targets set OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure records are being maintained</p>	<p>System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met</p>	<p>System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place but no targets set OR System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted and producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met</p>	<p>System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and either 1) farm-specific targets set by producers or 2) moderate (or unspecified) targets set by assurance scheme</p>	

APPENDIX 8A

SALMON

APPENDIX 8A: FULL RESULTS TABLE FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR SALMON

Table A8.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for salmon.

Up to 5 points are available for each criterion. Key criteria (marked with an asterisk) are weighted so that they are worth double points (i.e. up to 10 points for each key criterion). Criteria are grouped into five sets. Totals for each set of criteria are converted to scores out of 20, which are totalled to give an overall score out of 100 for each scheme (see **Table 3.8**).

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for salmon	Code of Good Practice for Scottish Finfish Aquaculture (CoGP)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Soil Association (SA)
ENVIRONMENT				
No close confinement	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Adequate space	Appropriate stocking density at freshwater parr stage*	0 (stocking density should be monitored in relation to health, behaviour and water quality to ensure that welfare is not compromised but no limits specified)	4 (30 kg/m ³ in freshwater production tank)	10 (10 kg/m ³ ±1%)
	Appropriate stocking density in saltwater cages/pens*	0 (stocking density should be monitored in relation to health, behaviour and water quality to ensure that welfare is not compromised but no limits specified)	6 (17 kg/m ³ in seawater enclosures with 15 kg/m ³ site maximum; the depth of water used in the calculation of stocking density must not exceed 15m)	10 (10 kg/m ³ ±1%)
Appropriate housing design	High standards of water quality*	2 (water quality parameters, including oxygen, carbon dioxide, temperature, pH, ammonia and sediment levels, should be maintained within acceptable limits, but limits not specified; water monitoring should be carried out – parameters measured and monitoring interval will depend on the system, stage of development and time of year)	8 (limits for water quality parameters specified in standards for freshwater systems only, including oxygen, free ammonia, carbon dioxide, temperature, pH, suspended solids and nitrate; water quality must be monitored sufficiently frequently, daily if necessary, depending on the system, time of year and stage of stock)	10 (limits for water quality parameters during seawater and freshwater stages specified in standards, including oxygen, inorganic N and P, pH and chlorophyll levels, flush rate, and must be grade 1 quality site with minimal risk of pollution; deviation from specified water quality parameters only permitted with approval for sites with specific mitigating circumstances; must regularly monitor and record wide range of water quality parameters specified in standards in both freshwater and saltwater operations)
Provision of appropriate bedding/ litter/ enrichment material	Provision of environmental enrichment*	0 (no requirement for environmental enrichment)	0 (no requirement for environmental enrichment at present – policy will be reviewed in 2012)	0 (recommends combining farming of salmon with shellfish and seaweeds but no requirement to provide enrichment)
Provision of appropriate nesting facilities	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Appropriate lighting	Appropriate light/dark periods	0 (exposure to light should be maintained at a level suitable for each stage of development or species in question but no stipulations on permitted lighting patterns)	0 (lighting must be maintained at a level suitable for each stage of development but no stipulations on permitted lighting patterns)	5 (artificial light must not be used to prolong day length to longer than 16 hours, manipulate smolting, or control maturation or production in finishing stock)
Free range access	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A

*Key criteria

Table A8.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for salmon.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for salmon	Code of Good Practice for Scottish Finfish Aquaculture (CoGP)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Soil Association (SA)
Appropriate shelter/shade and protection from predators	Provision of protection from predators	5 (must have standard operating procedures to prevent and manage predation problems)	5 (precautions must be taken to protect fish from predators by denying predators access to tanks and enclosures)	5 (protective measures must be used to deter predators from damaging or stressing stock)
	No killing of predators	1 (anti-predator measures must be used to exclude and deter predators but, where necessary, predators may be humanely killed in accordance with legislation)	3 (humane lethal methods of predator control must only be used as a last resort and producers must be able to demonstrate that all non-lethal measures are in place; predator exclusion procedures must be reviewed after every shooting incident)	5 (predators and other species must not be killed)
Appropriate social grouping	Fish maintained in groups of similar sized fish to minimise aggression	0 (not specified)	0 (advises that optimising husbandry practices and farming environments can significantly reduce the creation of size hierarchies within populations but no requirement to keep fish in groups of similar-sized stock)	5 (fish must be kept in groups of similar sized stock to minimise aggression)
	No use of cleaner fish such as wrasse to control sea lice	0 (a documented risk assessment must be undertaken before intentionally co-habiting wild and farmed fish, such as wrasse in salmon pens; wrasse should be humanely destroyed or reused, not released, following harvesting)	5 (control of sea lice using wrasse is prohibited)	1 (locally caught or cultivated wrasse may be used to remove sea lice; wrasse must have access to adequate shelter and feeding and their welfare must be covered in management plan)
HUSBANDRY				
No mutilations	No mutilations, including tagging*	4 (marking methods that cause distress or significant injury to fish should not be employed)	10 (mutilations involving the removal of sensitive tissue and marking methods that cause distress or injury are prohibited)	10 (no mutilations are permitted)
No use of genetic engineering/cloning or invasive reproductive technologies associated with health or welfare problems	No use of genetically modified or cloned fish or their offspring*	2 (use of transgenic finfish prohibited but no restriction on the use of cloned fish or their offspring)	8 (genetic modification is prohibited; cloning is effectively prohibited by requirement that fish must not have been produced by breeding techniques that result in health or welfare problems for any of the animals involved, but no restriction on use of offspring of cloned fish)	8 (genetically engineered stock prohibited; use of cloning is prohibited but no restriction on use of offspring of cloned fish)
	Broodstock must be anaesthetised or slaughtered before stripping*	10 (live fish that are to be stripped or milked must be properly anaesthetised and handled carefully at all times)	0 (not specified)	10 (salmonid broodstock must be anaesthetised or slaughtered before stripping)

*Key criteria

Table A8.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for salmon.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for salmon	Code of Good Practice for Scottish Finfish Aquaculture (CoGP)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Soil Association (SA)
Appropriate feeding	Requirement for feeding methods to minimise competition and aggression and for feeding behaviour to be monitored	0 (feed management plan must include details on feeding in “the proper manner” but no specific requirements to minimise aggression; it is suggested but not required that feeding behaviour be monitored and recorded as part of VHP)	5 (feed must be distributed in such a way that fish can eat without undue competition; fish must be observed during feeding and the person feeding must check that fish on the periphery of the tank or enclosure receive adequate amounts of food)	5 (feeding methods must minimise stress; feeding behaviour must be monitored)
	No use of high energy (high oil content) diets to increase production	0 (not specified)	0 (not specified)	5 (high energy diets – more than 28% oil – must not be used to increase production or to “fast track”)
	Short period of feed withdrawal prior to slaughter*	0 (the period during which fish may be deprived of feed to achieve gut clearance must be appropriate to the species; fish should be fasted for the minimum period necessary to clear the gut before slaughter but no limit specified)	10 (fish must only be fasted for the absolute minimum period to meet food hygiene requirements and not for more than 72 hours unless fasting is beneficial to welfare)	8 (salmon may be starved before slaughter for up to 40 degree days or 72 hours – whichever is shorter, except with approval may be extended, e.g. if entire population cannot be slaughtered in one day; whole pen can be starved only when all the fish from that pen are being slaughtered)
	Requirement for fish used in feed to be from sustainable sources and to be humanely handled and killed	1 (must obtain written declaration from feed supplier that fish meal and oil used are from fisheries whose vessels are registered within a state that has publicly subscribed to the FAO’s Code of Conduct for Responsible Fisheries and/or are recognised as having independent national or international management controls)	0 (not specified)	3 (aquatic ingredients must be of organic origin, or wild marine resources independently certified as sustainable e.g. by Marine Stewardship Council, or by-products of wild-caught fish for human consumption; no requirement for wild-caught fish to be handled or killed humanely)
Appropriate weaning age	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Adequate monitoring of health and welfare by producers	Regular veterinary visits, comprehensive sea lice management strategy and veterinary health plan with stringent targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits*	6 (must have regular vet visits; must have written veterinary health plan reviewed regularly; must follow A National Treatment Strategy for the Control of Sea Lice on Scottish Salmon Farms; must monitor and keep records of stock performance and health, including mortalities with categories, sea lice, physical damage, predation, deformities, cataracts, vaccine response, feeding behaviour, diver observations, and deaths or injuries during transport, but no requirement for targets)	8 (must have regular vet visits; must have veterinary health plan updated regularly, including sea lice prevention and treatment programme; fish condition must be continually monitored for signs of disease or problems with the environment or handling practices and remedial action taken if problem identified; VHP must specify conditions to be monitored – recommends that should include eye damage/ loss, snout injuries, fin damage, deformities and scale/skin damage; if mortality level is above 0.5% per week the vet must be notified and an investigation made; records must be kept of any deaths or injuries during transport; fish health and levels of physical damage must be benchmarked at entry to the scheme and monitored regularly to demonstrate progressive improvement in fish condition)	2 (no requirement for regular veterinary visits; must have health and welfare plan reviewed regularly, including sea lice monitoring and management procedures – sea lice data must be collected weekly, except within 140 degree days of slaughter, and submitted to Soil Association every month; tolerance limits specified for sea lice numbers; mortalities with categories must be recorded; a full record of any mortalities or injuries during transport must be kept; no requirement for monitoring or targets for other health and welfare parameters)

*Key criteria

Table A8.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for salmon.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for salmon	Code of Good Practice for Scottish Finfish Aquaculture (CoGP)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Soil Association (SA)
STOCKMANSHIP, HANDLING, TRANSPORT & SLAUGHTER				
Appropriate handling	Well-designed handling and grading systems to minimise stress and injury*	4 (pumps, pipes and grading equipment should be designed and correctly set up so as not to injure or unnecessarily stress fish; hand nets should be designed to minimise physical damage but no requirement for water-holding bag)	4 (grading equipment must be designed so as not to cause damage to the fish and must be regularly maintained; hand nets must be designed to avoid physical damage but no requirement for water-holding bag)	10 (grading equipment must be well-maintained and must not harm stock; in seawater systems, must allow sufficient time for stock to swim through grading nets – passive grading; if fish are netted the net must have a water-holding bag)
	Removal from water limited to very short periods*	0 (time out of water should never be so long as to produce signs of distress but no maximum stipulated)	8 (time out of water for live fish must never exceed 15 seconds unless anaesthetised)	8 (live fish must not be left out of water for more than 15 seconds unless anaesthetised)
	Crowding only permitted for short periods*	0 (the frequency and duration of crowding should be kept to a minimum but no limits stipulated)	10 (crowding must be kept to the minimum necessary and must not exceed 2 hours on any one occasion; no enclosure/tank must be crowded more than twice in any week or 3 times in any month unless required by the vet for fish welfare reasons; oxygen level must be monitored throughout and must not fall below 6mg/litre)	10 (stock may only be crowded when necessary for harvest, capture or treatment for a maximum of 2 hours; crowding in any holding facility must not take place more than twice in any week or 3 times in any month unless required by vet for health reasons; dissolved oxygen must be monitored during crowding and must not fall below 6mg/litre)
Promotion of high quality stockmanship	Requirement for stockpeople to be trained/ competent/ experienced	3 (training appropriate to the responsibilities of those engaged in aquaculture should be integral to all operations; a documented training programme must be in place to include areas specifically related to the VHP)	3 (all staff working with stock must be trained and competent in fish husbandry and welfare relevant to their duties; records of staff training must be maintained; there should be a programme of training relevant to the requirements of the VHP with induction training for new staff and regular reviews)	3 (all staff must be provided with training; staff training records must be kept; training must be covered by the VHP)
Frequent checks for signs of illness, injury or distress	Frequent checks for signs of illness, injury or distress	4 (fish must be inspected daily, weather permitting)	4 (fish must be inspected at least once a day unless exceptional weather conditions make this impossible; fry must be inspected at least twice daily)	4 (stock must be inspected at least once a day to check their health and welfare, unless weather conditions prevent this)
Short transport duration	Short transport duration and monitoring of water quality during transport*	2 (no limit on journey time specified; for lorry and well boat transport, oxygen monitoring should be carried out with sufficient frequency to ensure oxygen levels are maintained within safe parameters at all times)	2 (in well boats, journey time and holding time with closed valves must not exceed a planned max of 14 hours; water quality must be monitored throughout the journey)	6 (journey time must be less than 6 hours when transporting by road and oxygen and carbon dioxide levels of the water must be monitored on in-cab display; journey time must be no more than 25 minutes by helicopter; adult growing stock must not be transported between operations)

*Key criteria

Table A8.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for salmon.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for salmon	Code of Good Practice for Scottish Finfish Aquaculture (CoGP)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Soil Association (SA)
No live export	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
No use of livestock markets	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Humane slaughter	No inhumane slaughter methods (asphyxiation in air or on ice/gill cutting without stunning/carbon dioxide)*	10 (slaughter methods must result in rapid and irreversible loss of consciousness; use of CO ₂ prohibited)	10 (the method of slaughter must rapidly, and without pain and distress, render the fish insensible until death supervenes; percussive blow is the only permitted method at present; use of CO ₂ prohibited)	10 (fish must not be slaughtered using ice, suffocation, leaving to die in the open air or exsanguination without stunning; use of CO ₂ prohibited)
	Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death*	4 (killing efficiency should be monitored by a proficient person to ensure fish do not regain consciousness prior to death)	8 (humane mechanical devices must be used in preference to a manual blow, except for emergency slaughter, and must be monitored to ensure they are working properly and delivering the stun at the correct location – top of head just behind eyes; a priest must be available to allow a manual blow to be administered in an emergency; bleeding must follow within 10 seconds; slaughter efficiency must be continuously monitored to ensure that every fish is effectively stunned and does not regain consciousness prior to death)	8 (fish must be stunned by concussion to the head or electrocution, followed by severing of the gill arches; fish must be made instantly insensible as soon as they are taken from the water; the guidance notes of the HSA for the humane slaughter of salmon and trout must be followed, which specify stunning parameters and monitoring of stunning)
Promotion of high welfare standards in the handling of animals during transport and slaughter	Written procedures for transport and slaughter and requirement for people involved in transporting and slaughtering fish to be trained/ competent/ experienced	3 (transport and slaughter procedures covered by VHP; must have a documented training programme in place which covers humane slaughter)	4 (transport and slaughter procedures covered by VHP and must have written policy on catching and handling; all staff working with or handling fish must be trained and competent; records of training must be kept; a named person must be responsible for welfare during loading and unloading; all staff involved in the slaughter process must have received full training; there must be a named person responsible for welfare throughout the slaughter process who has attended a recognised training course in humane fish slaughter)	3 (transport and slaughter procedures covered by health and welfare plan; all staff responsible for loading, transporting and unloading must be adequately trained; staff involved in slaughtering must be skilled to perform their tasks efficiently and humanely; staff training records must be kept)
GENETICS & BREEDING				
No use of breeds associated with increased incidence of health/welfare problems	No use of triploid stock*	0 (permitted)	0 (permitted)	10 (prohibited)
	No use of all-female (sex-reversed) stock	0 (permitted)	0 (permitted)	5 (prohibited)
No killing of surplus male animals	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A

*Key criteria

Table A8.1: Scoring of assurance scheme standards for salmon.

Generic criteria	Specific criteria for salmon	Code of Good Practice for Scottish Finfish Aquaculture (CoGP)	RSPCA Freedom Food (RSPCA)	Soil Association (SA)
AUDITING				
Frequent inspections	Frequent inspections by certifying body	4 (inspections annually)	4 (inspections annually; time between inspections may be shorter or longer up to 15 months to allow visits at different times of year)	4 (annual inspection)
Spot-checks	Targeted unannounced spot-checks	2 (unannounced and short-notice inspections are carried out on 5% of sites certified each year; some are targeted according to perceived risk and the remainder are random)	5 (RSPCA monitor approx 35% of all members and 50% of monitoring visits are unannounced; all monitoring visits are made on a risk assessment basis following annual inspection – farms with non-compliances at assessment will get a monitoring visit)	3 (there is a programme of additional unannounced inspections over and above the annual visits; these target those who are considered to be higher risk or where specific risks have been identified, e.g. end of derogation periods, parallel production, following up complaints; around 10% of farms receive additional spot-checks or follow-up visits each year)
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme	Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set*	2 (no welfare outcome assessments carried out but checks are carried out during inspections to ensure producers are collecting and maintaining records of welfare-related data)	4 (no welfare outcome assessments carried out for salmon but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and demonstrate continual improvement in fish condition and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure records are in place and improvements are being made)	0 (no welfare outcome assessments carried out for salmon)
Measures to address non-compliance	Stringent measures to address non-compliance	5 (non-compliance categorised as minor or major; the producer must address and respond with corrective action and supporting evidence where relevant within 28 days of receipt of the audit report for all non-compliances raised; FCI may accept or reject any corrective action, demand further or additional corrective action and schedule an unannounced or short notice follow-up audit to check that serious issues have been addressed or take things further to suspension or certificate withdrawal where necessary)	5 (all non-compliances must be corrected as soon as possible; certificates are withdrawn after 8 weeks if the Freedom Food certification panel have not received corrective actions and objective evidence to verify compliance; a producer who has their certificate withdrawn due to non-compliance at assessment has 3 unannounced visits by Freedom Food over the next 6 months to ensure compliance is being maintained)	5 (an action summary form is drawn up following inspection, listing non-compliances and asking how they will be corrected, with a deadline for return of the completed form; actions to correct non-compliances must be approved before a licence is issued or continued; an additional inspection may be carried out to make sure non-compliances have been corrected; non-compliance categorised as minor, major, critical or manifest infringement; certification will normally be suspended for part or whole of the enterprise in response to critical non-compliance or multiple or unresolved major non-compliance)

*Key criteria

APPENDIX 8B
SALMON

APPENDIX 8B: SCORING CATEGORIES FOR THE SCORING OF STANDARDS FOR SALMON

Table A8.2: Scoring categories for salmon.

Criteria for salmon	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
ENVIRONMENT						
Appropriate stocking density at freshwater parr stage*	Stocking densities in excess of 35 kg/m ³ permitted	Max 35 kg/m ³	Max 30 kg/m ³	Max 25 kg/m ³	Max 20 kg/m ³	10 kg/m ³ ±1%
Appropriate stocking density in saltwater cages/pens*	Stocking densities in excess of 25 kg/m ³ permitted	Max 25 kg/m ³	Max 22 kg/m ³	Max 18 kg/m ³	Max 15 kg/m ³	10 kg/m ³ ±1%
High standards of water quality*	No requirement for monitoring of water quality parameters and no tolerance limits specified	Some water quality parameters must be monitored but no tolerance limits stipulated in standards	Some water quality parameters must be monitored and must meet moderate tolerance limits stipulated in standards in freshwater operations only	Some water quality parameters must be monitored and must meet moderate tolerance limits stipulated in standards in both freshwater and seawater operations	Wide range of water quality parameters must be monitored and must meet stringent tolerance limits stipulated in standards in freshwater operations only	Wide range of water quality parameters must be monitored and must meet stringent tolerance limits stipulated in standards in both freshwater and seawater operations
Provision of environmental enrichment*	No requirement to provide environmental enrichment	N/A	N/A	N/A	Environmental enrichment must be provided in either 1) the freshwater stage or 2) the saltwater stage (e.g. by combining with production of aquatic plants)	Environmental enrichment must be provided in both the freshwater and saltwater stages (e.g. by combining with production of aquatic plants)
Appropriate light/dark periods	No restrictions on lighting patterns	N/A	One of 1) artificial light must not be used to prolong day length to longer than 16 hours 2) artificial light must not be used to manipulate smolting 3) artificial light must not be used to control maturation or production in finishing stock	Two of 1) artificial light must not be used to prolong day length to longer than 16 hours 2) artificial light must not be used to manipulate smolting 3) artificial light must not be used to control maturation or production in finishing stock	N/A	Artificial light must not be used to prolong day length to longer than 16 hours, to manipulate smolting, or to control maturation or production in finishing stock
Provision of protection from predators	No specifications regarding protection from predators	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Preventive measures must be used to protect fish from predators
No killing of predators	Killing of predators permitted	Non-lethal means of predator control should be used in preference and, where lethal methods are used, these must be humane	N/A	Humane lethal means of predator control must only be used as a last resort where all non-lethal methods are in place; predator exclusion procedures must be reviewed following the killing of a predator	N/A	Killing of predators prohibited

*Key criteria

Table A8.2: Scoring categories for salmon.

Criteria for salmon	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Fish maintained in groups of similar sized fish to minimise aggression	No requirement to maintain fish in groups of similar-sized stock	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Fish must be maintained in groups of similar-sized stock to minimise aggression
No use of cleaner fish such as wrasse to control sea lice	Use of cleaner fish such as wrasse permitted	If cleaner fish such as wrasse are used, their welfare must be managed, including providing adequate shelter and feed	N/A	N/A	N/A	Use of cleaner fish such as wrasse prohibited

HUSBANDRY

No mutilations, including tagging*	No restrictions on legal mutilations	N/A	Marking methods that cause significant injury prohibited but those that cause a smaller degree of injury permitted	N/A	N/A	All mutilations prohibited
No use of genetically modified or cloned fish or their offspring*	No restriction on the use of genetically modified or cloned fish or their offspring	N/A	N/A	The use of genetically modified fish is prohibited but no restriction on the use of cloned fish or their offspring	The use of genetically modified and cloned fish is prohibited but no restriction on the use of clone offspring	The use of genetically modified and cloned fish and their offspring is prohibited
Broodstock must be anaesthetised or slaughtered before stripping*	No requirement for broodstock to be anaesthetised or slaughtered before stripping	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Broodstock must be anaesthetised or slaughtered before stripping
Requirement for feeding methods to minimise competition and aggression and for feeding behaviour to be monitored	No requirement for feed to be distributed in such a way as to minimise aggression and competition or for feeding behaviour to be monitored	N/A	One of 1) feed must be distributed in such a way as to minimise aggression or competition 2) feeding behaviour must be monitored	N/A	N/A	Feed must be distributed in such a way as to minimise aggression and competition; feeding behaviour must be monitored
No use of high energy (high oil content) diets to increase production	No restrictions on energy content of diet	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Feeding of high energy diets (above 30% oil content) prohibited
Short period of feed withdrawal prior to slaughter*	Feed may be withheld for more than 72 hours	N/A	N/A	N/A	Feed must not be withheld for more than 72 hours except with permission, e.g. if whole pen cannot be slaughtered in one day	Feed must not be withheld for more than 72 hours

*Key criteria

Table A8.2: Scoring categories for salmon.

Criteria for salmon	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Requirement for fish used in feed to be from sustainable sources and to be humanely handled and killed	No requirements for fish meal and oil to be sourced from sustainable or humane sources	Fish meal and oil used must be from fisheries whose vessels are registered within a state that has publicly subscribed to the FAO's Code of Conduct for Responsible Fisheries and/ or are recognised as having independent national or international management controls, but no requirement for fisheries to be independently certified as sustainable and no requirement for humane treatment of fish used in fish meal and fish oil	N/A	Fish meal and oil must be from sources independently certified as sustainable (e.g. Marine Stewardship Council) or organic, or from by-products of wild-caught fish for human consumption, but no requirement for humane treatment of fish used in fish meal and fish oil	N/A	Fish meal and oil must be from sources independently certified as sustainable (e.g. Marine Stewardship Council) or organic, or from by-products of wild-caught fish for human consumption, and independently certified as caught by methods involving short duration of capture and stunning and killing of each fish immediately after it is taken from the water (e.g. Fair-Fish) (NB. if all fish meal and fish oil is derived from by-products of wild-caught fish for human consumption this is considered to fulfil both the sustainable and humane criteria since no additional fish are killed)
Regular veterinary visits, comprehensive sea lice management strategy and veterinary health plan with stringent targets for key health and welfare parameters and action required if fall below tolerance limits*	No requirement for VHP, regular veterinary visits or monitoring of health and welfare and performance parameters	Must have VHP but no requirement for monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters or regular veterinary visits	Must have VHP including comprehensive sea lice monitoring and control strategy and one of 1) monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters or 2) regular veterinary visits	Must have VHP including comprehensive sea lice monitoring and control strategy and two of 1) monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters 2) moderate or unspecified targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits 3) regular veterinary visits	Must have VHP including comprehensive sea lice monitoring and control strategy, regular veterinary visits and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with moderate or unspecified targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits	Must have VHP including comprehensive sea lice monitoring and control strategy, regular veterinary visits and monitoring of key health and welfare and performance parameters with stringent targets and action required when fall below tolerance limits
STOCKMANSHIP, HANDLING, TRANSPORT & SLAUGHTER						
Well-designed handling and grading systems to minimise stress and injury*	No requirement for grading equipment to be well-designed and well-maintained to avoid injuring stock, for passive grading to be used in seawater systems or for nets to have a water-holding bag	N/A	One of 1) grading equipment must be well-designed and well-maintained to avoid injuring stock 2) passive grading used in seawater systems 3) if fish are netted the net must have a water-holding bag	Two of 1) grading equipment must be well-designed and well-maintained to avoid injuring stock 2) passive grading used in seawater systems 3) if fish are netted the net must have a water-holding bag	N/A	Grading equipment must be well-designed and well-maintained to avoid injuring stock; passive grading used in seawater systems; if fish are netted the net must have a water-holding bag

*Key criteria

Table A8.2: Scoring categories for salmon.

Criteria for salmon	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Removal from water limited to very short periods*	Live fish may be left out of water for more than 30 seconds without being anaesthetised	Live fish must not be left out of water for more than 30 seconds unless anaesthetised	Live fish must not be left out of water for more than 25 seconds unless anaesthetised	Live fish must not be left out of water for more than 20 seconds unless anaesthetised	Live fish must not be left out of water for more than 15 seconds unless anaesthetised	Live fish must not be left out of water for more than 10 seconds unless anaesthetised
Crowding only permitted for short periods*	No restriction on the frequency or duration of grading or requirement to monitor oxygen levels and maintain at minimum 6 mg/litre	N/A	One of 1) crowding must not exceed 2 hours on any one occasion 2) no enclosure/tank must be crowded more than twice in any week or 3 times in any month unless required by the vet for fish welfare reasons 3) oxygen level must be monitored throughout crowding and must not fall below 6 mg/litre	Two of 1) crowding must not exceed 2 hours on any one occasion 2) no enclosure/tank must be crowded more than twice in any week or 3 times in any month unless required by the vet for fish welfare reasons 3) oxygen level must be monitored throughout crowding and must not fall below 6 mg/litre	N/A	Crowding must not exceed 2 hours on any one occasion; no enclosure/tank must be crowded more than twice in any week or 3 times in any month unless required by the vet for fish welfare reasons; oxygen level must be monitored throughout crowding and must not fall below 6 mg/litre
Requirement for stockpeople to be trained/ competent/ experienced	No requirements regarding training or experience of stockpeople	N/A	Stockpeople must be suitably trained or experienced but no requirement to provide formal training in animal welfare or for training to be validated	Stockpeople must be suitably trained or experienced; formal training in animal welfare must be provided and records of training must be kept but no requirement for training to be validated	There must be at least one nominated person with responsibility for animal welfare (owner or manager) who must have attended a relevant validated training course; formal training in animal welfare must be provided for all stockpeople and records of training must be kept	All stockpeople must have attended a relevant validated training course and records of training must be kept
Frequent checks for signs of illness, injury or distress	Frequency of inspection not specified or less frequent than once per day	N/A	N/A	N/A	Stock must be inspected at least once per day to check their health and welfare, except when extreme weather conditions prevent this	Stock must be inspected at least twice daily to check their health and welfare, except when extreme weather conditions prevent this
Short transport duration and monitoring of water quality during transport*	Journeys in excess of 12 hours permitted and no requirement to monitor water quality during transport	One of 1) 12 hour journey limit or 2) water quality must be monitored throughout transport	12 hour journey limit; water quality must be monitored throughout transport	8 hour journey limit; water quality must be monitored throughout transport	4 hour journey limit; water quality must be monitored throughout transport	On-farm slaughter; 4 hour limit for other journeys; water quality must be monitored throughout transport

*Key criteria

Table A8.2: Scoring categories for salmon.

Criteria for salmon	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
No inhumane slaughter methods (asphyxiation in air or on ice/gill cutting without stunning/ carbon dioxide)*	One or more slaughter methods permitted where fish are not rendered insensible rapidly, and without pain or distress, until death, e.g. asphyxiation in air or on ice, carbon dioxide, or gill cutting without stunning	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	The method of slaughter must rapidly, and without pain or distress, render the fish insensible until death – asphyxiation in air or on ice, carbon dioxide stunning or gill cutting without stunning prohibited
Specifications and monitoring to ensure effective stunning and unconsciousness until death*	Slaughter without stunning permitted and/or no specifications for stunning parameters, no requirement for fish to be stunned immediately upon removal from the water, stun to bleed time may be in excess of 10 seconds and no monitoring to ensure effectiveness of stunning and unconsciousness until death	N/A	All fish must be stunned and one of 1) clear specifications for percussive stunning and/or electrical parameters for electrocution on 2) fish must be stunned immediately upon removal from the water 3) bleeding within 10 seconds of stunning 4) monitoring to ensure effectiveness of stunning and unconsciousness until death	All fish must be stunned and two of 1) clear specifications for percussive stunning and/or electrical parameters for electrocution 2) fish must be stunned immediately upon removal from the water 3) bleeding within 10 seconds of stunning 4) monitoring to ensure effectiveness of stunning and unconsciousness until death	All fish must be stunned and three of 1) clear specifications for percussive stunning and/or electrical parameters for electrocution 2) fish must be stunned immediately upon removal from the water 3) bleeding within 10 seconds of stunning 4) monitoring to ensure effectiveness of stunning and unconsciousness until death	All fish must be stunned; clear specifications for percussive stunning and/or electrical parameters for electrocution; fish must be stunned immediately upon removal from the water; bleeding must commence within 10 seconds of stunning; monitoring to ensure effectiveness of stunning and unconsciousness until death
Written procedures for transport and slaughter and requirement for people involved in transporting and slaughtering fish to be trained/ competent/ experienced	No requirement for written procedures for transport and slaughter or for staff training	N/A	One of 1) must have written procedures for transport and slaughter 2) all staff involved in handling and slaughtering fish must be trained and competent and records of training must be kept 3) there must be a named person responsible for welfare throughout the slaughter process who has attended a recognised training course in humane fish slaughter	Two of 1) must have written procedures for transport and slaughter 2) all staff involved in handling and slaughtering fish must be trained and competent and records of training must be kept 3) there must be a named person responsible for welfare throughout the slaughter process who has attended a recognised training course in humane fish slaughter	Must have written procedures for transport and slaughter; all staff involved in handling and slaughtering fish must be trained and competent and records of training must be kept; there must be a named person responsible for welfare throughout the slaughter process who has attended a recognised training course in humane fish slaughter	Must have written procedures for transport and slaughter; all staff involved in handling fish must be trained and competent and records of training must be kept; there must be a named person responsible for welfare throughout the slaughter process; all staff involved in slaughtering must have attended a recognised training course in humane fish slaughter

*Key criteria

Table A8.2: Scoring categories for salmon.

Criteria for salmon	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
GENETICS & BREEDING						
No use of triploid stock	Triploid stock permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Triploid stock prohibited
No use of all-female (sex-reversed) stock	All-female stock permitted	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	All-female stock prohibited
AUDITING						
Frequent inspections by certifying body	Inspections may be less frequent than every 24 months	Inspections at least every 24 months on average for all members	Inspections at least every 18 months on average for all members OR Inspections every 12 months initially and then up to 24 months with frequency determined by previous performance	Inspections at least every 15 months on average for all members OR Inspections every 6 months initially and then up to 24 months with frequency determined by previous performance	Inspections at least every 12 months on average for all members OR Inspections every 6 months initially and then up to 18 months with frequency determined by previous performance	Inspections every 6 months initially and then up to 12 months with frequency determined by previous performance
Targeted unannounced spot-checks	No spot checks	Spot checks for less than 10% of members annually (or proportion not specified); not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for less than 10% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced OR Spot checks for 10% of members annually but not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for 10% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced OR Spot checks for 20% of members annually but not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for 20% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced OR Spot checks for 30% of members annually but not targeted and/or advance notice given	Spot checks for 30% of members annually with targeting on a risk assessment basis and checks may be unannounced
Monitoring of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme and stringent targets set*	No assessment of welfare outcomes and no stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future	No assessment of welfare outcomes but stated intention to introduce recording of welfare outcomes in the future OR Informal observations of one or two welfare outcomes (e.g. injuries) during routine inspections but no formal recording of welfare outcomes and no targets set OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure records are being maintained	System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted OR No system of assessment of welfare outcomes by assurance scheme but producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place but no targets set OR System of assessment of welfare outcomes under development/ currently being piloted and producers must monitor and record health and performance parameters and set targets or demonstrate continual improvement and checks are carried out at inspection to ensure these are in place and are being met	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and either 1) farm-specific targets set by producers or 2) moderate (or unspecified) targets set by assurance scheme	System of assessment of welfare outcomes in place and stringent targets set by assurance scheme for all farms

*Key criteria

Table A8.2: Scoring categories for salmon.

Criteria for salmon	Score 0	Score 1 (2 for key criteria)	Score 2 (4 for key criteria)	Score 3 (6 for key criteria)	Score 4 (8 for key criteria)	Score 5 (10 for key criteria)
Stringent measures to address non-compliance	No requirement to correct minor non-compliances	N/A	N/A	All non-compliances must be corrected but no defined timescale for correction; certification may be suspended or withdrawn for a serious non-compliance or multiple and/or repeated minor non-compliances	N/A	All non-compliances must be corrected within agreed timescale; certification may be suspended or withdrawn for a serious non-compliance or multiple and/or repeated minor non-compliances